# THE SIGNIFICANCE OF LACK OF PENETRATION/ LACK OF FUSION IN ASME CLASS 3 WELDS AT WATTS BAR NUCLEAR PLANT 

Prepared by
Geoffrey R. Egan
Jeffrey L. Grover
Philip M. Besuner
William R. Blackstone
Scott D. Miller
Russell C. Cipolla
Albert E. Curtis, III
Aptech Engineering Services, Inc.
Post Office Box 3440
Sunnyvale, CA 94088-3440

Prepared for
Tennessee Valley AuthorityWatts Bar Nuclear Plant
Route 60, Near Spring City
Post Office Box 800
Spring City, Tennessee 37381
Attention: Mr. W. L. Elliott
February 1991

## VERIFICATION RECORD SHEET

-REPORT NO.: AES 90091312-10-1, REVISION 2

TITLE: . THE SIGNIFICANCE OF LACK OF PENETRATIONILACK OF.FUSION IN ASME CLASS 3 WELDS AT WATTS BAR NUCLEAR PLANT


## CONTENTS

Section Page
ABSTRACT ..... iv
INTRODUCTION ..... 1-1
Background ..... 1-1
Approach ..... 1-2
Task 1 - Review of Client Supplied Information ..... 1-3
Task 2 - Development of Statistical Sample of Flaw Size ..... 1-4
Task 3 - Development of Stress Data ..... 1-4
Task 4 - Design and Flaw Evaluations ..... 1-5
Scope ..... 1-5
2 RESOLUTION STRATEGY ..... 2-1
Strategy Overview ..... 2-1
Analytical Representation of Weld Condition ..... 2-3
References ..... 2-42.22.3
3ANALYSIS METHODS3-1
3.1Section Ill Analysis Procedure3-1
3.2 Fatigue Analysis ..... 3-4
3.3 Section XI Analysis Procedure For Austenitic Materials ..... 3-5
3.4 Section XI Analysis Procedure for Ferritic Materials ..... 3-7
3.4 .1 Screening Procedure ..... 3-7
3.4.2 Limit Load Analysis Procedure ..... 3-8
3.4.3 Elastic Plastic Fracture Mechanics Analysis Procedure ..... 3.9
3.4.4 Linear Elastic Fracture Mechanics Analysis Procedure ..... 3-9
3.5 References ..... 3-10
4 CHARACTERIZATION OF LACK OF PENETRATION/LACK OF FUSION ..... 4-1
FLAWS
4.1 Introduction ..... 4-1
4.2 Selection of Welds in Sample ..... 4-1
4.3 - Inspection ..... 4-3
4.3.1 Tennessee Valley Authority Radiography Examination of ..... 4-3
Sampled Welds
4.3.2 Image Analysis by APTECH ..... 4-4
4.3.3 Ultrasonic Sizing By Tennessee Valley Authority ..... 4-5
4.3.4 Destructive Analysis and Measurement ..... 4-6
4.4 Statistical Analysis of the Inspection Results ..... 4-74.4.1
4.4.2
Flaw Areas ..... 4-8Formulation of the Statistics Problem4-7
4.4.3
Flaw Depth ..... 4-8
Section ..... iii
Page
4.5 Weld Comparisons ..... 4-9
4.5.1 General Approach ..... 4-9
4.5.2 Random Versus Original Welds ..... 4-10
4.5.3 Material Effect on Flaw Area ..... 4-11
4.5.4 Other Effects on Flaw Area ..... 4-11
4.6 Welder Comparisons ..... 4-11
4.7 Major Conclusiosn and Recommendations ..... 4-12
4.8References4-14
5 BOUNDING STRESSES ..... 5-1
5.1 Selection of Class 3 Systems For Analysis ..... 5-1
5.2 Identification of Class 3 Analysis Problems for Detailed Analysis ..... 5-2
5.3 Extraction of Bounding Stresses ..... 5-3
6 STRUCTURAL INTEGRITY EVALUATIONS ..... $6-1$
6.1 References ..... 6-3
7 SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS ..... 7-1
8 APPLICATION OF THESE ANALYSES TO WATTS BAR NUCLEAR ..... 8-1
PLANT, UNIT 2
8.1 Introduction ..... 8-1
8.2 Background ..... $8-1$
8.3 Strategy for Unit 2 ..... 8-1
ĀPPENDIX A - RADIOGRAPHIC EXAMINATION RESULTS ..... A-1
APPENDIX B - STATISTICAL ANALYSIS METHOD ..... 8-1
APPENDIX C - ASSUMPTION FOR FLAW DISTRIBUTION ANALYSIS ..... C-1
APPENDIX D - REVISED MEMO OF WELDER COMPARISON ANALYSES ..... D-1
APPENDIX E - SUMMARY OF CALCULATION PACKAGES ..... E-1
APPENDIX F - DATABASE OF MOST HIGHLY STRESSED NODES ..... F-1

ABSTRACT

This report describes the results of analyses to determine the significance of lack of penetration (LOP) and lack of fusion (LOF) indications in ASME Class 3 welds at Tennessee Valley Authority's (TVA) Watts Bar Nuclear Plant.

Using a combined statistical and "worst-case" deterministic approach, it is shown that there is a better than $95 \%$ confidence that $95 \%$ of the affected weld population will meet the ASME Code acceptance criteria based on allowable stresses. The above analyses are based on fracture mechanics and limit load concepts and use as input data the upper bound flaw sizes, worst-case stresses, and Code-specified material properties (both carbon steel and stainless steel systems are affected).

The upper bound flaw size was established using a random sampling program to identify welds to be radiographed. The indication length data determined by radiography were supplemented by indication depth data derived from ultrasonic testing and destructive sectioning. A statistical analysis established that $95 \%$ of the population contained flaws with areas less than $18 \%$ of the section area. This was used as the bounding flaw size in the analysis. The confidence level for this bound was found to be $95 \%$.

Worst-case stress data were established by reviewing.TVA stress data for the systems which were anticipated to have the highest stresses. This resulted in a review of stress packages from two stainless steel systems and one carbon steel system. Stress data at highest stress locations (nodes) in the analyses were tabulated.

The analyses were performed using the above inputs to evaluate compliance with ASME Section III stress allowables for degraded pipe sections (due to LOP/LOF). Additionally structural integrity was assessed using the methods embodied in ASME Section XI.

These analyses included the highest stressed nodes and the bounding flaw size. In addition, the bounding flaw was placed at the worst location in the pipe section from the stress point of view. (This meant that the flaws were located in the positive part of the bending moment). Thus, the analysis method is conservative and resulted in 44 nodes that required further evaluation. Of the 44, only three required further radiography to ensure compliance with Code requirements. The remaining 41 were either previously radiographed or were not relevant weids.

It was concluded that there is high confidence (greater than $95 \%$ ) that $95 \%$ of the affected welds will meet the design stress requirements.

A separate statistical analysis of welder attributes was performed to identity those welders that may have produced substandard workmanship. This analysis, along with further selective radiography, identified one substandard welder. All of the welds of this welder have been radiographed and, where necessary, corrective actions will be effected.

Section 1
INTRODUCTION

The American Society of Mechanical Engineers (ASME) Boiler and Pressure Vessel (B\&PV) Code Section III requires that welds for all classes of nuclear construction meet certain standards. Several of these standards are for workmanship covering several weld discontinuities and lack of penetration (LOP) and lack of fusion (LOF). Class 1 and Class 2 fabrication and examination rules, embodied in Subsections NB/NC 4000 and 5000, specify radiographic examination (RT) for positive quality control of LOP/LOF. Class 3 fabrication and examination rules allow the owner a choice between surface examination or RT. By allowing a surface examination option for Class 3 construction, the code intends that the owner utilize adequate process control to minimize discontinuities such as LOP/LOF. Tennessee Valley Authority (TVAL, Watts Bar Nuclear Plant (WBN) specified surface examination for its Class 3 welds.

Tennessee Valley Authority and the Nuclear Regulatory Commission (NRC) discovered ASME B\&PV Code Section III, Class 3, piping welds with LOP and/or LOF at WBN. This report documents the results of a program to ascertain the extent of the problem and to demonstrate compliance with the ASME Code. In addition, methods to demonstrate suitability for service are described.

### 1.1 BACKGROUND

Tennessee Valley Authority previously conducted an extensive Weld Evaluation Project (WEP) reinspection to ensure the adequacy of welding at WBN. One issue addressed during the WEP was employee concerns regarding the potential for LOP/LOF. Ultrasonic testing (UT) of specifically implicated piping welds was used to determine that LOP/LOF was not a problem. Based on these results, the employee concerns were initially determined to be unfounded.

In July of 1990, an NRC inspection team checking for microbiologically-induced corrosion degradation radiographed welds in the essential raw cooling water (ERCW) system. Some of the welds checked by the NRC were those that were also evaluated during the WEP for LOP/LOF. The radiographs revealed LOP/LOF.

Subsequent additional RT by TVA and the NRC discovered LOP/LOF in systems other than the ERCW system.

Tennessee Valley Authority contracted with Aptech Engineering Services, Inc. (APTECH), to determine whether the ASME Class 3 allowables were satisfied for piping with LOP/LOF flaws and to determine the suitability for service of the Class 3 piping. This report describes the results of APTECH's work.

### 1.2 APPROACH

The objective of this project was to demonstrate by analysis that appropriate safety margins exist for the life of the plant for Class 3 piping with potential LOP/LOF weld imperfections. This was accomplished by two separate calculationsthat considered design basis loadings, including fatigue.

Calculation results are presented that demonstrate:

- Compliance to ASME Section III - Specifically that there is high confidence that the welds will meet the design stress allowables considering the maximum potential reduction in load carrying capacity due to LOP/LOF.
- Service suitability by structural integrity evaluations considering the behavior of the welds with LOP/LOF modeled as crack-like flaws.

There are two input parameters for these analyses - flaw size and stress. Given the large number of welds, a statistical approạch was determined to be appropriate to establish the upper bounds on these parameters. The analysis strategy is outlined in further detail in Section 2.

Initially, the flaw data from the TVA and NRC examinations were reviewed, and these were augmented by further random samples. Flaw sizes were estimated very conservatively from inspections for each of 116 welds. These overstated flaw sizes were then treated with a statistical analysis to establish bounding values of flaw size in terms of flaw depths, flaw lengths, and flaw area based on the 95th percentile at $95 \%$ confidence. This "95-95" overstated flaw was modeled in each uninspected weld at the location that produces maximum reduction of load carrying capacity.

Next, stress data were reviewed for the highest stressed systems. Analyses were conducted for all affected piping sizes and materials utilizing worst-case stresses for each pipe size. The effect of LOP/LOF flaws on piping stresses was determined and compared with the stress requirements of ASME Section III. In addition, suitability-for-service calculations based on the methods embodied in ASME Section XI were performed.

A summary of the work performed on each task follows. The tasks are described in greater detail in subsequent sections of this report.

### 1.2.1 Task 1-Review of Client Supplied Information

APTECH reviewed existing TVA nondestructive examination (NDE) data, stress data, and stress and fracture mechanics calculations to confirm WBN's initial assessment of the integrity of the ERCW system.

Previous work by EG\&G (TVA's contractor for WEP) was also reviewed. It was determined that, due to differences in UT results on the ERCW welds, the potential existed for problems with other groups dispositioned by EG\&G. The resolution of these issues is the subject of a separate report.

This task also included the development of two ASME Code interpretations which support the resolution strategy for this problem.

### 1.2.2 Task 2 - Development of Statistical Sample of Flaw Size

An upper bound flaw size was determined from a statistical random sample of welds developed by APTECH.

The WEP treated the population of all ASME Section III, B\&PV welds as a homogeneous sample. However, since specific parameters of welding could affect the potential for LOP/LOF, we decided to test the hypotheses of homogeneity.' The random sample was partitioned to assure coverage of base material, pipe diameter, pipe wall thickness, and other population variables. The hypothesis of homogeneity was determined to be conservative for the current problem.

Radiography was performed by TVA on the sample population to establish the extent of LOP/LOF. Indications were sized using UT procedures, radiographic imaging techniques, and limited destructive inspections. Physical limitations on flaw size from experience were considered. APTECH reviewed inspection procedures, summarized results of examinations, and determined an upper bound on flaw.size.

### 1.2.3 Task 3 - Development of Stress Data

In this task, maximum stress data were tabulated for all piping sizes and material combinations for the analyses. Four systems with anticipated worst loads (as determined from interviews with TVA piping analysis personnel) were selected for review.

Tennessee Valley Authority calculation packages were reviewed to identify those with the highest stresses for each piping size. Stress information was collected for the analysis at several of the nodes with the highest stresses in each of the selected calculation packages. Each node location may or may not correspond to a weld location and this was checked later in the program. Information required for subsequent analyses were tabulated.

### 1.2.4 Task 4 - Design and Flaw Evaluations

The analyses in this task perform two functions. The first is to evaluate compliance with the piping system design basis. The second is to determine whether the LOP/LOF flaws will have any impact on structural integrity or suitability for service.

Calculations using the maximum stress values identified above were made for each node that had a butt weld stressintensification factor, assuming a reduced net section due to the "95-95" overstated flaw. The reduced net section was determined by incorporating the maximum area loss as determined in Task 2. Compliance with the ASME Section III Code equations for Class 3 piping was determined for each relevant node by using these reduced areas and moments of inertia.

For all nodes checked with Section Ill equations, calculations were also made to determine flaw acceptability following the rules of ASME Section XI. Suitability for service was determined for design basis loadings including fatigue.

Individual nodes that failed the worst-case flaw analysis were identified. Those nodes that were determined to be within the scope of this project (e.g., TVA field welds, excluding those made with backing rings) were examined by TVA and the suitability for service was evaluated using actual flaw dimensions.

### 1.3 SCOPE

The ASME Class 3 piping at WBN ranges from $1 / 2$ inch to 36 inches in outside diameter and is found in the following systems:

- Auxiliary feedwater
- Essential raw cooling water
- Component cooling
- Spent fuel cooling
- High pressure fire protection
- Control air
- Chemical volume and control
- Purge vent


## $1-6$

APTECH determined the number of potentially affected welds in Unit 1 and common systems (required for licensing of Unit 1). A total of 7,120 welds were identified as ASME Class 3 including 3,908 stainless steel, 3,105 carbon steel, and 107 stainless steel to carbon steel welds.

## Section 2

## RESOLUTION STRATEGY

### 2.1 STRATEGY OVERVIEW

There are two distinct concerns that were addressed by APTECH in its evaluation of the significance of LOP/LOF. The first is whether the Class 3 piping at WBN complies with Section III of the ASME Code. The second is whether the flaws in the Class 3 piping have any impact on the structural integrity of the piping.

The primary aspect of Section III compliance is the presence of unacceptable indications in a piping system that has been previously accepted by a different inspection technique. The piping systems had been inspected by a surface inspection technique and were found acceptable, although subsequent volumetric inspection with radiography detected unacceptable indications. The ASME Code accounts for the possibility of undetected subsurface flaws when surface examination only is performed through the use of weld joint efficiency factors (Section III, Subparagraph NC-3611.1(a)(1) Ref. 2-1) that are less than unity for welds that do not receive a volumetric inspection. In order to ensure that this interpretation of the Code was correct, APTECH and TVA submitted the following two questions to Section III committee members to provide a Code interpretation:

Question 1: When an unacceptable indication is detected during a supplemental NDE of a piping weld (i.e., an examination performed for other than determination of Code acceptability) is it a requirement of the Code that the indication be repaired or removed if it is located in an area which was previously accepted by another permissible method of examination?

Reply 1: No.
Question 2: A Class 3 piping butt weld was acceepted by the certificate holder and ANI based on the results of a permissible surface examination method in accordance with the code requirements. Subsequently, the weld was
examined by radiography and found to have weld indications that would have been unacceptableif that method had been employed for acceptance of the weld in accordance with the subject code requirements (specifically, zones of incomplete fusion and penetration). is it a requirement of the Code that the unacceptableradiographic indications be removed or repaired?

Reply 2: No.

The ASME code response (Item $\mathrm{Nl}-90-41$ ) is included in Ref. 2-2. The strategy for accepting the welds with LOP/LOF indications is to rely on these code interpretations and a structural integrity analysis to demonstrate that the welds are in compliance with Section III. The strategy for evaluating the impact of the LOP/LOF flaws on structural integrity is discussed below.

Nuclear piping design for Class 3 systems at WBN are governed by ASME Section III, Subsection ND (2-1). The ASME Class 3 piping criteria•have been established to provide margin against failure under static loads encountered in normal service and dynamic loads associated with other events including low probability events such as earthquake. The design margins to be satisfied are embodied in the stress allowables provided in ASME Section III. Margins against fatigue failure, although not explicitly evaluated in Class 3 design, are handled in the Code rules in the evaluation of secondary stresses reducing the allowable stress range depending on the expected number of thermal expansion cycles. On this basis, the integrity of the piping design throughout the life of the piping system is assured at the start of operation.

Similarly, when flaws are detected during operation, ASME Section XI provides flaw evaluation rules for assessing the integrity of the piping and establishing the technical basis for continued operation. The margins against failure are demonstrated for the design basis loads as used in the original piping design employing fracture mechanics concepts. The Section XI flaw acceptance criteria contain appropriate safety factors for normal/upset and emergency/faulted loading conditions that are based on the original design safety margins from Section III. In addition, Section XI requires an evaluation of subcritical flaw growth to ensure that crack growth will not have an impact on structural integrity.

The presence of LOP/LOF in some Class 3 welds raises two integrity questions: will the net section properties of the weld, taking into account the area loss of the LOP/LOF, be sufficient to preserve the Code design safety margins, and will the fracture toughness and fatigue resistance properties of the weld be sufficient to prevent significant crack extension during service? The evaluation strategy, outlined in Figure 2-1, involves the definition of conservative bounding case LOP/LOF sizes and pipe stresses that can be used in the structural evaluation.

The bounding LOP/LOF size was based on a statistical evaluation of inspection data to define the largest LOP/LOF size in the population of Class 3 welds with a $95 \%$ probability of occurrence at $95 \%$ confidence. This statistical criterion is a reasonably conservative tolerance limit to use in establishing a bounding LOP/LOF size and has been previously used and accepted in the resolution of other weld review issues at WBN. Bounding stress values were determined from a review of calculation packages for three piping systems that were determined by TVA engineers to be more highly stressed than the other piping systems. Seventeen of the calculation packages with the highest stresses were selected for further review. Because the various acceptance criteria involve several different combinations of stresses, it is difficult to determine by observation which node(s) provide the bounding stresses for all of the acceptance criteria. To ensure that the bounding case was selected, several of the highest stressed nodes were tabulated for each pipe size and material for each calculation package. This results in a database of the most highly stressed nodes in the three piping systems.

Demonstrating the structural adequacy of the Class 3 piping in the as-built condition was based on showing both Code acceptanceto Section III design stress allowables and Section XI flaw acceptancecriteria. Because Section XI flaw evaluation methods cover only Class I piping, the rules in IWB-3640 and IWB-3650 were used as guidance in evaluating Class 3 pipe. Additional details of the analysis methods are provided later in Section 6.

### 2.2 ANALYTICAL REPRESENTATION OF WELD CONDITION

The LOP/LOF in Class 3 weldments has been observed in RT film to run intermittently around the inside circumference of the weld. Lack of fusion is a weld condition where either improper
heat input or poor welder technique in start/stop positioning of the weld rod can cause poor fusion between the deposited weld metal and parent pipe. Lack of fusion can occur anywhere through the thickness whenever the above welding deficiencies occur in the weld pass. Lack of penetration is generally' a root condition where the first weld pass does not completely penetrate to the inside diameter of the pipe because of low heat input, inadequate weld preparation, and poor welder technique.

Although the fundamental reasons for LOP or LOF can be different, from a structural integrity view point, they can be represented by the same analytical model. The loss in load carrying area from LOP/LOF is modelled by the geometry detail shown in Figure 2-2. The LOP/LOF is represented by a flaw in the weld metal with a normalized circumferential angle, $\theta / \pi$, and with a normalized through-wall penetration of a/t (Figure 2-2). The bounding flaw size from Section 4 of this report is a statistically based bound of the flaw area and a separate statistical bound of the through-wall extent. The bounding circumferential extent of the LOP/LOF flaws is determined by dividing the normalized flaw area by the normalized flaw depth.

### 2.3 REFERENCES

2-1 American Society of Mechanical Engineers, Boiler and Pressure Vessel Code, "Rules for Construction of Nuclear Power Plant Components", Section III, Division 1, 1971 Edition Through the Summer 1973 Addenda. Subsection ND, "Class 3 Components". Article ND-3000, Subparagraph ND-3611 (Piping Design Acceptability) Refers to NC-3600 (TVA Watts Bar Nuclear Plant Code of Record for ASME Piping).

2-2 Letter, Christian Sanna, Assistant Secretary, Boiler and Pressure Vessel Committee, ASME, to Rodney Dail, APTECH, dated January 25, 1991, APTECH External Document E-43. - 1001 APTECH


Figure 2-1 - Evaluation Strategy for LOP/LOF in Class 3 Welds.


Figure 2-2 - Representation of LOP/LOF.

Section 3

## ANALYSIS METHODS

In order to evaluate the significance of the LOP/LOF, the indications are evaluated based on strength (ASME Section III) and fracture (ASME Section XI) considerations. The Section III analysis addressesthe existing design margins present when the LOP/LOF indications are taken into account. The Section XI evaluation addresses the potential for flaw growth and fracture during the life of the plant. Both of these approaches are discussed in detail in this section.

### 3.1 SECTION III ANALYSIS PROCEDURE

The TVA sitress analyses are based on Eqs. 8 through 11 of ASME Section III, NC-3650 (3-1). These equations are reproduced below.

$$
\begin{gather*}
S_{L}=\frac{P D_{0}}{4 t_{n}}+\frac{0.75 i M_{A}}{Z} \leq 1.0 S_{h}  \tag{8}\\
S_{O L}=\frac{P_{m x} D_{0}}{4 t_{n}}+0.75 i\left(\frac{M_{A}+M_{B}}{Z}\right) \leq 1.2 S_{h}  \tag{9}\\
S_{E}=\frac{i M_{C}}{Z} \leq S_{A}  \tag{10}\\
S_{T E}=\frac{P D_{0}}{4 t_{n}}+0.75 i\left(\frac{M_{A}}{Z}\right)+1\left(\frac{M_{C}}{Z}\right) \leq\left(S_{h}+S_{A}\right) \tag{11}
\end{gather*}
$$

where,

$$
\begin{aligned}
& P=\text { Internal design pressure, psi } \\
& P_{\max }=\text { Peak pressure, psi }
\end{aligned}
$$

$D_{0}=-$ Outside diameter of pipe, inches
$\mathrm{t}_{n}=$ Nominal pipe wall thickness, inches
$M_{A}=$ Moment due to dead weight and other sustained loads, in-lb
$M_{B}=$ Moment due to occasional loads, in-lb
$M_{c}=$ Moment due to thermal expansion, in-lb
$\mathbf{Z}=$ Section modulus of pipe, $\mathrm{in}^{3}$
$i=$ Stress intensification factor
$S_{\mathrm{L}}=$ Stress due to sustained loads, psi
$\mathrm{S}_{\mathrm{ol}}=$ Stress due to mechanical loads, psi
$S_{\varepsilon}=$ Stress due to thermal expansion, psi
$\mathrm{S}_{\mathrm{TE}}=$ Stress due to pressure, dead weight and thermal expansion, psi
$\mathrm{S}_{\mathrm{n}}=$ Basic material allowable stress (hot), psi
$S_{\wedge}=$ Allowable stress range for expansion stress, psi

The allowable stress range for expansion stress is defined as:

$$
\begin{equation*}
S_{A}=f\left(1.25 S_{c}+0.25 S_{n}\right) \tag{3-1}
\end{equation*}
$$

where, .
$\mathrm{S}_{\mathrm{c}}=-$ Basic material allowable stress (cold), psi
$f=$ Stress range reduction factor.

The stress range reduction factor is determined from Table NC-3611.1(b)(3)-1 in Section III. For less than 7,000 cycles of thermal expansion, the factor $f$ is equal to 1.0 . Because the piping operates at relatively low temperatures, the hot and cold allowable stresses are assumed to be the same. Therefore,

$$
\begin{equation*}
-S_{A}=f\left(1.25 S_{a}+0.25 S_{h}\right)=1.0\left(1.25 S_{h}+0.25 S_{h}\right)=1.5 S_{h} \tag{3-2}
\end{equation*}
$$

Therefore, the right hand side of the inequalities in Eqs. 10 and 11 are $1.5 \mathrm{~S}_{\mathrm{n}}$ and $\mathbf{2 . 5 S _ { n }}$ respectively.

In the resolution strategy discussedin Section 2, the LOP/LOF indication is statistically bounded on the basis of percent loss of area. It is also statistically bounded based on through-thickness
extent (a/t). These bounds are described in detail in Section 4. Combining the two bounds results in a part-thickness flaw that extends around part of the circumference so that the total flaw area matches the bounding area.

The effect of loss of area is a linear increase in the axial stress, which is simply the pressure stress reaction divided by the pipe cross sectional area. The effect on bending stresses is nonlinear, as bending stress depends on the location of the centroid and the distribution of area around the centroid (i.e., the section modulus). The section modulus can be calculated for the geometry in Figure 3-1 using the following relations for a segment of a circle:

$$
\begin{gather*}
\text { Area }=r^{2} \alpha  \tag{3-3}\\
x_{0}=\frac{2}{3} \frac{r}{\alpha} \sin \alpha  \tag{3-4}\\
I_{y_{0}}=\frac{r^{4}}{4}\left(\alpha+\frac{\sin 2 \alpha}{2}\right) \tag{3-5}
\end{gather*}
$$

where $a$ is half the included angle of the circular segment, $x_{c}$ is the distance from the neutral axis to the center of the circle, and $I_{r c}$ is the moment of inertia about the $y$ axis (which goes through the-center of the circle and not the neutral axis).

In order to evaluate the effect of the LOP/LOF on the total stress for each of the Code equations, the pressure and bending stress components must be separated. The summary of TVA stress analyses (3-2) provides the pressure stress and the ASME stress ratios for each of the four equations, except that Eq. 9 is evaluated for upset, emergency, and faulted conditions (denoted as Eqs. 9U, 9E, and 9F, respectively). The pressure stress is taken as the first term in Eqs. 8 and 11. The maximum pressure for the upset, emergency, and faulted conditions is assumed to be the design pressure. As a result, the first term in Eqs. $9 \mathrm{C}, 9 \mathrm{E}$, and 9 F is the same as the first term in Eqs. 8 and 11.

Therefore, the following process is used to calculate the Section III Code stress ratios for each equation:

1. The Code stress ratio is multiplied by the allowable stress for that equation to determine the magnitude of the stress.
2. The pressure stress is subtracted from the total stress to give the bending stress (except Eq. 10 where the pressure stress is not considered).
3. The pressure stress is divided by the ratio of the effective net section area with LOP/LOF to the nominal area, $A^{\prime} / A$, to give the effective pressure stress.
4. The bending stressis divided by the ratio of the effective section modulus to the nominal section modulus, $Z^{\prime} / Z$, to give the effective bending stress.
5. The effective pressure and bending stresses are combined.
6. The resulting total effective stress is divided by the allowable stress for that equation to give the effective stress ratio for each equation.

In addition to the Section III evaluation, a flaw evaluation is performed using the Section XI methodology. The Section XI procedure requires knowledge of three stress values:

$$
P_{m}=\text { Primary membrane stress at the flaw, ksi }
$$

$P_{b}=$ Primary bending stress at the flaw, ksi.
$P_{\text {. }}=$ Pipe expansion stress, ksi

These values are determined from the as-designed stress ratios in Step 2 above. The value of $P_{m}$ is assumed to be the same as the pressure stress term and the value of $P_{b}$ is taken as the bending stress term, for Eq. 9 only. The Section XI procedure requires evaluation for two cases: normal/upset and emergency/faulted. No value is tabulated for normal conditions, so the upset condition stresses define the first case, whereas the greater of the emergency and faulted condition stresses defines the second case. The value of $P_{0}$ is taken from.Eq. 10.

### 3.2 FATIGUE ANALYSIS

Prior to performing a fracture evaluation, a fatigue evaluation must be performed for each flaw. The Section III methodology previously used assumes up to 7000 cycles of fatigue loading, so 7000 fatigue cycles are used here to conservatively account for fatigue crack growth. The crack growth per cycle is determined from:

3-5

$$
\begin{equation*}
d a / d N=C \Delta K^{m} \tag{3-6}
\end{equation*}
$$

where $C$ and $m$ are constants that depend on the material and environment, and $\Delta K$ is the cyclic range in the stress intensity factor, $K$. The methodology for calculating $K$ is described later in the section on linear elastic fracture mechanics (LEFM). Appendix A of Section XI (3-3) provides guidance on the values of $C$ and $m$ for a water environment for carbon and low alloy steels. Neither Appendix C (3-4) (for austenitic piping) or Appendix H (3-5) (for ferritic piping) provides any guidance on the values to be used for surface flaws in piping. For ferritic material, the crack growth constants from Appendix A of Section XI are used, assuming an R-ratio ( $K_{\min } / K_{\operatorname{mex}}$ ) of 0.25 . The ferritic crack growth constants used are:

$$
\begin{aligned}
& C=1.02 \times 10^{-12}, m=5.95 \text { for } \Delta K<19 \mathrm{ksiVin} \\
& C=1.01 \times 10^{-7}, m=1.95 \text { for } \Delta K>19 \mathrm{ksivin}
\end{aligned}
$$

where C and m are defined for units of ksi and inch. The constants for austenitic material were derived from Ref. (3-6):

$$
C=8.91 \times 10^{-11}, m=4.05
$$

The cyclic loads are assumed to be the pressure stress and the expansion stress, as the bending stress is due to dead loads that do not cycle. The fatigue evaluation is performed by calculating $\Delta K$ for the assumed crack size and flaw geometry, determining da/dN from Eq. 3-6, and
 and the procedure is repeated a total of 70 times, for a total of 7000 cycles of loading. The flaw size at the end of the 7000 cycles is used as the basis for the flaw evaluation.

The flaw evaluation procedures in Section XI specify different procedures for austenitic and ferritic materials. Each of these procedures will be described below.

## 3.3

 SECTION XI ANALYSIS PROCEDURE FOR AUSTENITIC MATERIALSFor austenitic materials that are not welded with a flux process the evaluation procedure is specified in Appendix C of Section XI (3-4) and is based solely on limit load considerations. For a circumferential flaw, the critical membrane and bending stresses, $P_{m}{ }^{\prime}$ and $P_{b}{ }^{\prime}$, corresponding to plastic collapse can be determined from:

$$
\begin{equation*}
P_{b}^{\prime}=\frac{2}{\pi} \sigma_{1}[2 \sin \beta-(a / t) \sin \theta] \tag{3-7A}
\end{equation*}
$$

where

$$
\begin{equation*}
\beta=\frac{1}{2}\left[(\pi-\theta a / t)-\left(P_{m}^{\prime} / \sigma_{t}\right) \pi\right] \tag{3-8A}
\end{equation*}
$$

or, if $(\theta+\beta)>\pi$, then

$$
\begin{equation*}
P_{b}^{\prime}=\frac{2}{\pi} \sigma_{1}[(2-a / t) \sin \beta] \tag{3-7B}
\end{equation*}
$$

where

$$
\begin{equation*}
\beta=\frac{\pi\left[1-a / t-P_{m}^{\prime} / \sigma_{t}\right]}{[2-a / t]} \tag{3-8B}
\end{equation*}
$$

The geometric variables for these equations are shown in Figure 2-2. The flow stress, $\sigma_{1}$, is assumed by the Code to be equal to $3 S_{m}$.

Eq. 3-7 is solved iteratively with different crack sizes, assuming $P_{m}=P_{m}$, until the critical bending stress, $P_{B}{ }^{\prime}$, converges on the value:

$$
\begin{equation*}
P_{b}^{\prime}=S F\left(P_{m}+P_{b}\right)-P_{m}- \tag{3-9}
\end{equation*}
$$

where SF is the factor of safety ( 2.77 for normal and upset conditions or 1.39 for emergency and faulted conditions). The flaw size thus derived is the allowable flaw size for limit load failure in austenitic materials.

## 3.7

## 3.4 SECTION XI ANALYSIS PROCEDURE FOR FERRITIC MATERIALS

The evaluation procedure for ferritic materials is contained in Appendix H of Section XI (3-5) and is considerably more complex, as it includes elastic and elastic plastic failure criteria as well as limit load. In order to establish the correct failure criteria, a screening evaluation is performed.

### 3.4.1 Screening. Procedure

For seamless or welded wrought carbon steel pipe operating on the material's lower shelf, the material toughness, $J_{1 c}$, is specified as $45 \mathrm{lb} / \mathrm{in}$. The yield stress is specified as 27.3 ksi , and the flow stress is taken as $2.4 \mathrm{~S}_{\mathrm{m}}$. The screening criterion is the ratio of $K^{\prime} / S^{\prime}{ }^{\prime}$, where

$$
\begin{equation*}
K_{\mathrm{T}}=\left[\frac{1000 K_{1}^{2}}{E^{\prime} J_{\mathrm{lc}}}\right]^{0.5} \tag{3-10}
\end{equation*}
$$

and

$$
\begin{equation*}
S_{\mathrm{r}}=\frac{P_{\mathrm{b}}+P_{\mathrm{o}}}{\sigma_{\mathrm{b}}^{\prime}} \tag{3-11}
\end{equation*}
$$

In Eq. 3-10, $E$ ' is the modulus of elasticity divided by $\left(1-v^{2}\right)$, where $v$ is Poisson's ratio. The stress intensity factor, $K_{1}$ is calculated from

$$
\begin{equation*}
K_{I}=K_{I m}+K_{l b} \tag{3-12}
\end{equation*}
$$

where

$$
\begin{aligned}
& K_{l m}=\left[\frac{P}{2 \pi R t}\right](\pi a)^{0.5} \ddot{F}_{m} \\
& K_{t b}=\left[\frac{M}{\pi R^{2} t}+P_{\cdot}\right](\pi a)^{0.5} F_{b}-
\end{aligned}
$$

and

$$
\begin{aligned}
& F_{m}=1.10+x\left[0.15421+16.772(x \theta / \pi)^{0.855}-14.944(x \theta / \pi)\right] \\
& F_{b}=1.10+x\left[-0.09967+5.0057(x \theta / \pi)^{0.565}-2.8329(x \theta / \pi)\right]
\end{aligned}
$$

In these equations, $x=a / t, \theta / \pi=$ ratio of crack length to pipe inner circumference, and $P$ and M are the applied axial load and bending moment, respectively.

In Eq. 3-11, the reference bending stress, $\sigma_{b}^{\prime}$ is calculated from

$$
\begin{equation*}
\sigma_{b}^{\prime}=\frac{2 \sigma_{y}}{\pi}\left[2 \sin \beta-\frac{a}{t} \sin \theta\right] \tag{3-13A}
\end{equation*}
$$

where

$$
\beta=\frac{1}{2}\left[\pi-\frac{a}{t} \theta-\pi \frac{P_{m}}{2.4 S_{m}}\right]
$$

or, if $(\theta+\beta)>\pi$, then

$$
\begin{equation*}
\sigma_{b}^{\prime}=\frac{2 \sigma_{y}}{\pi \cdot}\left[\left(2-\frac{a}{t}\right) \sin \beta\right] \tag{3-13B}
\end{equation*}
$$

where

$$
\begin{equation*}
\beta=\frac{\pi}{2-\alpha / t}\left[1-\frac{a}{t}-\frac{P_{m}}{2.4 S_{m}}\right] \tag{3-14B}
\end{equation*}
$$

As mentioned above, the screening criterion is based on the ratio of $\mathrm{K}^{\prime}$, over $\mathrm{S}^{\prime}$. When this ratio is less than 0.2 , the limit load procedure is applied. When the ratio is greater than or equal to 1.8 , then the LEFM procedure is applied. When the ratio takes on an intermediate value, the elastic plastic fracture mechanics (EPFM) procedure is applied.

### 3.4.2 Limit Load Analysis Procedure

The allowable bending stress in the limit load procedure is defined as

$$
\begin{equation*}
S_{c}=\frac{P_{b}^{\prime}}{S F}-P_{m}\left[1-\frac{1}{S F}\right] \tag{3-15}
\end{equation*}
$$

where SF is the factor of safety (defined as 2.77 for normal and upset conditions, and 1.39 for
emergency and faulted conditions). The bending stress at incipient plastic collapse is defined using Eqs. 3-13 and 3-14. Eq. 3-15 is solved iteratively with different crack sizes until the allowable bending stress converges on the applied bending stress, $P_{b}$. The flaw size thus derived is the allowable flaw size for limit load.

### 3.4.3 Elastic Plastic Fracture Mechanics Analysis Procedure

The EPFM procedure is similar to the limit load procedure, except that the allowable bending stress is defined as

$$
\begin{equation*}
S_{c}=\frac{1}{S F}\left(\frac{P_{b}^{\prime}}{Z}-P_{0}\right)-P_{m}\left(1-\frac{1}{Z(S F)}\right) \tag{3-16}
\end{equation*}
$$

where $\mathbf{Z}$ is an elastic plastic correction factor defined as

$$
Z=1.20[1+0.021 A(N P S-4)]
$$

where $A$ is a nondimensional term relating to the pipe geometry

$$
\begin{array}{ll}
A=[0.125(R / t)-0.25]^{0.25} & \text { for } 5 \leq R / t \leq 10 \\
A=[0.4(R / t)-3.0]^{0.25} & \text { for } 10 \leq R / t \leq 20
\end{array}
$$

and NPS is the nominal pipe size in inches. Although no guidance is given in the Code for pipe sizes less than four inches, $Z$ is assumed here to be equal to 1.20 for all pipe sizes less than four inches.

### 3.4.4 Linear Elastic Fracture Mechanics Analysis Procédure

The LEFM procedure is to evaluate the following equations, solving for the crack size, a, for a given circumferential extent, $\theta$ :

$$
\begin{equation*}
K_{1}=\left(J_{10} E^{\prime} / 1000\right)^{0.5} \tag{3-17}
\end{equation*}
$$

The applied stress intensity factor for a part-through, part-circumferential flaw is:

$$
\begin{equation*}
K_{1}=K_{t m}+K_{\phi}+K_{k} \tag{3-18}
\end{equation*}
$$

where

$$
\begin{aligned}
& K_{\mathrm{Lm}}=S F\left[\frac{P}{2 \pi R t}\right](\pi a)^{0.5} F_{m} \\
& K_{t b}=S F\left[\frac{M}{\pi R^{2} t}+P_{\bullet}\right](\pi a)^{0.5} F_{b}
\end{aligned}
$$

$F_{m}$ and $F_{b}$ are defined in Eq. 3-12 and $K_{t r}$ is the stress intensity factor for residual stress.
Residual stresses are ignored in the analysis procedure.

