

October 13, 2006

Mr. B. F. Maurer, Acting Manager
Regulatory Compliance and Plant Licensing
Westinghouse Electric Company, LLC
P.O. Box 355
Pittsburgh, PA 15230-0355

SUBJECT: PALO VERDE NUCLEAR GENERATING STATION UNITS 1, 2 AND 3 –
REQUEST FOR WITHHOLDING INFORMATION FROM PUBLIC DISCLOSURE
(CAW-06-2137) (TAC NOS. MC7182, MC7183 AND MC7184)

Dear Mr. Maurer:

By letter dated June 20, 2006, Arizona Public Service Company submitted an affidavit dated May 2, 2006, executed by Mr. I.C. Rickard, requesting that information in the following document be withheld from public disclosure pursuant to Title 10 of the *Code of Federal Regulations* (10 CFR) Section 2.390:

LTR-CDME-06-13-P, Rev. 0, "Responses to NRC Requests for Additional Information on WCAP-16208-P, Rev. 1, 'NDE [Nondestructive Examination] Inspection Length for CE [Combustion Engineering] Steam Generator Tubesheet Region Explosive Expansions,'"

A nonproprietary copy of the document has been placed in the Nuclear Regulatory Commission's (NRC's) Public Document Room and added to the Agencywide Documents Access and Management System Public Electronic Reading Room.

The affidavit stated that the submitted information should be considered exempt from mandatory public disclosure for the following reasons:

- (i) The information sought to be withheld from public disclosure is owned and has been held in confidence by Westinghouse.
- (ii) The information is of a type customarily held in confidence by Westinghouse and not customarily disclosed to the public.
 - (a) The information reveals the distinguishing aspects of a process (or component, structure, tool, method, etc.) where prevention of its use by any of Westinghouse's competitors without license from Westinghouse constitutes a competitive economic advantage over other companies.
 - (b) It consists of supporting data, including test data, relative to a process (or component, structure, tool, method, etc.), the application of which data secures a competitive economic advantage, e.g., by optimization or improved marketability.

- (c) Its use by a competitor would reduce his expenditure of resources or improve his competitive position in the design, manufacture, shipment, installation, assurance of quality, or licensing a similar product.
- (d) It reveals cost or price information, production capacities, budget levels, or commercial strategies of Westinghouse, its customers or suppliers.
- (e) It reveals aspects of past, present, or future Westinghouse or customer funded development plans and programs of potential commercial value to Westinghouse.
- (f) It contains patentable ideas, for which patent protection may be desirable.

We have reviewed your application and the material in accordance with the requirements of 10 CFR 2.390 and, on the basis of your statements, have determined that the submitted information sought to be withheld contains proprietary commercial information and should be withheld from public disclosure.

Therefore, the submitted information marked as proprietary will be withheld from public disclosure pursuant to 10 CFR 2.390(b)(5) and Section 103(b) of the Atomic Energy Act of 1954, as amended.

Withholding from public inspection shall not affect the right, if any, of persons properly and directly concerned to inspect the documents. If the need arises, we may send copies of this information to our consultants working in this area. We will, of course, ensure that the consultants have signed the appropriate agreements for handling proprietary information.

If the basis for withholding this information from public inspection should change in the future, such that the information could then be made available for public inspection, you should promptly notify the NRC. You also should understand that the NRC may have cause to review this determination in the future, for example, if the scope of a Freedom of Information Act request includes your information. In all review situations, if the NRC makes a determination adverse to the above, you will be notified in advance of any public disclosure.

B. F. Maurer

-3-

If you have any questions regarding this matter, I may be reached at (301) 415-3062.

Sincerely,

/RA/

Mel B. Fields, Senior Project Manager
Plant Licensing Branch IV
Division of Operating Reactor Licensing
Office of Nuclear Reactor Regulation

Docket Nos. STN 50-528, STN 50-529, and STN 50-530

cc: See next page

B. F. Maurer

-3-

If you have any questions regarding this matter, I may be reached at (301) 415-3062.

Sincerely,

/RA/

Mel B. Fields, Senior Project Manager
Plant Licensing Branch IV
Division of Operating Reactor Licensing
Office of Nuclear Reactor Regulation

Docket Nos. STN 50-528, STN 50-529, and STN 50-530

cc: See next page

DISTRIBUTION:

PUBLIC
LPLIV Reading
RidsNrrLALFeizollahi
RidsNrrPMMFields
RidsNrrDorLPL4 (DTerao)
RidsNrrDciCsgb (AHiser)
RidsAcrsAcnwMailCenter
RidsRgn4MailCenter
RidsOgcRp

Accession Number: ML062440162

OFFICE	LPL4/GE	LPL4/PM	LPL4/LA	CSGB/BC	LPL4/BC
NAME	LWilkins	MFields	LFeizollahi	AHiser	DTerao
DATE	9/14/06	9/14/06	9/13/06	9/25/06	10/13/06

OFFICIAL RECORD COPY

Palo Verde Generating Station,
Units 1, 2, and 3

cc:

Mr. Steve Olea
Arizona Corporation Commission
1200 W. Washington Street
Phoenix, AZ 85007

Mr. Douglas Kent Porter
Senior Counsel
Southern California Edison Company
Law Department, Generation Resources
P.O. Box 800
Rosemead, CA 91770

Senior Resident Inspector
U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission
P. O. Box 40
Buckeye, AZ 85326

Regional Administrator, Region IV
U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission
Harris Tower & Pavillion
611 Ryan Plaza Drive, Suite 400
Arlington, TX 76011-8064

Chairman
Maricopa County Board of Supervisors
301 W. Jefferson, 10th Floor
Phoenix, AZ 85003

Mr. Aubrey V. Godwin, Director
Arizona Radiation Regulatory Agency
4814 South 40 Street
Phoenix, AZ 85040

Mr. Craig K. Seaman, General Manager
Regulatory Affairs and
Performance Improvement
Palo Verde Nuclear Generating Station
Mail Station 7636
P.O. Box 52034
Phoenix, AZ 85072-2034

Mr. Matthew Benac
Assistant Vice President
Nuclear & Generation Services
El Paso Electric Company
340 East Palm Lane, Suite 310
Phoenix, AZ 85004

Mr. John Taylor
Public Service Company of New Mexico
2401 Aztec NE, MS Z110
Albuquerque, NM 87107-4224

Mr. Thomas D. Champ
Southern California Edison Company
5000 Pacific Coast Hwy Bldg D1B
San Clemente, CA 92672

Mr. Robert Henry
Salt River Project
6504 East Thomas Road
Scottsdale, AZ 85251

Mr. Jeffrey T. Weikert
Assistant General Counsel
El Paso Electric Company
Mail Location 167
123 W. Mills
El Paso, TX 79901

Mr. John Schumann
Los Angeles Department of Water & Power
Southern California Public Power Authority
P.O. Box 51111, Room 1255-C
Los Angeles, CA 90051-0100

Mr. Brian Almon
Public Utility Commission
William B. Travis Building
P. O. Box 13326
1701 North Congress Avenue
Austin, TX 78701-3326

Ms. Karen O'Regan
Environmental Program Manager
City of Phoenix
Office of Environmental Programs
200 West Washington Street
Phoenix AZ 85003

March 2006