

September 8, 2006

Mr. Michael Kansler  
President  
Entergy Nuclear Operations, Inc.  
440 Hamilton Avenue  
White Plains, NY 10601-1839

SUBJECT: REQUESTS FOR ADDITIONAL INFORMATION FOR THE REVIEW OF THE  
PILGRIM NUCLEAR POWER STATION LICENSE RENEWAL APPLICATION  
(TAC NO. MC9669)

Dear Mr. Kansler:

By letter dated January 25, 2006, Entergy Nuclear Operations, Inc., submitted an application pursuant to Title 10 of the *Code of Federal Regulations* 10 CFR Part 54, to renew the operating license for Pilgrim Nuclear Power Station, for review by the U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission (NRC). The NRC staff is reviewing the information contained in the license renewal application and has identified, in the enclosure, areas where additional information is needed to complete the review. These requests for additional information on Time Limited Aging Analysis of Reactor Vessel Internals in License Renewal Section: 4.2.1.

These questions were discussed with a member of your staff, Bryan Ford, and a mutually agreeable date for this response is within 30 days from the date of this letter. If you have any questions, please contact me at 301-415-1478 or by e-mail at [RXS2@nrc.gov](mailto:RXS2@nrc.gov).

Sincerely,

**/RA/**

Ram Subbaratnam, Project Manager  
License Renewal Branch A  
Division of License Renewal  
Office of Nuclear Reactor Regulation

Docket No. 50-293

Enclosure:  
Requests for Additional Information

cc w/encl: See next page

September 8, 2006

Mr. Michael Kansler  
President  
Entergy Nuclear Operations, Inc.  
440 Hamilton Avenue  
White Plains, NY 10601-1839

SUBJECT: REQUESTS FOR ADDITIONAL INFORMATION FOR THE REVIEW OF THE  
PILGRIM NUCLEAR POWER STATION LICENSE RENEWAL APPLICATION  
(TAC MC9669)

Dear Mr. Kansler:

By letter dated January 25, 2006, Entergy Nuclear Operations, Inc., submitted an application pursuant to Title 10 of the *Code of Federal Regulations* 10 CFR Part 54, to renew the operating license for Pilgrim Nuclear Power Station, for review by the U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission (NRC). The NRC staff is reviewing the information contained in the license renewal application and has identified, in the enclosure, areas where additional information is needed to complete the review. These requests for additional information on Time Limited Aging Analysis of Reactor Vessel Internals in License Renewal Section: 4.2.1.

These questions were discussed with a member of your staff, Bryan Ford, and a mutually agreeable date for this response is within 30 days from the date of this letter. If you have any questions, please contact me at 301-415-1478 or by e-mail at [RXS2@nrc.gov](mailto:RXS2@nrc.gov).

Sincerely,

**/RA/**

Ram Subbaratnam, Project Manager  
License Renewal Branch A  
Division of License Renewal  
Office of Nuclear Reactor Regulation

Docket No. 50-293

Enclosure:  
Requests for Additional Information

cc w/encl: See next page

**ADAMS Accession No.: ML062500401**

OFFICE	PM:RLRA:DLR	LA:RLRA:DLR	BC:REBB:DLR
NAME	RSubbaratnam	YEdmonds	LLund
DATE	09/08/06	09/08/06	09/08/06

OFFICIAL RECORD COPY

Letter to Michael Kansler from Ram Subbaratnam dated: September 8, 2006

SUBJECT: REQUESTS FOR ADDITIONAL INFORMATION FOR THE REVIEW OF THE  
PILGRIM NUCLEAR POWER STATION LICENSE RENEWAL APPLICATION  
(TAC MC9669)