## $3.5^{\circ}$ REFERENCES

3-1 American Society of Méchanical Engineers, Boiler and Pressure Vessel Code, Section III, "Rules For Construction of Nuclear Power Plant Components". Division 1, 1971 Edition Through the Summer 1973 Addenda. Subsection ND, "Class 3 Components", Articlè ND-3000, Subparagraph ND-3611 (Piping Design Acceptability) Refers to NC-3600 (TVA Watts Bar Nuclear Plant Code of Record for ASME Piping).

3-2 Internally generated controlled document l-8 "Highest Stresses by Pipe Size in Selected Analyses".

3-3 American Society of Mechanical Engineers, Boiler and Pressure Vessel Code, Section XI, "Rules for Inservice Inspection of Nuclear Power Plant Components", Appendix A, "Analysis of Flaws", 1989 Edition.

3-4 American Society of Mechanical Engineers, Boiler and Pressure Vessel Code, Section XI, "Rules for Inservice inspection of Nuclear Power Plant Components", Appendix C, "Evaluation of Flaws in Austenitic Piping", 1989 Edition.

3-5 American Society of Mechanical Enginears, Boiler and Pressure VesselCode. Section XI, "Rules for Inservice Inspection of Nuclear Power Plant Components". Appendix H, "Evaluation of Flaws in Ferritic Piping", 1989 Edition, 1989 Addenda.

3-6 Bamford, W.H., "Fatigue Crack Growth of Stainless Steel Piping in a Pressurized Water Reactor Environment", ASME Paper 77-PVP-34.


Figure 3-1 -
Geometry Used to Calculate Section Modulus of Part-Through, PartCircumferential Flaw.

# Section 4 <br> CHARACTERIZATION OF LACK OF PENETRATION/LACK OF FUSION FLAWS 

### 4.1 INTRODUCTION

In order to evaluate the significance of LOP/LOF flaws, it is necessary to characterize the extent of LOP/LOF. In this context, "extent" means not only the size of flaws but also what populations of welds (e.g., piping s.systems, materials, thicknesses, weiders) are affected by the LOP/LOF. Three types of statisticalanalysis are used to characterize the LOP/LOF flaws. They are listed in Table 4-1 (page 4-15).

The first type of analysis performed in this project is to bound the flaw size for use in the structural integrity evaluations of Section 6. Three steps to obtain this bound are:

- Selection of welds in sample
- Examination and inspection of welds
- Statistical analysis of the inspection results


### 4.2 SELECTION OF WELDS IN SAMPLE

A random sample of welds was selected for RT. APTECH obtained computer printouts of all ASME Class 3 welds at the WBN, and a "random number generator" was used to select welds from this population to be inspected. Results from this examination were supplemented by UT and limited destructive examination (DE).

A set of 59 welds was chosen as a minimum number for the sample of the total population. Under a broad range of statistical assumptions, a sample size of 59 has significance. For example, under broad assumptions the maximum flaw size in 58 to 60 welds estimates the 95th percentile size with $95 \%$ confidence. (Percentiles and confidence bounds are defined in the subsection on statistical analysis.)

The random sample did not specifically identify enough welds from a given subpopulation to perform the weld and weider comparisons discussed later in this section. Additional welds were selected to fill minimum subpopulation requirements. These criteria are listed in Table 4-2.

These sample sizes were selected from many discussions and a consensus. We considered:

- Preliminary statistical calculations based on sequential sampling methods
- The perceived greater difficulty to weld stainless steel
- The perceived greater difficulty to weld thicker cross sections
- The major effect of sample size and minor effect of total subpopulation size upon statistical comparisons

Initially over 100, rather than 59, welds were selected randomiy and ranked according to the order of selection. Extra welds were selected in case initial inspection results or access problems suggested more weld inspections were needed.

All weld numbers selected were submitted to TVA quality assurance ( $O A$ ) for determination of accessibilityrdrainage attempts if full, or other factors that would hinder RT. If a selected weld could not be radiographed the next number on the list was selected. After the first 59, additional welds were selected to meet the various subpopulation requirements in Table 4-2.

Of those selected initially; 82 were eventually inspected. Inadvertently, two inspected welds, identified as Welds 2-067G-T047-15 and 1-070B-0172-20C, were not from the initial random selection. They were next to randomly sampled welds and were included in the RT image of the randomly selected welds. Both had flaws and Weld 2-067G-T047-15 had a somewhat large flaw. För conservatism, they were included as if they had been selected randomly. Thus, in all that follows, we refer to "84 random welds."

Besides the APTECH random sample program, 32 welds were radiographed by TVA due to other concerns. In all that follows we call these " 32 original welds."

### 4.3 INSPECTION

The first objective of inspection was to quantify the length of LOP/LOF indications along the girth welds in the sample population. Radiography provided an accurate measurement of flaw length.

The next objective was to quantify flaw depth, an even more critical input to structural integrity evaluation. "Ordinary" RT cannot do this. Thus, our choices were UT or enhanced RT or both. Tennessee Valley Authority indicated that it was impractical to size manually every one of the identified LOP/LOF indications with UT. Thus we rely on enhanced RT, as calibrated against both UT and DE of some flaws.

The following sections summarize the RT efforts of TVA as reviewed by APTECH, the RT image enhancement work of APTECH, and the calibration of flaw depth estimates.

### 4.3.1 Tennessee Valley Authority Radiography Examination of Sampled Weids

The 84 random and 32 original welds were radiographed by TVA according to a modification of TVA Procedure N-RT-2. This procedure was designed to quantify microbiologically-induced corrosion damage and has been modified to size LOP/LOF defects in piping welds.

All radiographs were interpreted by a TVA NDE Level III inspector to identify areas of LOP/LOF. These radiographs and interpretations were then reviewed by APTECH's NDE Level III to confirm the LOP/LOF indications called by TVA.

Tennessee Valley Authority sent a Level III inspector, to Houston on November 13, 1990. He brought the last remaining radiographs and provided QA oversight of APTECH's work in Houston. Through these QA efforts, all major differencesin interpretation were resolved (during the visit the TVA Level III inspector also observed APTECH's imaging system described below).

The results of the RT examinations by TVA are listed in Appendix A.

### 4.3.2 Image Analysis by APTECH

Digital image analysis of radiograph density was used to estimate the depth of all LOP/LOF indications. An APTECH procedure, backed by ten years of development, was employed.

Depth information of the flaws was obtained by comparing two dimensions. One is the density difference on the radiograph between the flaw and adjacent weld area. The second is the density difference of a known thickness difference caused by the penetrameter and shim placed on the base metal next to the weld.

The image of a radiograph is captured and digitized in a $512 \times 512$ matrix of pixels. Each pixel is given a light value from 0 to 255 corresponding with the transmitted light through the radiograph at that minute area. The areas containing the flaws are interrogated through computer manipulation to find the deepest point (minimum light value).

After this screening process, four digital density light value measurements are taken: minimum light value of (1) flaw, (2) area adjacent to worst flaw, (3) penetrameter plus shim area, and (4) base metal next to penetrameter measurement. These light value measurements are converted to film density values by interpolation of readings from a density strip chart. This chart is traceable to National Institute of Standards and Technology (NIST - formerly the National Bureau of Standards) standards. This process eliminates any measurement variation due to the light source, camera adjustments, distance, etc. These film measurements are used to estimate flaw depth via a logarithmic relationship between film density and specimen thickness. Refer to Ref. (4-1) for this relationship and other details.

The imaging LOP/OF depth measurement procedure was qualified on a one-inch test block with notches cut in it to simulate flaws. This block was radiographed and the resulting $x$-ray film was imaged to reproduce these depths and confirm the procedure.

### 4.3.3 Ultrasonic Sizing By Tennessee Valley Authority

Ten weids were selected for UT sizing according to TVA's NDE Procedure N-UT-39. The weld crowns were ground flush to help this sizing. The welds examined were:

- 0-067J-T145-09
- 2-067J-T349-01B
- 1-067J-T526-01
- 0-026H-T010-06A
- 1-067C-T613-07
- 2-067G-T047-15

From the random sample population and

- 0-078A-D196-05B
- 1-067J-T608-02
- 1-067J-T608-03
e. 1-067J-T635-06

From the original 32 welds radiographed by TVA.

The results of this UT sizing are listed in the UT Depth column of the first table in Appendix A IUT sizing was attempted during August, 1990, on Welds 1-067J-T608-02 and -1-067J-T608-03 previously with maximum flaw depths of 0.140 and 0.136 , respectively). These measurements were limited to four places on the weld crown (six inches out of a 27-inch circumferencel and are deemed not as valid as the later measurements in Appendix A. Also, UT sizing was done on Welds 0-078A-D196-05B and 1-067J-T635-06 during September, 1990, with flaw depth measurements of 0.100 and 0.150 , respectively.)

## 4-6

### 4.3.4 Destructive Analysis and Measurement

Weld 0-078A-D196-05B was cut and sectioned in five places with the results in Table 4-3. Note that the flaws had both LOP and LOF. Table 4-3 lists results from the measurements of both RT imaging depths and UT sizing depths.

Given the limited DE sample tabulated in Table 4-3, we developed a simple but workable estimate of flaw depth "a." The estimate is based on the following observations.

- Ultrasonic testing was either accurate or significantly overstated flaw depth.
- Enhanced RT was either accurate or significantly understated flaw depth.
- Based on the physical principles behind enhanced RT, we expect this result. We believe the error " $\epsilon$ " should be expressed in length units (e.g., a $+\epsilon$ ), not as a factor (e.g., $\epsilon$ ).
- From these five readings, the worst error of enhanced RT is bounded by $\epsilon \leq 0.060$ inch.

From these observations, in the statistical evaluation below we assume the maximum flaw depth "a" is the lesser of:

- The largest measured with UT where available ( $a_{u r}$ )
- The largest measured with RT ( $\mathrm{a}_{\mathrm{kT}}$ ) plus 60 mils ( 0.060 in.)

In equation notation,

$$
a=\text { minimum }\left[a_{V T r}\left(a_{n T}+0.060\right)\right]
$$

## 4.4 STATISTICAL ANALYSIS OF THE INSPECTION RESULTS

### 4.4.1 Formulation of the Statistics Problem

The mathematical details of the employed methods are included in Appendix B and have been given elsewhere. Referencesinclude several applicationsto Nuclear equipment. This past work was done under the APTECH QA program for TVA (4-2) and (4-3) and other clients (e.g., (4-4)).

Many of the assumptions also have detailed mathematics. These are listed in Appendix B.

Most of the "textual" assumptions (i.e., without complex math and statisticsterminology) have been given previously. For example, we have documented the assumptions used to estimate flaw depth " $a$ " from inspection data. Two remaining assumptions to express here are:

- Defect area $Y=P A R$ is calculated by multiplying flaw length by its maximum depth

$$
Y=\% L / C \text { times } a / t
$$

As defined above, $Y=P A R$ is expressed as a percent of the cross section removed. This product is very conservative because it assumes that the defect will be at maximum depth " $a$ " over its entire length.

- No leaks from LOP/LOF defects have ever resulted in any of the existing 7120 TVA WBN Class 3 welds. Therefore, $Y<100 \%$ (and so is a/t) for all 7120 welds. For large groups we rely on this assumption in a conservative way. We input one leak and 7119 "no-leaks" into the computer program described in Appendices B and C.

For uninspected weids, a "no-leak" is input simply by telling the program that $\mathrm{Y}<100 \%$ or $a / t<1$. A big advantage of the statistical methods used here is their ability to handle input bounds like $\mathrm{Y}<100 \%$ as rigorously as they handle explicit values of Y .

A statistical analysis was applied to the key inspection results listed earlier in this section. The scatter in these flaw size data is apparent. It suggests strongly that for a structural integrity analysis, a value of flaw area based on the largest flaws in our weld sample should be used. It is intended that the structural analyst assume this flaw area is in each uninspected Class 3 weld.

A standard " $95-95$ " statistical definition was chosen to establish these values. Here, the first "95" refers to a 95\% probability of "doing better" than the value quoted. The second "95" refers to the use of a $95 \%$ confidence bound. This bound compensates for the lack of an infinite sample size. It limits the chance to $5 \%$ that our estimates are too optimistic.

### 4.4.2 Flaw Areas

Figure 4-1 is a plot of $F(x)$ for the "baseline data group sample BASEL." The 95-95 flaw area is $18 \%$ of the cross section. The $18 \%$ value is the kev inout from this section to the structural integrity evaluation of Section 6.

This is the largest group considered and is featured in this report. It includes all 116 welds except eight produced by a substandard welder identified by the TVA code, "6EL."

The excluded eight welds are analyzed here using the Symbol "6ELOR." See the subsections comparing welds and welders for the appropriate tests. These tests show that Welder 6EL produces larger defects than TVA welders-in general. On this basis and similar preliminary analyses, we have recommended that all 6ELs welds be inspected, repaired as needed, and eliminated from the 95-95 statistical evaluation. By all, we mean every weld 6EL has made, original or not.

Table 4-4 focusses on the 95th percentile flaw estimates for BASEL. It includes some language to help people unfamiliar with statistics to understand the meaning of confidence limits.

### 4.4.3 Flaw Depths

To handle future weld inspections with no information on flaw depth, a 95-95 estimate of a/t is useful. Figure 4-2 summarizes the analysis. With $95 \%$ confidence, no more than $5 \%$ of the welds will have LOP/LOF flaws exceeding $45 \%$ wall thickness.

### 4.5 WELD COMPARISONS

APTECH was asked by TVA to test whether certain variables affect flaw size. These variables include weld material, thickness, origin, and welder. By testing the variables, two purposes are achieved. First, we allow the structural integrity analysis to account for significant differences, if any, among weld flaws. Second, we help seek root causes for atypical weld flaws.

### 4.5.1 General Approach

There are several statistical analysis approaches to do this. Here, we evaluate the statistical significance of differences in the 95th percentile flaw area among the various groups of the subject welds. Later, under "Welder Comparisons," we test differences in the proportion of flawed welds among several welders.

Here, as above, the $95 \%$ flaw area $Y_{26}$ denotes flaws so large that only $5 \%$ of the welds exceed them. Flaw area is defined and computed as above. Also, the weld groups are specified completely in the calculation (4-3) and summarized below. Finally, for each weld group and sample considered, Ref. (4-2) gives best estimates $\dot{Y}_{958}$ and upper $95 \%$ ( $Y_{96-05}$ ) and lower $5 \%\left(Y_{9 s-s}\right)$ confidence bounds of flaw area.

As in Appendix B, we deal mainly with the transformed variable

$$
X_{96}=1 /\left(10 \%+Y_{96}\right) .
$$

We use an approximate technique analogous to Section 13.64 in Burlington and May (4-5). We investigate the difference " $D$ " in the best estimate of $X_{\text {ase }}$ between a baseline sample " $b$ " and the sample to be compared with "c." Specifically,

$$
D=X_{\text {ptsb }}-X_{\text {psec }}
$$

The problem is set up as a one-sided hypothesis test. The "null" hypothesis is that each weld sample comes from the same statistical population'of weld flaw area $Y$ as a baseline sample used for comparison. The alternative hypothesis is that the two flaw area samples were drawn from different populations.

We reject the null hypothesis only if the difference $D$ in best estimates $Y_{\text {gss }}$ from the two samples is large. The criterion for "large" is that if the null hypothesis is correct, the observed difference could be exceeded randomly with small chance $a(D)<\sigma_{\text {SpECIRED }}$. Here, $\sigma_{\text {SPELARE }}$ is called the significance level. Because the test is one sided, $a(D)$ can never exceed $1 / 2$ or be less than zero. In math notation,

$$
0=a(\infty) \leq a(D) \leq a(0)=1 / 2 .
$$

Thus, if there is precisely zero difference between the groups, $a$ is $\mathbf{1 / 2}$.

Depending on the application, analysts use $a_{\text {speaneo }}$ values ranging from 0.15 to as low as 0.001 . The values $0.01,0.05$ and 0.10 are seen most often. Low values are used when it is not a critical error to accept an incorrect hypothesis. Larger values are used when it is more important to avoid this error and reject an incorrect hypothesis. Following some early preliminary work, we chose $a_{\text {Specafed }}=0.10$, a $10 \%$ level of significance. As will be shown below, our conclusions under "Weid Comparisons" are not affected by the choice of any significance level between 0.05 and 0.2 .

Three general comparisons were made in Table 4-5. See the results in Tables 4-6 through 4-8 and Ref. (4-4) for complete definition of the five-digit group symbols denoting the weld group samples.

### 4.5.2 Random Versus Original Welds

Table 4-6 shows clearly that the difference between the random and original welds is insignificant if the eight original welds of 6EL are excluded. The $a(D)=0.41$ is much larger than the chosen critical value 0.1. Also, the 0.41 value is close to its theoretical maximum for zero difference of $\alpha(0)=1 / 2$.

These excluded eight welds lead to a best estimate 95th percentile flaw area of 34\%. The difference between this large flaw and the $12 \%$ baseline flaw area is significant since $a(D)=0.04<0.10$.

### 4.5.3 Material Effect on Flaw Area

Table 4-7 shows the negligible difference between the 95th percentile flaw areas observed in carbon steel and non-carbon steel welds. The non-carbon welds include 63 stainless steel and five dissimilar metal welds. The small sample of dissimilar metal welds looks slightly worse than the rest (one weld with $\mathrm{Y}=19 \%$ and four clean welds). From Table 4-8 we see that the single flaw found in five dissimilar metal welds is small enough to pass the hypothesis test.

We conclude from Tables 4-7 and 4-8 that no weld material influence on flaw area is apparent.

### 4.5.4 Other Effects on Flaw Area .

Table 4-8 compares the smallest samples against the much larger baseline, BASEL. Again, only Welder 6EL is different. We find no other influence of weld material, thickness, or origin on LOP/LOF flaw area.

### 4.6 WELDER COMPARISONS

In December of 1990, a memo and related viewgraph material were prepared to document this analysis. Thēse documents are revised in Appendix $D$ to include all data received in 1990 and any modifications from our QA efforts.

There are four major differences between this work and the "Weld Comparisons" above:

- We focussed solely on welders instead of many variables.
- We focused on flaw length rather than depth or area. Flaw length data are more complete and are felt to be good indicators of workmanship.
- Instead of analyzing the entire flaw size distribution, we considered only two statistics. These were the proportion of welds with LOP/LOF flaws of more than (1) $10 \%$ circumference and (2) $50 \%$ circumference.
- The carbon steel and stainlesssteel databaseswere treated separately in this analysis. This is because of an early suspicion, never confirmed, that the lengths of LOP/LOF flaws might be greater in stainless steel welds. Unlike the previous work, we have
not done a formal analysis of material effects on flaw length. The study on flaw area is sufficient for purpose of structural integrity.

The conclusions of this analysis are given in Appendix $D$ and above. For convenience, the "suspect" weiders mentioned in Appendix $D$ are listed below:

| Category | TVA Welder Code(s) |
| :---: | :---: |
| Major Suspect(s) | 6EL |
| Minor Suspect(s) | 6AAI, 6RS, 6NM, 6NU, <br> 6GR, 6PFF |
| Additional Minor <br> Suspect(s) if $a_{\text {weocifed }}=$ <br> $15 \%$ | .6SV, 6TTC, 6RSS |

We recommend that TVA investigate the first two categories of suspects with inspections. The third category could be added for extra conservatism but is not recommended. Figures 4-3 and 4-4 contain flow charts from Appendix $D$ of the inspection procedure. They may be used to evaluate with these suspects.

This list of suspects is based on weld inspection measurement only. Às stated in Appendix D, if there is other strong evidence for suspecting the workmanship of a welder, that welder should be added to the list by TVA.

These inspections could turn up welds that are candidates for rework. Our recommended criteria for weld rework have been given previously in this section. Recall that they apply to both past and future inspections and depend only on the weld, not the welder.

### 4.7 MAJOR CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATÍONS

We draw the following three major conclusions from the analysis of flaw size distributions:

1. With $95 \%$ confidence, the chance is less than $5 \%$ that a randomly selectediTVA Class 3 weld will lose more than $18 \%$ of its cross section to an LOP or LOF flaw.
2. With $95 \%$ confidence, the chance is less than $5 \%$ that a randomly selectedTVA Class 3 weld LOF or LOP flaw will be deeper than $45 \%$ of the pipe wall thickness.
3. Conclusions $\mathbf{1}$ and $\mathbf{2}$ suggest the following criteria for reworking the largest weld flaws:

- Limit total flaw area to $18 \%$ of the cross section.
- Unless flaw depth data as reliable are presented in this section is available, limit LOP/LOF flaw length to $40 \%$ of the girth weld circumference. Here, $40 \%=$ 18\%/(0.45).
- Without flaw depth data and under worst-case assumptions for microbiologicallyinduced corrosion in the same cross section, use the following:

$$
\ell_{\text {MIC }}+\left[\left(\ell_{\text {LOPLOF }} \times 0.45\right)\right] \leq 18 \%
$$

where,

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \ell_{\text {mic }}=\text { circumferential extent of MIC in } \% \\
& \mathcal{L}_{\text {LOPROF }}=\% \mathrm{~L} / C=\text { circumferential extent of LOP/LOF in } \%
\end{aligned}
$$

With the weld comparisons, three more major conclusions are added:
4. With one exception, there is no reason to doubt that flaw area data in all weld groups investigated were drawn from the same population.
5. The exception is the sample of eight original welds by Welder 6EL. This sample had larger defects than the other groups.
6. Based on Conclusion 4, and always excluding Welder 6EL, we find no statistical significance of flaw area differences among welds of different

- Material
- Pipe wall thickness
- "Origin" (i.e., original versus random welds)

With the welder comparisons, several more major conclusions are added:
7. Using a different statistical method, and with or without adding the most recent data on ten more welds from Welder 6EL, we confirmed Conclusion 5. The work product of Welder 6EL is an outlier. Thus, we classify Welder 6EL as the only "major suspect" of
atypical workmanship. "Major" means that additional samples are unlikely to change our adverse conclusion.
8. Using a more conservative approach here than in the Weld Comparisons, we produced a list of welders classified as "minor suspects." Minor means the database is very small or the welder almost passed our test or both. More samples are likely to pass the welder.
9. For all "suspects" we recommend a detailed remedy calling for more inspection and statistical analysis based on "sequential sampling." In essence, the remedy amounts to the following:

Start with at least four new randomly selected welds made by each suspect. Inspect the welds and analyze the results. Repeat this until either the suspect is shown to be indistinguishable from the general population or there are no more of the suspect's weld's to check.
10. If this remedy is followed, the most likely results are:

- All Welder 6EL's welds will need to be inspected
- For most if not all minor suspects, only the first four welds will need to be sampled


### 4.8 REFERENCES

4-1 "Detection and Measurement of Internal Undercut in Pipeline Girth Welds", Southwest Research Institute Project 17-5175 Draft Final Report, American Gas Association Contract PR-15-95 (February 1979).

4-2 Egan, G. R., P. M. Besuner, M. J. Cohn, and S. R. Paterson, "Analysis of HVAC Ducts in Tennessee Valley Authority's Watts Bar Nuclear Plant, Units 1 and 2, APTECH Report AES 90041243-1Q-1.

4-3 Calculations 3 and 4, APTECH Project AES 90041243-1 0.
4-4 Cipolla, R. C., "Statistical Analysis of Hole Depth Data", APTECH Project AES 89121166-1Q, Calculation 1166-10-6 (Document I-7).

4-5 Cipolla, R. C., J. L. Grover, and P. M. Besuner, "Significance of Over-Drilled Oil Holes on Fatigue Life of the KSV-4-2A Connecting Rod in the Standby Diesel Engines at South Texas Project", APTECH Report AES 89121166-1Q-1 (March, 1990)' (See Section 3 especially).

## Table 4-1

## THREE STATISTICAL ANALYSES OF WELD FLAWS

## Type of Analysis

Best estimates and confidence bounds of cumulative probability distributions $F(x)$ of flaw area PAR, and depth, a/t.

Statistical fiypothesis and significance tests of F(PAR) distributions for several weld groups.

Statistical hypothesis and significance tests of wetders' "flaw hit rates" and ability to avoid long and medium flaws.

## Purpese

Estimate flaw sizes for structural analyses and rework criteria.

Decide flaw sizes that go with each weld group.

Root cause study of substandard weld workmanship.

Short Label
Flaw Size
Distributions

Weld
Comparisons

Welder
Comparisons

Notes:
PAR = percent of cross section area removed by flaw a/t = flaw depth divided by thickness

## Table 4-2

MINIMUM SAMPLE SIZE FOR SUBPOPULATIONS

| Material | Thickness,t(ln) | Other | Number |
| :---: | :--- | :---: | :--- |
| CS | $t<0.25$ |  | 8 of 676 |
| CS | $0.25<t<0.375$ |  | 7 of 3025 |
| CS | $t>0.375$ |  | 8 of 207 |
| SS | $t<0.25$ |  | 15 of 1774 |
| SS | $t>0.25$ |  |  |
| All | All |  |  |
| SS-CS | All |  |  |

## Table 4-3

## COMPARING THREE FLAW DEPTH MEASUREMENTS AT FIVE FLAW LOCATIONS

| Location $L=0^{n}=T D C \text { (lnch) }$ | Destructively Measured Flaw LOP/LOF (mils) | $\begin{gathered} \text { RT (mils) } \\ \text { Imaging (mil } \end{gathered}$ | UT <br> Sizing (mils) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 8.25 | 28 | 34 | 80 |
| 16 | 94 | 35* | 110 |
| . 18.25 | 88 | 34 | 110 |
| 25.25 | 31. | 37 | 130 |
| 32.25 | 38 | 36 | 100 |

*This figure is low because distance between shim area and flaw area was too large. The measurement was repeated using a shim area closer to flaw area and it revealed a flaw depth of 58 mils.

Table 4-4

## 95TH PERCENTILE FLAW ESTIMATES FOR BASELINE WELDS

| Type of Estimate | Flaw Area (\%) | Statement that has C\% Chance of Being Conservative | Confidence Level = C |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 95\% Confidence Interval Estimate | 18 | Five percent of the welds have flaws removing more than $18 \%$ of their cross section. | 95\% |
| Best (Point) Estimate | 11 | Five percent of the welds have flaws removing more than $11 \%$ of their cross section. | About 50\% |
| 5\% Confidence Interval Estimate | 6 | Five percent of the welds have flaws removing more than 6\% of their cross section. | 5\% |

Table 4-5
THREE CATEGORIES OF STATISTICAL SIGNIFICANCE TESTS

| Comparison Type | Baseline Sample | Table <br> Number | Compared Samples |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :--- |
| Random Versus Original <br> Welds | RANDM | $4-6$ | ORIGL (All originals except <br> Welder 6EL) and <br> GELOR |
| Carbon Steel Versus <br> Non-Carbon-Steel Welds | NOCAR including <br> dissimilar metal <br> welds | $4-7$ | CARBN |

Table 4-6
COMPARING THE RANDOM GROUP WITH TWO ORIGINAL GROUP'S

| Sample of Welds Inspected | Best Estimate of Flaw Area Yor (\%) | Same as Baseline? | Significance Level a(D) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Baseline 84 random welds [RANDM] | 11.74 | N/A | N/A |
| 24 original welds (without 6EL) [ORIGL] | 14.1 | Same | 0.4122 |
| 8 originarwelds from 6EL [6ELOR] | 34.44 | Worse | 0.0421 |

Note: RANDM + ORIGL = BASEL

## COMPARING THE CARBON WELDS WITH NON-CARBON WELDS

## Sample of Welds inspected

Baseline 68 non-carbon welds [NOCAR]
35 carbon welds [CARBN]

Best Estimate of YosArea (\%)
13.26
11.28

Same as Baseline?

N/A

Same 0.4098

## NOTES:

See next table to define symbols used in the following notes.

- CARBN = THINC + MEDIC + THCKC + (one carbon weld from ORIGL)
- NOCAR $=$ THINS + THCKS + DISSR + ORIGL - (one carbon weld from ORIGL)
- Equivalently, NOCAR = BASEL - CARBN - 5 backing-bar welds in RANDM


## Table 4-8 <br> COMPARING THE BASELINE GROUP WITH THE SMALLEST SAMPLES CONSIDERED

| Sample of Welds Inspected | Best Estimate of Flaw Area $Y_{06}$ (\%) | Same as Baseline? | Significance Level |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Baseline 84 random plus 24 of 32 original welds [BASEL] | 11.05 | N/A | N/A |
| 9 carbon steel welds of thickness .LE. 0.25 inch [THINC] | 6.13 | SAME | 0.2472 |
| 17 carbon steel welds of $0.25^{\prime \prime}<$ T.LE. 0.375" [MEDIC] | 16.32 | SAME | 0.3520 |
| 8 carbon steel welds of thickness $>0.375$ inch [THCKC] | 7.54 | SAME | 0.3141 |
| 15 stainlēss steel welds of T.LE. 0.25 inch [THINS] | 19.41 | SAME | 0.3089 |
| 25 stainless steel welds of $T>$ 0.25 inch [THCKS] | 15.00 | SAME | 0.3505 |
| 5 welds of dissimilar mtl (SS/CS) - any T [DISSR] | 27.04 | SAME | 0.2034 |
| 8 original welds of Welder 6EL [6ELOR] | 34.44 | WORSE | 0.0346 |

Flaw Area Distribution for
Total Population Minus Welder 6EL


Figure 4-1 - Flaw Area Distribution For Total Population Minus Welder 6EL.

## Flaw Depth Distribution for Total Population Minus Welder 6EL



Figure 4-2 - Flaw Depth Distribution for Total Population Minus Welder 6EL.

## Section 5 <br> BOUNDING STRESSES

The resolution strategy for evaluation of the significance of the LOP/LOF indications is based on a bounding stress level. However, the analysis methodology described in Section 3 utilizes several different stress levels, in different combinations, to perform the ASME Section III and Section XI evaluations. As a result, it is not clear how to define the bounding stress level as the highest stress level for a Section III evaluation may not provide the worst-case for a Section XI evaluation, especially when fatigue is considered. Therefore, a screening procedure was used to identify the piping systems and calculation packages within each system that provided a likely upper bound, and several of the most highly stressed nodes in each package - were identified for detailed analysis. The complete screening procedure is described in detail - below.

## 5.1 $\operatorname{Sె} E L E C T I O N$ OF CLASS 3 SYSTEMS FOR ANALYSIS

Review of the lists of TVA field welds indicated that the Class 3 welds were limited to the following systems:

- Auxiliary feedwater
- Essential raw cooling water
- Component cooling
- Spent fuel pit cooling
- High pressure fire protection
- Control air
- Chemical volume and control
- Purge vent

The resolution strategy discussed in Section 3 of this report was based on sample of four of these systems. Tennessee Valley Authority engineers told APTECH that their experience indicated that analysis results for the carbon steel auxiliary feedwater system contain relatively
high stresses. This system was, therefore, selected for flaw analysis. To ensure an adequate sample of carbon steel welds, the component cooling water system was also initially selected. Similarly, the ERCW and spent fuel pit cooling systems were selected to provide an adequate sample of stainless steel welds.

### 5.2 IDENTIFICATION OF CLASS 3 ANALYSIS PROBLEMS FOR DETAILED ANALYSIS

Within each of the selected systems, TVA analysis problems associated with Class 3 piping were identified on flow diagrams that had been marked with analysis problem numbers by TVA engineers. The latest revisions of the analysis problems were located in the TVA RIMS records system. Successor calculations were obtained for three calculations which had been superseded.

One hundred thirty six analysis problems were reviewed. The results of the review are given in Appendix E. Materials, pipe sizes and pipe thicknesses were tabulated as a complete list of those used in an analysis problem. Stress ratios and node identifications were recorded only for the most highly stressed node for each combination of pipe size, thickness, and material as identified in the stress summary for each analysis problem.

Tennessee Valley Authority piping analysis procedures do not necessarily consider the physical location of welds in the structure during the assignment of nodal locations in the analysis problem. Thus, a node may or may not coincide with a weld, and a weld may or may not be located physically close to a node. From this, it follows that some of the maximum stress values may not represent Class 3 piping weids. In addition, some maximum stress points may represent piping of less than two inch nominal size. .These aspects were initially ignored for the purpose of searching out the most highly stressed systems but were considered during the detailed evaluation.

It should also be noted that several of the stress ratios in Appendix E violate ASME Section III requirements. A review of the calculation packages associated with the analysis problems indicated that the calculated stresses at these locations had been reduced using alternate
analyses. For the analyses herein, however, the computer output values were used to provide a uniform standard for comparison of stresses.

Based on the above review, 17 analysis problems were selected for more detailed review. The primary selection criteria included high stresses, a range of pipe sizes, and the inclusion of representative samples of carbon steel and stainless steel welds. The selected analysis problems are in the auxiliary feedwater, spent fuel cooling, and ERCW systems.

### 5.3 EXTRACTION OF BOUNDING STRESSES

The 17 selected analysis problems were reviewed to extract the highest nodal stresses for ASME Code Eqs. 8, 9, 10, and 11 for upset, emergency, and faulted conditions for each pipe size, each pipe thickness, and type of material (carbon or stainless steel). The nodal stresses were extracted as sets: a high stress value for any one of the equations resulted in the tabulation of all six values for that node.

As discussed previously, TVA piping analysis procedures do not provide for a direct correlation between the locations of nodes (in the analysis problem) and welds (in the physical structure). Therefore, when a high nodal stress was obviously not at a butt weld (e.g.; nodes denoted as CENTR are in the middle of bends), sets of stressesfor nearby nodes clearly corresponding with butt welds (such as a node adjacent to a CENTR node) were also extracted. Several sets of stresses were extracted for each combination of pipe size, thickness, and material in each analysis problem with the number of sets being chosen in view of the number of members involved and the magnitude of the stresses. Approximately 10,000 locations were reviewed to extract the data.

The result of. this task was a compilation of the Section III stress ratios for 664 nodes. This compilation was converted to a computer databasein order to facilitate the evaluation described in the following section. Appendix $F$ summarizes all of the data contained within this database.

## Section 6

## STRUCTURAL INTEGRITY EVALUATIONS

Because of the complexity of the analysis methodology used in this project, a single bounding node cannot easily be identified that will bound all aspects of code compliance, fatigue crack growth, and fracture that were considered. In addition, it was recognized that the most highly stressed welds may not be acceptable assuming the worst-case flaw size, and inspection would, therefore, be required to disposition a few specific welds. This would require evaluation of a group of the next most highly stressed welds. In order to ensure that the worst-case conditions were identified and to allow for evaluation of the next most severe cases, the analysismethodology was incorporated into a computer program that utilizes the bounding flaw size from Section 4 and the entire database of bounding stresses from Section 5 to evaluate the acceptability of each node in the database from an ASME Section III and Section XI point of view.

The database of bounding stresses contains information on 664 of the most highly stressed nodes (based on the TVA stress reports). In many cases, however, those nodes were not at TVA field welds but were at other locations, such as valves, fittings, and anchors. The TVA pipe stress analysis guidelines (6-1) indicate that all butt weld nodes in the piping analyses should have a stress intensification factor (SIF) of 1.8 for piping less than 0.322 inch thick, or an SIF of 1.0 for piping greater than or equal to 0.322 inch in thickness. However, if the butt welds were not identified on the walkdown isometric, then all of the data points on straight sections of pipe should have an SIF equal to the relevant butt weld value.

This definition of SIFs was used to screen out nodes that were definitely not welds because they had some other value for the SIF. This reduced the database of bounding stress nodes from 664 to 181 , including 123 carbon steel nodes and 58 stainless steel nodes. However, not all of these remaining nodes are necessarily welds because straight runs of pipe may have butt weld SIFs.

## 6-2

The analysis was performed using this reduced database of nodes with butt weld SIFs. The database included values for the allowable stress, $S_{n}$, but not for any other material properties. Tables I-1 and I-7 of Section III of the ASME Code were used to define $S_{m}$ values that matched the $S_{n}$ values in the database. When fracture toughness values were required, the minimum value specified in Appendix $H$ of Section XI was used. Fatigue crack growth properties are defined in Section 3 of this report.

The results of the Section III analysis showed that nine of the 181 nodes that have butt weld SIFs failed to meet the Section III acceptance criteria. Nine additional nodes failed the Eq. 10 acceptance criteria but passed Eq. 11, and the Code requires that either Eq. 10 or Eq. 11 is satisfied. Table 6-1 shows the complete results of the Section III analysis for all nodes with butt weld SIFs.

The Section XI analysis showed that 44 of the 181 nodes that have butt weld SIFs had an allowable flaw size for either normal and upset conditions (N/U) or emergency and faulted conditions (E/F) that was smaller than the size of the bounding flaw after 7000 cycles of fatigue loading. Twenty-six of these nodes had allowable flaw sizes smaller than the bounding flaw neglecting fatigue crack growth. Table 6-2 summarizes the results of the Section XI analyses for all nodes with butt weld SIFs. Table 6-3 lists the 44 nodes that failed the Section XI criteria (all of the nodes that failed Section III also failed Section XI).

This list of nodes was compared against TVA weld maps to determine which nodes, if any, were welds. Sixteen welds were identified to be at or near these nodes. Six of these welds are ASME Class 2 welds and were radiographed and acceptedas part of the Class 2 acceptance criteria. Five of the welds were vendor shop welds and two of the welds were determined to have backing rings where the potential for LOP/OF is considered to be small. Only three of the welds required further evaluation. These are a carbon steel node in the auxiliary feedwater system (Node N3-03-05A-729) and two stainless steel, nodes in the ERCW system (Nodes N3-67-24A-E48 and N3-67-43A-BO6E).

It is highly unlikely that the three nodes with the worst stresses also have worst-case flaws. A radiographic examination was performed on these three welds to determine the extent of any LOP in these welds. In order to determine whether any observed LOP defect was acceptable,
the analysismethodology described previously was used on an iterative basis to determine what flaw size would precisely meet the Section XI acceptance criteria.

