DOCKETED USNRC

February 12, 2007 (3:53pm)

OFFICE OF SECRETARY
RULEMAKINGS AND
ADJUDICATIONS STAFF

UNITED STATES NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION

Before the Atomic Safety and Licensing Board

In the matter of		
ENTERGY NUCLEAR VERMONT YANKEE, LLC)	Docket No. 50-271-LR
and ENTERGY NUCLEAR OPERATIONS, INC.)	ASLB No.06-849-03-LR
)	
(Vermont Yankee Nuclear Power Station))	

NEW ENGLAND COALITION, INC.'S SECOND MOTION TO COMPEL

Pursuant to 10 C.F.R. § 2.323 and the Atomic Safety and Licensing Board's ("the Board's) Initial Scheduling Order in this matter, issued November 17, 2006, the New England Coalition, Inc. (NEC) moves to compel the clarification of portions of Entergy's Third Supplemental privilege logs, attached hereto as Exhibits 1-2, and to compel the production of documents, as follows:

- 1. Entergy claims work product privilege for e-mail with attachments on the subject of hydrothermal modeling. Exhibit 1, entries 534-536. NEC requests that the Board require Entergy to clarify whether the attachments contain modeling results/data, and to produce any such results/data.
- 2. Entergy claims work product privilege for a 2005 e-mail on the subject of NPDES permit renewal. Exhibit 2. NEC requests that the Board require Entergy to state the actual purpose for which this document was prepared, and to produce it if it was prepared for the purpose of developing or supporting Entergy's application to the Vermont Agency of Natural Resources for its NPDES permit(s), § 316 determination or variance and equivalent permits and supporting documentation, or if it otherwise concerns the administrative proceedings before the Agency of Natural Resources concerning this permit(s).
- 3. Entergy has produced additional Third Supplemental Privilege Logs that appear identical to Entergy's Second Supplemental Privilege Logs, attached as Exhibits 13-15 to NEC's first Motion to Compel (January 16, 2007). If Entergy makes any new claims of privilege in these logs to which the arguments stated in NEC's first Motion to Compel would apply,

¹ It is not entirely clear that they are identical to logs previously produced. One of them includes the same number of entries, but is not the same number of pages.

NEC hereby moves to compel production for the reasons stated in its first Motion to Compel.

NEC incorporates by reference the arguments for clarification of Entergy's privilege logs and for production of documents stated in NEC's first Motion to Compel (January 16, 2007).

Pursuant to 10 C.F.R. § 2.323(a), and the Board's Initial Scheduling Order, NEC's counsel e-mailed Entergy's counsel on February 9 and 12, 2007 to request clarification of the degree of overlap between Entergy's Second Supplemental and Third Supplemental privilege logs, and regarding NEC's intent to file this motion. To date, Entergy's counsel has not responded.

February 12, 2007

New England Coalition

by:

Ronald A. Shems

Karen Tyler

SHEMS DUNKIEL KASSEL & SAUNDERS PLLC

For the firm

Attorneys for NEC

Privilege Log for Documents Through February 1, 2007, Part Three

This privilege log was prepared by counsel to Entergy Nuclear Vermont Yankee (ENVY) in connection with the Entergy Vermont Yankee License Renewal Proceeding. ENVY reserves the right to supplement, amend, or clarify this log, as necessary.

No	Type of Document	<u>Date</u>	<u>Author/Sender</u>	<u>Recipient</u>	<u>cc</u>	<u>Subject</u>	Privilege Asserted
530	eMail	1/16/2007	Lynn DeWald	Gwyn U. Williams; Elise N. Zoli; Chuck D. Barlow; Sarah Heaton Concannon; David McElwee; George Thomas; John Dreyfuss; Mark Mattson; Sharon Smith; Samuel Wender IV; Theodore A. Sullivan	·	Litigation strategy relating to permit appeal	Attorney-Client Communication; Attorney Work Product
531	eMail	1/17/2007	Lynn DeWald	Chuck D. Barlow; Elise N. Zoli; Sarah Heaton Concannon; David McElwee; George Thomas; John Dreyfuss; Mark Mattson; Samuel Wender IV; Gwyn U. Williams		Litigation strategy relating to permit appeal	Attorney-Client Communication;Attorney Work Product
532	eMail	1/17/2007	Elise N. Zoli	Lynn DeWald; Chuck D. Barlow; Sarah Heaton Concannon; David McElwee; George Thomas; John Dreyfuss; Mark Mattson; Samuel Wender IV; Gwyn U. Williams		Litigation strategy relating to permit appeal	Attorney-Client Communication;Attorney Work Product
533	eMail	1/22/2007	Chuck D. Barlow	Lynn DeWald; Gwyn U. Williams; Elise N. Zoli; Sarah Heaton Concannon; David McElwee; George Thomas; John Dreyfuss; Mark Mattson; Sharon Smith; Samuel Wender IV; Theodore A. Sullivan	Haimavathi Varadan Marlier	Litigation strategy relating to permit appeal	Attorney-Client Communication, Attorney Work Product
534	eMail w/Attachment	1/11/2007	Mark Mattson	Lynn DeWald	Mark Hutchins, Greg Thomas, Chuck Barlow	Analysis relating to NPDES Permit;Hydrothermal modeling	Attorney Work Product
	eMail w/Attachment eMail w/Attachments	1/12/2007	Mark Mattson Mark Mattson	Mark Hutchins VY - George Thomas, Dan Yasi	Elise Zoli, Lynn DeWald, Mark Hutchins	Hydrothermal modeling Hydrothermal modeling	Attorney Work Product Attorney Work Product