**HARD COPY**

DLR R/F

**E-MAIL:**

JFair  
RWeisman  
AMurphy  
RPettis  
GGalletti  
DShum  
GBagchi  
SSmith (srs3)  
SDuraiswamy  
YL (Renee) Li  
RidsNrrDir  
RidsNrrDirRlra  
RidsNrrDirRlrb  
RidsNrrDe  
RidsNrrDci  
RidsNrrEemb  
RidsNrrDeEeeb  
RidsNrrDeEqva  
RidsNrrDss  
RidsNrrDnrl  
RidsOgcMailCenter  
RidsNrrAdes  
DLR Staff  
-----  
RSubbaratnam  
Shoffman  
SUttal  
JShea  
AWilliamson  
CSydnor  
MMtichel  
GWilson  
CAnderson, Region 1  
WRaymond, Region 1  
NSheehan, Region 1

Pilgrim Nuclear Power Station

cc:

Regional Administrator, Region I  
U. S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission  
475 Allendale Road  
King of Prussia, PA 19406-1415

Senior Resident Inspector  
U. S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission  
Pilgrim Nuclear Power Station  
Post Office Box 867  
Plymouth, MA 02360

Chairman, Board of Selectmen  
11 Lincoln Street  
Plymouth, MA 02360

Chairman  
Nuclear Matters Committee  
Town Hall  
11 Lincoln Street  
Plymouth, MA 02360

Chairman, Duxbury Board of Selectmen  
Town Hall  
878 Tremont Street  
Duxbury, MA 02332

Office of the Commissioner  
Massachusetts Department of  
Environmental Protection  
One Winter Street  
Boston, MA 02108

Office of the Attorney General  
One Ashburton Place  
20th Floor  
Boston, MA 02108

MA Department of Public Health  
Radiation Control Program  
Schrafft Center, Suite 1M2A  
529 Main Street  
Charlestown, MA 02129

Secretary of Public Safety  
Executive Office of Public Safety  
One Ashburton Place  
Boston, MA 02108

Director, Massachusetts Emergency  
Management Agency  
Attn: James Muckerheide  
400 Worcester Road  
Framingham, MA 01702-5399

Mr. William D. Meinert  
Nuclear Engineer  
Massachusetts Municipal Wholesale  
Electric Company  
P.O. Box 426  
Ludlow, MA 01056-0426

Mr. Michael A. Balduzzi  
Site Vice President  
Entergy Nuclear Operations, Inc.  
Pilgrim Nuclear Power Station  
600 Rocky Hill Road  
Plymouth, MA 02360-5508

Mr. Stephen J. Bethay  
Director, Nuclear Safety Assurance  
Entergy Nuclear Operations, Inc.  
Pilgrim Nuclear Power Station  
600 Rocky Hill Road  
Plymouth, MA 02360-5508

Mr. Bryan S. Ford  
Manager, Licensing  
Entergy Nuclear Operations, Inc.  
Pilgrim Nuclear Power Station  
600 Rocky Hill Road  
Plymouth, MA 02360-5508

Mr. Gary J. Taylor  
Chief Executive Officer  
Entergy Operations  
1340 Echelon Parkway  
Jackson, MS 39213

cc:

Mr. John T. Herron  
Sr. VP and Chief Operating Officer  
Entergy Nuclear Operations, Inc.  
440 Hamilton Avenue  
White Plains, NY 10601

Mr. Oscar Limpias  
Vice President, Engineering  
Entergy Nuclear Operations, Inc.  
440 Hamilton Avenue  
White Plains, NY 10601

Mr. Christopher Schwarz  
Vice President, Operations Support  
Entergy Nuclear Operations, Inc.  
440 Hamilton Avenue  
White Plains, NY 10601

Mr. John F. McCann  
Director, Nuclear Safety Assurance  
Entergy Nuclear Operations, Inc.  
440 Hamilton Avenue  
White Plains, NY 10601

Ms. Charlene D. Faison  
Manager, Licensing  
Entergy Nuclear Operations, Inc.  
440 Hamilton Avenue  
White Plains, NY 10601

Mr. Michael D. Lyster  
5931 Barclay Lane  
Naples, FL 34110-7306

Mr. Michael J. Colomb  
Director of Oversight  
Entergy Nuclear Operations, Inc.  
440 Hamilton Avenue  
White Plains, NY 10601