Two bounding flaw models were evaluated for these three welds. Because RT primarily provides information on flaw length, the first flaw model used the worst-case flaw depth to solve for the allowable flaw length, as a percentage of the circumference. The second flaw model solves for the allowable depth, assuming a fully circumferential flaw. The results of these analyses are summarized below:

ALLOWABLE FLAW SIZES

| Node | Crack Depth.a/t | Circumferential Extent. \% |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| N3-03-05A-729 | $\begin{aligned} & 0.45 \\ & 0.02 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & <1 \\ & 100 \end{aligned}$ |
| N3-67-24A-E48 | $\begin{aligned} & 0.45 \\ & 0.16 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{gathered} 2 \\ 100 \end{gathered}$ |
| N3-67-43A-B06E. | $\begin{aligned} & 0.45 \\ & 0.26 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{gathered} 25 \\ 100 \end{gathered}$ |

From these results, the following conclusions can be made regarding the acceptability of these three welds: -

1. Weld N3-03-05A-729 cannot tolerate flaws as deep as the bounding flaw.
2. If the LOP/LOF is shorter than $25 \%$ of the circumference in Weld N3-67-43A-BO6E, it is acceptable.
3. If LOPROF is shorter than $2 \%$ of the circumference in Weld N3-67-24A-E48, it is acceptable.
4. If the LOPMOF flaw is determined to be shallower than a/t $=0.02$ for Weld N3-03-05A-729 or shallower than aft $=0.16$, for Weld N3-67-24A-E48 or shallower than a/t $=0.26$ for Weld N3-67-43A-BO6E, it is acceptable.
5. If the flaw depth or length exceeds the limits as described above, then further analysis may be required to determine if the weld is acceptable.


#### Abstract

6-4 Radiographic examination was subsequently performed on each of these welds. Interpretation of the radiographs by TVA Level III radiographers showed no LOP/LOF indications on Weld N3-03-05A-729 and this weld was accepted as-is. Weld N3-67-43A-B06E was found to have a $1 / 4$-inch long LOP/LOF indication which is acceptable to the allowable flaw sizes discussed previously. Weld N3-67-24A-E48 contained a LOP/LOF indication $\% / 8$ inch long, or approximately $1.4 \%$ of the circumference. This indication is also acceptable to the allowable flaw sizes.


The above evaluation was performed based on the $95 \%-95 \%$ bounding flaw area of $18 \%$ as developed in Section 4. In order to evaluate the adverse quality associated with the welds (including 6EL welds) having observed flaw areas greater than $18 \%$, another assessment was performed employing the observed flaw size information with location-specific stresses. This evaluation is necessary to address the CAQR as shown in Figure 2-1. Three welds had observed flaw areas greater than 18\%; namely, 1-067J-T608-03, 2-067G-T046-07, and 2-067G-T047-15. All three welds passed the ASME Section III and Section XI evaluations. Therefore, the observed LOP/LOF would not have resulted in an unsafe situation if the condition had gone undetected.

### 6.1 REFERENCES

6-1 Tennessee Valley Authority, "Pipe Stress Analysis Guidelines", WBN-RAH-Appendix A, Revision 2 (August 8, 1989).

6-5
Table 6-1
RESULTS OF SECTION III ANALYSIS FOR NODES WITH WELD SIFs

| System | Cale package | O.D. | Mat'l | Node | Eq 8 | Eq 90 | Eq 9E | Eq 9F | Eq 10 | Eq 11 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 2.375 | CS | 646 | . 304 | . 704 | . 472 | . 455 | . 383 | . 353 |
| AUXFV | 0600200-02-05 | 2.375 | cs | 646x | . 319 | . 677 | . 454 | . 433 | . 425 | . 382 |
| AUSFW | 0600200-02-05 | 2.375 | cs | 6472 | . 293 | . 691 | . 464 | . 452 | . 315 | . 307 |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 4.500 | cs | 125 | . 337 | . 372 | . 253 | . 378 | . 718 | . 565 |
| AUXFU | 0600200-02-05 | 4.500 | cs | 125Y | . 355 | . 385 | . 264 | . 361 | . 667 | . 543 |
| AUXFY | 0600200-02-05 | 4.500 | cs | 127 | . 284 | . 293 | . 201 | . 257 | . 699 | . 532 |
| AUXFY | 0600200-02-05 | 4.500 | CS | 1278 | . $284{ }^{\text {- }}$ | . 294 | . 200 | 263 | . 713 | . 541 |
| AUXFU | 0600200-02-05 | 4.500 | CS | 128 | . 289 | . 333 | . 223 | . 358 | 1.118 | . 787 |
| AUXFY | 0600200-02-05 | 4.500 | CS | 13P | . 388 | . 434 | . 291 | . 437 | . 666 | . 554 |
| AUXFY | 0600200-02-05 | 4.500 | cs | 130 | . 388 | . 433 | . 291 | . 443 | . 673 | . 558 |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 4.500 | cs | 164A | . 268 | . 431. | . 318 | . 252 | . 779 | . 575 |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 4.500 | cs | 195 | . 510 | . 860 | . 579 | . 531 | . 09.2 | . 259 |
| AUXFU | 0600200-02-05 | 4.500 | cs | 196 | . 488 | . 826 | . 555 | . 509 | . 081 | . 244 |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 4.500 | cs | 19X | . 456 | . 781 | . 524 | . 482 | . 068 | . 223 |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 4.500 | cs | 86 | . 498 | . 783 | . 524 | . 476 | . 015 | . 209 |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 4.500 | cs | 90 | . 310 | . 312 | . 208 | . 168 | . 228 | 260 |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 6.625 | cs | 13 | . 382 | . 540 | . 375 | 1.075 | . 231 | . 292 |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 6.625 | CS | 44 | . 437 | . 489 | . 327 | . 676 | . 302 | . 356 |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 6.625 | CS | 55 | . 329 | . 532 | . 366 | 1.128 | 284 | . 301 |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 6.625 | CS | 55A | . 309 | . 398 | . 278 | . 909 | 297 | 301 |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 6.625 | cs | 8 | . 354 | . 598 | . 400 | . 660 | . 356 | . 355 |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 6.625 | cs ${ }^{\text { }}$ | 93A | . 382 | . 365 | . 247 | . 194 | . 074 | . 197 |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 6.625 | CS | 813 | . 337 | . 562 | . 387 | 1.171 | . 284 | . 305 |
| AUXFV | 0600200-02-05 | 16.000 | CS | 2A | . 010 | . 007 | . 005 | . 004 | 0.000 | . 004 |
| AUSFU. | 0600200-02-05 | 16.000 | CS | 2ac | . 047 | . 092 | .062 | . 108 | . 063 | . 056 |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 16.000 | CS | $2 E$ | . 020 | . 063 | . 042 | . 049 | . 107 | . 072 |
| AUSFW | 0600200-02-05 | 16.000 | CS | 2EA | . 023 | . 035 | . 024 | . 036 | . 087 | . 061 |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 16.000 | CS | $2 F$ | . 038 | . 101 | . 066 | . 083 | . 122 | . 088 |
| AUXFU | 0600200-02-05 | 16.000 | CS | 22 | . 018 | . 062 | . 041 | . 056 | . 074 | . 052 |
| AUXFV | 0600200-02-05 | 16.000 | cs | 22A | . 022 | . 037 | . 025 | . 029 | . 027 | . 025 |
| AUXPV | 0600200-02-08 | 4.500 | CS | 222 | . 193 | . 337 | . 225 | . 233 | 1.227 | . 814 |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-08 | 4.500 | CS | 222A | . 193 | . 338 | . 225 | . 234 | 1.157 | . 771 |
| AUXFW | M3-03-05A | 4.500 | cs | 717 | . 269 | 1.049 | . 704 | . 720 | . 174 | . 213 |
| AUXFW | M3-03-05A | 4.500 | Cs | 729 | . 263 | 1.111 | . 745 | . 753 | . 525 | . 419 |
| AUXFW | N3-03-05A | 4.500 | CS | 7292 | . 263 | . 1.107 | . 742 | . 749 | . 644 | . 371 |
| AUXFW | M3-03-05A | 4.500 | CS | 120 | . 268 | . 655 | . 439 | . 428 | . 139 | . 191 |
| AUXFW | M3-03-05A | 4.500 | cs | 124 | . 268 | . 869 | . 583 | . 585 | . 135 | . 188 |
| ${ }^{\text {AUXFW }}$ | M3-03-05A | 4.500 | Cs | A48 | . 263 | 1.077 | . 722 | . 727 | . 423 | . 358 |
| AUXFW | N3-03-05A | 4.500 | cs | A 50 | . 263 | 1.058 | . 709 | . 713 | . 457 | . 379 |
| AUXFW | M3-03-05A | 4.500 | CS | A52 | . 263 | 1.038 | . 696 | . 698 | . 432 | . 365 |
| AUXFW | N3-03-05A | 8.625 | cs | $23 \%$ | . 130 | . 259 | . 172 | . 165 | . 169 | . 153 |
| AUXFW | N3-03-05A | 8.625 | CS | IN22 | . 053 | . 401 | . 268 | . 289 | . 012 | . 029 |
| AUXFW | N3-03-05A | 8.625 | CS | 1N23 | . 053 | . 417 | . 279 | . 299 | . 015 | . 030 |
| AUXPW | M3-03-05A | 8.625 | CS | IN24 | . 051 | . 393 | . 263 | . 282 | . 012 | . 028 |
| AUXFY | n3-03-05a | 8.625 | cs | 1N25 | . 057 | . 373 | . 249 | . 266 | . 025 | . 038 |

(Table 6-1, Continued)

| System | Calc package | O.D. | Mat'l | Node | Eq 8 | Eq 90 | Eq $9 E$ | Eq 9F | Eq 10 | Eq 11 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| AUXFW | M3-03-05A | 8.625 | CS | 1N26 | . 057 | . 332 | . 221 | . 235 | . 029 | . 040 |
| AUXFW | N3-03-13A | 3.500 | cs | 153 | . 599 | . 927 | . 619 | . 673 | . 065 | . 279 |
| AUSXL | N3-03-13A | 3.500 | CS | 154 | . 555 | . 844 | . 565 | . 608 | . 074 | . 266 |
| AUSFM | N3-03-13A | 4.500 | CS | 100 | . 286 | . 371 | . 252 | . 283 | . 440 | . 379 |
| AUXFW | N3-03-13A | 4.500 | CS | 106 | . 262 | . 453 | . 344 | . 340 | . 118 | . 177 |
| AUSFW | M3-03-13A | 4.500 | cs | 148 | . 516 | . 566 | . 379 | . 353 | . 043 | . 232 |
| AUXFW | N3-03-13A | 4.500 | CS | 158 | . 395 | . 442 | . 301 | . 279 | . 105 | . 221 |
| AUXFW | N3-03-13A | 4.500 | CS | 356 | . 351 | . 475 | . 343 | . 365 | . 087 | . 193 |
| AUXFW | N3-03-13A | 4.500 | cs | 368 | . 291 | . 406 | . 277 | . 320 | . 547 | . 444 |
| AUXFW | N3-03-13A | 4.500 | CS | PK | . 301 | . 434 | . 299 | . 352 | . 621 | . 493 |
| auxpu | N3-03-13A | 4.500 | cs | PW1 | . 312 | . 489 | . 336 | . 410 | 1.028 | . 741 |
| ERCW | N3-67-01A | 8.625 | CS | 4497 | . 091 | . 147 | . 099 | . 102 | . 675 | . 442 |
| ERCN | N3-67-01A | 8.625 | CS | 475E | . 129 | . 197 | . 133 | . 134 | . 133 | . 132 |
| ERCW | N3-67-01A - | 8.625 | cs | 1EB | . 093 | . 139 | . 092 | . 094 | . 635 | . 418 |
| ERCW | N3-67-01A | 8.625 | cs | LYM | . 098 | . 146 | . 097 | . 098 | . 314 | . 228 |
| ERCW | N3-67-01A | 8.625 | sS | 737x | . 088 | . 183 | . 123 | . 146 | . 332 | . 234 |
| ERCN | N3-67-01A | 8.625 | SS | 117 | . 114 | . 195 | . 131 | . 148 | . 204 | . 168 |
| ERCW | N3-67-01A | 18.000 | CS | 224 | . 284 | . 356 | . 238 | . 235 | . 040 | . 138 |
| ERCW | N3-67-01A | 18.000 | cs | 224A | . 293 | . 358 | . 238 | . 232 | . 040 | . 142 |
| ERCW | N3-67-01A | 18.000 | cs | FL20 | . 162 | . 214 | . 142 | . 140 | . 116 | . 135 |
| ERCN | N3-67-01A | 18.000 | CS | upita | . 203 | . 249 | . 165 | . 162 | . 024 | . 115 |
| ERCW | N3-67-01A | 24.000 | CS | 48Y | . 291 | . 37 | . 250 | . 249 | . 085 | . 167 |
| ERCW | N3-67-01A | 24.000 | cs | 54X | . 268. | . 409 | . 275 | . 296 | . 207 | . 231 |
| ERCN | N3-67-01A | 24.000 | CS | UP4 | . 266 | . 405 | . 270 | . 292 | . 203 | . 228 |
| ERCU | M3-67-01A | 30.000 | CS | $26 E$ | . 258 | . 294 | . 19 | . 186 | . 223 | . 237 |
| ERCN | N3-67-01A | 30.000 | cs | 37 | . 452 | . 598 | . 399 | . 408 | . 405 | . 424 |
| ERCIT | N3-67-02A | 8.625 | cs | 646 | . 170 | . 467 | . 310 | . 377 | . 324 | . 262 |
| ERCW | M3-67-02A | 8.625 | cs | 646a | . 162 | . 444 | . 296 | . 358 | . 344 | . 272 |
| ERCW | M3-67-02A | 8.625 | CS | 124 | . 098 | . 407 | . 270 | . 366 | . 402 | . 281 |
| ERCW | N3-67-02A | 8.625 | CS | P29 | . 095 | . 446 | . 297 | . 407 | . 465 | . 317 |
| ERCH | N3-67-02A | 18.000 | CS | 1298 | . 162 | . 184 | . 122 | . 115 | . 129 | . 142 |
| ERCW | N3-67-02A | 18.000 | Cs | 95 | . 253 | . 410 | . 274 | . 305 | . 019 | . 112 |
| ERCW | N3-67-02A | 18.000 | cs | men | . 273 | . 397. | . 265 | . 283 | . 024 | . 123 |
| ERCW | N3-67-02A | 18.000 | cs | H/OB | . 286 | . 446 | . 297 | . 326 | . 019 | . 126 |
| ERCH | M3-67-02A | 18.000 | CS | H 40 C | . 281 | . 452 | . 301 | . 334 | . 018 | . 122 |
| ERCM | N3-67-02A | 20.000 | cs | 449 | . 247 | . 275 | . 185 | . 169 | . 026 | . 114 |
| ERCH | M3-67-02A | 20.000 | cs | 1942 | . $232^{\circ}$ | . 257 | . 171 | . 457 | . 023 | . 106 |
| ERCW | M3-67-02A | 24.000 | cs | 187 | . 312 | . 463 | . 310 | . 323 | . 616 | . 495 |
| ERCW | M3-67-02A | 24.000 | cs | 188 | . 311 | . 460 | . 307 | . 321 | . 609 | . 490 |
| ERCW | M3-67-02A | 24.000 | cs | 196 | . 339 | . 713 | . 476 | . 538 | . 059 | . 166 |
| ERCW | N3-67-02A | 24.000 | cs | 202 | . 368 | . 659 | . 439 | . 482 | . 032 | . 166 |
| ERCN | N3-67-09A | 4.500 | cs | KK5 | . 095 | . 350 | . 232 | . 303 | 1.164 | . 738 |
| ERCW | N3-67-09A | 4.500 | Ss | 889 | . 092 | . 382 | . 255 | . 341 | . 762 | . 493 |
| ERCS | N3-67-09A | 6.625 | cs ${ }^{1}$ | 5532 | . 194 | . 234 | . 156 | . 150 | . 547 | . 407 |
| ERCM | N3-67-09A | 6.625 | CS | J.12 | . 133 | . 246 | . 163 | . 184 | . 550 | . 383 |
| ERCN | N3-67-09A | 12.750 | CS | V2 | . 232 | . 380 | . 253 | . 273 | . 449 | . 362 |

6-7
(Table 6-1, Continued)

| System | Calc package | O.D. | Hat'l | Node | Eq 8 | Eq 90 | Eq $9 E$ | Eq 9F | Eq 10 | Eq 11 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| ERCW | N3-67-09A | 12.750 | cs | $\sqrt{3}$ | . 155 | . 285 | . 190 | . 211 | . 264 | . 221 |
| ERCW | M3-67-09A | 12.750 | cs | V3A | . 156 | . 280 | . 186 | . 206 | . 256 | . 216 |
| ERCW | M3-67-09A | 12.750 | sS | v13 | . 247 | . 540 | . 360 | . 417 | . 062 | . 135 |
| ERCW | M3-67-09A | 12.750 | ss | V14 | . 287 | . 664 | . 443 | . 519 | . 043 | . 140 |
| ERCW | M3-67-09A | 14.000 | cs | 024 | . 172 | . 284 | . 189 | . 206 | . 048 | . 098 |
| ERCW | N3-67-09A | 14.000 | ss | 021 | . 259 | . 426 | . 283 | . 309 | . 070 | . 145 |
| ERCN | N3-67-09A | 16.000 | cs | 306 Y | . 216. | . 258 | . 179 | . 164 | . 231 | . 225 |
| ERCW | N3-67-09A | 18.000 | cs | 536 | . 228 | . 339 | . 226 | . 237 | . 156 | . 185 |
| ERCW | N3-67-09A | 18.000 | cs | 0906 | . 393 | . 349 | . 232 | . 184 | . 015 | . 166 |
| ERCW | N3-67-09A | 20.000 | cs | 275A | . 279 | . 347 | . 232 | . 222 | . 036 | . 133 |
| ERCW | N3-67-09A | 20.000 | cs | 271 | . 219 | . 305 | . 203 | . 206 | . 027 | . 104 |
| ERCW | N3-67-09A | 24.000 | Cs | 172 | . 293 | . 325 | . 216 | . 196 | . 088 | . 170 |
| ERCW | N3-67-09, | 24.000 | cs | 223 | . 266 | . 292 | . 195 | . 178 | . 476 | . 391 |
| ERCH | N3-67-09A | 30.000 | cs | 4931 | . 293 | . 320 | . 213 | . 193 | . 035 | . 138 |
| ERCN | N3-67-09A | 36.000 | cs | 49 | . 349 | . 516 | . 344 | . 399 | . 297 | . 318 |
| ERCW | N3-67-09A | 36.000 | cs | 595 | . 351 | :342 | . 228 | . 192 | . 202 | . 262 |
| ERCW | N3-67-09A | 36.000 | Cs | 598 | . 358 | . 342 | . 228 | . 191 | . 382 | . 373 |
| ERCW | N3-67-09A | 36.000 | CS | 5984 | . 355 | . 334 | . 223 | . 184 | . 249 | . 292 |
| ERCN | N3-67-09A | 36.000 | Cs | 652 | . 263 | . 543 | . 362 | . 434 | . 150 | . 195 |
| ERCU | N3-67-23A | 4.500 | Cs | 136 | . 151 | . 302 | . 202 | . 232 | . 037 | . 083 |
| ERCM | N3-67-24A | 3.500 | SS | 808 | . 126 | . 326 | . 217 | . 279 | . 173 | . 153 |
| ERCW | . N3-67-24 ${ }^{\text {a }}$ | 3.500 | S5 | B08 | . 140 | . 326 | . 217 | . 271 | . 174 | . 160 |
| ERCH | N3-67-24A | 4.500 | ss | 759 | . 236 | . 285 | . 190 | . 184 | . 082 | . 143 |
| ERCW | N3-67-24A | 6.625 | CS | 702 | . 236 | . 409 | . 268 | . 300 | . 044 | . 121 |
| ERCN | N3-67-24A | 6.625 | CS | 702A | . 224 | . 421 | . 281 | . 321 | . 023 | . 104 |
| ERCN | U3-67-24A | 6.625 | CS | 705 | . 289 | . 488 | . 326 | . 359 | . 045 | . 142 |
| ERCW | N3-67-24A | 6.625 | CS | 710 | . 136 | . 436 | . 290 | . 361 | . 013 | . 061 |
| ERCU | N3-67-24A | 6.625 | CS | 711 | . 120 | . 416 | . 277 | . 348 | . 012 | . 055 |
| ERCM | N3-67-24A | 6.625 | CS | 720 | . 294 | . 575 | . 384 | . 436 | . 020 | . 130 |
| ERCU | N3-67-24A | 6.625 | cs | $\times 710$ | . 114 | . 420 | . 279 | . 353 | . 013 | . 053 |
| ERCW | N3-67-24A | 6.625 | CS | 2705 | . 265 | . 478 | . 319 | . 359 | . 048 | . 134 |
| ERCW | N3-67-24A | 6.625 | ss | c1 | . 094 | . 181 | . 120 | . 141 | . 654 | . 431 |
| ERCN | N3-67-24A | 6.625 | SS | c37 | . 313 | . 559 | . 373 | . 414 | . 029 | . 142 |
| ERCW | N3-67-24A | 6.625 | Ss | C38 | . 370 | . 648 | . 432 | . 478 | . 036 | . 169 |
| ERCN | N3-67-24A | 6.625 | SS | C4 1 | . 952 | . 427 | . 285 | . 348 | . 566 | . 400 |
| ERCN | M3-67-24A | 8.625 | ss | 805 | . $103{ }^{\circ}$ | . 144 | . 096 | . 102 | . 017 | . 051 |
| ERCN | N3-67-24A | 8.625 | ss | E48 | . 074 | . 062 | . 068 | . 032 | 1.389 | . 863 |
| ERCN | N3-67-39A | 2.875 | Ss | 14. | . 123 | . 223 | . 168 | . 179 | . 027 | . 065 |
| ERCW | N3-67-39A | 2.875 | Ss | B05 | . 164 | . 273 | . 207 | . 194 | . 051 | . 097 |
| ERCU | N3-67-39A | 2.875 | SS | C208 | . 064 | . 096 | . 068 | . 067 | . 290 | . 200 |
| ERCN | N3-67-39A | 2.875 | SS | C20e | . 063 | . 097 | . 068 | . 069 | . 275 | . 190 |
| ERCU | N3-67-39A | 3.500 | SS | 190 | . 070 | . 160 | . 110 | . 087 | . 185 | . 139 |
| ERCW | N3-67-39A | 4.500 | cs | C12B | . 071 | . 094 | . 069 | . 067 | . 617 | . 399 |
| ERCM | N3-67-39A | 4.500 | cs | C12E | . 060 | . 085 | . 058 | . 059 | . 585 | . 375 |
| ERCN | N3-67-39A | 4.500 | CS | C17 ${ }^{\text {P }}$ | . 136 | . 393 | . 304 | . 349 | . 079 | . 101 |
| ERCW | N3-67-39A | 6.625 | CS | 99 | . 080 | . 097 | . 066 | . 064 | . 158 | . 128 |

(Table 6-1, Continued)

| System | Cale package | O.D. | Mat'l | Node | Eq 8 | Eq 90 | Eq $9 E$ | Eq 9F | Eq 10 | Eq 11 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| ERCW | N3-67-39A | 6.625 | ss | 131 | . 103 | . 099 | . 066 | . 056 | . 836 | . 543 |
| ERCW | N3-67-39A | 6.625 | SS | 137 | . 082 | . 082 | . 054 | . 048 | . 516 | . 343 |
| ERCW | N3-67-39A | 6.625 | SS | 145 | . 261 | . 293 | . 196 | . 193 | . 045 | . 130 |
| ERCM | N3-67-39A | 6.625 | ss | 146 | . 166 | . 172 | . 115 | . 106 | . 138 | . 149 |
| ERCW | N3-67-39A | 6.625 | sS | P15M | . 067 | . 062 | . 041 | . 033 | . 535 | . 347 |
| ERCW | N3-67-43A | 2.875 | ss | 40 | . 039 | . 169 | . 137 | . 159 | . 227 | . 151 |
| ERCW | N3-67-43A | 2.875 | SS | 62 | . 056 | . 158 | . 109 | . 133 | . 232 | . 162 |
| ERCN | N3-67-43A | 2.875 | SS | C028 | . 056 | . 158 | . 109 | . 132 | . 234 | . 163 |
| ERCW | N3-67-43A | 2.875 | ss | CO2E | . 043 | . 144 | . 105 | . 125 | . 247 | . 166 |
| ERCW | N3-67-43A | 3.500 | Cs | 490 | . 206 | . 351 | . 234 | . 258 | . 432 | . 342 |
| ERCW | N3-67-43A | 3.500 | CS | 500 M | . 246 | . 400 | . 267 | . 290 | . 464 | . 376 |
| ERCW | N3-67-43A | 3.500 | ss | 24 | . 056 | . 092 | . 061 | . 067 | 1.410 | . 867 |
| ERCN | N3-67-43A | 3.500 | ss | B038 | . 093 | . 372 | . 255 | . 204 | . 671 | . 439 |
| ERCN | N3-67-43A | 3.500 | SS | B04E | . 077 | . 291 | . 201 | . 166 | . 597 | . 389 |
| ERCW | N3-67-43A | 3.500 | SS | B05B | . 049 | . 156 | . 106 | . 084 | 1.241 | . 764 |
| ERCN | R3-67-43A | 3.500 | SS | 8068 | . 077 | . 102 | . 072 | . 071 | 1.304 | . 812 |
| ERCW | M3-67-43A | 3.500 | SS | B06E | . 066 | . 101 | . 068 | . 072 | 1.530 | 1.010 |
| ERCW | N3-67-43A | 4.500 | cs | C158 | . 070 | . 141 | . 103 | . 116 | . 537 | . 349 |
| ERCW | M3-67-43A | 4.500 | cs | FLO2 | . 080 | . 163 | . 108 | . 126 | . 705 | . 454 |
| ERCN | N3-67-43A | 4.500 | SS | 100 L | . 062 | . 106 | . 081 | . 076 | . 041 | . 050 |
| ERCW | N3-67-43A | 4.500 | SS | 100 M | . 092 | . 215 | . 110 | . 097 | . 098 | . 096 |
| ERCW | N3-67-43A | 6.625 | CS | 500 N | . 099 | . 115 | . 076 | . .072 | . 281 | . 209 |
| ERCW | N3-67-43A | 6.625 | SS | 750 | . 143 | . 153 | . 102 | . 089 | . 230 | . 196 |
| ERCW | N3-67-43A | 6.625 | SS | 770 | . 099 | . 112 | . 075 | . 069 | . 202 | . 161 |
| ERCH | N3-67-43A | 6.625 | SS | P123 | . 171 | . 238 | . 159 | . 157 | . 029 | . 087 |
| ERCU | N3-76-34A | 4.500 | CS | 40 | . 078 | . 072 | . 048 | . 039 | . 171 | . 134 |
| SFC | U3-78-0142 | 8.625 | SS | 577 | . 174 | . 360 | . 239 | . 275 | . 059 | . 104 |
| SFC | M3-78-0142 | 10.750 | SS | 80 | . 092 | . 141 | . 095 | . 101 | . 016 | . 045 |
| SFC | N3-78-0103 | 3.500 | SS | 502 | . 081 | . 332 | . 221 | . 300 | . 681 | . 447 |
| SFC | N3-78-01A3 | 3.500 | 55 | 512 | . 115 | . 139 | . 093 | . 091 | . 781 | . 522 |
| SFC | U3-78-0143 | 3.500 | ss | 622 | . 043 | . 487 | . 324 | . 467 | . 048 | . 046 |
| SFC | W3-78-01A3 | 3.500 | ss | 906 | . 050 | . 058 | . 039 | . 037 | . 536 | . 348 |
| SFC | N3-78-0143 | 3.500. | SS | 908 | . 081 | . 109 | . 073 | . 075 | 1.169 | . 746 |
| SFC | K3-78-01A3 | 3.500 | SS | 909 | . 070 | . 086 | . 058 | . 057 | . 807 | . 520 |
| SFC | N3-78-01A3 | 4.500 | Ss | 383 | . 155 | . 191 | . 127 | . 125 | . 022 | . 074 |
| SFC | N3-78-01A3 | 10.730 | SS | 1204 | . 080 | . 139 | . 093 | . 105 | . 281 | . 204 |
| SFC | N3-78-01A3 | 10.750 | ss | 1208 | . 090 | . 144 | . 097 | . 107 | . 268 | . 199 |
| SFC | N3-78-01A3 | 10.750 | ss | 331 | . 076 | . 109 | . 072 | . 076 | . 199 | . 151 |
| SFC | N3-73-01A4 | 10.730 | SS | 182 | . 082 | . 392 | . 262 | . 340 | . 020 | . 044 |
| SFC | M3-73-12A | 3.500 | SS | 255 | . 035 | . 046 | . 031 | . 032 | . 613 | . 388 |
| SFC | N3-78-12A | 3.500 | SS | 30 | . 038 | . 046 | . 030 | . 029 | 1.081 | . 675 |
| SFC | N3-78-12A | 3.500 | SS | 36 | . 037 | . 046 | . 029 | . 026 | . 993 | . 621 |
| SFC | N3-78-12A | 3.500 | SS | 37 | . 035 | . 040 | . 026 | . 024 | . 871 | . 545 |
| SFC | N3-78-12A | 3.500 | SS | 55 | . 071 | . 069 | . 046 | . 038 | . 311 | . 218 |

Table 6-2
RESULTS OF SECTION XI ANALYSIS FOR NODES WITH WELD SIFs

| System | Calc package | O.D. | Mat'l | Node | $\begin{gathered} a / t \\ (N / U) \end{gathered}$ | theta/pi (N/U) | $\begin{gathered} s / t \\ (E / F) \end{gathered}$ | theta/pi (E/F) | $\begin{gathered} a / t \\ \text { (fatigue) } \end{gathered}$ | theta/pi (fatigue) | mode <br> (N/U) | mode <br> (E/F) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| AUXFU | 06 |  | CS |  |  |  |  | . 400 | . 481 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 2.375 | CS | 646x | . 447 | . 400 | . 733 | . 400 | . 509 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 2.375 | CS | 6472 | . 492 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | . 461 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 4:500 | cs | 125 | . 679 | . 400 | . 679 | . 400 | 1.000 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 4.500 | cs | 125Y | . 690 | . 400 | . 720 | . 400 | 1.000 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 4.500 | cs | 127 | . 750 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | 1.000 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 4.500 | CS | 1278 | . 750 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | 1.000 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 4.500 | CS | 128 | . 527 | . 400 | . 505 | . 400 | 1.000 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 4.500 | CS | 138 | . 638 | . 400 | . 641 | . 400 | 1.000 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| AUXFW | .0600200-02-05 | 4.500 | CS | 130 | . 637 | . 400 | . 632 | . 400 | 1.000 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 4.500 | cs | 164A | . 588 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | 1.000 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| - AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 4.500 | cs | 195 | . 442 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | . 452 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 4.500 | cs | 196 | . 488 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | . 451 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| AUSFW | 0600200-02-05 | 4.500 | CS | 19X | . 545 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | . 451 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 4.500 | cs | 86 | . 568 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | . 450 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 4.500 | CS | 90 | . 750 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | . 468 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 6.625 | CS | 13 | . 706 | . 400 | . 060 | . 400 | . 468 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 6.625 | cs | 44 | . 726 | . 400 | . 531 | . 400 | . 501 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 6.625 | CS | 55 | . 690 | . 400 | . 000 | . 400 | . 489 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| /AUXFU | 0600200-02-05 | 6.625 | CS | 55A | . 750 | . 400 | . 250 | . 400 | . 497 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| AUXFU | 0600200-02-05 | 6.625 | cs | 8 | . 584 | . 400 | . 521 | . 400 | . 597 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| AUXFM | 0600200-02-05 | 6.625 | cs | 93A | . 601 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | . 455 | . 400 | LEFM | LEFM |
| ausfu | 0600200-02-05 | 6.625 | cs | 813 | . 658 | . 400 | . 000 | . 400 | . 489 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 16.000 | cs | 2A | . 750 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | . 450 | . 400 | Limit | Limit |
| AUSFW | 0600200-02-05 | 16.000 | CS | 2 Ca | . 750 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | . 450 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 16.000 | cs | 2 E | . 750 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | . 450 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 16.000 | CS | 2EA | . 750 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | . 450 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 16.000 | CS | $2 F$ | . 750 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | . 450 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 16.000 | cs | 22 | . 750 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | . 450 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 16.000 | CS | 22A | . 750 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | . 450 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-08 | 4.500 | CS | 222 | . 452 | . 400 | . 577 | . 400 | 1.000 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-08 | 4.500 | CS | 222A | . 488 | . 400 | . 611 | . 400 | . 1.000 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| AUXFW | N3-03-05A | 4.500 | CS | 717 | . 171 | . 400 | . 574 | . 400 | . 453 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| AUSFW | N3-03-05A | 4.500 | cs | 729 | . 000 | . 400 | . 354 | . 400 | 1.000 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| AUSFW | N3-03-05A | 4.500 | cs | 7292 | . 000 | . 400 | . 402 | . 400 | . 634 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| AUXFW | M3-03-05A | 4.500 | CS | 120 | . 657 | . 400 | .750 | . 400 | . 451 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| AUXFW | N3-03-05A | 4.500 | cs | 124 | . 420 | . 400 | . 736 | . 400 | . 451 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| AUXFW | M3-03-05A | 4.500 | cs | A48 | . 000 | . 400 | . 440 | . 400 | . 560 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| AUXFY | N3-03-05A | 4.500 | CS | 150 | . 000 | . 400 | . 438 | . 400 | . 719 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| AUXFW | M3-03-05A | 4.500 | cs | 152 | . 020 | . 400 | . 468 | . 400 | . 584 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| AUXFW | N3-03-05A ${ }^{1}$ | 8.625 | cs | $23 \%$ | . 730 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | . 450 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| AUXFW | N3-03-05A | 8.625 | cs | IN22 | . 750 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | . 450 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| AUXFW | N3-03.05A | 8.625 | CS | IN23 | . 750 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | . 450 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| AUXFW | 13-03-05A | 8.625 | cs | IN24 | . 750 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | . 450 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| AUXFW | N3-03-05A | 8.625 | CS | IN25 | . 750 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | . 450 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |

6-10
(Table 6-2, Continued)

| System | Calc package | O.D. | Mat'l | Node | $\begin{gathered} a / t \\ (N / U) \end{gathered}$ | theta/pi <br> (N/U) | $\begin{aligned} & a / t \\ & (E / F) \end{aligned}$ | theta/pi (E/F) | $\begin{gathered} a / t \\ \text { (fatigue) } \end{gathered}$ | theta/pi <br> (fatigue) | mode <br> (N/U) | mode <br> (E/F) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| AUXFU | N3-03-05A | 8.625 | cs | IN26 | . 750 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | . 450 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| AUXFU | N3-03-13A | 3.500 | cs | 153 | . 353 | . 400 | . 655 | . 400 | . 450 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| AUXFV | N3-03-13A | 3.500 | cs | 154 | . 452 | . 400 | . 722 | . 400 | . 450 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| AUXFW | N3-03-13A | 4.500 | cs | 100 | . 750 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | . 614 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| AUXFW | N3-03-13A | 4.500 | cs | 106 | . 750 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | . 451 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| AUSFL | N3-03-13A | 4.500 | cs | 148 | . 750 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | . 451 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| AUXFY | N3-03-13A | 4.500 | cs | 158 | . 750 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | . 451 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| AUXFW | N3-03-13A | 4.500 | cs | 356 | . 750 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | . 450 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| AUXIFU | N3-03-13A | 4.500 | cs | 368 | . 724 | . 400 | . 730 | . 400 | 1.000 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| AUXFL | N3-03-13A | 4.500 | cs | PK | . 660 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | 1.000 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| AUXFY | N3-03-13A | 4.500 | cs | PW1 | . 393 | . 400 | . 491 | . 400 | 1.000 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| ERCW | N3-67-01A | 8.625 | cs | 4497 | . 750 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | 1.000 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| ERCW | N3-67-014 ${ }^{\text {- }}$ | 8.625 | CS | 473E | . 750 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | -. 450 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| ERCW | N3-67-01A | 8.625 | CS | IEB | . 750 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | . 975 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| ERCW | N3-67-01A | 8.625 | cs | LYM | . 750 | . 400 | . 730 | . 400 | . 453 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| ERCW | N3-67-01A | 0.625 | ss | 737X | . 750 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | . 458 | . 400 | Limit | Linit |
| ERCW | N3-67-01A | 8.625 | ss | 417 | . 750 | . 400 | . 730 | . 400 | . 452 | . 400 | Limit | Limit |
| ERCW | N3-67-01A | 18.000 | CS | 224 | . 750 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | . 450 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| ERCW | N3-67-01A | 18.000 | CS | 224A | . 750 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | . 450 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| ERCW | M3-67-01A | 18.000 | CS | FL20 | . 750 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | . 450 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| ERCM | N3-67-01A | 18.000 | cs | up14A | . 750 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | . 450 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| ERCW | R3-67-01A | 24.000 | Cs | 48Y | . 665 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | . 450 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFIM |
| ERCW | N3-67-01A | 24.000 | cs | 54X | . 503 | . 400 | . 723 | . 400 | . 453 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| ERCW | N3-67-01A | 24.000 | cs | UPh | . 514 | . 400 | . 733 | .400 | . 452 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| ERCW | 43-67-01A | 30.000 | cs | $26 E$ | . 568 | . 400 | . 730 | . 400 | . 456 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| ERCW | .N3-67-01A | 30.000 | CS | 37 | . 000 | . 400 | . 121 | . 400 | . 533 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| ERCW | N3-67-02A | 8.625 | cs | 646 | . 726 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | . 453 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| ERCU | N3-67-02A | 8.625 | cs | 6464 | . 742 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | . 454 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| ERCW | N3-67-02A | 8.625 | cs | 124 | . 730 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | . 460 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| ERCW | M3-67-02A | 8.625 | cs | P21 | . 676 | . 400 | . 723 | . 400 | . 473 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| ERCN | N3-67-02A | 18.000 | cs | 1298 | . 750 | . 400 | . 730 | . 400 | . 450 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| ERCW | N3-67-02A | 18.000 | cs | 95 | . 730 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | . 450 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| ERCW | N3-67-02A | 18.000 | cs | M $40 \mathrm{~A}^{\circ}$ | . 750 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | . 450 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| ERCW | N3-67-02A | 18.000 | cs | H 408 | . 730 | . 400 | . 730 | . 400 | . 450 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| ERCW | N3-67-02A | 18.000 | cs | M 40 C | . 723 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | . 450 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| ERCW | M3-67-02A | 20.000 | cs | 449 | . 750 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | . 450 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| ERCM | N3-67-02A | 20.000 | cs | 1142 | . 750 | . 400 | . 730 | . 400 | . 450 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| ERCW | N3-67-02A | 24.000 | cs | 187 | . 000 | . 400 | . 318 | . 400 | 1.000 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| ERCW | N3-67-02A | 24.000 | cs | 188 | . 000 | . 400 | . 330 | . 400 | 1.000 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| ERCM | N3-67-02A | 24.000 | cs | 196 | . 000 | . 400 | . 400 | . 400 | . 450 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| ERCW | N3-67-02A | 24.000 | cs | 202 | . 138 | . 400 | . 528 | . 400 | . 450 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| ERCM | N3-67-09A | 4.500 | cs | KK5 | . 750 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | . 552 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| ERCW | M3-67-09A | 4.500 | ss | 889 | . 750 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | . 476 | . 400 | Limit | Limit |
| ERCM | N3-67-09A | 6.625 | CS | 5532 | . 750 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | . 452 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| ERCN | N3-67-09A | 6.625 | cs | JJ2 | . 750 | . 400 | . 730 | . 400 | . 451 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| ERCN | N3-67-09A | 12.750 | cs | V2 | . 683 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | . 482 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |

