

**From:** Christian Jacobs  
**To:** Charlie Medency  
**Date:** 7/9/2007 3:38:17 PM  
**Subject:** Fwd: CR Fire CDF Value Clarification

Charlie,  
To summarize, is the  $6.31E-5$  value from the RAI 3c response correct, and if so, where did it come from?  
Or are Bob and ISL correct in using the IPEEE value for CR of  $1.43E-6$ ?

See attached email from Bob for clarification.  
Chris

Christian Jacobs  
Environmental Project Manager  
Division of License Renewal  
U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission  
301-415-3874  
O-12D11  
cjj@nrc.gov

**Mail Envelope Properties** (46928EA9.347 : 2 : 35062)

**Subject:** Fwd: CR Fire CDF Value Clarification  
**Creation Date** 7/9/2007 3:38:17 PM  
**From:** Christian Jacobs

**Created By:** CJJ@nrc.gov

<b>Recipients</b>	<b>Action</b>	<b>Date &amp; Time</b>
WCNOC.com chmeden (Charlie Medency)	Transferred	7/9/2007 3:38:26 PM

<b>Post Office</b>	<b>Delivered</b>	<b>Route</b>
		WCNOC.com

<b>Files</b>	<b>Size</b>	<b>Date &amp; Time</b>
MESSAGE Mail	978	7/9/2007 3:38:17 PM

**Options**

**Auto Delete:** No  
**Expiration Date:** None  
**Notify Recipients:** Yes  
**Priority:** Standard  
**ReplyRequested:** No  
**Return Notification:** None

**Concealed Subject:** No  
**Security:** Standard

**To Be Delivered:** Immediate  
**Status Tracking:** Delivered & Opened

**From:** Robert Palla  
**To:** Christian Jacobs  
**Date:** 7/9/2007 3:25:45 PM  
**Subject:** CR Fire CDF Value Clarification

It appears that the ER ignores the control room contribution to fire. To complicate this further, it appears that the response to RAI 3c contains errors. The IPEEE states that the overall fire CDF is  $7.59E-6$  (non-control room contribution =  $6.16E-6$  and control room contribution =  $1.43E-6$ ). The table in the ER (Page F-48) does not include the control room contribution nor does the comparison table provided in the response to the RAI -- nor does the ER explicitly state that the CR is excluded. The total CDF from the fire re-analysis excludes the CR -- the  $5.92E-6$  value (also not explicitly stated, however its value is the sum of the numbers in the RAI table and that table does not include the CR). In addition, the discussion that is included in the RAI talks separately about how the non-control room and control room values changed. For the non-control room stuff this appears to be fine. However, for the control room, it states that the value is reduced from  $6.31E-5$  to  $2.22E-6$  and provides a discussion about this decrease. But the IPEEE value for CR is  $1.43E-6$  not  $6.31E-5$  (it is not clear where the  $6.31E-5$  value comes from) and assuming that the new value (the  $2.22E-6$  re-analysis value) is correct, there was an actual increase in the CR contribution between the IPEEE and the fire re-analysis. Note that the CR value for the fire re-analysis only shows up in the RAI response. Please verify the correct CR fire CDF values.