Ms. Stacey Lousteau  
Treasury Department  
Entergy Services, Inc.  
639 Loyola Avenue  
New Orleans, LA 70113

Mr. James Sniezek  
5486 Nithsdale Drive  
Salisbury, MD 21801

Mr. Travis C. McCullough  
Assistant General Counsel  
Entergy Nuclear Operations, Inc.  
440 Hamilton Avenue  
White Plains, NY 10601

Mr. James Ross  
Nuclear Energy Institute  
1776 I Street, NW, Suite 400  
Washington, DC 20006-3708

Plymouth Public Library  
Attn: Dinah O'Brien  
132 South Street  
Plymouth, MA 02360

Duxbury Free Library  
ATTN: Ms. Elaine Winquist  
77 Alden Street  
Duxbury, MA 02332

Kingston Public Library  
ATTN: Reference Librarian  
6 Green Street  
Kingston, MA 02364

Ms. Mary Lampert  
Duxbury Nuclear Advisory, Chair  
Pilgrim Watch, Director  
148 Washington Street  
Duxbury, MA 02332

**REQUESTS FOR ADDITIONAL INFORMATION  
PILGRIM LICENSE RENEWAL APPLICATION (LRA)  
TIME-LIMITED AGING ANALYSIS (TLAA) OF REACTOR VESSEL (RV) INTERNALS  
SECTION: 4.2.1 NEUTRON FLUENCE**

RAI 4.2.2-1

Section 4.2.2 of the Pilgrim Nuclear Power Station (PNPS) License Renewal Application (LRA), "Pressure-Temperature [P-T] Limits," states that in a license amendment request dated December 4, 2002, PNPS requested to use the present P-T limit curves through the end of operating cycle 16, which corresponds to approximately 23 effective full power years (EFPY) of facility operation. The end of operating cycle 16 is expected to occur in 2007. Section 4.2.2 also states that, in this December 4, 2002 submittal, PNPS committed to develop and submit updated P-T limit curves and revised fluence calculations based on an NRC-approved calculation method that adheres to Regulatory Guide (RG) 1.190, "Calculational and Dosimetry Methods for Determining Pressure Vessel Neutron Fluence," prior to the end of operating cycle 16. License Amendment 197 granted this request in 2003. Section 4.2.2 then states that recent fluence calculations that were done per RG 1.190 confirm that the fluence for 54 EFPY is less than the fluence used to calculate the P-T limits that were approved for use only through the end of operating cycle 14. Based on the above statements, you conclude that the current Technical Specification (TS) P-T limit curves remain valid for the period of extended operation.

- (a) Please confirm whether the P-T limit curves currently established in the PNPS TSs expire at the end of operating cycle 16 (23 EFPY).
- (b) Please explain why the recent fluence calculations that were done per RG 1.190 confirm that the fluence for 54 EFPY is less than the fluence used to calculate the P-T limits that were approved for use through the end of cycle 14. Explain how this information was used to determine that the existing P-T limits remain valid for the period of extended operation.
- (c) The staff does not require the P-T limit curves for the extended period of operation to be submitted as part of the applicant's LRA for this time-limited aging analysis (TLAA). However, the staff does require NRC approval of the P-T limit curves for the extended period of operation prior to the expiration of the P-T limit curves for 32 EFPY. Please state when you intend to submit P-T limit curves for NRC approval for the extended licensed period of operation (54 EFPY).

RAI 4.2.4-1

Table 4.2-2 of the PNPS LRA lists initial  $RT_{NDT}$  values for the PNPS RV beltline materials. The initial  $RT_{NDT}$  values for Lower Intermediate Shell Plate G-3108-1 (Heat No. C-2921-2) and Lower Intermediate Shell Plate G-3108-3 (Heat No. C-2945-2) are less conservative than the corresponding initial  $RT_{NDT}$  values established in the NRC staff's reactor vessel integrity database (RVID) for these materials. Section 4.2.4 of the PNPS LRA states that, "initial  $RT_{NDT}$  values are from report SIR-00-82, which was submitted in 2001 as part of the PNPS P-T limit change request (Reference 4.2-5)." Reference 4.2-5 points to the April 13, 2001, license amendment issued by the NRC authorizing revised P-T limit curves.