(Table 6-2, Continued)
a/t theta/pi a/t theta/pi a/t theta/pi mode mode


6-12

- 1 PQI APTECN
(Table 6-2, Continued)

| System | Calc package | O.D. | Mat'l | Mode | $\begin{gathered} a / t \\ (N / U) \end{gathered}$ | theta/pi <br> (N/U) | $\begin{gathered} a / t \\ (E / F) \end{gathered}$ | theta/pi (E/F) | a/t <br> (fatigue) | theta/pi <br> (fatigue) | mode <br> (N/U) | mode $(E / F)$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| ERCY | N3.67-30.-3. | -0.0.0. | ss | 131 | -...- | 400 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| ERCN | H3-67-39A | 6.625 | SS | 137 | . 730 | . 400 | . 730 | . 400 | . 454 | . 400 | Limit | Limit |
| ERCW | M3-67-39A | 6.625 | ss | 145 | . 750 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | . 450 | . 400 | Limit | Limit |
| ERCW | N3-67-39A | 6.625 | ss | 146 | . 750 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | . 450 | . 400 | Limit | Limit |
| ERCN | N3-67-39A | 6.625 | SS | P15M | . 750 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | . 454 | . 400 | Limit | Limit |
| ERCN | N3-67-43A | 2.875 | SS | 40 | .750 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | . 450 | . 400 | Limit | Limit |
| ERCN | N3-67-43A | 2.875 | SS | 62 | . 750 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | . 450 | . 400 | Limit | Limi |
| ERCU | N3-67-43A | 2.875 | SS | C028 | . 750 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | . 450 | . 400 | Limit | Limi |
| ERCW | N3-67-43A | 2.875 | ss | CO2E | . 750 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | . 450 | . 400 | Limit | Limit |
| ERCW | N3-67-43A | 3.500 | cs | 490 | . 750 | . 400 | . 730 | . 400 | . 450 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| ERCW | N3-67-43A | 3.500 | cs | 500\% | . 750 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | . 450 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| ERCW | N3-67-43A | 3.500 | SS | 24 | . 750 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | . 736 | . 400 | Limit | Limit |
| ERCW | N3-67-43A | 3.500 | SS | B038 | . 750 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | . 457 | . 400 | Limit | Limit |
| ERCU | N3-67-43A | 3.500 | ss | B04E | . 750 | . 400 | . 730 | . 400 | . 454 | . 400 | Limit | Limit |
| ERCN | N3-67-43A | 3.500 | 5s | 8058 | . 750 | . 400 | . 730 | . 400 | . 551 | . 400 | Limit | Limit |
| ERCN | N3-67-43A | 3.500 | ss | 8068 | . 750 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | . 590 | . 400 | Limit | Limit |
| ERCH | N3-67-43A | 3.500 | ss | B06E | . 750 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | 1.000 | . 400 | Limit | Limit |
| ERCH | N3-67-43A | 4.500 | cs | C158 | . 730 | . 400 | . 730 | . 400 | . 451 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| ERCW | N3-67-43A | 4.500 | cs | FLO2 | . 750 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | .454 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| ERCN | N3-67-43A | 4.500 | SS | 100L | . 750 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | . 450 | . 400 | Limit | Limit |
| ERCN | N3-67-43A | 4.500 | SS | 100\% | $.750^{\circ}$ | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | . 450 | . 400 | Limit | Limit |
| ERCW | N3-67-43A | 6.625 | cs | 500N | . 750 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | . 450 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| ERCU | N3-67-43A | 6.625 | SS | 750 | . 730 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | . 450 | . 400 | Linit | Limit |
| ERCM | N3-67-43A | 6.625 | SS | 770 | . 750 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | . 450 | . 400 | Limit | Limit |
| ERCW | R3-67-43A | 6.625 | SS | P123 | . 750 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | . 450 | . 400 | Limit | Limit |
| ERCW | N3-76-34A | 4.500 | CS | 40 | . 750 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | . 450 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| SFC | N3-78-01A2 | 8.625 | ss | 577 | .750 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | . 450 | . 400 | Limit | Limit |
| SFC | N3-78-0142 | 10.750 | ss | 80 | . 750 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | . 450 | . 600 | Limit | Linit |
| SFC | U3-78-01A3 | 3.500 | ss | 502 | . 750 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | . 461 | . 400 | Limit | Limit |
| SFC | 133-78-01A3 | 3.500 | ss | 512 | . 750 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | . 470 | . 400 | Limit | Limit |
| SFC | N3-78-0143 | 3.500 | SS | 622 | . 750 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | . 450 | . 400 | Limit | Liait |
| SFC | N3-78-01A3 | 3.500 | SS | 906 | . 750 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | . 454 | . 400 | Limit | Limit |
| SfC | U3-78-01A3 | 3.500 | ss | 908 | . 750 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | . 605 | . 400 | Limit | Limit |
| SFC | 143-78-0143 | 3.500 | ss | 909 | . 750 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | . 473 | . 400 | Limit | Limit |
| SFC | M3-78-0143 | 4.500 | SS | 383 | . 750 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | . 450 | . 400 | Limit | Linit |
| SFC | N3-78-01A3 | 10.750 | ss | 1200 | . 750 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | . 458 | . 400 | Limit | Limit |
| SFC | N3-78-01A3 | 10.730 | ss | 1208 | . 750 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | $\cdot .457$ | . 400 | Limit | Limit |
| SFC | M3-78-01A3 | 10.750 | SS | 331 | . 750 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | . 453 | . 400 | Limit | Limit |
| sfe | M3-78-01A4 | 10.750 | SS | 182 | . 750 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | . 450 | . 400 | Limit | Limit |
| SFC | M3-78-12A | 3.500 | SS | 255 | . 730 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | . 458 | . 400 | Limit | Linit |
| SfC | N3-78-12A | 3.500 | SS | 30 | . 750 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | . 543 | . 400 | Limit | Limit |
| SFC | M3-78-12A | 3.500 | SS | 36 | . 750 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | . 509 | . 400 | Limit | Limit |
| SFC | N3-78-12A | 3.500 | ss | 37 | . 750 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | . 482 | . 400 | Limit | Limit |
| SFC | N3-78-12A | 3.500 | SS | 55 | . 750 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400. | . 451 | . 400 | Limit | Limit |

Table 6-3

## SUMMARY OF NODES THAT FAILED THE SECTION XI ACCEPTANCE CRITERIA

| System | Calc package | O.D. | Mat'l | Node | $\begin{gathered} a / t \\ (N / U) \end{gathered}$ | theta/pi (N/U) | $\begin{gathered} a / t \\ (E / F) \end{gathered}$ | theta/pi. (E/F) | $\begin{gathered} a / t \\ \text { (fatigue) } \end{gathered}$ | theta/pi (fatigue) | mode <br> (N/U) | mode <br> (E/F) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| -.....- |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| AUXFU | 0600200-02-05 | 2.375 | Cs | 646 | . 437 | . 400 | . 729 | . 400 | . 481 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 2.375 | cs | 646x | . 447 | . 400 | . 733 | . 400 | . 509 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| AUXFK | 0600200-02-05 | 4.500 | CS | 125 | . 679 | . 400 | . 679 | . 400 | 1.000 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 4.500 | CS | 125Y | . 690 | . 400 | . 720 | . 400 | 1.000 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 4.500 | cs | 127 | . 750 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | 1.000 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 4.500 | cs | 1278 | . 750 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | 1.000 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 4.500 | CS | 128 | . 527 | . 400 | . 505 | . 400 | 1.000 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| AUXFU | 0600200-02-05 | 4.500 | Cs | 13 P | . 638 | . 400 | . 641 | . 400 | 1.000 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 4.500 | Cs | 139 | . 637 | . 400 | . 632 | . 400 | 1.000 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 4.500 | CS | 164A | . 588 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | 1.000 | . 400 | EPFK | EPFM |
| AUXFU | 0600200-02-05 | 4.500 | cs | 195 | . 442 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | . 452 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 6.625 | cs | 13 | . 706 | . 400 | . 060 | . 400 | . 468 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| MUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 6.625 | CS | 55 | . 690 | . 400 | . 000 | . 400 | . 489 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 6.625 | CS | 55A | . 750 | . 400 | . 250 | . 400 | . 497 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| AUXFY | 0600200-02-05 | 6.625 | Cs | 8 | . 584 | . 400 | . 521 | . 400 | . 597 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 6.625 | CS | 813 | . 658 | . 400 | . 000 | . 400 | . 489 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-08 | 4.500 | Cs | 222 | . 452 | . 400 | . 577 | . 400 | 1.000 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-08 | 4.500 | CS | 222A | . 488 | . 400 | . 619 | . 400 | 1.000 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| AUXFW | N3-03-05A | 4.500 | CS | 717 | . 171 | . 400 | . 574 | . 400 | . 453 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM. |
| AUXFW | N3-03-05A | 4.500 | Cs | 729 | . 000 | . 400 | . 354 | . 400 | 1.000 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM ${ }^{\circ}$ |
| AUXFW | N3-03-05A | 4.500 | Cs | 7292 | . 000 | . 400 | . 402 | . 400 | . 634 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| AUXFW | *3-03-05A | 4.500 | Cs | 124 | . 620 | . 400 | . 736 | . 400 | . 451 | :400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| NUXFW | N3-03-05A | 4.500 | CS | 448 | . 000 | . 400 | . 440 | . 400 | . 560 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| AUXFW | M3-03-05A | 4.500 | cs | 150 | . 000 | . 400 | . 438 | . 400 | . 719 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| AUXFU | M3-03-05A | 4.500 | cs | 252 | . 020 | . 400 | . 468 | . 400 | . 584 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| AUXFU | N3-03-13A | 3.500 | CS | 153 | . 353 | . 400 | . 655 | . 400 | . 450 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| AUXFW | M3-03-13A | 4.500 | cs | 368 | . 724 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | 1.000 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| AUXFW | N3-03-13A | 4.500 | cs | PK | . 660 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | 1.000 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| AUXFW | N3-03-13A | 4.500 | cs | PW1 | . 393 | . 400 | . 491 | . 400 | 1.000 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| ERCW | N3-67-01A | 8.625 | CS | $449 \%$ | . 750 | . 600 | . 750 | . 400 | 1.000 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| ERCN | M3-67-01A | 8.625 | CS | IEB | . 750 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | . 975 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| ERCU | U3-67-01A | 30.000 | cs | 37 | . 000 | . 400 | . 121 | . 400 | . 533 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| ERCH | W3-67-02A | 26.000 | cs | 187 | . 000 | . 400 | . 318 | . 600 | 1.000 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| ERCH | M3-67-02A | 24.000 | cs | 188 | . 000 | . 400 | . 330 | . 400 | 1.000 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| ERCN | N3-67-02A | 26.000 | cs | 196 | . 000 | . 400 | . 400 | . 400 | . 450 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| ERCW | M3-67-02A | 24.000 | cs | 202 | . 138 | . 400 | . 528 | . 400 | . 450 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| ERCN | N3-67-09A | 24.000 | Cs | 223 | . 696 | . 400 | . 720 | . 400 | . 616 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| ERCN | N3-67-09A | 36.000 | Cs | 49 | . 000 | . 400 | . 000 | . 600 | . 505 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| ERCN | N3-67-09A | 36.000 | cs | 595 | . 315 | . 400 | . 720 | . 400 | . 458 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| ERCW | N3-67-09A | 36.000 | Cs | 598 | . 075 | . 400 | . 531 | .400 | . 562 , | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| ERCW | N3-67-09A | 36.000 | CS | 5984 | . 278 | . 400 | . 690 | . 400 | . 465 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| ERCN | N3-67-09A | 36.000 | CS | 652 | . 000 | . 400 | . 000 | . 400 | . 454 | . 400 | EPFM | EPFM |
| ERCN | M3-67-24A | 8.625 | ss | E48 | . 750 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | 1.000 | . 400 | Limit | Limit |
| ERCN | M3-67-63A | 3.500 | ss | B06E | . 750 | . 400 | . 750 | . 400 | 1.000 | . 400 | Limit | Limi |

## Section 7

## SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS

- A random sampling procedure was used to characterize the extent of LOP/LOF in Class 3 weids at WBN. The procedure included checks that demonstrated homogeneity.
- A statistical analysis identified one welder (6EL) whose workmanship was judged substandard. All other suspects were found to be equal to the general population when additional RT samples were analyzed. On this basis, the inspection data for 6EL welder were removed from the database.
- Inspection data from the sample of Class 3 welds (i.e., all data minus 6EL data) showed that the bounding flaw size ( $95 \%$ reliability at $95 \%$ confidence) is $18 \%$ of the pipe section area.
- Stress data for the three systems judged to be the most highly stressed have been . reviewed to identify bounding stress levels for input to the analysis.
- Using conservative combinations of flaw size, flaw location and stresses, flaw evaluations were performed.
- The stress results of the flaw evaluations were compared with the stress requirements of ASME Section III. Nine of the nodes analyzed failed to meet Section III allowables when the effect of LOP/LOF on the net section was considered.
- The flaw evaluations based on Section XI acceptance criteria showed that 44 total nodes (potential weld locations) could not tolerate the bounding flaw. All of the nodes that failed Section III also failed Section XI.
- The 44 non-conforming nodes (potential weld locations) were further evaluated with the following results. Thirty-four node locations did not correspond to Class 3 weld locations. The ten remaining welds were dispositioned on a case-by-case basis.
- On the basis of the above analyses, we conclude that there is high confidence that all welds that fall within the scope of this project meet the allowable stress requirements of ASME Sections III and XI.
- To evaluate the welds which had LOP LOF in excess of $18 \%$, the assessments were repeated using location specific flaw data and stress information. This evaluation, which included all inspectiondata including 6EL, confirmed that all inspectedlocations
satisfied the allowable stress limits of ASME Sections III and XI. Therefore, the observed conditions would not have caused a safety issue if the existing conditions had gone undetected prior to plant operation.


## Section 8

## APPLICATION OF THESE ANALYSES TO WATTS BAR NUCLEAR PLANT, UNIT 2

### 8.1 INTRODUCTION

The analyses described in this report have been developed to cover the scope identified in Section 1. This covers Class 3 welds at WBN, Unit 1, and the common systems required for Unit 1 and start-up. This section outlines recommendations to apply the results to Unit 2.

### 8.2 BACKGROUND

Although Unit 2 construction was behind Unit 1 in time, there are factors that indicate the same weld quality may be expected in Unit 1 as Unit 2. From the upper tier documents (PSAR) through to the same crafts-people there are common factors between Unit 1 and Unit 2. This fact was established by the WEP, Phase II.

### 8.3 STRATEGY FOR UNIT 2

Based on the above expected similarities in weld quality between Units 1 and 2 the following steps will ensure that the Unit 2 weids meet the design requirements:

1. Check to see if the substandard welder worked on Unit 2
2. If yes, check all those welds with RT
3. Perform a reduced sample of RT to confirm the $95 \% / 95 \%$ bounding flaw size from Unit 1 data. An hypothesis can be set up to check this; it can be confirmed with about 20 samples.
4. Scan the Unit 2 stress analysis packages to determine that the highest stresses in the Unit 1 analysis also would envelop Unit 2 stresses.

## 8-2

5. Perform limited analyses to evaluate ASME Section III and Section XI criteria

These tasks will lead to the conclusion that the Unit 2 LOP/LOF issue is adequately covered by the present analysis on Unit 1.

Appendix A
RADIOGRAPHIC TESTING EXAMINATION RESULTS

 one $12 / 18 / 90$ cerate ir $\qquad$ we cr


 . Mat. Size Thk
.-.... ....... ......



3 cs/cs 3.0N . $216^{n}$ 1-0700-0162-03
0 CS/CS 4.0" .438" 1-003c-0007-07
9 ss/cs 8.0" .322" 1-0670-1045-07
3 cs/Cs 6.0" .562" 1-003C-N242-03
6 5s/cs 8.0" . $322^{\prime \prime}$ 2-0670-1046-06
1 ss/Cs 8.0w .322" 2-0670-7068-15
P CS/CS 4.0" .216" 1-070A-0141-03
3 CS/CS 4.0w .438" 1-0708-0163-05

3 CS/CS 4.0" .438" 1-003C-0006-07
7 cs/cs 2.5" .154" 1.0708-D179-07
5 cs/cs $6.0^{\omega} \quad .562^{n} \quad$ 1.003C-0008-05
5 CS/CS 4.0m .438m 1-003c-0005-11
2 cs/cs 6.0" .562n 1-003c-0006-11
3 cs/cs 4.0n .438" 1-070A-0183-03
6 cs/Cs 3.0" .216" 1.0708-0172-20C

3 cs/cs 10.0n $\quad .365^{n} \quad 2.067 \mathrm{C}-1047-15$

$2, .125, .5, .09, .56, .1, .372 .25, .0625, .125, .125, .187525 .99 \sim 16.42^{n} 63.2 \chi$. 038 APJECH (COnt) $.625,2.375, .5$ 5,3,1.375,.25,.675,1,.95 ,.375,.125,.25,3.125,1.25, .1.3,.8,2.75,.57 LOF .375,2.125,1.0625,1.5,.125
0.4 porositr 0.625 MIC NO LOP/LOF
" $\quad \cdots \quad x$
no ImoIcailiows same

0.02 HIC . NO LOP/LOF

10.16 MIC NO LOP/LOF

2,2.56,.375,.425,22.0 1.625,2.5,.25,.3125,.375,. 33.76 ~27.36"
IP . $325+$ MIC
75,.1875,.875,.375,1.25,17
75.
.75

REPLACED-ML_1-003C-0008-02A dissimilar meld - hic looks StRAMGE

MEXT 1O-1-0708-D172-208 (ITEM (\#44)
APJECH (cont) .625,2.375,.5 UT DEPTH <. 220 LOF HO THK REXRAY CAP GROUHO
81.0\% . 072 . 150 . 390 EXTRA WLD wXI 10 \#63 - UT 124.90 a $\mathrm{t}=2 \mathrm{~T}^{-28^{n}}=.150$
jared ay $\qquad$ date $12 / 18 / 90$

sared ay
Soty $1 / 010$ date $L 2 / 4 \delta /$ Chilcckeo dr $\square$ DNE $\frac{1 \cdot / 11_{1}^{\prime}}{1} 90$

PARED or



## LOP DEFECT THROUGH WALL THICKNESS DETERMINATION USING H\&D DENSITIES FROM RADIOGRAPHS



[^0]
## LOP DEFECT THROUGH WALL THICKNESS DETERMINATION USING H\&D DENSITIES FROM RADIOGRAPHS

| $\begin{aligned} & \text { ITEM } \\ & \text { NO. } \end{aligned}$ | WELD ID | FUA ${ }^{\text {a }}$ | WALL THK | $\begin{aligned} & \text { PENNY+ } \\ & \text { SHIM } \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { PROC } \\ & \text { LOC } \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { DATA } \\ & \text { SHEET } \\ & \text { LOCATION } \end{aligned}$ | PIXEL. VALUE | $\begin{gathered} \text { H\&D } \\ \text { DENSITY } \end{gathered}$ | CALCULATED R | - /T |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| . 7 | 1-0\%76-1273-0.5 | 12 | 0216 | 0.10375 . |  |  |  |  | -0.056 | 8.257 |
| 35 | 1-067C0783-07 |  | $0.322$ | $0.135$ |  |  |  |  | 0.017 | 0.053 |
| 72 | 1-078A-123005 | 3-7 | 0.35 | 0.135 |  |  |  |  | 0.048 | 0.131 |
| 36 | 1-06\% $7-1435-06$ | $8$ | 0303 | 0.135 |  |  |  |  | 0.035 | 0.185 |
| 15 | 2-087/5-1348-018 | 1-2 | 0.203 | 0.10376 |  |  |  |  | 0.071 | 0.335 |
| $10$ | 2-667 $7.7301-38$ | 0.1 | 0.375 | 0.135 |  |  |  |  | 0.020 | 0.078 |
| 71 | 2-070A-12410,02 |  | $0.216$ | $0.70375$ |  |  |  |  | 0.018 | 0.215 |



## JOB AES 90091312-10

19-Dec-90 04:20 PM

## LOP DEFECT THROUGH WALL THICKNESS DETERMINATION USING H\&D DENSITIES FROM RADIOGRAPHS



Prepared By $\underset{\sim}{\therefore} \rightarrow \boldsymbol{i}$

## LOP DEFECT THROUGH WALL THICKNESS•DETERMINATION USING H\&D DENSITIES FROM RADIOGRAPHS <br> (all dimenatons in Inchea)

| WELDID | FILM | WALL THK | $\begin{aligned} & \text { PENNY } \\ & + \text { SHIM } \\ & \hline \end{aligned}$ | PROC LOC 1 | SHEET LOCATION | PIX. VAL. | $\begin{gathered} \text { H\&D } \\ \text { DENSITY } \end{gathered}$ | CALCULATED DEPTH | an |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1-067-1608-02. | $2 \cdot 3$ | 0.3\% | 0.07 |  |  |  |  | $\frac{0.050}{}$ | 0.15 |
| 1-067J-T608-02 | 1-2 | 0.322 | 0.07 |  |  |  |  | 0.020 | 0.063 |
| 1-067J-T608-03 | $1-2$ | 0.322 | 0.07 |  |  |  |  | 0.032 | 0.099 |
| 1-067J-T608-03 | 1-2 | 0.322 | 0.07 |  |  |  |  | 0.013 | 0.041 |
| 1-067-7600-03 | $2-3$ | 0.322 | 0.07 |  |  |  |  | 0.038 | 0.117 |
| 1-067-7608-07 | 0.1 | 0.322 | 0.07 |  |  |  |  | 0.045 | 0.138 |
| 1-067J-T600-16 | $2 \cdot 3$ | 0.322 | 0.07 |  |  |  |  | 0.070 | 0.218 |





## WATTS BAR CLASS THREE WELD RANDOM SAMPLING LOP/LOF DISTRIBUTION BY PERCENT OF CIRCUMFERENCE

| LOP/LOF <br> \% AMT | tOTAL RANDOM POP. | $\begin{gathered} \text { ALL } \\ \text { SS-CS } \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { CS } \\ \text { LESS O } \\ \text { EQ TO } \\ 0.25 \\ \hline \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { CS } \\ >0.25 \\ \text { OR } \\ <.375 \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { CS } \\ \gg .375 \end{gathered}$ | SS<. 25 | SS>. 25 | ORIGINAL 32 WELDS TOTAL |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| NONE | 63 | 4 | 13 | 12 | 5 | 19 | 10 | 12 |
| 0<amt<10 | 12 | 0 | 2. | 1 | 3 | 2 | 4 |  |
| 10<amt<20 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 6 |
| 20<amt<30 | 5 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 3 |  | 1 |
| 30<amt<40 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 40<amt<50 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 |
| 50<amt<60 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 |
| 60<amt<70 | 2 |  | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 1 |
| 70<amt<80 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 80<amt<90 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 |
| amt>90 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| totals | 84 | 5 | 15 | 15 | 8 | 24 | 17 | 32 |
| TOTAL w/IP | 21 | 1 | 2 | 3 | 3 | 5 | 7 | 20 |
| PERCENT | 25\% | 20\% | 13\% | 20\% | 38\% | 21\% | 41\% | 63\% |

-SUMMARY: OUT OF 84 WELDS ON RANDOM SAMPLE 21 HAVE LOP/LOF DEFECTS

OUT OF 32 WELDS RT'D BY TVA 20 HAVE LOP/LOF DEFECTS

## WATTS BAR CLASS 3 WrLD LOP DISTRIBUTION PERCENT LOP/LOF OF CIRC. TOTAL RNDM POP




## $\varsigma_{\text {WATTS BAR CLASS } 3}$ WELD LOP DISTRIBUTION PERCENT LOP/LOF OF CIRC. :SS <. 25





( WATTS BAR CLASS 3 WE LD LOP DISTRIBUTION PERCENT LOP/LOF OF CIRC. :CS >. 375



## B-1

Appendix B
STATISTICAL ANALYSIS METHOD

Appendix B
STATISTICAL ANALYSIS METHOD

A standard nonparametric technique of order statisticsis employed to compute upper and lower confidence limits of the cumulative distribution, $F(R)$ of the random variable $R$. The technique requires no assumed probability distribution model to compute limits and plot data as discrete points. This relieves the analyst from making an arbitrary selection of a model like the normal, log normal, or Weibull distribution.

After executing the nonparametric analysis and plotting all data, the program plots some curves. These curves are three-parameter Weibull distributions used to fit the nonparametric data points. Each curve was used to estimate flaw areas and was checked for its fit of the distribution - free data.

## BEST (POINT) ESTIMATES OF F(R)

Following the recommended graphical procedures of Gumbel (B-1), and Whittaker and Besuner ( $B-2$ ), the mean rank is used to estimate the plotting position ( $R, F(R)$ ) in a cumulative failure probability plot. Figures 4-1 and 4-2 are such plots. This mean rank is given by:

$$
\begin{equation*}
F(R)=1(R) /(N+1) \tag{B-1}
\end{equation*}
$$

where $N$ is the sample size and $i$ is the order number of the value of $R$. That is, $i=1$ is used for the lowest value of $\mathrm{R}, \mathrm{i}=\mathbf{2}$ is for the next largest, etc. In other words, the data are ordered by the procedure, so that $R_{1} \leq R_{2} \leq \ldots \leq R_{n}$.

The procedure most easily handles "complete" samples for which all the $R_{i}$ values are known. ${ }^{*}=-$ Also, the procedure handles so-called incomplete samples. These samples contain suspended data expressed as $R<r$ or $R>r$, not $R=r$. The procedure and software handle any mixture of suspended and complete data.

For suspended data samples, the best-estimate equations for $F(R)$ are:

$$
\begin{equation*}
F\left(R_{q}+1\right)=F\left(R_{l}\right)+1 /\left(N_{m}+1\right) ; 1=0, n_{4} \tag{B-2}
\end{equation*}
$$

where,
$F\left(R_{1}\right)$ denotes the plotting position of the ith of $n_{1}$ ordered data values for which $R$ is known precisely (i.e., nonsuspended values of R).

$$
\begin{equation*}
F\left(R_{0}\right)=0 . \tag{B-3}
\end{equation*}
$$

and
$N_{\text {eff }}=$ Effective number of units with $R>R_{1}$

$$
N_{m}=N_{1}+\sum_{j=1}^{N^{-}}\left(R_{j}-R_{l}\right) /\left(R_{1+1}-R_{l}\right)
$$

where,
$N_{8}=$ Number of units for which $R$ is known to be $>R_{1+1}$
$N^{-}=$Number of units for which $R$ is known to be $>R_{1}$, where $R_{1} \leq R_{1} \leq R_{1+1}$

Use of the above algorithm is equivalent to assuming a piecewise linear cumulative probability function for observed values of $R$.

## CONFIDENCE BOUNDS $F_{r}(R)$ OF $F(R)$

The procedure uses a rigorous nonparametric confidence bound estimation method to handle small sample sizes. This avoids the errors of asymptotically normal distribution confidence levels, which should only be used for large samples. For complete samples in which the value of $R$ of one unit is independent of all other values of $R$, the exact confidence bounds for the ith order statisticin N are given by the cumulative binomial distribution. The specificequation used is given below:

$$
\begin{equation*}
\gamma=1-\sum_{k=0}^{I-1} \frac{N!}{k l(N-k)!} F_{\gamma}^{k}\left(1-F_{\gamma}\right)^{N-k} \tag{B-4}
\end{equation*}
$$

where $\boldsymbol{\gamma}$ is the specified confidence level and $F_{\boldsymbol{\gamma}}$, defined as

$$
F_{\gamma}=F_{\gamma}\left(R_{p} i, N\right)
$$

is the desired confidence bound estimate of cumulative $\mathbf{R}$ probability. This means that $\boldsymbol{\gamma}$ is the probability that the true cumulative value $F(R)$ lies in the interval between 0 and $F_{r}$. For all but the simplest situations, the above equation must be solved implicitly through an iterative numerical scheme.

For the case of suspended data, the previous set of equations is used with $N_{0} . N e$ is the effective size of the sample rather than the complete sample value $N$. The parameter $N_{0}$ is completed from the relationship

$$
\begin{equation*}
N_{0}=\left(V / F\left(R_{j}\right)\right)-1 \tag{B-5}
\end{equation*}
$$

for each $\left[R_{i}, F\left(R_{i}\right)\right]$ point plotted.

## B-5

This procedure accounts for the fact that the fewer the values of R, the less the accuracy in making estimates of R. In general, $N_{0}$ is not an integer. A linear interpolation is used to estimate the confidence bounds, $F_{Y}$ for noninteger values.

The specific equation used is given by:

$$
\begin{equation*}
F_{\gamma}\left(R_{i}, N_{\nu}\right)=F_{\gamma}\left(R_{p} N B\right)+\left(N_{0}-N B\right)\left(F_{\gamma}\left(R_{p}, N A\right)-F_{\gamma}\left(R_{p} N B\right)\right) \tag{B-6}
\end{equation*}
$$

where $\mathrm{N}_{\mathrm{s}}$ lies in the closed interval between the two integers NB and NA. $=\mathrm{NB}+1$.

The above procedure, while complex in nature, has been benchmarked twice against an independent analysis method with fewer capabilities ( $(B-3$ ) through ( $\mathrm{A}-5$ )). Reasonable-toexcellent agreement between the two methods was observed.

REFERENCES

B-1 Gumbel, E. J., Statistics of Extremes, Columbia University Press, New York (1958).
B-2 Whittaker, I. C., and P. M. Besuner, "A Reliability Analysis Approach to Fatigue Life Variability of Aircraft Structures", Wright-Patterson Air Force Base, AFML-TR-69-65 (April 1969).

B-3 Calculations 3 and 4, APTECH Project AES 90041243-1Q
B-4 Cipolla, R. C., "Statistical Analysis of Hole Depth Data".. APTECH Project AES 89121166-10, Calculation 1166-10-6 (Document l-7) (March 6, 1990).

B-5 Cipolla, R. C., J. L. Grover, and P. M. Besuner, "Significance of Over-Drilled Oil Holes on Fatigue Life of the KSV-4-2A Connecting Rod in the Standby Diesel Engines at South Texas Project", APTECH Report AES 89121166-10-1 (March 1990) (See Section 3, especially).

Appendix $\mathbf{C}$ ASSUMPTIONS FOR FLAW DISTRIBUTION ANALYSIS

## C-2

## Appendix C <br> ASSUMPTIONS FOR FLAW DISTRIBUTION ANALYSIS

1. We assume the cumulative probability distributions (CPDs),

$$
F(x)=\text { PROBABILITY }(X \leq x) \text {, }
$$

for various statistical samples of weld inspection data are continuous functions. For more details see Refs. (C-1) through (C-5).
2. The inspection data analyzed here are for two types of crack-like flaws:

- Lack of penetration (LOP)
- Lack of fusion (LOF)

In all that follows, these two similar flaw types are assumed to be interchangeable and combined.
3. We deal only with the transformed variable

$$
X=1 /(10 \%+Y)
$$

4. We assume that these data include a combination of visual, radiographic (RT), and ultrasonic (UT) inspection results to estimate two flaw dimensions:

- \%L/C = the length $L$ of the defect along the circumference and measured as a percent of the circumference $C$
- $a / t=$ the maximum measured depth of the defect \{despite where that maximum occurred along the circumference "a") divided by our best estimate of thickness "t." UT measurements of $t$ are used if existing. If not, nominal thickness is used. For the estimate of "a" see the equation below.

5. Nonparametric method in Appendix B assumes no specific probability distribution function for $F(x)$.
6. The Weibull (three-parameter) probability distribution is used to fit nonparametric data calculations of $F(x)$ in Assumption 5. It is also used as an interpolater to compute the desired 95-95 flaw area bound. The specific equation used is

$$
\begin{equation*}
F(x)=1-\exp \left\{-\left[\left(x-x_{0}\right) /\left(B-x_{0}\right)\right]^{\top}\right\} \text { for } x \geq x_{0} \text { and } \tag{C-1}
\end{equation*}
$$

$$
\begin{gathered}
C-3 \\
F(x)=0 \text { for } x<x
\end{gathered}
$$

$a, B$, and $x_{0}$ are Weibull-distribution constants used here as mere fitting parameters. They are used differently for small and large samples. See the last few assumptions for more information on this.

In the literature, the Weibull distribution is classifiedas an "asymptotic distribution of the lowest extreme values." Because the Weibull models the lower tail of the distribution better than the higher, we use the $X(Y)$ transformation above.
7. For the transformed variable $X$, the lower tail region (e. g., $Y=P A R=$ Area $>10 \%$ so that $X<0.05$ ) and its lower $95 \%$ confidence bound are the regions of primary interest. For significance testing in the "Weld Comparisons" of Section 4, we are also interested in the best and the upper $5 \%$ confidence bound $F(x)$ estimates.
8. Accordingly, for purpose of this calculation we have no interest in the upper part of the distribution, $X>0.0833$ (Area $<2 \%$ ).
9. The inspection data from Section 4 are accurate.
10. Flaw Length ( $\% \mathrm{~L} / \mathrm{C}$ ) is taken directly from Section 4.
11. Using destructive inspection data on five weld flaw locations in Section 4 as a guideline, the maximum defect depth " $a$ " is the lesser of:

- The largest value measured with UT where available ( $a_{u T}$ )
- The largest value measured with RT ( $a_{\text {RT }}$ ) plus 60 mils ( 0.060 in .)

In equation notation,

$$
a=\text { minimum }\left[a_{v T},\left(a_{n T}+0.060\right)\right]
$$

12. Defect area $Y$ is calculated from

$$
Y=\% L / C \text { times } a / t
$$

and, as defined above, is expressed as a percent of the cross section removed. This product is very conservative because it assumes that the defect will be at maximum depth " $a$ " over its entire length.
13. No leaks from LOF/OP defects have ever resulted in any of the existing 7120 TVA Watts Bar Class 3 welds. Therefore, $\mathrm{Y}<100 \%$ (and so is a/t) for all 7120 welds. For large groups we rely on this assumption in a conservative way. We input one leak and 7119 no-leaks into the computer program.
14. For large groups in which the leak assumption is used, we assume the database is sufficient to estimate all three Weibull parameters.

$$
C-4
$$

15. For small samples, that typically contain only one or two precisely measured flaw areas, we

- Rely on the baseline sample of 108 welds (BASEL) to estimate the Weibull minimum $x_{0}$ and shape parameter $a$
- Use the small sample data only to estimate the Weibull characteristic value B
- Omit the no-leak Assumption 13. The effect of assuming 0 or 1 leak in the large sample is conservatively simulated by using the large baseline sample to set $x_{0}$


## C-5

## REFERENCES

C-1 Besuner, P. M., "Statistical Analysis of LOP and LOF Weld Flaw Areas", Calculation 1312-10-8 (January 2, 1991).

C-2 Besuner, P. M., "Statistical Analysis of Flaw Area in Weld Samples", Calculation 1312-1 Q-9 (January 2, 1991).

C-3 Besuner, P. M., "StatisticalTests of Flaw Lengths by Welders", Calculation 1312-10-10 (January 4, 1991).

C-4 Cipolla, R. C., "Statistical Analysis of Hole Depth Data", APTECH Project AES 89121166-1Q, Calculation 1166-10-6 (Document l-7) (March 6, 1990).

C-5 Cipolla, R. C., J. L. Grover and P. M. Besuner, "Significance of Over-Drilled Oil Holes on Fatigue Life of the KSV-4-2A Connecting Rod in the Standby Diesel Engines at South Texas Project," APTECH Report AES 89121166-1Q-1, March 1990 (See Section 3, especially).

Appendix D
REVISED MEMO OF WELDER COMPARISON ANALYSES

Appendix D
REVISED MEMO OF WELDER COMPARISON ANALYSES

## MEMORANDUM

```
TO: G. Egan
FROM: P. Besuner
SUBJECT: Welder Comparisons (AES 1366-Q, Revision 1)
DATE: January 21.1991
```

The attached material can be used to present my statistical analysis of the subject welders. I trust the work and conclusions are clear from our discussions. Please let me know if you also want a write-up in plain english to back up our discussions.

```
cc: A. Curtis
    J. Grover
    E. Merrick
```


## STATISTICAL PLAN TO COMPARE WORKMANSHIP OF WELDERS

Figure 1 is a flowchart of our procedure to evaluate welders and help find a root cause for substandard workmanship, if any. The following comments amplify the flowchart.

- Define Substandard Workmanship as an LOP/LOF Flaw of Length $\ell$ Greater Than 10\% of the Girth Weld Circumference
- Informal Inspection of Original Database to Pick Welder(s) With Possibly Substandard Performance
- After Picking Welder(s), Test the Following Hypotheses in at Least Two Different Statistically Valid Ways:
"For-Stainless Steel Welds, is the Distribution of LOP Lengths F(l) the Same For the Welder(s) and the 41 Randomly Selected SS Welds?"
"For Carbon or Dissimilar Steel Welds, is the Distribution of LOP Lengths $F(l)$ the Same For the Welder(s) and the 43 Randomly Selected CS and SS/CS Welds?"