Vermont Yankee License Renewal Proceeding Privilege Log for Documents Determined Relevant and Responsive to NEC Contentions Initial Disclosure, October 23, 2006

No.	Type of	Date	From	To	Document Title	Privilege Asserted
]]	Document					
1	Email	11/03/2005	R.	L.	NPDES required sampling	Work Product. Prepared at the request of
			Buckley	DeWald	for permit renewal	counsel in anticipation of litigation.

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION

Before the Atomic Safety and Licensing Board

In the Matter of)		
)		
Entergy Nuclear Vermont Yankee, LLC)	Docket No. 50-271-LR	
and Entergy Nuclear Operations, Inc.)	ASLBP No. 06-849-03-LR	
)		
(Vermont Yankee Nuclear Power Station))		

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I, Michelle Cronin, hereby certify that copies of the NEW ENGLAND COALITION, INC'S, SECOND MOTION TO COMPEL, in the above-captioned proceeding were served on the persons listed below, by U.S. Mail, first class, postage prepaid; by Fed Ex overnight to Judge Elleman; and, where indicated by an e-mail address below, by electronic mail, on the 12th day of February, 2007

Administrative Judge Alex S. Karlin, Esq., Chair Atomic Safety and Licensing Board Mail Stop T-3 F23 U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission Washington, DC 20555-0001 E-mail: ask2@nrc.gov

Administrative Judge Thomas S. Elleman Atomic Safety and Licensing Board Panel 5207 Creedmoor Road, #101 Raleigh, NC 27612 E-mail: elleman@eos.ncsu.edu

Office of Commission Appellate Adjudication Mail Stop: O-16C1 U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission Washington, DC 20555-0001 E-mail: OCAAmail@nrc.gov

Administrative Judge
Dr. Richard E. Wardwell
Atomic Safety and Licensing Board Panel
Mail Stop T-3 F23
U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission
Washington, DC 20555-0001
E-mail: rew@nrc.gov

Office of the Secretary
Attn: Rulemaking and Adjudications Staff
Mail Stop: O-16C1
U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission
Washington, DC 20555-0001
E-mail: hearingdocket@nrc.gov

Sarah Hofmann, Esq.
Director of Public Advocacy
Department of Public Service
112 State Street, Drawer 20
Montpelier, VT 05620-2601
E-mail: sarah.hofmann@state.vt.us

Mitzi A. Young, Esq.
Steven C. Hamrick, Esq.
Office of the General Counsel
Mail Stop O-15 D21
U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission
Washington, DC 20555-0001
E-mail: may@nrc.gov; sch1@nrc.gov

Diane Curran, Esq.
Harmon, Curran, Spielberg & Eisenberg, LLP
1726 M Street NW, Suite 600
Washington, DC 20036
E-mail: dcurran@harmoncurran.com

Callie B. Newton, Chair
Gail MacArthur
Lucy Gratwick
Marcia Hamilton
Town of Marlboro Selectboard
P.O. Box 518
Marlboro, VT 05344
E-mail: cbnewton@sover.net; marcialynn@ev1.net

Marcia Carpentier, Esq.
Jonathan M. Rund, Esq.
Atomic Safety and Licensing Board Panel
Mail Stop T-3 F23
U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission
Washington, DC 20555-0001

E-mail mxc7@nrc.gov; Jmr3@nrc.gov

Anthony Z. Roisman, Esq.
National Legal Scholars Law Firm
84 East Thetford Road
Lyme, NH 03768
E-mail: aroisman@nationallegalscholars.com

Matthew Brock, Esq.
Assistant Attorney General
Office of the Massachusetts Attorney General
Environmental Protection Division
One Ashburton Place, Room 1813
Boston, MA 02108-1598
E-mail: matthew.brock@ago.state.ma.us

Dan MacArthur, Director Town of Marlboro Emergency Management P.O. Box 30 Marlboro, VT 05344 E-mail: dmacarthur@igc.org

David R. Lewis, Esq.
Matias F. Travieso-Diaz
Pillsbury Winthrop Shaw Pittman LLP
2300 N Street NW
Washington, DC 20037-1128
E-mail: david.lewis@pillsburylaw.com
matias.travieso-diaz@pillsburylaw.com

SHEMS DUNKIEL KASSEL & SAUNDERS, PLLC

by:

Mighelle Cronin, Administrative Assistant for Ronald A. Shems, Esq. and

Karen Tyler, Esq.
91 College Street
Burlington, VT 05401
802 860 1003
802 860 1208 (fax)
rshems@sdkslaw.com
ktyler@sdkslaw.com

for the firm Attorneys for New England Coalition, Inc.