ENCLOSURE

Please provide additional information that points to where the NRC staff authorized the use of the specific initial  $RT_{NDT}$  values listed in Table 4.2-4 for determining the adjusted reference temperature (ART) values for the PNPS reactor vessel (RV) beltline materials.

RAI 4.2.4-2

The %Cu and chemistry factor (CF) values for Lower Shell Axial Welds 2-338A, B, and C from LRA Table 4.2-2 are less conservative than the corresponding %Cu and CF values that were established in the staff's RVID for these welds. Please provide the following information:

- (a) verification of whether the %Cu and CF values listed in Table 4.2-1 are valid for the above welds,
- (b) justification for the use of these chemistry data for the above welds, including the source of the data, and a specific reference for the documentation/analysis demonstrating that these chemistry data represent the best available estimate of the weld chemistries.

RAI 4.2.4-3

Lower Intermediate / Upper Shell Circumferential Weld 3-339B (Heat No. 13253) is listed in the NRC staff's RVID. However this weld is not represented in LRA Table 4.2-2 or (LRA Table 4.2-1). Please resolve this discrepancy.

RAI 4.2.5-1

Section 4.2.5 of the PNPS LRA addresses the TLAA for the RV Circumferential Weld Examination Relief. Table 4.2-3 of the LRA compares the limiting RV circumferential weld parameters for PNPS to those used in the NRC evaluation of the BWRVIP-05 report, "BWR Vessel and Internals Project, BWR Reactor Pressure Vessel Shell Weld Inspection Recommendations." The PNPS limiting RV circumferential weld parameters are based on Lower Intermediate / Lower Shell Circumferential Weld 1-334 (Heat No. 21935), which is the only circumferential weld represented in LRA Table 4.2-2. However, as discussed in RAI 4.2.4-3, the NRC staff's RVID also lists Lower Intermediate / Upper Shell Circumferential Weld 3-339B (Heat No. 13253) as one of the RV welds for PNPS. Furthermore, the chemistry and CF data for this weld are more limiting than for the Circumferential Weld 1-334. Please explain why this TLAA did not address Lower Intermediate / Upper Shell Circumferential Weld 3-339B (Heat No. 13253).

RAI 4.2.5-2

The NRC staff requires that a request for relief from the American Society of Mechanical Engineer Boiler and Pressure Vessel Code (ASME Code) RV circumferential shell weld examination requirements be submitted prior to the beginning of the extended period of operation. Please state whether you intend to apply for relief from the ASME Code RV circumferential weld examination requirements for the extended licensed period of operation. State when you plan to submit this relief request.

RAI 4.2.5-3

In the July 28, 1998 SER on BWRVIP-05, the NRC staff concluded that examination of the RV circumferential shell welds would need to be performed if the corresponding volumetric examinations of the RV axial shell welds revealed the presence of an age-related degradation mechanism. Confirm whether or not previous volumetric examinations of the RV axial shell welds have shown any indication of cracking or other age-related degradation mechanisms in the welds.

RAI 4.2.6-1

The limiting axial weld failure probability calculated by the NRC staff in the BWRVIP-05 SER is based on the assumption that “essentially 100 percent” (i.e., greater than 90 percent) examination coverage of all RV axial welds can be achieved in accordance with ASME Code, Section XI requirements.

State whether your ISI examinations achieve “essentially 100 percent” (i.e., greater than 90 percent) overall examination coverage for the RV axial welds for the duration of the current licensed operating period. If less than 90 percent overall examination coverage is achieved for the RV axial welds, revise this TLAA to account for the effects of the limited scope examination coverage.