## STATISTICAL PLAN (CONTINUED)

- One Statistical Test Will Focus on the Poor Workmanship Cutoff $\ell>10 \%$ Circumference and the Second Will Focus on the Largest Flaws, $\ell>50 \%$ Circumference.
- Conclusions Will Be Based Unon the Outcome of the Hypothesis Tests
- Regression Fits on Flaw Area Have Already Been Used to Test Other Variables (Weld Material and Thickness)


## SPECIFIC APPROACH CHOSEN

1. Define an Avoiding-Long-Flaw Indication (or ALFI) Index. Index (e/c > 10\%) Measures How Well Flaws Over 10\% Circumference Are Avoided. Index (l/c > 50\%) Does the Same for Half + Circumference Flaws. Big Values of the Indices Are Good. Index Values Below a "Critical" (Specified) Value $\mathrm{ALFI}<\sigma_{\text {specified }}=10 \%$ Are Bad.
(TVA's informal review of our preliminary results led them to use the more conservative value $\sigma_{\text {SPECIFED }}=15 \%$ to pick more welders for additional inspection. Here, for consistency with our judgement and "weld comparison" analysis in section 5, we use $\sigma_{\text {SPECIFED }}=10 \%$ to make recommendations. The tabulated results will allow the reader to use his or her own critical value.)
2. ALFI Index $=$ Chance That a Random Sample Will Do No Better Than the Subject Welder(s).
3. Baseline is APTECH-Chosen Random Sample of 41 SS/SS Welds or 43 CS/CS or SS/CS Welds.
4. Index Computed From Hypergeometric Distribution Using QA'd Program HYPERGEO.C By Jeff Grover Of APTECH.
5. Index Can Be Used Directly For Hypothesis Testing. It is the Most Rigorous Treatment We Know of the Small-Sample Problem.
6. On This Basis and Assuming Welds are O.K. Until Proven Otherwise, Index > 10\% Can Be Ignored. Index Values Much Less Than 5\% to 10\% Show Substandard Workmanship. For Conservatism, We Use Index Values $\mathbf{< 1 0 \%}$ to Identify Suspect Welder(s).
7. See Next Page For Results.
index of selected welders' Ability to avoid long flaws in stainless steel (SS)

| Welder(s) or Weldis) | Welds Inspected (NII) | Avoiding Medium Flaws |  | Avoiding Large Flaws |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  | Number at L/C $>10 \%$ | Index (10\%) | Number at L/C $>50 \%$ | Index (50\%) | Welds Existing |
| Random sample | 41 | 6 flawed | N/A | 2 big flaws | N/A | $\begin{aligned} & 3105 \text { (all SS } \\ & \text { Class C) } \end{aligned}$ |
| 31 original SS | 31 | 11 flawed | 3.3\% | 3 big flaws | 35.7\% | 31 |
| 31 originals minus 8 from 6EL | 23 | 7 flawed | 11.0\% | 1 big flaw | 73.7\%. | 23 |
| 6EL (originals) | 8 | 4 flawed | 4.1\% | 2 big flaws | 11.5\% | 8 |
| 6EL (all) | 18 | 8 flawed | 1.6\% | 3 big flaws | 15.4\% | $\begin{gathered} 35 \text { (23 } \\ \text { roots) (all } \\ \text { Class C) } \end{gathered}$ |
| 6SV | 2 | 1 flaw | 29.6\% | 1 big flaw | 13.3\% | 54 Class C |
| 6TTC ${ }^{-}$ | 7 | 3 flaws | 10.5\% | No big flaws | 100.0\% | 52 Class C (33 roots) |
| 6RSS | 4 | 2 flaws | 13.4\% | No big flaws | 100.0\% | 10 Class C ( 8 roots) |
| 6NU | 1 | 1 flaw | 16.3\% | 0 or 1 big (L/C = 46\%) | $\begin{aligned} & 7 \% \text { or } \\ & 100 \% \end{aligned}$ | 87 Class C <br> 2 Class B |

## CONCLUSIONS ABOUT ORIGINAL 31 STAINLESS STEEL WELDS

On the Basis of Current Data and Statistical Hypothesis Tests:

- The Workmanship of the Total Group of 31 SS Welds is Probably Inferior to the Stainless Steel Weld Population in General.
- There is Little Reason to Suspect Inferior Workmanship in the Group of 23 Original SS Welds Not Produced By Welder 6EL. In these 23 Original SS Welds, While the Ability to Avoid 10\%Circumference Flaws is Marginal (with ALFI = 11\%), the Ability to Avoid Large Flaws (ALFI $=73.7 \%$ ) Equals the Random Sample. This is Consistent with Our Finding in Section 5 (Under Weld Comparisons) That the 95th Percentile Estimate of Flaw Area is Similar for the Original and Random Weld Samples.


## POSSIBLE APPROACH BASED ON STATISTICAL COMPARISON OF SS WELDERS (ALFI INDEX)

1. Assume Welder(s) are O.K. Unless Present Data or Other Knowledge Says Otherwise (Else All Welders Must Be Checked With Multiple Inspections).
2. If Welders' Presently Inspected Work Product Give Both ALFI Indices (For L/C $>10 \%$ and L/C $>50 \%$ ) Greater Than 10\% (or for extra Conservatism 15\%), Do Nothing. See a Previous Page For Definition and Values of Current ALFI Indices.
3. If Either ALFI-Index is Less Than $1.0 \%$, the Welders' Workmanship is Suspect. In This Case, Inspect More Suspect Welds Until Either the Indices Rise Above 10\% or All Are Inspected.
4. On This Basis, from the Original Welds Only One Welder (6EL) is a Prime Suspect and One (6NU) is a Minor Suspect. Two additional Minor Suspects Come from Our Random Sample.
5. However, if a Specified Cutoff of $\boldsymbol{a}_{\text {SPECIRED }}=15 \%$ is used, 3 More Minor Suspects are Added. The Next Page Gives Specific Suggestions to Deal With These Seven Welders' Work Products.

## SUGGESTED INSPECTIONS OF SEVEN WELDERS

Figure 2 is a flowchart of the approach we recommend to investigate welders suspected of poor workmanship. The comments below amplify this flowchart.

1. Welder 6EL is an Outlier and Using Figure 2, All of His Welds Will Need to Be Looked at.
2. Welder 6NU Had Only One Inspected Weld at $46 \%$ Circumference. Rounding This Up to $50 \%$, One or Two New Clean Random Samples Will Eliminate This Suspect. We Suggest Starting With 4 Welds For Caution. It Can Be Argued That Pulling More Welds on the Basis of One Data Point is Overkill. Yet 50\% Circumference Flaws Are Rare and Are The. Most Important Flaws to Consider For Structural Integrity. It May Be Prudent to Treat One Bad Data Point as an Alarm and Check For More.
3. APTECH's Random Sample Picked up two Welders Similar to 6NU (One Big Flaw in Orily One SS Weld Inspection). These Are 6GK and 6PFF. We Suggest Planning 4 New Inspections Each With More as Required.
4. Note That of the Six Minor Suspects, 6GK, 6SV, 6TTC and 6NU Each Made Many Uninspected SS Class 3 Welds so They are More Important to Check Than 6PFF and 6RSS.
5. Welder 6RSS Shows Up at the $13.4 \%$ Level. If TVA continues to specify $\alpha_{\text {SPECIFIED }}=15 \%$, we Suggest a Further Sample of Four Welds.
6. Welder 6SV Shows Up at Less Than 15\% For One Big Flaw in Two Welds. We Suggest a Further Sample of Four Welds.
7. Finally, Welder 6TTC shows up marginally at $\mathrm{ALFI}=10.5 \%$ for 3 Flaws in 7 Welds. Note that 6TTC had No Big Flaws and on of His Three Barely Qualified at $\mathbf{1 0 . 1 \%}$ of the Circumference.
8. Any More Inspecting Beyond That Suggested Above Falls Under the Category of "Looking For New SS Welder Suspects."

INDEX OF SELECTED WELDERS' A'BILITY TO AVOID LONG FLAWS IN CARBON AND
DISSIMILAR WELDS

|  |  | Avoiding Medium Flaws |  | Avoiding Large Flaws |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Welder(s) or Weldis) | Welds Inspected (Nill | Number at L/C>10\% | $\begin{aligned} & \text { Index } \\ & (10 \%) \end{aligned}$ | Number at L/C $>50 \%$ | Index <br> (50\%) | Welds Existing |
| Random Sample | 43 | 3 flawed | N/A | 2 big flaws | N/A | 4015. Class. C |
| 6AAI | 2 | 1 flaw | $\begin{gathered} \text { 17.2\% } \\ \text { (13.3\%) } \end{gathered}$ | 1 big flaw | $\begin{aligned} & \text { 12.8\% } \\ & \text { (9.0\%) } \end{aligned}$ | 54A, 123B, 40C, and 20 Class D |
| 6RS | 1 | 1 flaw | $\begin{aligned} & 8.9 \% \\ & (6.8 \%) \end{aligned}$ | 1 big flaw | $\begin{aligned} & 6.7 \% \\ & \text { (4.5\%) } \end{aligned}$ | 12 Class C |
| 6NM | 1 | 1 flaw | $\begin{aligned} & 8.9 \% \\ & (6.8 \%) \end{aligned}$ | 0 | $\begin{aligned} & \text { 100.0\% } \\ & (100 \%) \end{aligned}$ | 124 Class C |

## NOTES ON CARBON STEEL WELD ANALYSIS

1. Values in Brackets () are Based on a More Rigorous Approach Which Temporarily Removes the Evaluated Welder From the 43-Weld Random Sample Before Applying the Hypothesis Tests. This Was Not Necessary For the Evaluation of Welders Outside the Random Sample (e.g., the Welders in the Original SS-Weld Sample). All Other Assumptions Are as for the ALFI Index Analysis of the Stainless Steel Welds.
2. Based on the Above, We Rely on the More Conservative Bracketed Values for Our Conclusions.
3. Yet, Note That at the $a_{\text {SPECIFED }}=15 \%$ Level of Significance, Using the Lower of the Two Medium and Large-Flaw Indices, the Bracketed and Unbracketed Values Give the Same Conclusion. To Wit, All Three Welders are "Minor Suspects". Using $\sigma_{\text {SPECIFED }}=10 \%$ with the bracketed values gives the same results.
4. As for the SS Welders, The Flowchart in Figure 2 Should be Used to Investigate these Minor Suspects, Starting with Four Inspected Welds Each.


Figure 1-Generic Screening Technique Applied to Any Welder.


Figure 2 - Statistical Screening Technique Applied to Welder 6EL.


Appendix E
SUMMARY OF CALCULATION PACKAGES

## CALCULATION COVER SHEET

Document No: $\quad Z-7$ 1312-C-5
Tile: $\square$ Class 3 Pipit Augites
$\qquad$

Client: Tennessee Lhecrifumbery Project No: PES 5005/312-10 APTECH Office: $\qquad$
Sheet No. $\qquad$ of $\qquad$

## Purpose:

This calculation documents the identification of stress analyses for selected ASNE Boiler and Pressure Vessel Code Section III Class 3 piping systems and the highest stresses within the analyses.

## Assumptions:

The identification of drawings and stress analysis calculations used are found in Table 1 and Table 2 respectively.

## Results:

Stress analyses were identified and reviewed for the Auxiliary Feedvater, Essential Ray Cooling Dater (BRCT), Component Cooling, and Spent Fuel Pit Cooling system.- The applicable stress analysis calculations and their most highly stressed nodes and stress ratios are listed in. Table 3.


Document No.: 工ー?
Tile: thanes, STress Rants id
Cunts 3 Piping Analyses


Method of data extraction and results -
Piping systems for stress analysis review were selected from a preliminary list of the number of butt welds made by TVA within a piping system. The list had been separated into carbon steel welds, stainless steel velds, and welds between carbon steel and stainless steel. The systems were selected to ensure two stainless steel piping systems and one carbon steel system. TVA engineers suggested that the carbon steel Auxiliary Peedvater system stress analyses contained relatively high stresses: The Component Cooling Water system vas selected to ensure an adequate sample of carbon steel piping stress analyses. The ERCN and Spent Fuel Pit Cooling systems were selected for stainless steel content.

All class 3 piping vas identified on Flow Diagrams (see Table 1) of the four systems. The identification number of corresponding stress analysis calculations were obtained from flow diagrams which had been marked with analysis numbers by TVA. The latest revisions of the analysis calculations were located in the TVA RIMS records system. Successor calculations vert obtained. for three calculations which had been superseded.

Because of difficulties in locating the calculations in the records system, Table 2 ia an index into the records system to locate calculations and microfiches of computer output. The applicable drawings and Design Change Authorizations are noted in the calculations.

The results of the review are in Table 3. Materials, pipe sizes, and pipe thicknesses are a complete list of those used in a analysis. Stress ratios and node identifications are the most highly stressed nodes as identified in computer output stress summaries of an entire analysis. The information may or may not represent Class 3 piping or piping velds. Many analyses contain Class 2 piping or piping less than 2 inch nominal pipe size.

Several of the stress ratios in Table 3:violate ASMR Section III requirements. A cursory review. of the calculations indicated that the calculated stresses at these locations had been reduced using alternate analyses. However, the stress ratios from the computer output have been used in Table 3 to provide a uniform standard for comparison of stresses.

Class 3 Piping Analyses


Table 1
Piping Systems and Flow Diagrams Reviewed


Spent Fuel Cooling


TVA Vatts Bar Nuclear Plant Blghest Stress Ratios in Class 3 piping analyses


Table 2
Location of Class 3 Calculations
Calculation Frame Microfiche Accession No.
** System: Auxiliary Feedwater 0600200-02-05 8888.0001 0600200-02-08 8519.1531 N3-03-01A,2A 8875.0602 N3-03-03A 8771.0581 N3-03-05A 8809.0497 N3-03-10A 8814.1135 N3-03-12A . 8810.2229 N3-03-13A 8771.0989 N3-03-14A 8827.0253
** System: Component Cooling 0600200-04-08 8773.0666
0600200-04-09 8175.0430
0600200-04-11 8698.0001
N3-70-01A 8800.0217
N3-70-02A 8772.0743 .
N3-70-03A 8798.0001
N3-70-04A 8765.1163
N3-70-05A 8815.1526
N3-70-05R 8897.0001
N3-70-06A 8800.0001
N3-70-06R 8880.0001
N3-70-07A 8801.0146
N3-70-08A 8827.2060
N3-70-09A 8711.0852
N3-70-10A. 8848.0928
$\mathrm{N} 3-70-26 \mathrm{~A} \quad 8810.1923$
N3-70-29A 8772.1809
N3-70-30A 8720.0163
N3-70-314 8711.1159
N3-70-32A 8715.1514
N3-70-33A 8815.1087
N3-70-38A 8766.1226
N3-70-39A 8784.1737
N3-70-42A 8767.1937
N3-70-43A 8788.0854
N3-70-45A 8879.0001
N3-70-47A 8719.0469
N3-70-48A 8715.1270
N3-70-49A 8713.0219
N3-70-50A 8716.0798
N3-70-51A 8710.1245
N3-70-52A 8749.0517
N3-70-53A 8815.0829
N3-70-54A 8818.0368
N3-70-55A
8815.0717

AA-F-G095138
TVA-P-G088628
TVA-F-G087922
TVA-P-G095144
TVA-F-G088816
TVA-P-G088514
TVA-P-G088932
TVA-P-G095170
TVA-F-G089194
TVA-F-G095150
TVA-F-G096002
TVA-F-G092530
TVA-P-G091536
TVA-P-G089272
TVA-F-G089188\&95978
TVA-P-G091774
TVA-P-G088080
TVA-F-G088100
TVA-F-G089896
TVA-F-G087606
TVA-F-G088414
TVA-F-G091776
TVA-F-G089800
TVA-P-G095140
TVA-F-G092696
TVA-F-G088102
IVA-F-G088178
TVA-F-G088042
TVA-R-G000146
TVA-P-G087760
TVA-F-G088148
TVA-F-G088600
TVA-F-GOOOO35
TVA-F-G088718
TVA-F-G088550

B18900716057 B18900405044 B18900806001 B18900703059
B18900717034
B18900717039
B18900717053
B18900705004
B18900705047

B18900717032
B18891220256
B18900614043
B18900712066
B18900703050
B18900621013
B18900712003
B18900725023
B18900828001
B18900712065
818900712011
B18900712029
B18900731004
B18900622029
B18900731002
B18900717050
B18900705005
B18900621011
B18900622033
B18900618012
B18900725017
B18900705044
B18900705006
B18900627086 B18900705037 B18900705043 B18900618004 B18900618006 B18900618005 B18900618017 B18900618003 B18900703021 B18900717048 B18900716095 B18900717047

TVA Vatts Bar Nuclear Plant Gighest Stress Ratios in Class 3 piping analyses

APTECH Rngineering Services ABS90091312-10 Document No. I-7, Rev. 0 Sh $\square$ Made Lat Date $1 / 2 / 50$ Checked WLS Date $10 / 30 / 90$

Table 2 (cont)
Location of Class 3 Calculations
Reel\&
Calculation Prame Micr

| N3-67-01A | 8830.0001 | TVA-P-G095256 | B18900716052 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| N3-67-01P | 8768.0916 | TVA-F-G088538 | B18900712009 |
| N3-67-02A | 8709.1084 | TVA-P-G089926893686 | B18900622031 |
| N3-67-02P | 8801.0001 | TVA-P-G088540 | B18900529005 |
| N3-67-03A | 8766.0832 | TVA-8-G088808 | B18900705031 |
| N3-67-03P | 8771.1116 | TVA-P-G088536 | B18900705048 |
| N3-67-03R | 8827.1710 | TVA-P-G095146 | . 1818900730054 |
| N3-67-04A | 8827.0472 | TVA-P-G089246 | B18900716053 |
| N3-67-04P | 8771.0001 | TVA-P-G088542 | B18900529002 |
| N3-67-04R | 8847.0720 | TVA-F-G095166 | B18900717035 |
| N3-67-05A | 8815.0394 | TVA-P-G089336 | B18900717004 |
| N3-67-06A | 8770.0521 | TVA-P-G085610 | B18900703045 |
| N3-67-06R | 8842.0699 | TVA-P-G089362 | B18900712027 |
| N3-67-07A | 8791.1673 | TVA-F-G087258 | B18900529003 |
| N3-67-08A | 8815.0940 | TVA-P-G087434 | B18900725016 |
| N3-67-09A | . 8879.0197 | TVA-F-G095722 | B18900730053 |
| N3-67-10A | 8808.0001 | TVA-F-G088000 | B18900529006 |
| N3-67-11A | 8849.0078 | TVA-F-G087470 | B18900712012 |
| N3-67-12R | 8711.0508 | TVA-P-G087762 | B18900618009 |
| N3-67-13A | 8781.0781 | TVA-F-G087440 | B18900712023 |
| N3-67-13R | 8839.0048 | TVA-P-G087792 | B18900705026 |
| N3-67-14R | 8788.0961 | TVA-F-G087532 | B18900705038 |
| N3-67-15A | 8791.2063 | TVA-P-G087998 | B18900705011 |
| N3-67-15R | 8766.0730 | TVA-F-G087992 | B18900705030 |
| N3-67-16A | 8788.1075 | TVA-F-G087422 | B18900705039 |
| N3-67-16R | 8780.0733 | TVA-F-G092470 | B18900705008 |
| N3-67-17A | 8806.0078 | TVA-F-G091770 | B18900618015 |
| N3-67-17R | 8720.0329 . | TVA-F-G087974 | B18900621012 |
| N3-67-18A | 8719.0627 | TVA-F-G095810 | B18890106007 |
| N3-67-18R | 8810.2105 | TVA-F-G088668 | B18900717052 |
| N3-67-19A | 8827.1984 | TVA-F-G095604 | B18900731003 |
| N3-67-19R | 8766.0212 | TVA-F-G087896 | B18900705027 |
| N3-67-20A | 8720.0440 | TVA-F-G093796 | B18900621014 |
| N3-67-20R | 8815.0641 | TVA-F-G088632 | B18900717046 |
| N3-67-21A | 8750.0067 | TVA-F-G0891788092168 | B18900629035 |
| N3-67-21R | 8842.0109 | TVA-P-G088326 | B18900716093 |
| N3-67-22A | 8703.0204 | TVA-F-G092516 | B18900614002 |
| N3-67-22R | 8814.1910 | TVA-F-G088410 | B18900725015 |
| N3-67-23A | 8781.1565 | TVA-F-G095666 | B18900713054 |
| N3-67-23R | 8808.1223 | TVA-F-G088710 | B18900717057 |
| N3-67-24A | 8848.0001 | TVA-F-G088290 | B18900703024 |
| N3-67-24R | 8808.1305 | TVA-F-G088680 | B18900717058 |
| N3-67-25A | 8771.0716 | TVA-P-G095134 | B18900703061 |
| N3-67-25R | 8814.1826 | TVA-P-G088626 | B18900725013 |
| N3-67-26A | 8771.0460 | TVA-P-G089184 | B18900703049 |
| N3-67-26R | 8750.0245 | TVA-F-G088980 | B18900701002 |
| *2-67-974 | 877n neka | MTA-p_encaiz | gigonntninan |

TVA Vats Bar Nuclear Plant Elghest Stress Ratios in Class 3 piping analyses

APTBCH Engineering Services ABS90091312-10 Document No. I-7, Rev. 0 Sh 6 of 17



Table 2 (cont)
Location of Class 3 Calculations

** System: Spent Fuel Pit Cooling

| N3-78-01A1 | 8278.0001 |
| :--- | :--- |
| N3-78-01A2 | 8278.0001 |
| N3-78-01A3 | 8278.0001 |
| N3-78-01A4 | 8278.0001 |
| N3-78-01A5 | 8278,0001 |
| N3-78-12A | 8015.0001 |
| $\ldots-2$. |  |

B04900228403 B04900228403 B04900228403 B04900228403 B04900228403 89111300001 anenimnnnise

Table 3
Maximum Stress Ratios

## Calculation Mater. Pipe sizes

$$
\begin{array}{lllll}
\text { Stress ratios and nodes for } & \mathrm{Eq} . \\
9 \mathrm{U} & 9 \mathrm{~B} & 9 \mathrm{P} & 10 & 11
\end{array}
$$ ** Piping System Auxiliary. Feedvater



TVA Watts Bar Nuclear Plant Bighest Stress Ratios in Class 3 piping analyses

APTECH Rngineering Services ABS90091312-10 Document No. I-7; Rev. O Sh

Table 3 (cont)
Maximum Stress Ratios

** Piping System Component Cooling

| 0600200-04-08 | CS | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 3 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & x .154,3 \\ & \times .438 \end{aligned}$ | x . 216, | $\begin{aligned} & 32 \\ & .617 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 32 \\ & .412 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 32 \\ & .444 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { CENTR } \\ & .622 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & .394 \end{aligned}$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 0600200-04-09 | CS | 2 | x . 154, 3 | x. 216 | $\begin{aligned} & 3668 \\ & .344 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 366 \mathrm{~B} \\ & .229 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 279 \\ -.231 \end{array}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 232 \\ & 1.137 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 232 \\ & .833 \end{aligned}$ |
| 0600200-04-11 | CS | 4 | x . 237, 6 | x. 280 | $\begin{aligned} & 29 \\ & .357 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 29 \\ & .238 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 29 \\ & .243 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 113 \\ & .510 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 113 \\ & .339 \end{aligned}$ |
| N3-70-01A | CS | $\begin{aligned} & 4 \\ & 8 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & x .237,6 \\ & x .322 \end{aligned}$ | $\times .280,$ | $\begin{aligned} & 63 \\ & .761 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 63 \\ & .507 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 63 \\ & .734 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 32 \\ & .646 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 32 \\ & .435 \end{aligned}$ |
| N3-70-02A | CS | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 16 \\ & 24 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{array}{lll} x & .154, & 14 \\ x & .375, & 20 \\ x & .375 \end{array}$ | $\times \quad .375$, $\times \quad .375$ \% | $\begin{aligned} & 166 \\ & .784 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 166 \\ & .523 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 329 \\ & .676 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 198 \\ & 1.079 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 198 \\ & .715 \end{aligned}$ |
| N3-70-03A | CS | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 4 \\ & 10 \\ & 14 \\ & 18 \\ & 24 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{array}{lll} x & .154, & 3 \\ \times & .237, & 8 \\ x & .365, & 12 \\ \times & .375 ; & 16 \\ x & .375, & 20 \\ x & .375 & \end{array}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { x } .216, \\ & \times .322, \\ & \times . .375, \\ & \times .375, \\ & \times \\ & \times .375, \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { CA9 } \\ & 1.005 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { CA9 } \\ & .670 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { CA9 } \\ & .860 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { CB1 } \\ & 1.243 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { CB1 } \\ & .814 \end{aligned}$ |
| N3-70-04A | CS | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 4 \\ & 10 \\ & 16 \\ & 24 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{array}{lll} x & .154, & 3 \\ x & .237, & 8 \\ x & .365, & 12 \\ x & .375, & 18 \\ x & .375 & \end{array}$ |  | $\begin{aligned} & \text { T2A } \\ & .940 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { T2A } \\ & .627 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 235 \\ & .733 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { D2B } \\ & 1.240 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { D2B } \\ & .864 \end{aligned}$ |
| N3-70-05A | CS | 2 3 8 | $\begin{aligned} & x .154,3 \\ & x .438,6 \\ & x .322 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & x .216, \\ & x .280, \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { FC3 } \\ & .845 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { PC3 } \\ & .564 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & . \mathrm{PC3} \\ & .703 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 124 \\ & .743 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 124 \\ & .470 \end{aligned}$ |
| N3-70-05R | CS | 4 | x . 237, 6 | x. 280 | $\begin{aligned} & P X 52 \\ & .550 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { PX52 } \\ & .367 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { PX52 } \\ & .469 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { CENTR } \\ & .750 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { CENTR } \\ & .479 \end{aligned}$ |
| N3-70-06A | CS | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 3 \\ & 8 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{array}{ll} x & .154, \\ x \\ x & .438, \\ x .322 \end{array}$ | $\begin{aligned} & x \quad .216 \\ & x .280 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 918 \\ & .815 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 918 \\ & .591 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 225 \\ & .646 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 50 \\ & .970 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 50 \\ & .615 \end{aligned}$ |
| N3-70-06R | CS | 2 | x . 344,3 | X. 438 | $\begin{aligned} & 585 \\ & 1.130 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 585 \\ & .758 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 585 \\ & .574 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 167 \\ & 1.417 \end{aligned}$ | $167$ |

Highest Stress Ratios in Class 3 piping analyses

Document No. I-7, Rev. O Sh $\square$ of $\qquad$ Made loQ. Date cshchou checked h) $1 B$ Date 10/30/90

Table 3 (cont)
Maximum Stress Ratios


TVA Wats Bar Nuclear Plant Highest Stress Ratios in Class 3 piping analyses

APTECE Engineering Services ABS90091312-10 Document No. I-7, Rev. 0 Sh 10 of 17


Table 3 (cont)
Maximum Stress Ratios


TVA Vatts Bar Nuclear Plant Elghest Stress Ratios in Class 3 piping analyses

** Piping System Essential Rav Cooling Water

| N3-67-01A | CS\&SS | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 4 \\ & 8 \\ & 18 \\ & 30 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & x \\ & x \\ & x \\ & x \\ & x \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & .154 \\ & .237 \\ & .322 \\ & .375 \\ & .375 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 3 \\ & : \\ & : 10 \\ & : 10 \\ & : 24 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{array}{ll} x & .216, \\ \text { x } & .280, \\ \text { x } & .365, \\ \times & .375, \end{array}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 275 \mathrm{x} \\ & 1.086 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { 275X } \\ .724 . \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { 275x } \\ & .900 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 449 \mathrm{X} \\ & 2.042 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 449 \mathrm{x} \\ & 1.261 \end{aligned}$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| N3-67-01P | SS | 4 | x | . 237 |  |  | $\begin{aligned} & 92 \\ & .659 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 92 \\ & .439 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{gathered} 92 \\ \cdot .561 \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 5 \\ & 1.080 \end{aligned}$ | 5 <br> .666 |
| N3-67-02A | CS\&SS | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 6 \\ & 18 \\ & 24 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & x \\ & x \\ & x \\ & x \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & .154, \\ & .280, \\ & .375, \\ & .375 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & , 3 \\ & , 8 \\ & , 20 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { x . } 216 \text {, } \\ & \text { x } .322, \\ & \text { x. } 375 \text {, } \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 230 \mathrm{~A} \\ & 1.049 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 230 \mathrm{~A} \\ & .699 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { A16 } \\ & .930 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 134 \\ & 1.013 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 88 X \\ & .693 \end{aligned}$ |
| N3-67-02P | SS | 4 | x | . 237 |  |  | $\begin{aligned} & 92 \\ & .659 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 92 \\ & .439 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 92 \\ & .561 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 5 \\ & 1.121 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 5 \\ & .690 \end{aligned}$ |
| N3-67-03A | CS\&SS | 6 | x | . 280, | 8 | x. 322 | $\begin{aligned} & \text { A36 } \\ & .582 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { A36 } \\ & .388 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { A36 } \\ & .442 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { A90 } \\ & 1.511 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { A90 } \\ & .999 \end{aligned}$ |
| N3-67-03P | SS | 4 | x | . 237 |  |  | $\begin{aligned} & 92 \\ & .658 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 92 \\ & .439 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 92 \\ & .560 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \cdot 105 \\ & .665 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 105 \\ & .429 \end{aligned}$ |
| N3-67-03R | CS\&SS | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 4 \end{aligned}$ |  | $\begin{aligned} & .154, \\ & .237, \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 3 \\ & , 6 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & x \cdot 216, \\ & x .280 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { AN9 } \\ & .311 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { AN9 } \\ & .207 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 203 A \\ & .425 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 434 \\ & 1.632 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 434 \\ & .995 \end{aligned}$ |
| N3-67-04A | CS | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 24 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \mathbf{x} \\ & \mathbf{x} \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & .218, \\ & .375 \end{aligned}$ | $20$ | $x \cdot 375$ | $\begin{aligned} & 22 \\ & .373 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 22 \\ & .249 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 22 \\ & .242 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & .65 \\ & .856 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 65 \\ & .608 \end{aligned}$ |
| N3-67-04P | SS | 4 |  | . 237 |  |  | $\begin{aligned} & 92 \\ & .659 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 92 \\ & .439 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 92 \\ & .561 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 5 \\ & .598 \end{aligned}$ | $5$ $.377$ |
| N3-67-04R | CS\&SS | $\begin{aligned} & 2 . \\ & 4 \end{aligned}$ |  | $\begin{aligned} & .154, \\ & .237, \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 3 \\ & 6 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{array}{ll} x & .216, \\ x & .280 \end{array}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { A11 } \\ & .304 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { A11 } \\ & .204 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { Al1 } \\ & .207 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 24 A \\ & .923 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { 24A } \\ & .589 \end{aligned}$ |
| - N3-67-05A | CS\&SS | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 8 \\ & 20 \end{aligned}$ |  | $\begin{aligned} & .154, \\ & .322, \\ & .375 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 3 \\ & 18 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & x .216, \\ & \times . .375, \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { 20A } \\ & .655 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 20 \mathrm{~A} \\ & .437 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 204 \\ & .622 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 44 \\ & .850 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 44 \\ & .570 \end{aligned}$ |
| N3-67-06A | CS\&SS | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 8 \\ & 20 \end{aligned}$ | x | $\begin{aligned} & .154, \\ & .322, \\ & .375 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 3 \\ & 18 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{array}{ll} x & .216, \\ x & .375, \end{array}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 141 B \\ & .555 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1418 \\ & .564 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 141 A \\ & .568 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 141 \mathrm{~A} \\ & 1.374 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 141 A \\ & .834 \end{aligned}$ |

TVA Watts Bar Nuclear Plant highest Stress Ratios in Class 3 piping analyses

APTECE Engineering Services ARS90091312-10 Document No. I-7, Rev. 0 Sh $\mathbb{Z}$ of $L$ Z

Made $\qquad$ Date oflefac checked WRB Date 10/30/90

Table 3 (cont)
Maximum Stress Ratios


TVA Vatts Bar Nuclear Plant APTECE Bngineering Services ABS90091312-10 Eighest Stress Ratios in Class 3 piping analyses

TVA Patts Bar Nuclear Plant Elghest Stress Ratios in Class 3 piping analyses

Table 3 (cont)
Maximum Stress Ratios

|  |  | Stress ratios and nodes for Eq. |  |  |  |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| Calculation | Kater. Pipe sizes | 90 | 98 | 98 | 10 |

** Piping System Essential Raw Cooling Water (cont)

| N3-67-23R | SS | 2 | x . 154, |  | x | . 216 | $\begin{aligned} & \text { PL3 } \\ & .244 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { PL3 } \\ & .162 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { PL3 } \\ & .139 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { FL3 } \\ & .867 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { PL3 } \\ & .624 \end{aligned}$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| N3-67-24A | CS\&SS | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 4 \\ & 8 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { x } .154, \\ & \text { x. } .237, \\ & \text { x } .322 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 3 \\ .6 \end{array}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \mathbf{x} \\ & \mathbf{x} \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { c.216, } \\ & \text { c } 280, \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { BB06 } \\ & .778 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { BB06 } \\ & .519 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { BB06 } \\ & .662 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { F17 } \\ & 1.495 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \mathrm{F} 18 \\ & .964 \end{aligned}$ |
| N3-67-24R | SS | 2 | x . 154, | 3 | x | . 216 | $\begin{aligned} & \text { FLO3 } \\ & .141 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { FLO3 } \\ & .094 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { FLO3 } \\ & .077 . \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { FLO1 } \\ & .598 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { FLO1 } \\ & .388 \end{aligned}$ |
| N3-67-25A | CSSSS | $\begin{aligned} & 6 \\ & 8 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & x .280 \\ & \times . .322 \end{aligned}$ |  | $x$ | .432, | $\begin{aligned} & \text { R3I } \\ & .364 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \mathrm{R} 3 Y \\ & . .243 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { R3I } \\ & ; 366 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \mathrm{R} 12 \\ & .521 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { R12 } \\ & .337 \end{aligned}$ |
| N3-67-25R | SS | 2 | x . 154, | 3. | x | . 216 | $\begin{aligned} & \text { FLO1 } \\ & .229 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { PLO1 } \\ & : 153 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { FLO1 } \\ & .126 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { FLO1 } \\ & .833 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { PLO1 } \\ & .598 \end{aligned}$ |
| N3-67-26太 | CS\&SS | $\begin{aligned} & 6 \\ & 8 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{array}{ll} x & .280, \\ \times & .322 \end{array}$ | $6$ | $x$ | . 432, | $\begin{aligned} & \text { B92B } \\ & .925 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 8928 \\ & .606 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { B92B } \\ & .840 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { B92B } \\ & 1.296 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \mathrm{B92B} \\ & 1.001 \end{aligned}$ |
| N3-67-26R | SS | 2. | x . 154, | 3 | x | . 216 | $\begin{aligned} & \text { FLO3 } \\ & .168 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { FLO3 } \\ & .112 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { PLO1 } \\ & .110 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { PLO1 } \\ & .593 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { PLO3 } \\ & .413 \end{aligned}$ |
| N3-67-27A | CS\&SS | $\begin{aligned} & 6 \\ & 8 . \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & x .280 \\ & \times . .322 \end{aligned}$ | $6$ | $x$ | $.432$ | $\begin{aligned} & 10 \\ & .216 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \cdot 10 \\ & .144 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { CO6B } \\ & .299 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 10 \\ & .371 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 10 \\ & .284 \end{aligned}$ |
| N3-67-272 | SS | 2. | x . 154, | 3 | X | . 216 | $\begin{aligned} & \text { FLO1 } \\ & .213 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { FLO1 } \\ & .142 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { PLO1 } \\ & .120 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { FLO1 } \\ & .765 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { PLO1 } \\ & .548 \end{aligned}$ |
| N3-67-284 | CS\&SS | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 8 \\ & 24 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & x .154, \\ & \text { x . } 322, \\ & \text { x . } 375 \text {, } \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 4 \\ & 10 \\ & 30 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & x \\ & x \\ & x \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & .237, \\ & .365 \\ & .375 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 800 \\ & .768 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 800 \\ & .512 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{gathered} 800 \\ \therefore .596 \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 820 \\ & 1.292 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 820 \\ & .815 \end{aligned}$ |
| N3-67-29A | CS\&SS | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 8 \\ & 20 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & x .154, \\ & \times .322, \\ & \times . .375 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 3 \\ & 18 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & x \\ & x \end{aligned}$ | .216, | $\begin{aligned} & 141 \\ & .453 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 141 \\ & .302 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 141 \\ & .388 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 118 \\ & 1.059 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 118 \\ & .678 \end{aligned}$ |
| N3-67-30A | CSESS | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 3 \\ & 6 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{array}{ll} x & .154, \\ x & .216, \\ x & .280 \end{array}$ | $2 .$ | $\begin{gathered} 5 x \\ x \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{aligned} & .203, \\ & .237, \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 505 \\ & .316 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 505 \\ & .211 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 505 \\ & .267 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 495 \\ & .844 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 495 \\ & .537 \end{aligned}$ |
| N3-67-31A | SS | 2 | $\begin{aligned} & x .154, \\ & x . .237 \end{aligned}$ | 3 | x | .216, | $\begin{aligned} & 10 \\ & .094 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 10 \\ & .063 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 10 \\ & .084 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 10 \\ & .468 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 10 \\ & .292 \end{aligned}$ |

TVA Wats Bar Nuclear Plant Highest Stress Ratios in Class 3 piping analyses

APTECE Engineering Services ABS 90091312-10 Document No. I-7, Rev. O Sh

$\qquad$ Made LAR Date A/tatso Checked WRS Date $10 / 30 / 90$

Table 3 (cont)
Maximum Stress Ratios

Calculation . Mater. Pipe sizes
Stress ratios and nodes for Eq. Piping System Essential Riv Cooling Water (cont)


