

**From:** Amy Cabbage  
**To:** Leatherman, John (GE Infra Energy); Patel, Chandu  
**Date:** 06/11/2007 4:57:57 PM  
**Subject:** Re: Clarification Required for RAI 3.8-114 - RAI letter 100

John - see additional clarification below and attached files. We will add this e-mail to ADAMS to provide a record of this transmittal. Please confirm that the information in the attached files does not contain proprietary information. Please contact Chandu if you have any additional questions. Thanks, Amy

(1) The latest ANSYS results are not identical to the data given to GE at the December 2006 audit.

(2) At the December 2006 audit, we provided a set of 300 plots showing ANSYS force and moment results at the locations previously agreed to by BNL and GE. We also provided a set of 6 vertical displacement figures, one for each load case analyzed.

(3) The attached files replace the files provided at the December 2006 audit. The 300 plots now show both the latest BNL ANSYS results and the latest GE NASTRAN results on the same plot. The ANSYS results are in blue and the NASTRAN results are in red.

(4) RAI 3.8-114 refers to these new plots which should have been transmitted to GE along with the RAI.

FYI - Transmittal of the raw ANSYS results would not be useful, as considerable postprocessing was needed to produce the latest 300 comparison plots.

>>> "Leatherman, John (GE Infra, Energy)" <john.leatherman@ge.com> 06/06/2007 8:16 AM  
>>>

Chandu,  
NRC requests us in RAI 3.8-114 to explain the incompatibility between NASTRAN and ANSYS results. However, we don't know whether the ANSYS results referred to in this RAI are identical to the results we received during the 2nd structural audit held December 12-14, 2006. Would you please confirm that the ANSYS results referred to in RAI 3.8-114 are identical to the results we received during the 2nd structural audit held December 12-14, 2006? If they are not identical, we need the latest ANSYS results to analyze the incompatibility.

Regards, John 408-778-8421

-----Original Message-----

From: Liu, Ai-Shen (GE Infra, Energy)  
Sent: Tuesday, June 05, 2007 7:09 AM  
To: Leatherman, John (GE Infra, Energy)  
Cc: Solorzano, Enrique R. (GE Infra, Energy); Herzog, Maryann (GE Infra, Energy); Sedney, Kathy K. (GE Infra, Energy); Kinsey, James C (GE Infra, Energy)  
Subject: RE: RAI 3.8-114 - RAI letter 100

John,

NRC requests us in RAI 3.8-114 to explain the incompatibility between NASTRAN and ANSYS results. However, we don't know whether ANSYS results referred in this RAI are identical to the results we received during the 2nd structural audit held December 12-14, 2006. Would you please obtain NRC confirmation? If they are not identical, we need the latest ANSYS results to analyze the incompatibility.

Ai-Shen Liu  
Phone: 408-925-5963  
Fax: 910-341-2503  
e-mail: [ai-shen.liu@ge.com](mailto:ai-shen.liu@ge.com)

**CC:** Chakrabarti, Samir; Herzog, Maryann (GE Infra Energy); Kinsey, James C (GE Infra Energy); Liu, Ai-Shen (GE Infra Energy); Samaddar, Sujit; Sedney, Kathy K. (GE Infra Energy)

**Mail Envelope Properties** (466DB755.946 : 18 : 35676)

**Subject:** Re: Clarification Required for RAI 3.8-114 - RAI letter 100  
**Creation Date** 06/11/2007 4:57:57 PM  
**From:** Amy Cabbage  
**Created By:** AEC@nrc.gov

**Recipients**

ge.com

Ai-Shen.LIU CC (Ai-Shen (GE Infra Energy) Liu)  
jim.kinsey CC (James C (GE Infra Energy) Kinsey)  
john.leatherman (John (GE Infra Energy) Leatherman)  
kathy.sedney CC (Kathy K. (GE Infra Energy) Sedney)  
Maryann.Herzog CC (Maryann (GE Infra Energy) Herzog)

nrc.gov

OWGWPO03.HQGWD001  
SXC4 CC (Samir Chakrabarti)

nrc.gov

TWGWPO02.HQGWD001  
SKS3 CC (Sujit Samaddar)

nrc.gov

TWGWPO03.HQGWD001  
CPP (Chandu Patel)

**Post Office**

OWGWPO03.HQGWD001  
TWGWPO02.HQGWD001  
TWGWPO03.HQGWD001

**Route**

ge.com  
nrc.gov  
nrc.gov  
nrc.gov

**Files**

MESSAGE  
Z Displacement.pdf  
6all frJinsuo 050907.pdf

**Size**

4243  
246729  
719013

**Date & Time**

06/11/2007 4:57:57 PM  
06/11/2007 4:32:29 PM  
06/11/2007 4:32:33 PM

**Options**

**Expiration Date:** None  
**Priority:** Standard  
**ReplyRequested:** No  
**Return Notification:** None

**Concealed Subject:** No  
**Security:** Standard