# Document No. I-7, Rev. 0 Sh 16 of 12 Made lef, Date h/ze/so Checked WhB Date $10 / 30 / 90$ 

Table 3 (cont)
Maximum Stress Ratios


* Piping System Essential Raw Cooing Water (cont)

| N3-67-45A | CS\&SS | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 3 \\ & 6 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{array}{ll} x & .154, \\ x & .216 \\ x & .280 \end{array}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2.5 x .203, \\ & 4 \times .237, \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { CENTR } \\ & .727 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { CENTR } \\ & .501 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { CENTR } \\ & .666 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 21 \\ & 1.029 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 21 \\ & .642 \end{aligned}$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| N3-67-46A | SS | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 3 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & x \quad .154 ; \\ & \text { x } .216, \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2.5 x \quad .203, \\ & 4 \times .237 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & .251 \end{aligned}$ | $1.167$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & .153 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 22 \\ & .277 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 22 \\ & .194 \end{aligned}$ |
| N3-67-49A | CS\&SS | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 3 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & x .154, \\ & x . .216 \end{aligned}$ | 2.5x . 203, | $\begin{aligned} & 101 \\ & .263 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 101 \\ & .175 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 101 \\ & .242 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { CENTR } \\ & .566 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { CENTR } \\ & .352 \end{aligned}$ |
| N3-67-51A | CS | 3 . | x. 216 |  | $\begin{array}{r} \text { B170 } \\ .705 \end{array}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \mathrm{B} 230 \\ & . ~ \\ & \hline \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & B 230 \\ & .164 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & B 170 \\ & 1.569 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { B170 } \\ & .963 \end{aligned}$ |
| N3-67-52A | CS | 3 | x. 216 |  | $\begin{aligned} & 16 \\ & .229 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 16 \\ & .153 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 16 \\ & .140 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { A130 } \\ & 1.332 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { A130 } \\ & .820 \end{aligned}$ |
| N3-67-53A | CS\&SS | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 4 \\ & 8 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{array}{ll} x & .154, \\ x & .237, \\ x & .322 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{lll} 3 & x & .216, \\ 6 & x & .280, \end{array}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \mathrm{Fl} \\ & .240 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { F1. } \\ & .160 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 514 \\ & .184 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 514 \\ & 1.533 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 514 \\ & .957 \end{aligned}$ |
| N3-67-54A | SS | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 3 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{array}{ll} x & .154, \\ x & .216 \end{array}$ | 2.5x . 203, | $\begin{aligned} & \text { P240 } \\ & .318 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \mathrm{P} 240 \\ & .224 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { P240 } \\ & .241 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 480 \mathrm{~A} \\ & 1.089 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 480 \mathrm{~A} \\ & .674 \end{aligned}$ |
| N3-67-56A | SS | 2.5 | 5x . 203, | $6 \times .280$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { 80A } \\ & .348 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 80 \mathrm{~A} \\ & .232 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 80 \mathrm{~A} \\ & .316 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { CO6B } \\ & .417 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { CO6B } \\ & .275 \end{aligned}$ |
| N3-67-574 | CS\&SS | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & 4 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & x \quad .154, \\ & x \quad .237 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{array}{lll} 3 & \times .216, \\ 6 & \times .280 \end{array}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 956 \\ & .290 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 956 \\ & .193 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & .956 \\ & .224 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 956 \\ & 1.551 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 956 \\ & .976 \end{aligned}$ |
| N3-67-58A | CS\&SS | 2 | x .154, | $3 \times .216$ | $5$ $.505$ | $\begin{aligned} & 5 \\ & .337 \end{aligned}$ | $.5$ | $\begin{aligned} & 30 \\ & .238 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 30 \\ & .204 \end{aligned}$ |
| N3-67-59A | CS\&SS | $\begin{gathered} 2 \\ 6 \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{aligned} & x .154, \\ & x .280 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{array}{lll} 3 & x & .216, \\ 20 \times & .375 \end{array}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 999 \\ & .163 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 999 \\ & .109 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 999 \\ & .132 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 999 \\ & 1.417 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 999 \\ & .882 \end{aligned}$ |
| N3-67-62A | SS | 2 | x .154, | $3 \times .216$ | $\begin{aligned} & 47 \\ & .726 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 47 \\ & .484 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 47 \\ & .723 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 61 \\ & 1.111 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 61 \\ & .702 \end{aligned}$ |
| N3-82-010 | CS | 8 | x . 322, | $10 \times .365$ | $\begin{aligned} & 11 \\ & .244 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 11 \\ & .163 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 11 \\ & .139 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { CRNTR } \\ & .471 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { CENTR } \\ & .315 \end{aligned}$ |
| N3-82-02D | CS\&SS | 8 | x. 322 |  | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & .175 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & .116 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & .134 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{gathered} 2 \\ .131 \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 2 \\ & .109 \end{aligned}$ |

TVA Watts Bar Nuclear Plant Elghest Stress Ratios in Class 3 piping analyses

APTECE Bagineering Services ABS90091312-10
Document No. I-7, Rev. O Sh 12 of 12 Made Lefy Date A/2ckcchecked 1 NB Date 10/30/90

Table 3 (cont)
Maximum Stress Ratios

|  |  | Stress ratios and nodes for |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Cal | Mater. Pipe sizes | 9U 9B 9F | ** Piping System Essential Rav Cooling Water (cont)


| N3-82-03D | CS\&SS | 8 | x. 322 |  | 2 | '2 | 2 | 24 | 24 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  |  |  |  | . 183 | . 122 | . 139 | . 114 | . 196 |
| N3-82-04D | CS | 8. | x . 322 , | $10 \times .365$ | $\begin{aligned} & 33 \\ & .298 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 33 \\ & .199 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & .42 \\ & .139 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { CENTR } \\ & .550 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { CENTR } \\ & .363 \end{aligned}$ |
| N3-82-05D | CS | 8 | x. 322 |  | $\begin{aligned} & 290 \\ & .365 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 290 \\ & .243 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 290 \\ & .197 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 320 \\ & .567 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 320 \\ & .369 \end{aligned}$ |
| N3-82-06D | CS | 8 | x . 322, | $10 \times .365$ | $\begin{aligned} & 11^{\circ} \\ & .243 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 11 \\ & .162 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 11 \\ & .138 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { CRNTR } \\ & .499 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { CENTR } \\ & .331 \end{aligned}$ |
| N3-82-07D | CS | $8^{\circ}$ | x . 322, | $10^{\circ} \times .365$ | $\begin{aligned} & 11 \\ & .245 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 11 \\ & .163 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 11 \\ & .139 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { CENTR } \\ & .472 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { CENTR } \\ & .316 \end{aligned}$ |
| N3-82-08D | CS | 8 | x.322, | $10 \times .365$ | $\begin{aligned} & 11 \\ & .242 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 11 \\ & .161 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 11 \\ & .137 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { CRNTR } \\ & .511 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { CENTR } \\ & .338 \end{aligned}$ |

** Piping System Spent Fuel Pit Cooling



| N3-78-12A | SS | 2 | $x .154$, | $3 \cdot \times .216$ | $\begin{aligned} & 360 \\ & .060 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 360 \\ & .040 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 315 \\ & .038 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 30 \\ & .825 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 30 \\ & .516 \end{aligned}$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| N3-78-13A | SS | $10 \times \cdot .365$ |  |  | 90 | 90 | 90 | 135 | 135 |
|  |  |  |  |  | . 270 | . 180 | . 184 | . 548 | . 378 |

## F-1

## Appendix F DATABASE OF MOST HIGHLY STRESSED NODES

| System | Calc package | O.D. | Mat | Node | Thick | SIF | Sigme a | Sigma p | Eq 8 | Eq 90 | Eq $9 E$ | Eq 9F | Eq 10 | 911 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 4.500 | CS | 59 | . 438 | 1.216 | 15000 | 3645 | . 254 | . 301 | . 209 | 72 | 73 | 66 |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 4.500 | CS | 60 E | . 438 | 1.216 | 15000 | 3645 | . 251 | . 286 | . 198 | . 243 | . 732 | . 540 |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 4.500 | cs | 82 | . 438 | 2.073 | 15000 | 3645 | . 272 | . 608 | . 407 | . 386 | . 650 | . 499 |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 4.500 | CS | 86 | . 438 | 1.000 | 15000 | 3645 | . 401 | . 622 | . 416 | . 377 | . 012 | 168 |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 4.500 | cs | $86 \times$ | . 438 | 1.298 | 15000 | 3645 | . 386 | . 600 | . 402 | 363 | . 041 | . 179 |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 4.500 | cs | 192A | . 438 | 2.073 | 15000 | 3645 | . 266 | . 700 | . 468 | 457 | 280 | 275 |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 4.500 | cs | 195 | . 438 | 1.000 | 15000 | 3645 | . 410 | . 682 | . 459 | 420 | 072 | 207 |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 4.500 | cs | 196 | . 438 | 1.000 | 15000 | 3645 | . 393 | . 655 | . 440 | 403 | 063 | 195 |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 4.500 | cs | 19X | . 438 | 1.000 | 15000 | 3645 | . 368 | . 620 | 416 | 382 | 053 | 179 |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 4.500 | CS | 197 | . 438 | 1.900 | 15000 | 3645 | . 413 | . 672 | . 452 | 413 | . 191 | 280 |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 6.625 | CS | 918 | . 562 | 2.000 | 15000 | 4385 | . 299 | . 270 | . 181 | 141 | . 089 | 173 |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 6.625 | CS | 92 | . 562 | 2.000 | 15000 | 4385 | . 309 | . 278 | . 187 | 146 | . 053 | . 152 |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 6.625 | cs | 93 | . 562 | 1.031 | 15000 | 4385 | . 307 | . 288 | . 194 | 152 | . 048 | . 152 |
| AUXFS | 0600200-02-05 | 6.625 | cs | 93A | . 562 | 1.000 | 15000 | 4385 | . 312 | . 296 | . 200 | . 157 | . 057 | . 159 |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 6.625 | cs | 94 | . 562 | 1.770 | 15000 | 4385 | . 334 | . 430 | . 290 | . 250 | . 445 | . 401 |
| AUXFV | 0600200-02-05 | 4.500 | CS | 90 | . 438 | 1.000 | 15000 | 3645 | . 254 | . 253 | . 169 | . 136 | . 178 | . 208 |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 2.375 | CS | 623A | . 344 | 2.100 | 15000 | 2019 | . 198 | . 279 | . 191 | . 169 | 1.056 | . 713 |
| AUXVW | 0600200-02-05 | 2.375 | CS | 625 | . 344 | 2.100 | 15000 | 2019 | . 191 | . 387 | . 262 | . 249 | 1.059 | 712 |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 2.375 | CS | 634 | . 344 | 2.100 | 15000 | 2019 | . 329 | 1.000 | . 752 - | . 744 | . 324 | 326 |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 2.375 | CS | 6501 | . 344 | 2.100 | 15000 | 2019 | . 318 | . 957 | . 798 | . 804 | 1.086 | 779 |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 2.375 | cs | 647 | . 344 | 2.100 | 15000 | 2011 | . 305 | . 863 | . 580 | . 576 | . 535 | 443 |
| AUXFU | 0600200-02-05 | 2.375 | cs | 618 | . 344 | 2.100 | 15000 | 2011 | . 242 | . 436 | . 324 | . 294 | 619 | . 469 |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 2.375 | cs | 619A | . 344 | 2.100 | 15000 | 2019 | . 170 | . 241 | . 186 | . 172 | . 511 | . 375 |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 2:375 | Cs | 629 | . 344 | 2.100 | 15000 | 2019 | . 253 | . 734 | . 494 | . 487 | . 304 | . 284 |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 2.375 | CS | 630 | . 344 | 2.100 | 15000 | 2011 | . 267 | . 709 | . 480 | . 467 | . 347 | . 315 |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 2.375 | CS | 632 | . 344 | 2.100 | 15000 | 2011 | . 240 | . 731 | . 491 | . 483 | . 353 | . 308 |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 2.375 | Cs | 635 | . 344 | 2.100 | 15000 | 2019 | . 202 | . 425 | . 308 | . 284 | . 504 | . 383 |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 2.375 | CS | 646 | . 344 | 1.000 | 95000 | 2019 | . 248 | . 571 | . 383 | . 369 | . 310 | . 286 |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 2.375 | cs | 646x | . 344 | 1.000 | 15000 | 2011 | . 260 | . 549 | . 368 | . 351 | . 344 | . 310 |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 2.375 | Cs | 6472 | . 344 | 1.000 | 15000 | 2011 | . 239 | . 560 | . 376 | . 366 | . 255 | . 249 |
| auxfy | 0600200-02-05 | 2.375 | cs | 650 | . 344 | 2.100 | 15000 | 2011 | . 262 | . 719 | . 484 | . 477 | . 553 | . 437 |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 4.500 | Cs | 138 | . 337 | 2.000 | 15000 | 3091 | . 365 | . 424 | . 286 | . 563 | 1.128 | . 823 |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 4.500 | Cs | 127A | . 337 | 1.496 | 15000 | 3091 | . 236 | . 258 | . 173 | . 256 | . 875 | . 620 |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 4.500 | Cs | 128 | . 337 | 1.000 | 15000 | 3091 | . 235 | . 267 | . 179 | . 281 | . 861 | . 611 |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 4.500 | Cs | 54 | . 337 | 1.496 | '15000 | 3091 | . 214 | . 271 | . 187 | . 349 | . 779 | . 553 |
| AUXFY | 0600200-02-05 | 4.500 | CS | 56A | . 337 | 1.496 | 15000 | 3091 | . 210 | . 251 | . 177 | . 360 | . 758 | . 539 |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 4.500 | cs | 125 | . 337 | 1.000 | 15000 | 3091 | . 272 | . 297 | . 202 | . 296 | . 553 | . 440 |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 4.500 | CS | 125Y | . 337 | 1.000 | 15000 | 3091 | . 286 | . 307 | . 210 | . 283 | . 514 | . 423 |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 4.500 | cs | 127 | . 337 | 1.000 | 15000 | 3091 | . 231 | . 236 | . 162 | . 203 | . 538 | . 495 |
| AUXFU | 0600200-02-05 | 4.500 | CS | 127B | . 337 | 1.000 | 15000 | 3091 | . 231 | . 237 | . 161 | . 208 | . 549 | . 422 |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 4.500 | cs | 13P | . 337 | 1.000 | 15000 | 3091 | . 311 | . 345 | . 231 | . 342 | . 513 | . 432 |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 4.500 | cs | 130 | . 337 | 1.000 | 15000 | 3091 | . 311 | . 344 | . 231 | . 346 | . 518 | . 435 |
| AUXFV | 0600200-02-05 | 4.500 | cs | 164A | . 337 | 1.000 | 15000 | 3091 | . 219 | . 342 | . 252 | . 199 | . 600 | . 448 |
| AUXFU | 0600200-02-05 | 16.000 | cs | 2 Ca | . 500 | 1.000 | 15000 | 115 | . 036 | . 069 | . 047 | . 081 | . 047 | . 042 |
| AUXFS | 0600200-02-05 | 16.000 | cs | 2EA | . 500 | 1.000 | 15000 | 115 | . 018 | . 027 | . 018 | . 027 | . 065 | 046 |


| System | ge | D. | Mat'l | Node | Thick | SIF | Sigma a | Sigma | Eq 8 | Eq Pu | Eq 9E | 9 F | Eq 10 | 919 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 16.000 | cs | $2 E$ | . 500 | 1.000 | 15000 | 115 | . 016 | . 048 | . 032 | . 037 | . 080 | . 054 |
| AUXFL | 0600200-02-05 | 16.000 | cs | $2 F$ | . 500 | 1.000 | 15000 | 115 | . 029 | . 076 | . 050 | . 062 | . 091 | . 066 |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 16.000 | cs | 22 | . 500 | 1.000 | 15000 | 115- | . 014 | . 047 | . 031 | . 042 | . 055 | . 039 |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 16.000 | CS | 22A | . 500 | 1.000 | 15000 | 115 | . 017 | . 028 | . 019 | . 022 | . 020 | . 019 |
| AUXFU | 0600200-02-05 | 16.000 | CS | 2 A | . 500 | 1.000 | 15000 | 115 | . 008 | . 006 | . 004 | . 003 | 0.000 | . 003 |
| AUXFY | 0600200-02-05 | 6.625 | CS | 314 | . 432 | 2.000 | 15000 | 3675 | . 330 | . 459 | . 307 | . 470 | . 643 | . 578 |
| AUXFY | 0600200-02-05 | 6.625 | CS | 32 | . 432 | 2.000 | 15000 | 3675 | . 326 | . 454 | . 303 | . 438 | . 651 | . 521 |
| AUXFV | 0600200-02-05 | 6.625 | cs | 32A | . 432 | 1.643 | 15000 | 3675 | . 313 | . 419 | . 274 | . 369 | . 540 | . 449 |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 6.625 | cs | 32A-C | . 432 | 1.643 | 15000 | 3675 | . 319 | . 424 | . 283 | . 342 | . 523 | . 441 |
| AUXFY | 0600200-02-05 | 6.625 | CS | 448 | . 432 | 1.900 | 15000 | 3675 | . 335 | . 398 | . 266 | . 647 | . 429 | . 391 |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 6.625 | cs | 44 | . 432 | 1.000 | 15000 | 3675 | . 351 | . 388 | . 259 | . 524 | . 231 | . 279 |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 6.625 | cs | 50x | . 432 | 1.643 | 15000 | 3675 | . 261 | . 263 | . 176 | . 259 | . 501 | . 405 |
| AUXFY | 0600200-02-05 | 6.625 | cs | 29 | . 432 | 2.000 | 15000 | 3675 | . 396 | . 546 | . 365 | . 573 | . 619 | . 530 |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 6.625 | CS | 5 | . 432 | 1.643 | 15000 | 3675 | . 248 | . 333 | . 222 | . 360 | . 589 | . 452 |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 6.625 | cs | 8 | . 432 | 1.000 | 15000 | 3675 | . 287 | . 471 | . 315 | . 512 | . 272 | . 278 |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05* | 6.625 | cs | 111 | . 432 | 1.643 | 15000 | 3675 | . 253 | . 305 | . 212 | . 655 | . 351 | . 312 |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 6.625 | cs | 13 | . 432 | 1.000 | 15000 | 3675 | . 309 | . 427 | . 296 | . 829 | . 177 | . 230 |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 6.625 | cs | 813 | . 432 | 1.000 | 15000 | 3675 | . 274 | . 444 | . 305 | . 903 | . 217 | . 240 |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 6.625 | cs | 55 | . 432 | 1.000 | 15000 | 3675 | . 268 | . 421 | . 289 | . 870 | . 217 | . 237 |
| AUXFW | .0600200-02-05 | 6.625 | Cs | 55A | . 432 | 1.000 | 15000 | 3675 | . 253 | . 318 | . 222 | . 702 | . 227 | . 237 |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 6.625 | CS | 24 | . 432 | 1.643 | 15000 | 3675 | . 258 | . 827 | . 554 | . 700 | . 799 | . 583 |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 6.625 | CS | 24-C | . 432 | 1.643 | 15000 | 3675 | . 258 | . 944 | . 632 | . 821 | . 861 | . 620 |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 6.625 | cs | 25 | . 432 | 1.642 | 15000 | 3675 | . 296 | . 976 | . 688 | . 900 | . 883 | . 648 |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 8.625 | Cs | 140 | . 500 | 1.355 | 15000 | 4240 | . 326 | . 339 | . 226 | . 298 | . 201 | . $251^{\circ}$ |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-05 | 8.625 | cs | 31 | . 500 | 2.000 | 15000 | 4240 | . 330 | . 369 | . 246 | . 324 | . $318^{\circ}$ | . 323 |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-08 | 2.375 | cs | 612 | . 344 | 2.100 | 15000 | 1207 | . 190 | . 933 | . 622 | . 697 | . 428 | . 333 |
| AUXFY | 0600200-02-08 | 2.375 | cs | 613 | . 346 | 2.100 | 15000 | 1207 | . 169 | . 884 | . 589 | . 665 | . 580 | . 415 |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-08 | 2.375 | cs | 594 | . 344 | 2.100 | 15000 | 1207 | . 194 | . 861 | . 574 | . 579 | . 109 | . 143 |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-08 | 2.375 | CS | 614 | . 344 | 2.100 | 15000 | 1207 | . 157 | . 827 | . 551 | . 620 | . 592 | . 418 |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-08 | 2.375 | cs. | 596 | . 344 | 2.100 | 15000 | 1207 | . 226 | . 816 | . 544 | . 542 | . 139 | . 173 |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-08 | 4.500 | cs | 296 | . 337 | 1.225 | 15000 | 3091 | . 399 | . 378 | . 252 | . 796 | 1.116 | . 829 |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-08 | 4.500 | cs | 298 | . 337 | 1.225 | 15000 | 3091 | . 385 | . 356 | . 237 | . 682 | 1.008 | . 739 |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-08 | 4.500 | CS | CENTR | . 337 | 1.496 | 15000 | 3091 | . 220 | . 344 | . 230 | . 235 | . 927 | . 644 |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-08 | 4.500 | cs | 219 | . 337 | 1.496 | 15000 | 3091 | . 232 | . 356 | . 237 | . 237 | . 910 | . 639 |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-08 | 4.500 | cs | 286 | . 337 | 1.496 | 15000 | 3091 | . 307 | . 279 | . 186 | . 462 | . 730 | . 561 |
| AUXFU | 0600200-02-08 | 4.500 | cs | CENTR | . 438 | 1.216 | 15000 | 2187 | . 155 | . 264 | . 176 | . 182 | 1.207 | . 786 |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-08 | 4.500 | cs | 222 | . 438 | 1.216 | 15000 | 2187 | . 158 | . 269 | . 180 | . 185 | 1.167 | . 764 |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-08 | 4.500 | cs | 221 | . 438 | 1.216 | 15000 | 2187 | . 159 | . 262 | . 175 | . 178 | 1.044 | . 690 |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-08 | 4.500 | cs | 222 | . 438 | 1.000 | 15000 | 2187 | . 958 | . 269 | . 180 | . 185 | . 960 | . 639 |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-08 | 4.500 | cs | 222A | . 438 | 1.000 | 15000 | 2187 | . 158 | . 270 | . 180 | . 186 | . 905 | . 606 |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-08 | 4.500 | cs | 249 | . 438 | 1.900 | 15000 | 2187 | . 373 | . 857 | . 572 | . 556 | . 197 | . 267 |
| AUXFU | 0600200-02-08 | 4.500 | Cs | 269 | . 438 | 1.900 | 15000 | 2187 | . 321 | . 763 | . 509 | . 497 | . 176 | . 234 |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-08 | 6.625 | Cs | 53 | . 432 | 1.643 | 15000 | 3675 | . 384 | . 361 | . 241 | . 556 | 1.149 | . 843 |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-08 | . 6.625 | CS | CENTR | . 432 | 1.643 | 15000 | 3675 | . 345 | . 318 | . 212 | . 511 | 1.101 | . 798 |
| AUXFV | 0600200-02-08 | 6.625 | cs | 6 | . 432 | 1.643 | 15000 | 3675 | . 314 | . 452 | . 301 | . 972 | 1.005 | . 728 |
| AUXFU | 0600200-02-08 | 6.625 | cs | 528 | . 432 | 1.418 | 15000 | 3675 | . 354 | . 328 | . 219 | . 485 | 1.001 | . 742 |

Page 3

| System | Calc package | 0.0. | Mat'l | Node | Thick | SIF | Sigma a | Sigma p | Eq 8 | Eq 9U | Eq 9E | Eq 97 | Eq 10 | Eq 11 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| AUXFY | 0600200-02-08 | 6.625 | cs | 56 | . 432 | 1.643 | 15000 | 3675 | . 326 | . 298 | . 199 | . 462 | . 901 | . 671 |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-08 | 6.625 | cs | 77 | . 432 | 1.643 | 15000 | 3675 | . 261 | . 259 | . 173 | . 143 | . 869 | . 626 |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-08 | 6.625 | cs | 259 | . 562 | 1.770 | 15000 | 2631 | . 384 | . 572 | . 381 | . 346 | . 423 | . 407 |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-08 | 6.625 | cs | 258 | . 562 | 1.900 | 15000 | 2631 | . 315 | . 417 | . 278 | . 245 | . 423 | . 380 |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-08 | 6.625 | CS | 257 | . 562 | 1.031 | 15000 | 2631 | . 248 | . 286 | . 190 | . 161 | . 208 | . 224 |
| AUXFW | 0600200-02-08 | 8.625 | cs | 528 | . 500 | 1.418 | 15000 | 4240 | . 337 | . 297 | . 198 | . 308 | . 499 | . 434 |
| AUXFV | 0600200-02-08 | 8.625 | CS | 294 | . 500 | 1.418 | 15000 | 4240 | . 355 | . 318 | . 212 | . 328 | . 496 | . 439 |
| AUXFU | 0600200-02-08 | 8.625 | cs | 52A | . 500 | 1.418 | 15000 | 4240 | . 366 | . 329 | . 219 | . 276 | . 419 | . 398 |
| AUXFY | N3-03-3A | 3.500 | cs | 43 | . 438 | 2.000 | 15000 | 2535 | . 301 | . 686 | . 460 | . 562 | . 092 | . 176 |
| AUXFW | N3-03-3A | 3.500 | cs | 46 | . 438 | 2.000 | 15000 | 2535 | . 317 | . 541 | . 362 | . 410 | . 222 | . 260 |
| AUXFW | N3-03-3A | 3.500 | cs | 205 | . 438 | 2.000 | 15000 | 2535 | . 297 | . 641 | . 434 | . 520 | . 120 | . 191 |
| AUXFW | N3-03-3A | 3.500 | cs | 208 | . 438 | 2.000 | 15000 | 2535 | . 318 | . 510 | .. 345 | . 379 | . 378 | . 354 |
| AUXFW | N3-03-3A | 4.500 | cs | 212 | . 337 | 1.317 | 15000 | 3091 | . 213 | . 219 | . 155 | . 131 | . 160 | . 181 |
| AUXFY | N3-03-3A | 4.500 | cs | 50 | . 337 | 1.317 | 15000 | 3091 | . 215 | . 216 | . 150 | . 129 | . 112 | . 153 |
| AUXFY | N3-03-3A | 4.500 | cs | 295 | . 438 | 2.020 | 15000 | 3645 | . 297 | . 489 | . 346 | . 297 | . 722 | . 552 |
| AUXFW | M3-03-3A | 4.500 | cs | 14 C | . 438 | 2.020 | 15000 | 3645 | . 284 | . 397 | . 275 | . 225 | . 385 | . 645 |
| AUXFW | N3-03-3A | 4.500 | cs | 145 | . 438 | 1.800 | 15000 | 3645 | . 329 | . 403 | . 283 | . 237 | . 594 | . 488 |
| AUXFW | N3-03-3A | 4.500 | CS | 38 | . 438 | 1.800 | 15000 | 3645 | . 253 | . 383 | . 275 | . 240 | . 359 | . 317 |
| AUXFW | N3-03-3A | 6.625 | CS | 9 | . 562 | 1.900 | 15000 | 4385 | . 417 | . 529 | . 371 | . 362 | . 159 | . 263 |
| AUXFW | N3-03-3A | 6.625 | CS | 10 | . 562 | 1.900 | 15000 | 4385 | . 409 | . 505 | . 354 | . 345 | . 163 | . 258 |
| AUXFW | N3-03-3A | 6.625 | cs | 32A | . 562 | 1.800 | 15000 | 4385 | . 341 | . 481 | . 345 | . 301 | . 219 | . 268 |
| AUXFW | N3-03-3A | 6.625 | cs | 12 | . 562 | 1.800 | 15000 | 4385 | . 374 | . 455 | . 335 | . 300 | . 208 | . 274 |
| AUXFW | N3-03-05A | 2.375 | cs | 680 | . 218 | 1.800 | 15000 | 0 | . 026 | . 037 | . 025 | . 023 | . 393 | . 246 |
| AUXPY | N3-05-05A | 2.375 | CS | 664 | . 218 | 2.100 | 15000 | 0 | . 017 | . 018 | . 012 | . 011 | . 657 | . 401 |
| AUXFW | 43-03-05A | 2.375 | cs | C66 | . 218 | 2.100 | 15000 | 0 | . 017 | . 019 | . 012 | . 019 . | . 651 | . 398 |
| AUXFW | N3-03-05A | 2.375 | cs | C67 | . 218 | 2.100 | 15000 | 0 | . 041 | . 041 | . 028 | . 023 | . 529 | . 334 |
| AUXFW | N3-03-05A | 2.375 | CS | 669 | . 218 | 2.100 | 15000 | 0 | . 048 | . 049 | . 032 | . 027 | . 534 | . 340 |
| AUXFW | M3-03-05A | 2.375 | CS | 813 | . 218 | 2.100 | 15000 | 0 | . 049 | . 053 | . 035 | . 031 | . 392 | . 255 |
| AUXFW | N3-03-05A | 2.875 | cs | C48 | . 276 | 1.800 | 15000 | 188 | . 019 | . 041 | . 027 | . 027 | . 119 | . 074 |
| AUXFW | N3-03-05A | 2.875 | cs | C54 | . 276 | 1.800 | 15000 | 188 | . 018 | . 026 | . 017 | . 016 | . 223 | . 141 |
| AUXFW | N3-03-05A | 2.875 | CS | c72 | . 276 | 1.800 | 15000 | 188 | . 059 | . 067 | . 044 | . 038 | . 144 | . 110 |
| AUXFW | N3-03-05A | 3.500 | CS | 065 | . 300 | 1.000 | 15000 | 219 | . 025 | . 047 | . 031 | . 029 | . 129 | . 088 |
| AUSXL | N3-03-05A | 4.500 | cs | 120 | . 337 | 1.000 | 15000 | 3091 | . 219 | . 515 | . 345 | . 335 | . 107 | . 152 |
| AUXFW | N3-03-05A | 4.500 | cs | 124 | . 337 | 1.000 | 15000 | 3091 | . 219 | . 680 | . 456 | . 456 | . 104 | . 150 |
| AUXFU | N3-03-05A | 4.500 | cs | 717 | . 337 | 1.000 | 15000 | 3091 | . 220 | . 818 | . 549 | . 560 | . 134 | . 169 |
| AUXFW | N3-03-05A | 4.500 | cs | A31 | . 337 | 1.800 | 15000 | 3091 | . 218 | . 889 | . 596 | . 606 | . 843 | . 593 |
| AUXFW | N3-03-05A | 4.500 | cs | A31-C | . 337 | 1.496 | 15000 | 3091 | . 212 | . 810 | . 543 | . 551 | . 727 | . 521 |
| AUXFW | N3.03-05A | 4.500 | cs | A32 | . 337 | 1.800 | 15000 | 3091 | . 211 | . 949 | . 636 | . 652 | . 834 | . 585 |
| AUXFW | M3-03-05A | 4.500 | CS | 138 | . 337 | 1.800 | 15000 | 3091 | . 212 | . 681 | . 456 | . 452 | . 916 | . 634 |
| AUXFW | M3-03-05A | 4.500 | cs | A38-C | . 337 | 1.496 | 15000 | 3091 | . 218 | . 584 | . 391 | . 380 | . 795 | . 564 |
| AUXFW | N3-03-05A | 4.500 | cs | A40 | . 337 | 1.800 | 15000 | 3091 | . 224 | . 649 | . 434 | . 425 | . 925 | . 645 |
| NUSXW | N3-03-05A | 4.500 | cs | A48 | . 337 | 1.000 | 15000 | 3091 | . 215 | . 840 | . 563 | . 565 | . 326 | . 281 |
| AUXFW | N3-03-05A | 4.500 | cs | 7292 | . 337 | 1.000 | 15000 | 3091 | . 215 | . 863 | . 578 | . 582 | . 342 | . 291 |
| AUXFW | 43-03-05A | 4.500 | cs | 729 | . 337 | 1.000 | 15000 | 3091 | . 215 | . 866 | . 581 | . 585 | . 404 | . 328 |
| AUXFW | N3-03-05A | 4.500 | CS | 050 | . 337 | 1.000 | 15000 | 3091 | . 215 | . 825 | . 553 | . 554 | . 352 | . 297 |
| AUSFW | N3-03-05A | 4.500 | CS | 052 | . 337 | 1.000 | 15000 | 3091 | . 215 | . 810 | . 543 | . 543 | . 333 | . 286 |



Database of Most Highly Stressed Nodes
Page


| system | Calc package | O.D. | Mat'l | Node | Thick | SIf | Signa a | Signa P | Eq 8 | Eq 90 | Eq 9 ¢ | Eq 9 F | Eq 10 | Eq 11 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| ERCW | N3-67-01A | 3.500 | cs | 2HH | . 216 | 2.100 | 15000 | 531 | . 119 | 186 | . 124 | . 130 | . 131 | . 126 |
| ERC | N3-67-01A | 4.500 | cs | $66 x$ | 237 | 1.928 | 5000 | 642 | . 378 | . 735 | . 504 | . 570 | . 618 | . 522 |
| ERCN | N3-67-01A | 4.500 | cs | 6SY | . 237 | 1.800 | 15000 | 642 | . 334 | . 668 | 445 | . 504 | . 541 | . 458 |
| ERCN | N3-67-014 | 4.500 | cs | IA8 | . 237 | 1.800 | 15000 | 642 | . 132 | . 420 | . 280 | . 332 | . 070 | . 095 |
| ERCN | W3-67-01A | 4.500 | cs | 275x | . 237 | 2.854 | 15000 | 642 | . 364 | . 800 | . 724 | . 900 | . 796 | 623 |
| ERCW | N3-67-01A | 500 | cs | 273 r | 237 | 1.800 | 15000 | 642 | . 230 | . 66 | . 441 | . 545 | 476 | . 377 |
| ERCW | N3-67-01A | 6.625 | ss | fl34 | . 280 | 1.800 | 15700 | 828 | . 139 | . 308 | . 206 | . 236 | . 327 | . 252 |
| ERCU | N3-67-01A | 6.625 | ss | 9068 | . 280 | 1.800 | 15700 | 828 | . 081 | . 199 | . 133 | . 154 | . 273 | . 196 |
| ERCW | N3-67-01A | 6.625 | ss | 9074 | . 280 | 1.800 | 1570 | 828 | . 084 | . 180 | . 12 | . 137 | . 306 | . 217 |
| ERCW | N3-67-01A | 6.625 | ss | FL35 | . 280 | 1.800 | 15700 | 828 | . 099 | . 193 | . 129 | . 144 | 32 | . 236 |
| ERCN | N3-67-01A | 6.625 | ss | nbx | . 280 | 1.844 | 45700 | 828 | . 072 | . 124 | . 087 | . 091 | . 445 | . 29 |
| ERCN | N3-67-01A | 6.625 | cs | Ahzx | . 280 | 2.784 | 1500 | 828 | . 136 | . 218 | . 145 | . 152 | 1.599 | . 965 |
| ERCW | N3-67-014 | 6.625 | cs | ahzr | . 280 | 1.800 | 15000 | 828 | . 101 | . 141 | . 094 | . 094 | . 879 | 568 |
| ERCN | N3-67-01A | 6.625 | cs | 900 | . 280 | 2.780 | 15000 | 828 | . 208 | . 588 | . 392 | . 47 | . 596 | . 441 |
| ERCH | N3-67-014 | 6.625 | cs | 900 | . 280 | 1.800 | 1500 | 828 | . 153 | . 378 | . 252 | . 296 | . 373 | . 285 |
| ERCW | N3-67-01A | 6.625 | cs | Fl33 | . 280 | 1.800 | 15000 | 828 | . 151 | . 353 | . 235 | . 273 | . 356 | . 274 |
| ERCW | N3-67-01A | 6.625 | cs | 516 | . 280 | 1.800 | 15000 | 828 | .175 | . 248 | . 16 | . 169 | . 213 | . 198 |
| ERCH | N3-67-01A | 6.625 | cs | 510 | . 280 | 1.80 | 1500 | 828 | . 16 | . 275 | . 183 | . 198 | . 039 | . 088 |
| ERCW | N3-67-014 | 6.625 | cs | $527 \times$ | . 280 | 1.800 | 15000 | 828 | . 190 | . 250 | . 167 | . 164 | . 335 | . 277 |
| ERCU | N3-67-01A | 8.625 | cs | 449x | . 322 | 3.869 | 15000 | 953 | . 090 | . 245 | . 163 | . 192 | 2.042 | . 897 |
| ERCN | N3-67-01A | 8.625 | cs | 449 | . 322 | 1.000 | 15000 | 953 | . 074 | . 115 | . 07 | . 079 | . 507 | . 334 |
| ERCW | N3-67-01A | 8.625 | cs | IEB | . 322 | 1.00 | 15000 | 953 | . 073 | . 109 | . 07 | . 07 | . 477 | . 316 |
| ERCW | N3-67-01A | 8.625 | cs | LYH | . 322 | 1.000 | 15000 | 953 | . 079 | . 114 | . 076 | . 076 | . 236 | . 173 |
| ERCH | N3-67-01A | 8.625 | cs | 4735 | . 322 | 2.439 | 15000 | 953 | . 133 | : 233 | . 158 | . 168 | . 244 | . 199 |
| ERCH | W3-67-01A | 8.625 | cs | 473 E | . 322 | 1.000 | 15000 | 953 | . 102 | . 15 | . 10 | . 10 | . 100 | . 101 |
| ERCW | N3-67-01A | 8.625 | ss | 736 | . 322 | 2.000 | 15700 | 953 | . 103 | . 263 | . 175 | . 220 | . 806 | . 525 |
| ERCW | N3-67-01A | 8.625 | ss | 737x | . 322 | 1.000 | 15700 | 953 | . 071 | . 142 | . 095 | . 112 | . 249 | . 178 |
| ERCW | N3-67-014 | 8.625 | ss | 765 | . 322 | 2.000 | 15700 | 953 | . 109 | . 242 | . 16 | . 19 | 1.017 | . 654 |
| ERCU | H3-67-014 | 8.625 | ss | 789 | . 322 | 2.100 | 15700 | 953 | . 139 | . 228 | . 153 | . 168 | 1.020 | . 668 |
| ERCW | N3-67-01A | 8.625 | ss | 811 | . 322 | 2.000 | 15700 | 953 | . 115 | . 335 | . 22 | . 285 | . 89 | . 585 |
| ERCW | 133-67-01A | 8.625 | SS | L17 | . 322 | 1.000 | 15700 | 953 | . 091 | . 151 | . 101 | . 113 | . 15 | . 128 |
| ERC | N3-67-01A | 8.625 | ss | 830 E | . 322 | 2.43 | 15700 | 953 | . 083 | . 246 | . 165 | . 210 | . 739 | . 47 |
| ERCW | N3-67-01A | 8.625 | ss | 834 | . 322 | 2.100 | 15700 | 953 | . 173 | . 421 | . 282 | . 347 | 1.029 | . 687 |
| ERCW | N3-67-01A | 10.750 | cs | $\times \times 1$ | . 365 | 5.143 | 15000 | 1059 | . 139 | . 489 | . 326 | . 431 | 1.096 | . 713 |
| ERCW | N3-67-01A | 10.750 | cs | 735 | . 365 | 1.968 | 15000 | 1059 | . 108 | . 213 | . 142 | . 168 | . 587 | . 395 |
| ERCW | M3-67-01A | 10.750 | cs | 735 | . 365 | 1.968 | 15000 | 1059 | . 105 | . 305 | . 204 | . 262 | . 256 | . 196 |
| ERCW | N3-67-011 | 10.750 | cs | 736 | . 365 | 2.000 | 15000 | 1059 | . 095 | . 18 | . 122 | . 14 | . 474 | . 323 |
| ERCM | N3-67-014 | 10.750 | cs | $800 \times$ | . 365 | 5.143 | 15000 | 1059 | . 129 | . 555 | . 371 | . 499 | . 949 | . 621 |
| ERCW | N3-67-014 | 10.750 | cs | 810 | . 365 | 1.968 | 15000 | 1059 | . 104 | . 334 | . 223 | . 288 | . 486 | . 333 |
| ERCW | N3-67-014 | 10.750 | cs | 810 | . 365 | 1.968 | 15000 | 1059 | . 099 | . 166 | . 111 | . 124 | . 467 | . 308 |
| ERCW | N3-67-014 | 18.000 | cs | $85 \times$ | . 375 | 8.014 | 15000 | 1801 | . 215 | . 472 | . 312 | . 391 | 1.550 | . 878 |
| ERCW | N3-67-01A | 18.000 | cs | 206x | . 375 | 8.014 | 15000 | 1801 | . 342 | . 874 | . 582 | . 687 | 1.090 | . 791 |
| ERCW | N3-67-014 | 18.000 | cs | 2118-C | . 375 | 2.493 | 15000 | 1801 | . 123 | . 140 | . 093 | . 087 | . 257 | . 203 |
| ERCM | N3-67-014 | 18.000 | cs | 2115 | . 375 | 2.493 | 15000 | 180 | . 138 | . 209 | . 139 | . 146 | . 237 | . 197 |
| ERCW | M3-67-01A | 18.000 | cs | Fl20 | . 375 | 1.000 | 15000 | 1809 | . 132 | . 168 | . 112 | . 109 | . 086 | . 105 |
| ERCW | N3-67-01A | 18.000 | cs | 224 | . 373 | 1.000 | 15000 | 1801 | . 222 | . 274 | . 183 | . 179 | . 030 | . 107 |

Database of Most Highly Stressed Nodes
Page 6

| System | Calc package | O.D. |  | Node | Thick |  | Sigma a | Sigma p |  | Eq 90 | Eq 9E | Eq 9F | Eq 10 | Eq 11 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| ERCW | N3-67-01A | 18.000 | CS | WP14A | . 375 | 1.000 | 15000 | 1801 | . 162 | . 194 | . 129 | . 125 | . 018 | . 090 |
| ERCH | N3-67-01A | 18.000 | cs | 224A | . 375 | 1.000 | 15000 | 1801 | . 229 | . 275 | . 183 | . 177 | . 030 | . 110 |
| ERCW | N3-67-01A | 18.000 | CS | 1014 | . 375 | 3.500 | 15000 | 1801 | . 171 | . 265 | . 177 | . 190 | . 093 | . 124 |
| ERCW | N3-67-01A | 18.000 | cs | 2315 | . 375 | 3.500 | 15000 | 1801 | . 225 | . 356 | . 238 | . 258 | . 071 | . 133 |
| ERCW | N3-67-01A | 18.000 | CS | 245B | . 375 | 3.500 | 15000 | 1801 | . 183 | . 308 | . 205 | . 222 | . 167. | . 174 |
| ERCW | N3-67-01A | 18.000 | cs | 253 B | . 375 | 3.500 | 15000 | 1801 | . 153 | . 218 | . 145 | . 148 | . 258 | . 216 |
| ERCW | N3-67-01A | 24:000 | cs | 48Y | . 375 | 1.000 | 15000 | 2441 | . 231 | . 292 | . 194 | . 191 | . 063 | . 130 |
| ERCW | N3-67-01A | 24.000 | cs | UP4 | . 375 | 1.000 | 15000 | 2441 | . 213 | . 313 | . 209 | 223 | . 150 | . 175 |
| ERCN | N3-67-01A | 24.000 | cs | 54X | . 375 | 1.000 | 15000 | 2441 | . 214 | . 316 | . 211 | 226 | . 153 | . 177 |
| ERCW | N3-67-01A | 24.000 | cs | 85 | . 375 | 6.420 | 15000 | 2441 | . 446 | . 799 | . 532 | . 577 | . 793 | . 654 |
| ERCW | N3-67-01A | 24.000 | cs | 85x | . 375 | 8.014 | 15000 | 2441 | . 215 | . 340 | . 226 | . 236 | . 861 | . 603 |
| ERCW | N3-67-01A | 24.000 | cs | 85 | . 375 | 6.420 | 15000 | 2449 | . 445 | . 755 | . 503 | . 536 | . 390 | . 412 |
| ERCW | N3-67-01A | 24.000 | cs | 160 | . 375 | 3.345 | 15000 | 2449 | . 188 | . 636 | . 424 | . 554 | . 365 | . 294 |
| ERCW | N3-67-01A | 24.000 | CS | 206 | . 375 | 6.420 | 15000 | 2441 | . 317 | . 487 | . 572 | . 381 | . 601 | . 487 |
| ERCW | N3-67-01A | 24.000 | cs | 206x | . 375 | 8.014 | 15000 | 2441 | . 286 | . 564 | . 376 | . 421 | . 603 | . 476 |
| ERCW | N3-67-01A | 24.000 | cs | 206 | . 375 | 6.420 | 15000 | 2441 | . 323 | . 572 | . 381 | . 410 | 1.131 | . 808 |
| ERCW | N3-67-01A | 30.000 | CS | 23E-C | . 375 | 4.976 | 15000 | 3081 | . 254 | . 312 | . 208 | . 206 | . 904 | . 644 |
| ERCW | N3-67-01A | 30.000 | cs | $26 E$ | . 375 | 4.976 | 15000 | 3081 | . 225 | . 405 | . 270 | . 311 | . 821 | . 583 |
| ERCW | N3-67-01A | 30.000 | cs | $26 E$ | . 375 | 1.000 | 15000 | 3081 | . 211 | . 234 | . 156 | . 146 | . 165 | . 183 |
| ERCW | N3-67-01A | 30.000 | Cs. | 358 | . 375 | 4.976 | 15000 | 3081 | . 246 | . 507 | . 338 | . 403 | 1.123 | . 772 |
| :RCW | N3-67-01A | 30.000 | cs | 37 | . 375 | 1.000 | 15000 | 3081 | . 354 | . 459 | -. 306 | . 310 | . 299 | . 321 |
| ERCU | N3-67-01A | 30.000 | CS | 3315 | . 375 | 4.976 | 15000 | 3081 | . 255 | . 547 | . 364 | . 439 | 1.103 | . 764 |
| ERCW | N3-67-01A | $30.000{ }^{\circ}$ | CS | 335B | . 375 | 4.976 | 15000 | 3081 | . 233 | . 484 | . 323 | :384 | . 795 | . 570 |
| ERCW | N3-67-01A | 30.000 | cs | 3358-C | : 375 | 4.976 | 15000 | 3081 | . 257 | . 340 | . 227. | . 232 | . 886 | . 634 |
| ERCW | N3-67-02A | 2.375 | SS | 141 | . 154 | 2.100 | 18800 | 500 | . 060 | . 357 | . 238 | . 330 | . 529 | . 342 |
| ERCW | N3-67-02A | 2.375 | SS | 142A | . 154 | 2.100 | 18800 | 500 | . 041 | . 389 | . 259 | . 378 | . 646 | . 404 |
| ERCW | M3-67-02A | 2.375 | SS | T44A | . 154 | 2.100 | 18800 | 500 | . 048 | . 330 | . 220 | . 317 | . 577 | . 365 |
| ERCM | M3-67-02A | 2.375 | CS | W78 | . 154 | 2.100 | 15000 | 500 | . 053 | . 108 | . 072 | . 083 | . 651 | . 419 |
| ERCW | M3-67-02A | 2.375 | SS | 5428 | . 154 | 2.100 | 18800 | 500 | . 042 | . 377 | . 251 | . 365 | . 557 | . 351 |
| ERCW | M3-67-02A | 2.375 | ss | T448 | . 154 | 2.100 | 18800 | 500 | . 045 | . 361 | . 241 | . 350 | . 626 | . 393 |
| ERCN | N3-67-02A | 2.375 | CS | $N 232$ | . 154 | 2.000 | 15000 | 500 | . 083 | . 172 | . 115 | . 134 | . 670 | . 435 |
| ERCW | M3-67-02A | 2.375 | cs | N68 | . 151 | 2.100 | 15000 | 500 | . 057 | . 116 | . 077 | . 089 | . 454 | . 295 |
| ERCN | N3-67-02A | 3.500 | cs | 13x | . 216 | 1.000 | 15000 | 531 | . 083 | . 522 | . 348 | . 478 | . 631 | . 412 |
| ERCH | N3-67-02A | 3.500 | cs | 134 | . 216 | 1.800 | 15000 | 531 | . 100 | . 656 | . 437 | . 604 | 1.013 | . 648 |
| ERCW | M3-67-02A | 3.500 | cs | 150 | . 216 | 1.800 | 15000 | 531 | . 114 | . 619 | . 413 | . 569 | . 069 | . 087 |
| ERCU | N3-67-02A | 3.500 | cs | 147 | . 216 | 1.800 | 15000 | 531 | . 112 | . 625 | . 416 | . 575 | . 066 | . 084 |
| ERCY | M3-67-02A | 3.500 | CS | 148 | . 216 | 1.800 | 15000 | 531 | . 109 | . 626 | . 417 | . 579 | . 059 | . 079 |
| ERCN | N3-67-02A | 3.500 | CS | 151 | . 216 | 1.800 | 15000 | 531 | . 107 | . 623 | . 416 | . 577 | . 056 | . 076 |
| ERCW | M3-67-02A | 3.500 | CS | M1X | . 216 | 2.374 | 15000 | 531 | . 068 | . 455 | . 303 | . 405 | . 724 | . 461 |
| ERCW. | N3-67-02A | 3.500 | cs | C15B | . 216 | 1.800 | 15000 | 531 | . 043 | . 138 | . 092 | . 118 | . 906 | . 560 |
| ERCN | M3-67-02A | 3.500 | CS | C15B | . 216 | 1.77 | 15000 | 531 | . 043 | . 137 | . 091 | . 196 | . 894 | . 553 |
| ERCN | U3-67-02A | 3.500 | CS | C15E | . 216 | 1.800 | 15000 | 531 | . 038 | . 113 | . 075 | . 095 | . 662 | . 443 |
| ERCN | N3-67-02A | 3.500 | cs | C16E | . 216 | 1.800 | 15000 | 531 | . 040 | . 135 | . 090 | . 197 | . 656 | . 410 |
| ERCN | M3-67-02A | 6.625 | SS | T3 | . 280 | 2.800 | 18800 | 828 | . 127 | . 364 | . 243 | . 298 | . 661 | . 448 |
| ERCM | N3-67-02A | 6.625 | SS | 73A | . 280 | 1.800 | 18800 | 828 | . 093 | . 239 | . 159 | . 192 | . 404 | . 280 |
| ERCW | N3-67-02A | 6.625 | SS | T11 | . 280 | 2.266 | 18800 | 828 | . 075 | . 186 | . 124 | . 146 | . 439 | . 294 |

Page 7

| Syster | ge | -.D | Mat'l | Node | Thick | SIF | Sigma a | 0 | Eq 8 | Eq 90 | Eq 9E | 95 | Eq 10 | Eq 11 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| ERCW | N3-67-02A | 6.625 | ss | T12E | . 280 | 2.266 | 18800 | 828 | . 061 | . 134 | . 089 | . 106 | . 414 | . 273 |
| ERCW | N3-67-02A | 6.625 | ss | P87 | . 280 | 1.800 | 18800 | 828 | . 093 | . 120 | . 080 | . 078 | . 490 | . 331 |
| ERCW | N3-67-02A | 6.625 | SS | T19 | . 280 | 1.800 | 18800 | 828 | . 079 | . 222 | . 148 | . 178 | . 363 | . 249 |
| ERCW | N3-67-02A | 6.625 | SS | FL21 | . 280 | 1.800 | 18800 | 357 | . 042 | . 119 | . 079 | . 095 | . 183 | . 127 |
| ERCW | N3-67-02A | 6.625 | cs | 90X | . 280 | 2.800 | 15000 | 828 | . 090 | . 276 | . 184 | . 226 | . 551 | . 367 |
| ERCW | M3-67-02A | 6.625 | CS | 90Y | . 280 | 1.800 | 15000 | 828 | . 078 | . 174 | . 116 | . 136 | . 336 | . 233 |
| ERCW | N3-67-02A | 6.625 | CS | 9038 | . 280 | 2.266 | 15000 | 828 | . 089 | . 151 | . 101 | . 113 | . 335 | . 237 |
| ERCW | N3-67-02A | 6.625 | CS | 9114 | . 280 | 1.800 | 15000 | 828 | . 130 | . 274 | . 183 | . 222 | . 375 | . 277 |
| ERCW | N3-67-02A | 6.625 | CS | 111 | . 280 | 1.800 | 15000 | 828 | . 105 | . 224 | . 149 | . 181 | . 314 | . 230 |
| ERCW | N3-67-02A | 6.625 | cs | 9114 | . 280 | 1.800 | 15000 | 828 | . 130 | . 274 | . 183 | . 222 | . 375 | . 277 |
| ERCW | N3-67-02A | 8.625 | CS | P2X | . 322 | 2.416 | 15000 | 953 | . 087 | . 593 | . 395 | . 558 | . 888 | . 568 |
| ERCW | M3-67-02A | 8.625 | CS | P21 | . 322 | 1.000 | 15000 | 953 | . 077 | . 339 | . .226 | . 308 | . 349 | . 240 |
| ERCW | N3-67-02A | 8.625 | cs | 124 | . 322 | 1.000 | 15000 | 953 | . 079 | . 310 | . 206 | . 277 | . 302 | . 213 |
| ERCW | N3-67-02A | 8.625 | CS | P24E | . 322 | 2.439 | 15000 | 953 | . 096 | . 183 | . 122 | . 143 | . 355 | . 257 |
| ERCW | N3-67-02A | 8.625 | cs | 115 | . 322 | 2.439 | 15000 | 953 | . 091 | . 235 | . 157 | . 196 | . 399 | . 275 |
| ERCW | N3-67-02A | 8.625 | cs | 646 | . 322 | 1.000 | 15000 | 953 | . 133 | . 355 | . 236 | . 285 | . 243 | . 199 |
| ERCW | N3-67.02A | 8.625 | CS | 6461 | . 322 | 1.000 | 15000 | 953 | . 127 | . 338 | . 225 | . 271 | . 258 | . 206 |
| ERCH | N3-67-02A | 8.625 | cs | 655 | . 322 | 1.440 | 15000 | 953 | . 078 | . 478 | . 318 | . 427 | . 162 | . 128 |
| ERCW | N3-67-02A | 8.625 | SS | P44 | . 322 | 1.843 | 18800 | 953 | . 070 | . 166 | . 191 | . 137 | . 106 | . 091 |
| ERCW | N3-67-02A | 12.750 | SS | FL38 | . 250 | 1.000 | 18800 | 1801 | . 096 | . 080 | . 053 | . 040 | 0.000 | . 038 |
| ERCW | N3-67-02A | 12.750 | ss. | CH3 | . 250 | 1.000 | 18800 | 1801 | . 098 | . 627 | . 418 | . 595 | 0.000 | . 039 |
| ERCN | N3-67-02A | 12.750 | SS | CHA3 | . 250 | 1.000 | 18800 | 1801 | . 098 | . 673 | . 449 | . 642 | :009 | . 040 |
| ERCW | N3-67-02A | 18.000 | CS | mean | . 375 | 1.000 | 15000 | 1801 | . 214 | . 304 | . 203 | . 215 | . 018 | . 096 |
| ERCW | N3-67-02A | 18.000 | cs | M 408 | . 375 | 1.000 | 15000 | 1801 | . 224 | . 341 | . 227 | . 247 | . 014 | . 098 |
| ERCW | N3-67-02A | 18.000 | CS | H4OC | . 375 | 1.000 | 15000 | 1801 | . 220 | . 345 | . 230 | . 253 | . 013 | . 095 |
| ERCW | N3-67-02A | 18.000 | cs | 95 | . 375 | 1.000 | 15000 | 1801 | . 199 | . 314 | . 210 | . 231 | . 014 | . 088 |
| ERCW | N3-67-02A | 18.000 | Cs | 111A | . 375 | 3.500 | 15000 | 1801 | . 251 | . 378 | . 252 | . 273 | . 078 | . 147 |
| ERCW | N3-67-02A | 18.000 | Cs | 129E | . 375 | 2.493 | 15000 | 1801 | . 146 | . 202 | . 135 | . 140 | . 323 | . 252 |
| ERCW | N3-67-02A | 18.000 | cs | 1298-C | . 375 | 2.493 | 15000 | 1801 | . 145 | . 186 | . 124 | . 125 | . 303 | . 240 |
| ERCW | M3-67-02A | 18.000 | cs | 23x | . 375 | 5.000 | 15000 | 1801 | . 267 | . 778 | . 519 | . 664 | . 188 | . 220 |
| ERCH | N3-67-02A | 18.000 | Cs | 2358 | . 375 | 2.493 | 15000 | 1801 | . 166 | . 333 | . 222 | . 242 | . 036 | . 088 |
| ERCW | M3-67-02A | 18.000 | cs | 1298 | . 375 | 1.000 | 15000 | 1801 | . 132 | . 146 | . 097 | . 090 | . 096 | . 110 |
| ERCW | M3-67-02A | 18.000 | cs | 1298 | . 375 | 2.493 | 15000 | 1801 | . 142 | . 185 | . 123 | . 126 | . 239 | . 200 |
| ERCW | M3-67-02A | 18.000 | cs | 88x | . 375 | 5.000 | 15000 | 1801 | . 263 | . 657 | . 438 | . 551 | . 993 | . 693 |
| ERCW | M3-67-02A | 20.000 | cs | 165 | . 375 | 3.345 | 15000 | 2014 | . 138 | . 266 | . 178 | . 205 | . 051 | . 086 |
| ERCW | N3-67-02A | 20.000 | CS | 1142 | . 375 | 1.000 | 15000 | 2014 | . 185 | . 201 | . 134 | . 122 | . 017 | . 084 |
| ERCW | N3-67-02A | 20.000 | cs | 449 | . 375 | 1.000 | 15000 | 2014 | . 196 | . 215 | . 144 | . 131 | . 019 | . 090 |
| ERCU | N3-67-02A | 20.000 | cs | 4668-C | . 375 | 3.766 | 15000 | 2014 | . 199 | . 257 | . 179 | . 170 | . 025 | . 094 |
| ERCW | N3-67-02A | 24.000 | cs | 808 | . 375 | 5.596 | 15000 | 2441 | . 205 | . 351 | . 234 | . 263 | . 843 | . 588 |
| ERCW | N3-67-02A | 24.000 | CS | 88 | . 375 | 6.416 | 15000 | 2441 | . 562 | . 825 | . 550 | . 582 | . 703 | . 647 |
| ERCW | N3-67-02A | 24.000 | cs | 88 | . 375 | 6.416 | 15000 | 2461 | . 255 | . 570 | . 380 | . 460 | . 858 | . 617 |
| ERCW | N3-67-02A | 24.000 | CS | 1120 | . 375 | 4.270 | 15000 | 2441 | . 253 | . 374 | . 249 | . 260 | . 722 | . 535 |
| ERCU | N3-67-02A | 24.000 | cs | 230A | . 375 | 6.416 | 15000 | 2441 | . 568 | . 999 | . 699 | . 781 | . 149 | . 317 |
| ERCW | M3-67-02A | 24.000 | cs | 2304 | . 373 | 6.416 | 15000 | 2461 | . 294 | . 806 | . 538 | . 679 | . 178 | . 224 |
| ERCW | N3-67-02A | 24.000 | Cs | 154 | . 375 | 3.345 | 15000 | 2441 | . 202 | . 370 | . 247 | . 285 | . 989 | . 674 |
| ERCW | N3-67-02A | 24.000 | cs | 196 | . 375 | 1.000 | 15000 | 2441 | . 267 | . 549 | . 361 | . 405 | . 038 | 129 |


| System | Calc package | 0.D. | Mat'l | Node | Thick | SIf | sigma | Sigma p | Eq 8 | Eq 9 | Eq $9 E$ | Eq 9F | Eq 10 | Eq |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| ERCW | N3-67-02A | 24.000 | cs | 202 | . 375 | 1.000 | 15000 | 2441 | . 288 | . 501 | . 334 | 363 | . 024 | . 129 |
| ERCW | N3-67-02A | 24.000 | cs | 187 | . 375 | 1.000 | 15000 | 2441 | . 247 | . 356 | . 238 | . 246 | . 456 | 373 |
| ERCW | N3-67-02A | 24.000 | cs | 188 | . 375 | 1.000 | 15000 | 2441 | . 246 | . 354 | . 236 | . 244 | . 451 | . 369 |
| ERCN | N3-67-02A | 24.000 | cs | 23x | . 375 | 5.000 | 15000 | 2441 | . 246 | . 511 | . 341 | . 408 | . 104 | . 160 |
| ERCN | N3-67-43A | 6.625 | cs | 500 N | . 280 | 1.800 | 15000 | 828 | . 079 | . 090 | . 060 | . 056 | . 212 | . 159 |
| ERCN | N3-67-63A | 6.625 | cs | 410 | . 280 | 2.000 | 15000 | 828 | . 073 | . 094 | . 063 | . 062 | . 275 | . 194 |
| ERCU | N3-67-43A | 6.625 | ss | 770 | . 280 | 1.800 | 15700 | 828 | . 079 | . 088 | . 059 | . 054 | . 152 | . 123 |
| ERCW | 43-67-43A | 6.625 | ss | 750 | . 280 | 1.800 | 15700 | 828 | . 112 | . 119 | . 079 | . 069 | . 173 | . 149 |
| ERCM | N3-67-43A | 6.625 | ss | C29E | . 280 | 2.266 | 15700 | 828 | . 062 | . 062 | . 041 | . 035 | . 205 | 47 |
| ERCW | N3-67-43A | 6.625 | ss | centr | . 280 | 2.266 | 15700 | 828 | . 055 | . 076 | . 050 | . 051 | . 276 | . 188 |
| ERCW | N3-67-43A | 6.625 | ss | C27E | . 280 | 2.266 | 15700 | 828 | . 055 | . 076 | . 051 | . 052 | . 269 | . 184 |
| ERCW | N3-67-43A | 6.625 | ss | P123 | . 280 | 1.800 | 15700 | 828 | . 133 | . 183 | -. 122 | . 120 | . 022 | . 067 |
| - ERCW | N3-67-43n | 4.500 | cs | 410 | . 237 | 2.000 | 15000 | 642 | . 090 | . 162 | . 108 | . 121 | . 727 | . 472 |
| ERCW | N3-67-43n | 4.500 | cs | FLO2 | . 237 | 1.800 | 15000 | 642 | . 064 | . 126 | . 084 | . 097 | . 535 | . 346 |
| ERCW | H3-67-43A | 4.500 | cs | flot | . 237 | 1.000 | 15000 | 642 | . 060 | . 121 | . 081 | . 094 | . 497 | . 322 |
| ERCW | N3-67-43A | 4.500 | cs | C158 | . 237 | 1.800 | 15000 | 642 | . 056 | . 110 | . 080 | .089 | . 407 | . 266 |
| ERCW | 43-67-43A | 4.500 | cs | centr | . 237 | 1.952 | 15000 | 642 | . 058 | . 120 | .088 | . 099 | . 460 | . 299 |
| ERCW | H3-67-43A | 4.500 | cs | C158 | . 237 | 1.952 | 15000 | 642 | . 057 | . 117 | . 084 | . 095 | . 441 | . 288 |
| ERCW | 143-67-43A | 4.500 | cs | P42J | . 237 | 1.952 | 15000 | 642 | . 096 | . 163 | . 121 | . 111 | . 238 | . 181 |
| ERCW | N3-67-43A | 3.500 | ss | B06E | . 216 | 1.800 | 15700 | 531 | . 053 | . 079. | . 053 | . 056 | 1.168 | . 772 |
| Ercu | N3-67-43A | 3.500 | SS. | 24 | . 216 | 1.800 | 15700 | 531 | . 045 | . 072 | . 048 | . 052 | 1.076 | . 663 |
| ERCW | N3-67-43A | 3.500 | ss | boss | . 216 | 1.800 | 15700 | 531 | . 061 | . 080 | . 056 | . 055 | . 995 | . 621 |
| ERCW | N3-67-43A | 3.500 | ss | 8058 | . 216 | 1.800 | 15700 | 531 | . 040 | . 121 | . 082 | . 065 | . 947 | . 584 |
| ERCW | N3-67-43A | 3.500 | ss | 8038 | . 216 | 1.800 | 15700 | 531 | . 073 | . 286 | . 196 | . 157 | . 512 | . 336 |
| ERCW | N3-67-43A | 3.500 | ss | BOSE | . 216 | 1.800 | 15700 | 531 | . 061 | . 224 | . 155 | . 128 | . 456 | . 298 |
| ERCM | N3-67-43A | 3.500 | cs | 500w | . 216 | 1.800 | 15000 | 531 | . 190 | . 307 | . 205 | . 222 | . 354 | . 288 |
| ERCW | N3-67-43A | 3.500 | cs | 490 | . 216 | 1.800 | 15000 | 531 | . 160 | . 270 | . 180 | . 198 | . 330 | . 262 |
| ERCM | 43-67-43A | 4.500 | ss | 100w | . 237 | 1.800 | 15700 | 642 | . 073 | . 166 | . 085 | . 075 | . 074 | . 074 |
| ERCW | N3-67-43A | 4.500 | ss | 100 L | . 237 | 1.800 | 15700 | 642 | . 050 | . 083 | . 063 | . 059 | . 031 | . 039 |
| ERCW | N3-67-43A | 4.500 | ss | 1002 | . 237 | 1.800 | 15700 | 642 | . 050 | . 083 | . 063 | . 059 | . 031 | . 039 |
| ERCW | N3-67-43A | 2.875 | ss | C02E | . 203 | 1.800 | 15700 | 450 | . 035 | . 11 | . 082 | . 097 | . 19 | . 128 |
| ERCN | N3-67-43A | 2.875 | ss | c028 | . 203 | 1.800 | 15700 | 450 | . 045 | . 123 | . 085 | . 102 | . 180 | . 126 |
| ERCH | 43-67-43A | 2.875 | ss | 62 | . 203 | 1.800 | 15700 | 450 | . 045 | . 123 | . 085 | . 103 | . 178 | . 125 |
| ERCN | 43-67-43A | 2.875 | ss | 40 | . 203 | 1.800 | 15700 | 450 | . 032 | . 131 | . 106 | . 123 | . 174 | . 117 |
| ERCH | N3-67-43A | 2.875 | ss | CEntr | . 203 | 1.500 | 15700 | 450 | . 037 | . 106 | . 076 | . 090 | . 170 | . 117 |
| ERCW | N3-67-43A | 2.875 | ss | 62 | . 203 | 1.800 | 15700 | 450 | . 045 | . 123 | . 085 | . 103 | . 178 | . 125 |
| ERCW | N3-67-43A | 2.373 | ss | E01 | . 154 | 2.100 | 15700 | 500 | . 146 | . 340 | . 261 | . 251 | 1.156 | . 752 |
| ERCU | N3-67-43A | 2.375 | ss | E38 | . 154 | 2.100 | 15700 | 500 | . 088 | . 214 | . 148 | . 178 | . 790 | . 509 |
| ERCW | N3-67-43A | 2.375 | ss | E55 | . 154 | 2.100 | 15700 | 500 | . 123 | . 235 | . 168 | . 185 | . 758 | . 504 |
| ERCH | N3-67-43A | 2.375 | ss | E34 | . 154 | 2.100 | 15700 | 500 | . 040 | . 288 | . 201 | . 272 | . 693 | . 432 |
| ERCM | N3-67-43A | 2.375 | ss | E52 | . 154 | 2.100 | 15700 | 500 | . 111 | . 209 | . 148 | . 163 | . 688 | . 457 |
| ERCN | N3-67-43A | 2.375 | ss | E34 | . 154 | 2.100 | 15700 | 500 | . 040 | . 288 | . 201 | . 272 | . 693 | . 432 |
| ERCU | N3-67-094 | 2.375 | ss | Hxac | . 154 | 2.100 | 18800 | 500 | . 054 | . 131 | . 087 | . 109 | 1.109 | . 687 |
| ERCW | N3-67-09A | 2.375 | ss | H×AD | . 154 | 2.100 | 18800 | 500 | . 038 | . 108 | . 072 | . 092 | 1.153 | . 707 |
| ERCW | N3-67-09A | 2.375 | ss | HXAF | . 154 | 2.100 | 18800 | 500 | . 031 | . 085 | . 057 | . 073 | 1.181 | . 721 |
| ERCW | N3-67-09A | 2.375 | ss | HXAG | . 1542 | 2.100 | 18800 | 500 | . 031 | . 064 | . 042 | . 052 | 1.144 | . 698 |


| System | Calc package | O.D. | Mat'l | Mode |  | SIF | Signa a | Sigma p | Eq 8 | Eq 90 | Eq 9E | Eq 9 \% | Eq 10 | Eq 11 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| ERCW | N3-67-09A | 2.375 | SS | HXCC | . 154 | 2.100 | 18800 | 162 | . 055 | . 303 | . 202 | . 253 | 1.098 | 681 |
| ERCW | N3-67-09A | 2.375 | ss | HXCD | . 154 | 2.100 | 18800 | 500 | . 039 | . 286 | 191 | 242 | 1.129 | . 693 |
| ERCW | N3-67-09A | 2.375 | ss | HXCG | . 154 | 2.100 | 18800 | 500 | . 030 | . 252 | 168 | 213 | 1.108 | . 677 |
| ERCW | N3-67-09A | 2.375 | SS | 058 | . 154 | 1.000 | 18800 | 500 | . 037 | . 053 | 035 | . 037 | . 132 | . 094 |
| ERCW | N3-67-09A | 2.375 | SS | HXCO | . 154 | 1.000 | 18800 | 500 | . 027 | . 022 | . 015 | . 011 | 0.000 | . 011 |
| ERCW | N3-67-09A | 4.500 | ss | 889 | . 237 | 1.800 | 18800 | 662 | . 072 | . 292 | . 195 | . 260 | . 578 | 375 |
| ERCW | N3-67-09A | 4.500 | CS | KK5 | . 237 | 1.800 | 15000 | 642 | . 076 | . 268 | . 178 | . 231 | . 883 | . 561 |
| ERCN | N3-67-09A | 4.500 | cs | 87A | . 237 | 1.952 | 15000 | 642 | . 261 | . 426 | . 284 | . 302 | . 860 | . 620 |
| ERCW | N3-67-09A | 4.500 | cs | 87 C . | . 237 | 1.952 | 15000 | 642 | . 241 | . 398 | . 266 | . 283 | . 787 | . 569 |
| ERCW | N3-67-09A | 4.500 | CS | 871 | . 237 | 2.100 | 15000 | 642 | . 133 | . 323 | . 216 | . 252 | . 605 | . 416 |
| ERCW | N3-67-09A | 4.500 | CS | KKK5 | . 237 | 1.000 | 15000 | 642 | . 084 | . 156 | . 104 | . 115 | . 371 | 256 |
| ERCW | N3-67-09A | 6.625 | ss | J4 | . 280 | 1.000 | 18800 | 673 | . 078 | . 149 | . 099 | 112 | . 076 | . 077 |
| ERCW | N3-67-09A | 6.625 | SS | J6 | . 280 | 1.000 | 18800 | 673 | . 102 | . 177 | . 118 | . 128 | . 037 | . 063 |
| ERCW | N3-67-09A | 6.625 | cs | 563 | . 280 | 2.100 | 15000 | 828 | . 076 | . 074 | . 050 | . 042 | . 975 | . 616 |
| ERCW | N3-67-09A | 6.625 | cs | 59 | . 280 | 2.100 | 15000 | 828 | . 078 | . 088 | . 059 | . 057 | 1.005 | . 635 |
| ERCW | N3-67-09A | 6.625 | CS | NN2 | . 280 | 2.266 | 15000 | 828 | . 075 | . 142 | . 095 | . 107 | 1.142 | . 715 |
| ERCU | N3-67-09A | 6.625 | CS | NN2-C | . 280 | 2.266 | 15000 | 828 | . 069 | . 121 | . 080 | . 089 | 1.142 | . 713 |
| ERCW | N3-67-09A | 6.625 | Cs | NN4 | . 280 | 2.266 | 15000 | 828 | . 066 | . 098 | . 066 | . 070 | 1.076 | . 671 |
| ERCW | N3-67-09A | 6.625 | Cs | NN8 | . 280 | 2.100 | 15000 | 828 | . 096 | . 193 | . 129 | . 145 | 1.115 | . 707 |
| ERCW | N3-67-09A | 6.625 | cs | J12 | . 280 | 1.800 | 15000 | 673 | . 104 | . 188 | . 125 | . 140 | 414 | . 290 |
| ERCW | N3-67-09A | 6.625 | Cs | 5532 | . 280 | 1.800 | . 15000 | 828 | . 151 | . 180 | . 120 | . 115 | 412 | . 308 |
| ERCW | N3-67-09i | 6.625 | cs | 551 | . 280 | 8.610 | 15000 | 397 | . 324 | . 460 | . 307 | . 317 | 1.434 | . 990 |
| ERCW | N3-67-09A | 8.625 | SS | B8 | . 322 | 2.439 | 18800 | 953 | . 057 | . 083 | . 055 | . 056 | . 462 | . 300 |
| ERCW | N3-67-09A | 8.625 | SS | B8-C | . 322 | 2.439 | 18800 | 953 | . 057 | . 082 | . 055 | . 056 | . 529 | . 340 |
| ERCW | N3-67-09A | 8.625 | SS | 810 | . 322 | 2.439 | 18800 | 953 | . 057 | . 082 | . 055 | . 055 | . 494 | . 319 |
| ERCW | N3-67-09A | 8.625 | Ss | T6A | . 322 | 3.230 | 18800 | 953 | . 112 | . 136 | . 091 | . 088 | . 193 | . 161 |
| ERCW | N3-67-09A | 8.625 | SS | T7 | . 322 | 2.100 | 18800 | 953 | . 110 | . 126 | . 084 | . 078 | . 148 | . 132 |
| ERCW | N3-67-09A | 8.625 | ss/cs | KK1 | . 322 | 1.800 | 18800 | 953 | . 063 | . 147 | . 098 | . 116 | . 708 | . 450 |
| ERCW | N3-67-09A | 8.625 | CS | 874 | . 322 | 1.843 | 15000 | 953 | . 084 | . 265 | . 176 | . 221 | 1.038 | . 656 |
| ERCW | N3-67-09A | 8.625 | cs | 87m | . 322 | 1.843 | 15000 | 953 | . 085 | . 201 | . 134 | . 159 | 1.051 | . 665 |
| ERCW | N3-67-09A | 8.625 | SS/CS | KK1 | . 322 | . 1.800 | 18800 | 953 | . 079 | . 184 | . 123 | . 146 | . 887 | . 564 |
| ERCW | N3-67-09A | 8.625 | cs | 873A | . 322 | 1.800 | 15000 | 953 | . 093 | . 234 | . 156 | . 188 | . 834 | . 538 |
| ERCW | N3-67-09A | 8.625 | CS | 874 | . 322 | 1.843 | 15000 | 953 | . 101 | . 275 | . 183 | . 223 | . 957 | . 615 |
| ERCW | N3-67-09A | 12.750 | ss | V7 | . 375 | 2.862 | 18800 | 1241 | . 117 | . 421 | . 281 | . 353 | . 157 | . 141 |
| ERCW | N3-67-09A | 12.750 | ss | V7-c | . 375 | 2.862 | 18800 | . 1241 | . 114 | . 464 | . 296 | . 375 | . 177 | . 152 |
| ERCN | N3-67-09A | 12.750 | ss | v8 | . 375 | 2.862 | 18800 | 1241 | . 120 | . 497 | . 278 | . 348 | . 171 | . 150 |
| ERCW | N3-67-09A | 12.750 | ss | V13 | . 375 | 1.000 | 18800 | 1241 | . 190 | . 408 | . 272 | . 314 | . 046 | . 103 |
| ERCW | N3-67-09A | 12.750 | ss | V14 | . 375 | 1.000 | 18800 | 1261 | . 220 | . 509 | . 334 | . 390 | . 032 | . 107 |
| ERCW | N3-67-09A | 12.750 | sS | vi6a | . 375 | 2.862 | 18800 | 1241 | . 306 | . 462 | . 308 | . 322 | . 044 | . 149 |
| ERCW | N3-67-09A | 12.750 | SS | V17a | . 375 | 2.862 | 18800 | 1241 | . 236 | . 489 | . 326 | . 373 | . 076 | 140 |
| ERCW | N3-67-09A | 12.750 | SS | V16-C | . 373 | 2.862 | 18800 | 1241 | . 217 | . 451 | . 300 | . 344 | . 039 | . 110 |
| ERCW | N3-67-09A | 12.750 | ss | v52 | . 375 | 1.800 | 18800 | 1241 | . 120 | . 165 | . 110 | . 114 | . 571 | . 391 |
| ERCN | N3-67-09A | 12.750 | SS | $\times 21$ | . 375 | 2.862 | 18800 | 1241 | . 070 | . 093 | . 062 | . 062 | . 973 | . 612 |
| ERCW | N3-67-09A | 12.750 | sS | $\times 21-\mathrm{C}$ | . 375 | 2.862 | 18800 | 1241 | .070 | . 093 | . 062 | . 062 | . 733 | . 468 |
| ERCW | N3-67-09A | 12.750 | SS | Y20-C | . 375 | 2.862 | 18800 | 1241 | . 087 | . 164 | . 109 | . 126 | . 754 | . 487 |
| ERCW | N3-67-09A | 12.750 | CS | V2 | . 375 | 1.000 | 15000 | 1249 | . 181 | . 290 | . 193 | . 207 | . 335 | . 273 |

$2 / 21 / 91 \quad$ Database of Most Highly Stressed Nodes Page 10

| System | Calc package | O.D. | Mat'l |  | Thick | SIF | Sigma a | Sigmap | Eq 8 | Eq 90 | Eq 9E | Eq 9F | Eq 10 | Eq 11 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| ERCW | N3-67-09A | 12.750 | cs | $\sqrt{ } 3$ | . 375 | 1.000 | 15000 | 1241 | . 123 | . 219 | . 146 | . 161 | . 197 | . 168 |
| ERCM | N3-67-09A | 12.750 | CS | V3A | . 375 | 1.000 | 95000 | 1241 | . 124 | . 215 | . 143 | . 157 | . 191 | . 164 |
| ERCW | N3-67-09A | 12.750 | CS | $x 1$ | . 375 | 4.700 | 15000 | 3081 | . 223 | . 283 | . 189 | . 186 | . 159 | . 185 |
| ERCU | N3-67-09A | 12.750 | cs | $\times 2$ | . 375 | 2.100 | 15000 | 548 | . 055 | . 154 | . 103 | . 127 | . 192 | . 137 |
| ERCU | N3-67-09A | 14.000 | ss | 07 | . 375 | 3.848 | 18800 | 1374 | . 091 | . 211 | . 140 | . 164 | . 236 | . 178 |
| ERCW | N3-67-09A | 14.000 | ss | 08 | . 375 | 3.848 | 18800 | 1374 | . 108 | . 219 | . 146 | . 167 | . 213 | . 171 |
| ERCW | N3-67-09A | 14.000 | ss | 010 | . 375 | 2.936 | 18800 | 1374 | . 167 | . 236 | . 157 | . 161 | . 149 | . 156 |
| ERCW | N3-67-09A | 14.000 | sS | 021 | . 375 | 1.000 | 18800 | 1374 | . 200 | . 323 | . 215 | . 233 | . 052 | . 111 |
| ERCW | N3-67-09A | 14.000 | ss | 0102 | . 375 | 2.936 | 18800 | 1374 | . 080 | . 107 | . 071 | . 071 | . 251 | . 183 |
| ERCM | N3-67-09A | 14.000 | CS | 024 | . 375 | 1.000 | 15000 | 669 | . 132 | . 215 | . 143 | . 155 | . 036 | . 075 |
| ERCW | N3-67-09A | 14.000 | CS | 083 | . 375 | 2.936 | 15000 | 1374 | . 169 | . 276 | . 184 | . 197 | . 359 | . 283 |
| ERCW | N3-67-09A | 14.000 | cs | 085 | . 375 | 2.936 | 15000 | 1374 | . 159 | . 236 | . 157 | . 163 | . 312 | . 251 |
| ERCW | N3-67-09A | 14.000 | cs | QY07 | . 375 | 1.800 | 15000 | 1374 | . 115 | . 402 | . 268 | . 336 | . 315 | . 235 |
| ERCW | N3-67-09A | 14.000 | cs | 0108 | . 375 | 4.050 | 15000 | 434 | . 048 | . 300 | . 200 | . 265 | . 242 | . 164 |
| ERCW | N3-67-09A | 16.000 | cs | 306\% | . 375 | 1.000 | 15000 | 1588 | . 169 | . 200 | . 133 | . 126 | . 172 | . 171 |
| ERCW | N3-67-09A | 16.000 | cs | 308 | . 375 | 1.800 | 15000 | 1588 | . 152 | . 217 | . 145 | . 148 | . 340 | . 264 |
| ERCN | N3-67-09A | 16.000 | cs | 312 | . 375 | 2.538 | 15000 | 1588 | . 131 | . 263 | . 176 | . 198 | . 504 | . 355 |
| ERCW | N3-67-09A | 16.000 | cs | 312 | . 375 | 2.538 | 15000 | 1588 | . 155 | . 269 | . 180 | . 195 | . 504 | . 364 |
| ERCW | N3-67-09A | 16.000 | cs | 314 | . 375 | 1.900 | 15000 | 1588 | . 128 | . 199 | . 132 | . 139 | . 266 | . 211 |
| ERCW | N3-67-09A | 16.000 | CS | $318^{\circ}$ | . 375 | 3.225 | 15000 | 1588 | . 132 | . 213 | . 142 | . 452 | . 359 | . 268 |
| ERCW | N3-67-09A | 16.000 | CS | 318-C | . 375 | 3.225 | 15000 | 9588 | . 134 | . 223 | . 149 | . 160 | . 500 | . 354 |
| ERCW | N3-67-09A | 16.000 | Cs | 315 | . 375 | 2.100 | 15000 | 1588 | . 137 | . 235 | . 157 | . 170 | . 623 | . 429 |
| ERCN | N3-67-09A | 16.000 | cs | 310 | . 375 | 1.800 | 15000 | 1588 | . 125 | . 180 | . 120 | . 123 | . 397 | . 288 |
| ERCW | N3-67-09A | 18.000 | cs | 069 | . 375 | 3.500 | 15000 | 1801 | . 191 | . 295 | . 197 | . 205 | . 953 | . 168 |
| ERCW | N3-67-09A | 18.000 | cs | 072 | . 375 | 4.050 | 15000 | 2461 | . 252 | . 335 | . 223 | . 219 | . 111 | . 168 |
| ERCW | N3-67-09A | 18.000 | CS | 519 | . 375 | 3.500 | 15000 | 1801 | . 167 | . 184 | . 123 | . 111 | . 299 | . 246 |
| ERCN | N3-67-09A | 18.000 | cs | 533 | . 375 | 1.900 | 15000 | 1801 | . 138 | . 267 | . 978 | . 204 | . 241 | . 200 |
| ERCW | N3-67-09A | 18.000 | CS | 536 | . 375 | 1.000 | 15000 | 1801 | . 181 | . 261 | . 174 | . 181 | . 116 | . 142 |
| ERCW | N3-67-09A | 18.000 | cs | 5384 | . 375 | 2.100 | 15000 | 1801 | . 142 | . 258 | . 172 | . 192 | . 216 | . 186 |
| ERCW | N3-67-09A | 18.000 | cs | 539 | . 375 | 3.500 | 15000 | 1801 | . 139 | . 185 | . 123 | . 123 | . 356 | . 269 |
| ERCW | U3-67-09A | 18.000 | CS | 539-C | . 375 | 3.500 | 15000 | 1801 | . 151 | . 194 | . 130 | . 130 | . 348 | . 269 |
| ERCW | N3-67-09A | 18.000 | cs | 541 | . 375 | 3.500 | 15000 | 1801 | . 160 | . 215 | . 143 | . 147 | . 307 | . 248 |
| ERCW | N3-67-09A | . 18.000 | cs | 549 | . 373 | 3.500 | 15000 | 1809 | . 148 | . 293 | . 195 | . 223 | . 013 | . 067 |
| ERCW | N3-67-09A | 18.000 | cs | 557 | . 375 | 3.500 | 15000 | 1801 | . 167 | . 386 | . 257 | . 305 | . 235 | . 208 |
| ERCW | N3-67-09A | 18.000 | cs | 0906 | . 375 | 1.000 | 15000 | 4780 | . 322 | . 284 | . 189 | . 149 | . 011 | . 135 |
| ERCI | N3-67-09A | 20.000 | cs | 87 | . 375 | 3.766 | 95000 | 2014 | . 187 | . 230 | . 153 | . 148 | . 309 | . 260 |
| ERCH | N3-67-09A | 20.000 | cs | 87-c | . 375 | 3.766 | 15000 | 2014 | . 172 | . 184 | . 123 | . 111 | . 405 | . 312 |
| ERCW | N3-67-09A | 20.000 | cs | 940 | . 375 | 1.800 | 15000 | 2014 | . 152 | . 220 | . 147 | . 153 | . 788 | . 533 |
| ERCW | N3-67-09A | 20.000 | cs | 275 | . 375 | 2.100 | 15000 | 2014 | . 223 | . 324 | . 216 | . 220 | . 038 | . 112 |
| ERCN | N3-67-09A | 20.000 | cs | 275A | . 375 | 1.000 | 15000 | 2014 | . 220 | . 268 | . 179 | . 170 | . 027 | . 104 |
| ERCH | N3-67-09A | 20.000 | cs | 277 | . 375 | 1.000 | 15000 | 2014 | . 175 | . 237 | . 158 | . 158 | . 020 | . 082 |
| ERCN | N3-67-09A | 24.000 | cs | 211 | . 375 | 3.343 | 15000 | 2461 | . 225 | . 339 | . 226 | . 233 | . 746 | . 537 |
| ERCH | N3-67-09A | 24.000 | cs | 243 | . 375 | 4.050 | 15000 | 2441 | . 366 | . 639 | . 426 | . 468 | . 991 | . 741 |
| ERCW | N3-67-09A | 24.000 | cs | 247 | . 375 | 5.596 | 15000 | 2461 | . 207 | . 361 | . 241 | . 261 | . 832 | . 582 |
| ERCH | N3-67-09A | 24.000 | cs | 229 | . 375 | 1.900 | 15000 | 2449 | . 381 | . 524 | . 349 | . 353 | . 367 | . 373 |
| ERCN | N3-67-09A | 24.000 | cs | 018 | . 375 | 4.050 | 15000 | 2461 | . 359 | . 511 | . 341 | . 350 | . 396 | . 381 |



| System | Calc package | O.D. |  | Mode | Thick | SIF | Signe | Signa p | Eq 8 | Eq 9u | Eq $9 E$ | Eq 97 | Eq 10 | Eq 1 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| ERCW | N3-67-23A | 10.750 | CS | 856 | . 365 | 1.968 | 15000 | 1059 | . 091 | . 140 | . 093 | . 102 | . 749 | 48 |
| ERCW | N3-67-23A | $\cdot 10.750$ | cs | 856 | . 365 | 1.968 | 15000 | 1059 | . 113 | . 205 | . 137 | . 160 | . 738 | . 488 |
| ERCH | N3-67-23A | 24.000 | cs | 850 | . 375 | 3.890 | 15000 | 2441 | . 341 | . 550 | . 368 | . 402 | . 706 | 56 |
| ERCW | N3-67-23A | 24.000 | cs | 40 | . 375 | 2.000 | 15000 | 2441 | . 240 | . 388 | . 259 | 291 | . 209 | 22 |
| ERCU | N3-67-23A | 24.000 | CS | 47A | . 375 | 1.800 | 15000 | 2441 | . 245 | . 354 | . 236 | 250 | . 224 | 23 |
| ERCW | N3-67-23A | 24.000 | cs | 47 | . 375 | 1.800 | 15000 | 2441 | . 245 | . 352 | . 235 | 248 | . 202 | 21 |
| ERCW | N3-67-23A | 30.000 | cs | 27 | . 375 | 4.980 | 15000 | 3081 | . 342 | . 904 | . 602 | . 840 | . 433 | 396 |
| ERCW | N3-67-23A | 30.000 | cs | 34 | . 375 | 4.980 | 15000 | 3081 | . 328 | . 902 | . 601 | . 845 | . 397 | 370 |
| ERCW ${ }^{\text {- }}$ | N3-67-23A | 30.000 | CS | 22-C | . 375 | 4.976 | 15000 | 3081 | . 349 | . 908 | . 605 | . 844 | . 445 | 40 |
| ERCW | N3-67-23A | 30.000 | cs | 22 | . 375 | 4.980 | 15000 | 3081 | . 354 | . 974 | . 649 | . 916 | . 395 | 37 |
| ERCW | N3-67-23A | 30.000 | CS | 24 | . 375 | 4.980 | 15000 | 3081 | . 334 | . 790 | . 527 | . 718 | . 432 | 39 |
| ERCN | N3-67-24A | 2.375 | SS | F2 | . 154 | 2.100 | 15700 | 500 | . 104 | . 316 | . 211 | . 249 | . 899 | . 58 |
| ERCN | N3-67-24A | 2.375 | SS | F8 | . 154 | 2.100 | 15700 | 500 | . 061 | . 187 | . 125 | . 147 | . 640 | . 40 |
| ERCH | N3-67-24A | 2.375 | SS | F15 | . 154 | 2.100 | 15700 | 500 | . 146 | . 301 | . 201 | . 222 | 1.233 | . 798 |
| ERCW | N3-67-24A | 2.375 | SS | F17 | . 154 | 2.100 | 15700 | 500 | . 167 | . 318 | . 212 | . 233 | 1.495 | . 964 |
| ERCW | W3-67-24A | 2.375 | SS | F18 | . 154 | 2.100 | 15700 | 500 | . 979 | . 303 | . 202 | . 219 | 1.492 | . 964 |
| ERCW | N3-67-26A | 2.375 | 55 | 820 | . 154 | 2.100 | 15700 | 500 | . 144 | . 249 | . 166 | . 179 | 1.229 | . 795 |
| ERCW | N3-67-24A | 2.375 | SS | 825 | . 954 | 1.000 | 15700 | 500 | . 063 | . 165 | . 110 | . 126 | . 147 | . 113 |
| ERCW | N3-67-24A | 2.375 | SS | F26 | . 154 | 1.000 | 15700 | 500 | . 047 | . 116 | . 077 | . 087 | .071* | . 061 |
| ERCN | N3-67-24A | 3.500 | SS | BB06 | . 216 | 2.000 | 15700 | 531 | . 296 | . 778 | . 519 | . 662 | . 247 | 267 |
| ERCW | N3-67-24A | 3.500 | SS | AB06 | . 216 | 1.000 | 15700 | 531 | . 215 | . 554 | . 369 | . 470 | . 126 | . 162 |
| ERCU | N3-67-24A | 3.500 | SS | P118-C | . 216 | 1.800 | 15700 | 531 | . 109 | . 251 | . 167 | . 208 | . 133 | . 123 |
| ERCW | N3-67-24A | 3.500 | ss | 808 | . 216 | 1.800 | 15700 | 531 | . 097 | . 251 | . 167 | . 214 | . 132 | 118 |
| ERCW | N3-67-24A | 4.500 | ss | 759 | . 237 | 1.800 | 15700 | 642 | . 182 | . 219 | . 146 | . 141 | . 062 | . 110 |
| ERCW | N3-67-24A | 4.500 | SS | 805 | . 237 | 1.000 | 15700 | 662 | . 147 | . 350 | . 233 | . 292 | . 071 | . 101 |
| ERCW | N3-67-24A | 4.500 | SS | 806 | . 237 | 2.000 | 15700 | 642 | . 192 | . 477 | . 318 | . 402 | . 137 | . 159 |
| ERCM | N3-67-24A | 4.500 | SS | AB06 | . 237 | 1.000 | 15700 | 642 | . 938 | . 316 | . 211 | . 261 | . 067 | . 096 |
| ERCN | N3-67-24A | 6.625 | Cs | 702 | . 280 | 1.800 | 15000 | 828 | . 182 | . 306 | . 204 | . 228 | . 033 | . 093 |
| ERCW | N3-67-24A | 6.625 | CS | 702A | . 280 | 1.800 | 15000 | 828 | . 173 | . 321 | . 214 | . 244 | . 017 | . 080 |
| ERCW | M3-67-24A | 6.625 | cs | 705 | . 280 | 1.800 | 15000 | 828 | . 222 | . 371 | . 248 | . 272 | . 034 | . 109 |
| ERCW | N3-67-24A | 6.625 | cs | 2705 | . 280 | 1.800 | 15000 | 828 | . 204 | . 364 | . 243 | . 272 | . 036 | . 103 |
| ERCW | 133-67-24A | 6.625 | Cs | X710 | . 280 | 1.800 | 15000 | 828 | . 090 | . 320 | . 213 | . 268 | . 010 | . 042 |
| ERCW | M3-67-24A | 6.625 | cs | 710 | . 280 | 1.800 | 15000 | 828 | . 107 | . 332 | . 221 | . 274 | . 010 | . 048 |
| ERCU | N3-67-24A | 6.625 | CS | 711 | . 280 | 1.800 | 15000 | 828 | . 095 | . 317 | . 211 | . 264 | . 009 | . 043 |
| ERCW | N3-67-24A | 6.625 | cs | 720 | . 280 | 1.800 | 15000 | 828 | . 226 | . 437 | . 292 | . 330 | . 015 | . 100 |
| ERCW | N3-67-26A | 6.625 | SS | C1 | . 280 | 1.800 | 15700 | 828 | . 075 | . 140 | . 093 | . 108 | . 493 | . 326 |
| ERCN | N3-67-24A | 6.625 | SS | 803 | . 280 | 1.691 | 15700 | 828 | . 074 | . 148 | . 099 | . 117 | . 574 | . 374 |
| ERCN | N3-67-24A | 6.625 | Ss | P168 | . 280 | 2.270 | 15700 | 828 | . 079 | . 133 | . 089 | . 098 | . 467 | . 300 |
| ERCN | N3-67-24A | 6.625 | SS | P178 | . 280 | 2.270 | 15700 | 828 | . 099 | . 314 | . 209 | . 261 | . 428 | . 296 |
| ERCW | N3-67-24A | 6.625 | SS | 637 | . 280 | 1.800 | 15700 | 828 | . 240 | . 425 | . 283 | . 314 | . 022 | . 109 |
| ERCW | N3-67-24A | 6.625 | SS | C38 | . 280 | 1.800 | 45700 | 828 | . 283 | . 492 | . 328 | . 362 | . 027 | . 129 |
| ERCH | N3-67-24A | 6.625 | Ss | CH 1 | . 280 | 1.800 | 15700 | 828 | . 119 | . 325 | . 217 | . 264 | . 426 | . 303 |
| ERCH | N3-67-24A | 6.625 | SS | P198-C | . 280 | 2.270 | 15700 | 828 | . 131 | . 374 | . 249 | . 306 | . 501 | . 353 |
| ERCW | N3-67-24A | . 6.625 | ss | P198 | . 280 | 2.270 | 15700 | 828 | . 135 | . 396 | . 264 | . 325 | . 537 | . 376 |
| ERCN | N3-67-24A | 6.625 | ss | P19E | . 280 | 2.270 | 15700 | 828 | . 120 | . 329 | . 219 | . 267 | . 411 | . 295 |
| ERCN | N3-67-24A | 8.625 | cs | 656 | . 322 | 1.800 | 15000 | 953 | . 143 | . 227 | . 159 | . 166 | . 896 | . 595 |



Page 13

| System | Calc package | O.D. | Mat'l | Node | Thick | SIF | Sigma a | Sigma p | Eq 8 | Eq 9u | Eq $9 E$ | Eq 9F | Eq 10 | Eq 11 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| ERCW | N3-67-24A | 8.625 | cs | 655 | . 322 | 1.400 | 15000 | 953 | . 125 | . 201 | . 134 | . 147 | . 758 | . 505 |
| ERCH | N3-67-24A | 8.625 | cs | 657 | . 322 | 1.800 | 15000 | 953 | . 152 | . 210 | . 140 | . 145 | . 795 | . 538 |
| ERCW | N3-67-24A | 8.625 | cs | P18 | . 322 | 2.440 | 15000 | 953 | . 132 | . 190 | . 127 | . 134 | . 129 | . 130 |
| ERCU | 133-67-24A | 8.625 | CS | P2E | . 322 | 2.440 | 15000 | 953 | . 159 | . 167 | . 112 | . 098 | . 171 | . 166 |
| ERCW | N3-67-24A | 8.625 | CS | 662 | . 322 | 1.800 | 15000 | 953 | . 083 | . 143 | . 095 | . 107 | . 115 | . 102 |
| ERCW | N3-67-24A | 8.625 | CS | 667 | . 322 | 1.800 | 15000 | 953 | . 079 | . 158 | . 105 | . 123 | . 078 | . 079 |
| ERCW | N3-67-24A | 8.625 | cs | 665 | . 322 | 1.800 | 15000 | 953 | . 085 | . 166 | . 110 | . 130 | . 071 | . 077 |
| ERCW | N3-67-26A | 8.625 | cs | 658 | . 322 | 1.843 | 15000 | 953 | . 158 | . 206 | . 137 | . 139 | . 750 | . 513 |
| ERCU : | N3-67-24A | 8.625 | SS | B05 | . 322 | 1.000 | 15700 | 642 | . 081 | . 111 | . 074 | . 078 | . 013 | . 040 |
| ERCW | W3-67-24A | 8.625 | ss | 803 | . 322 | 1.843 | 15700 | 953 | . 101 | . 155 | . 103 | . 194 | . 322 | . 234 |
| ERCW | N3-67-24A | 8.625 | ss | E46 | . 322 | 1.140 | 15700 | 953 | . 061 | . 053 | . 035 | . 035 | . 927 | . 580 |
| ERCN | N3-67-24A | 8.625 | sS | E48 | . 322 | 1.000 | 15700 | 953 | . 061 | . 051 | . 034 | . 026 | 1.043 | . 650 |
| ERCN | N3-76-34A | 2.375 | SS | 16 | . 154 | 1:900. | 18600 | 625 | . 035 | . 956 | . 035 | . 037 | 1.135 | . 697 |
| ERCW | N3-76-34A | 2.375 | SS | 20 | . 154 | 2.333 | 18600 | 625 | . 040 | . 040 | . 027 | . 023 | 1.454 | . 891 |
| ERCN | N3-76-34A | 2.375 | SS | 21 | . 154 | 2.100 | 18600 | 625 | . 038 | . 037 | . 025 | . 022 | 1.190 | . 732 |
| ERCW | N3-76-36A | 2.375 | SS | 44 | . 154 | 2.100 | 18800 | 625 | . 053 | . 061 | . 041 | . 039 | 1.529 | . 938 |
| ERCW | N3-76-34A | 2.375 | SS | 46 | . 154 | 2.333 | 18600 | 625 | . 040 | . 046 | . 029 | . 027 | 1.388 | . 852 |
| ERCW | N3-76-34A | 2.375 | SS | 45 | . 154 | 2.100 | 18600 | 625 | . 039 | . 653 | . 042 | . 028 | 1.059 | . 653 |
| ERCW | N3-76-34 $A$ | 2.375 | SS | 27a | . 154 | 2.100 | 18600 | 625 | . 064 | . 066 | . 044 | . 040 | . 323 | . 220 |
| ERCM | N3-76-34A | 2.375 | SS | 29 | . 154 | 1.000 | 18600 | 625 | . 051 | . 050 | . 033 | . 029 | . 145 | . 108 |
| ERCW | N3-76-34A | 2.375 | SS | 69 | . 154 | 1.210 | 18600 | 625 | . 036 | . 060 | . 040 | . 045 | . 584 | . 364 |
| ERCW | N3-76-34A | 4.500 | CS | 38 | . 237 | 2.000 | 15000 | 802 | . 058 | . 050 | . 033 | . $026{ }^{\circ}$ | . 060 | . 059 |
| ERCW | M3-76-34A | 4.500 | Cs | 39 | . 237 | 1.450 | 15000 | 802 | . 058 | . 050 | . 034 | . 026 | . 069 | . 065 |
| ERCW | N3-76-34A | 4.500 | cs | 40 | . 237. | 1.800 | 15000 | 802 | . 063 | . 058 | . 039 | . 031 | . 130 | . 103 |
| ERCW | N3-76-34A | 4.500 | CS | 49 | . 237 | 1.000 | 15000 | 802 | . 630 | . 058 | . 039 | . 031 | . 063 | . 063 |
| ERCW | N3-76-34A | 4.500 | cs | 414 | . 237 | 1.000 | 15000 | 802 | . 062 | . 055 | . 037 | . 029 | . 039 | . 048 |
| ERCW | N3-76-34A | 4.500 | CS | 418 | . 237 | 1.000 | 15000 | 802 | . 063 | . 055 | . 037 | . 029 | . 030 | . 043 |
| ERCW | N3-76-34A | 4.500 | CS | 42 | . 237 | 2.020 | 15000 | 802 | . 056 | . 048 | . 032 | . 025 | . 029 | . 040 |
| ERCW | N3-67-39A | 2.375 | SS | 808 | . 154 | 2.100 | 15700 | 500 | . 279 | . 492 | . 365 | . 335 | . 110 | . 178 |
| ERCW | N3-67-39A | 2.375 | ss | B23 | . 154 | 2.100 | 15700 | 500 | . 359 | . 763 | . 535 | . 448 | . 103 | . 205 |
| ERCN | N3-67-39A | 2.375 | SS | AV40 | . 154 | 2.100 | 15700 | 500 | . 241 | . 570 | . 409 | . 355 | . 082 | . 145 |
| ERCW | M3-67-39A | 2.375 | SS | D05 | . 154 | 2.100 | 15700 | 500 | . 049 | . 094 | . 068 | . 059 - | . 684 | . 430 |
| ERCN | N3-67-39A | 2.375 | SS | up3t | . 154 | 2.100 | 15700 | 500 | . 047 | . 088 | . 062 | . 052 | . 594 | . 375 |
| ERCW | N3-67-39A | 2.373 | SS | 008 | . 154 | 2.100 | 15700 | 500 | . 051 | . 074 | . 054 | . 047 | . 578 | . 367 |
| ERCW | N3-67-39A | 2.375 | SS | 023 | . 154 | 2.100 | 15700 | 500 | . 042 | . 052 | . 038 | . 035 | . 596 | . 374 |
| ERCW | N3-67-39A | 2.375 | ss | E19 | . 154 | 2.100 | 15700 | 500 | . 248 | . 523 | . 359 | . 284 | . 259 | . 255 |
| ERCW | N3-67-39A | 2.375 | SS | E32 | . 154 | 2.100 | 15700 | 500 | . 068 | . 168 | . 121 | . 106 | . 726 | . 463 |
| ERCW | N3-67-39A | 2.375 | 55 | D23 | . 154 | 2.100 | 45700 | 407 | . 043 | . 066 | . 049 | . 049 | 1.024 | . 632 |
| ERCN | N3-67-39A | 2.875 | SS | C208 | . 203 | 1.800 | 15700 | 450 | . 059 | . 075 | . 053 | . 052 | . 223 | . 154 |
| ERCW | N3-67-39A | 2.875 | SS | C20e | . 203 | 1.800 | 15700 | 450 | . 050 | . 076 | . 053 | . 054 | . 211 | . 147 |
| ERCN | N3-67-39A | 2.875 | SS | 14 C | . 203 | 1.800 | 15700 | 450 | . 096 | . 173 | . 130 | . 138 | . 021 | . 051 |
| ERCU | N3-67-39A | 2.875 | ss | B05 | . 203 | 1.800 | 15700 | 450 | . 128 | . 211 | . 160 | . 150 | . 039 | . 075 |
| ERCM | N3-67-39A | 3.500 | ss | 1548 | . 216 | 2.000 | 15700 | 531 | . 042 | . 116 | . 078 | . 096 | . 139 | . 100 |
| ERCW | N3-67-39A | 3.500 | ss | 190 | . 216 | 1.800 | 15700 | 531 | . 056 | . 124 | . 085 | . 067 | . 141 | . 107 |
| ERCW | N3-67-39A | 3.500 | ss | 200 | . 216 | 1.296 | 15700 | 531 | . 052 | . 105 | . 071 | . 056 | . 107 | . 085 |
| ERCW | N3-67-39A | 4.500 | cs | c128 | . 237 | 1.800 | 15000 | 642 | . 057 | . 074 | . 054 | . 052 | . 468 | 30 |

2/21/91
Database of Most Highly Stressed Nodes
Page 14

| System | Calc package | O.D. | Mat'l | Node | Thick | SIf | Sigma a | Sigma p | Eq 8 | Eq 90 | Eq $9 E$ | Eq 95 | Eq 10 | Eq 11 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| ERCW | N3-67-39A | 4.500 | CS | C12B | . 237 | 1.952 | 15000 | 642 | . 058 | . 078 | . 056 | . 054 | 508 | 328 |
| ERCW | N3-67-39A | 4.500 | cs | C128-C | . 237 | 1.952 | 15000 | 642 | . 054 | . 076 | . 054 | . 054 | 527 | 337 |
| ERCW | N3-67-39A | 4.500 | CS | C12E | . 237 | 1.800 | 15000 | 642 | . 049 | . 067 | . 046 | . 046 | . 444 | . 286 |
| ERCW | N3-67-39A | 4.500 | CS | C12E | . 237 | 1.952 | 15000 | 642 | . 049 | . 070 | . 048 | . 049 | . 482 | . 309 |
| ERCW | N3-67-39A | 4.500 | cs | C178 | . 237 | 1.800 | 15000 | 642 | . 106 | . 301 | . 232 | . 266 | . 060 | . 078 |
| ERCW | N3-67-39A | 4.500 | CS | C178 | . 237 | 1.852 | 15000 | 642 | . 111 | . 324 | . 249 | . 287 | . 065 | . 084 |
| ERCW | N3-67-39A | 4.500 | ss | 25 | . 237 | 1.450 | 15700 | 642 | . 072 | . 089 | . 061 | . 058 | . 140 | . 113 |
| ERCW | N3-67-39A | 6.625 | CS | 99 | . 280 | 1.800 | 15000 | 828 | . 065 | . 077 | . 052 | . 050 | . 119 | . 098 |
| ERCW | N3-67-39A | 6.625 | SS | 131 | . 280 | 1.800 | 15700 | 828 | . 082 | . 078 | . 052 | . 044 | . 630 | . 411 |
| ERCW | N3-67-39A | 6.625 | SS | P15M | . 280 | 1.800 | 15700 | 828 | . 055 | . 050 | . 033 | . 027 | . 403 | . 263 |
| ERCW | N3-67-39A | 6.625 | SS | 137 | . 280 | 1.800 | 15700 | 828 | . 066 | . 065 | . 043 | . 038 | . 389 | . 260 |
| ERCW | N3-67-39A | 6.625 | SS | C03B | . 280 | 2.266 | 15700 | 828 | . 061 | . 056 | . 037 | . 031 | . 456 | . 298 |
| ERCW | N3-67-39A | 6.625 | SS | 146 | . 280 | 1.800 | 15700 | 828 | . 129 | . 133 | . 089 | . 082 | . 104 | . 114 |
| ERCW | N3-67-39A | 6.625 | SS | 145 | . 280 | 1.800 | 15700 | 828 | . 201 | . 224 | . 150 | . 147 | . 034 | . 100 |
| SFC | N3-78-01A2 | 3.500 | SS | 450 | . 216 | 1.670 | 17800 | 498 | . 064 | . 103 | . 069 | . 073 | . 206 | . 151 |
| SFC | N3-78-0142 | 3.500 | SS | 452 | . 216 | 1.777 | 17800 | 498 | . 055 | . 098 | . 065 | . 072 | . 217 | . 154 |
| SFC | N3-78-0142 | 3.500 | ss | 4541 | . 216 | 1.900 | 17800 | 498 | . 035 | . 076 | . 051 | . 058 | . 203 | 138 |
| SFC | N3-78-01A2 | 3.500 | ss | 480 | . 216 | 1.000 | 17800 | 498 | . 040 | . 128 | . 085 | . 107 | . 188 | 130 |
| SFC | N3-78-0142 | 3.500 | ss | 484 | . 216 | 1.670 | 17800 | 498 | . 075 | . 238 | . 159 | . 195 | . 200 | . 151 |
| SFC | N3-78-0142 | 3.500 | ss | 486 | . 216 | 1.777 | 17800 | 498 | . 069 | . 233 | . 155 | . 193 | . 207 | 153 |
| SFC | N3-78-0142 | 8.625 | Ss | 52 | . 322 | 1.900 | 17800 | 893 | . 060 | . 203 | . 135 | . 169 | . 057 | . 058 |
| SFC | N3-78-0142 | 8.625 | SS | 453 | . 322 | 2.100 | 17800 | 893 | . 058 | . 252 | . 168 | . 216 | . 070 | . 065 |
| SFC | M3-78-01A2 | 8.625 | SS | 64 | . 322 | 1.843 | 17800 | 893 | . 076 | . 251 | . 167 | . 208 | 078 | 077 |
| SFC | M3-78-01A2 | 8.625 | SS | 68 | . 322 | 2.439 | 17800 | 893 | . 055 | . 259 | . 173 | . 231 | . 096 | . 080 |
| SFC | M3-78-0142 | 8.625 | SS | 588 | . 322 | 2.439 | 17800 | 893 | :105 | . 275 | . 183 | . 221 | . 082 | . 091 |
| SFC | N3-78-0112 | 8.625 | SS | 575 | . 322 | 2.253 | 17800 | 893 | . 071 | . 286 | . 191 | . 245 | . 135 | $.110^{\circ}$ |
| SFC | N3-78-0112 | 8.625 | SS | 577 | . 322 | 1.000 | 17800 | 893 | . 135 | . 274 | . 182 | . 208 | . 044 | . 080 |
| SFC | N3-78-01A2 | 8.625 | SS | 581 | . 322 | 2.439 | 17800 | 893 | . 083 | . 310 | . 207 | . 261 | . 083 | . 083 |
| SFC | N3-78-01A2 | 8.625 | SS | 20-C | . 322 | 2.439 | 17800 | 893 | . 063 | . 365 | . 243 | . 319 | .173 | 130 |
| SFC | N3-78-01A2 | 8.625 | ss | 261 | . 322 | 1.741 | 17800 | 893 | . 075 | . 343 | . 228 | . 293 | . 106 | . 094 |
| SFC | N3-78-0142 | 8.625 | SS | 8260 | . 322 | 2.100 | 17800 | 893 | . 073 | . 373 | . 249 | . 323 | . 127 | . 106 |
| SFC | M3-78-0112 | 10.750 | SS | 76 | . 365 | 2.000 | 17800 | 993 | . 065 | . 120 | . 080 | . 092 | . 005 | . 028 |
| SFC | N3-78-0112 | 10.750 | SS | 78 | . 365 | 2.000 | 17800 | 993 | . 069 | . 124 | . 083 | . 095 | . 006 | . 031 |
| SFC | N3-78-01A2 | 10.750 | SS | 78-c | . 365 | 2.605 | 17800 | 993 | . 089 | . 165 | . 110 | . 126 | . 018 | . 045 |
| SFC | N3-78-01A2 | 10.750 | SS | 80 | . 365 | 1.000 | 17800 | 993 | . 074 | . 110 | . 074 | . 078 | . 012 | . 036 |
| SFC | N3-78-01A3 | 3.500 | SS | 500 | . 216 | 1.407 | 17800 | 498 | . 058 | . 214 | . 143 | . 192 | . 440 | . 292 |
| SFC | N3-78-01A3 | 3.500 | SS | 502 | . 216 | 1.800 | 17800 | 498 | . 064 | . 255 | . 170 | . 230 | . 520 | . 342 |
| SFC | N3-78-0113 | 3.500 | SS | 504 | . 216 | 1.900 | 17800 | 498 | . 063 | . 249 | . 166 | . 224 | . 488 | . 322 |
| SFC | N3-78-01A3 | 3.500 | SS | 512 | . 216 | 1.800 | 17800 | 498 | . 090 | . 108 | . 072 | . 070 | . 596 | . 399 |
| SFC | N3-78-0143 | 3.500 | SS | 906 | . 216 | 1.800 | 17800 | 498 | . 040 | . 046 | . 031 | . 029 | . 409 | 266 |
| SFC | N3-78-01A3 | 3.500 | SS | 908 | . 216 | 1.800 | 17800 | 498 | . 064 | . 085 | . 057 | . 058 | . 892 | . 570 |
| SFC | N3-78-01A3 | 3.500 | SS | 600 | . 216 | 2.333 | 17800 | 498 | . 062 | . 310 | . 206 | . 279 | . 544 | . 357 |
| SfC | N3-78-01A3 | 3.500 | SS | 909 | . 216 | 1.800 | 17800 | 498 | . 055 | . 067 | . 045 | . 044 | . 616 | . 398 |
| SFC | N3-78-01A3 | 3.500 | SS | 622 | . 216 | 1.800 | 17800 | 498 | . 035 | . 373 | . 248 | . 357 | . 037 | . 036 |
| SFC | N3-78-01A3 | 4.500 | SS | 350 | . 237 | 1.759 | 17800 | 602 | . 219 | . 385 | . 256 | . 288 | . 136 | . 168 |
| SFC | N3-78-0113 | 4.500 | SS | 352 | . 237 | 1.900 | 17800 | 602 | . 217 | . 385 | . 257 | . 289 | . 144 | 173 |


| System | Calc package | O.D. | Mat'l | Mode | Thick | SIF | Sigma | Signa P | Eq 8 | Eq 9V | Eq 9E | Eq 9F | Eq 10 | Eq 11 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| SFC | N3-78.0143 | 4.500 | SS | 352 | . 474 | 1.900 | 17800 | 285 | 102 | 180 |  |  |  |  |
| SFC | N3-78-0113 | 4.500 | SS | 358 | . 237 | 1.900 | 17800 | 602 | . 137 | . 230 | . 120 | . 135 | . 067 | . 081 |
| SFC | N3-78-0113 | 4.500 | SS | R3768 | . 237 | 1.000 | 17800 | 602 | . 095 | . 123 | . 080 | . 178 | . 127 | . 131 |
| SFC | N3-78-0113 | 4.500 | SS | 383 | . 237 | 1.800 | 17800 | 602 | . 120 | . 120 | . 080 | .081 | . 021 | . 050 |
| SFC | M3-78-0113 | 8.625 | SS | 106 | . 322 | 1.909 | 17800 | 893 | . 058 |  |  | O | 107 | \% |
| SFC | N3-78-0143 | 8.625 | ss | 312 | . 365 | 2.000 | 17800 | 893 | . 060 |  |  | 062 | 107 | . 08 |
| SFC | N3-78-01A3 | 8.625 | Ss | 312 | . 322 | 1.901 | 17800 | 893 | . 057 |  |  |  |  | 043 |
| SFE | N3-78-0103 | 10.730 | SS | 120 | . 375 | 2.592 | 17800 | 993 | . 075 |  |  | . 08 | 055 | 056 |
| SFC | 133-78-0113 | 10.750 | 5s | 1200 | . 375 | 1.000 | 17800 | 993 |  |  | . 107 | 127 | 503 | 337 |
| SFC | M3-78-0113 | 10.750 | ss | 1208 | . 375 | 1.000 | 17800 | 993 |  |  | . 072 | . 01 | 211 | 155 |
| SFC | N3-78-01A3 | 10.750 | Ss | 331 | . 375 | 1.000 | 17800 | 993 | . 062 |  |  | 282 | 201 | 151 |
| SFC | N3-78-01A3 | 10.750 | ss | 120 | . 375 | 2.592 | 17800 | 993 |  |  | 057 | , | 149 | 15 |
| SFC | N3-78-0144 | 10.730 | ss | 192 | . 250 | 1.000 | 17800 | 1051 |  |  |  |  | 22 | 324 |
| SFC | M3-78-014 | 10.750 | ss | 176-C | . 365 | 2.605 | 17800 | 993 | , |  |  | 79 | . 225 | 183 |
| SFC | N3-78-014 | 10.730 | ss | 176 | . 365 | 2.605 | 17800 | 993 | . 207 |  |  | 307 | 040 | . 050 |
| SFC | N3-78-0144 | 10.750 | ss | 182 | . 365 | 1.000 | 17800 | 993 |  |  |  | 3 | 0.000 | . 081 |
| SFC | M3-78-12A | 2.375 | SS | 160 | . 154 | 2.100 | 17800 | 468 |  |  | . 19 | 257 | . 015 | . 035 |
| SFC | M3-78-12A | 2.375 | ss | 165 | . 154 | 2.100 | 17800 | 468 |  |  | . 022 | . 021 | . 022 | . 024 |
| SFC | N3-78-12A | 2.375 | ss | 310 | . 154 | 2.100 | 17800 |  |  | . 050 | . 033 | . 036 | . 039 | . 035 |
| SFC | M3-78-92A | 2.375 | ss | 315 | . 154 | 2.100 | 17800 |  | . 028 | 03 | . 021 | . 019 | . 125 | . 087 |
| SFC | M3-78-12A | 3.500 | ss | 30 | . 216 | 1.800 | 17800 |  | . 029 | . 059 | . 034 | . 038 | . 257 | . 168 |
| SFC' | M3-78-12A | 3.500 | ss | 36 | . 216 | 1.800 | 17800. |  | . 03 | . 037 | . 024 | . 023 | . 825 | . 516 |
| SFC | M3-78-12A | 3.500 | SS | 37 | . 216 | 1.800 | 17800 | 498 | . 03 | . 035 | . 023 | . 021 | . 758 | . 475 |
| SFC | M3-78-12A | 3.500 | SS | 255 | . 216 | 1.800 | 17800 | 49 | . | . 032 | . 021 | . 019 | . 665 | . 417 |
| SFC | M3-78-12A | 3.500 | 55 | 55 | . 216 | 1.800 | 17800 | 498 | . 029 | . 037 | . 025 | . 025 | . 468 | . 297 |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 498 | . 056 | . 054 | . 036 | . 030 | . 237 | . 167 |


[^0]:    Prepared By
    Sr .te mallopon $\qquad$
    

