

July 26, 2006

MEMORANDUM TO: Beth Wetzel, Acting Chief
Financial, Policy and Rulemaking Branch
Division of Policy and Rulemaking
Office of Nuclear Reactor Regulation

FROM: Richard Dudley, Senior Project Manager **/RA/**
Financial, Policy and Rulemaking Branch
Division of Policy and Rulemaking
Office of Nuclear Reactor Regulation

SUBJECT: SUMMARY OF PUBLIC MEETING TO DISCUSS RESOLUTION OF
CERTAIN STAKEHOLDER COMMENTS ON PROPOSED RULE ON
RISK-INFORMED CHANGES TO LOSS-OF-COOLANT ACCIDENT
TECHNICAL REQUIREMENTS (10 CFR 50.46a)

On June 28, 2006, the staff conducted a Category 3 public meeting on the proposed rule to add a risk-informed alternative to §50.46 (large-break LOCA redefinition). Approximately 25 people attended, primarily industry and staff. The purpose of the workshop was to discuss ways to resolve stakeholder comments on the following two issues:

(1) What are appropriate accident mitigation requirements for pipe breaks larger than the TBS?

(2) What should be required by the risk-informed integrated safety performance (RISP) assessment?

On the mitigation topic, stakeholder discussions seemed to indicate that an acceptable alternative would be to include a requirement in the final rule that licensees establish appropriate, non-voluntary operational controls for equipment used to mitigate breaks larger than the transition break size, commensurate with the risk significance of the equipment.

On the RISP assessment topic, industry stakeholders did not want to develop, submit for prior NRC approval, or implement a RISP process that must be applied to all proposed facility changes. Those stakeholders believed that existing processes, including 10 CFR 50.59, the design control process, and Appendix B to 10 CFR 50, address the defense-in-depth and safety margin requirements without the need for additional controls. The NRC agreed to review the existing processes when determining the need for NRC approval of the RISP process.

Industry stakeholders also expressed concerns over the cumulative risk issue. Several issues were raised: (a) PRA updates are difficult and time consuming; (b) it is difficult to predict what

CONTACT: Richard Dudley, DPR/PFPB
(301) 415-1116

the overall change in risk will be from just looking at the individual changes; (c) a continuous, cumulative record will require a "living, daily PRA" which will be impractical to implement; (d) it is not clear how to handle model methodology improvements as opposed to plant changes; (e) it is not clear what a plant would need to do if the periodic risk assessment exceeded the acceptance guidelines. The NRC agreed to consider these comments when determining the final rule requirements for the RISP process.

A list of meeting attendees is provided in Enclosure 1. Presentation slides used by the NRC staff are provided in Enclosure 2.

Enclosures:

- (1) List of Attendees
- (2) NRC presentation slides

the overall change in risk will be from just looking at the individual changes; (c) a continuous, cumulative record will require a "living, daily PRA" which will be impractical to implement; (d) it is not clear how to handle model methodology improvements as opposed to plant changes; (e) it is not clear what a plant would need to do if the periodic risk assessment exceeded the acceptance guidelines. The NRC agreed to consider these comments when determining the final rule requirements for the RISP process.

A list of meeting attendees is provided in Enclosure 1. Presentation slides used by the NRC staff are provided in Enclosure 2.

Enclosures:

- (1) List of Attendees
- (2) NRC presentation slides

DISTRIBUTION:

PUBLIC	PFPB r/f	TCollins	GMizuno	RidsNrrAdes
RidsNrrDorl	RidsOgcMailCenter	RidsNrrDpr	RidsNrrDprPfpb	BSheron
RidsNrrAdra	RidsAcrsAcnwMailCenter	RDudley	Mtg Attendees	SDinsmore

Package Accession Number: ML061940138

Memo Accession Number: ML061940161

Enclosure 2 Accession Number: ML061990483

OFFICE	NRR:DPR:PFPB	NRR:DRA:APLA	NRR:DPR:PFPB
NAME	RDudley	SDinsmore	BWetzel
DATE	07/19/2006	07/25/2006	07/26/2006

OFFICIAL RECORD COPY

List of Attendees

Name	Organization	Email Address
Bob Jaquith	Westinghouse	robert.e.jaquith@us.westinghouse.com
David Midlik	Southern Nuclear	dwmidlik@southernco.com
John Butler	NEI	jcb@nei.org
Stanley Levinson	Framatome ANP	stanley.levinson@framatome-anp.com
Barry Sloane	Erin Engineering & Research	bdsloane@erineng.com
Gregg Swindlehurst	Duke Power	gbswindl@duke-energy.com
Michael Tschlitz	NRC/NRR/DRA	mrt@nrc.gov
Wayne Harrison	STPNOC	awharrison@stpegs.com
Beth A. Wetzel	NRC/NRR/DPR	baw@nrc.gov
Steven A. Lauer	NRC/NRR	sal@nrc.gov
Richard Dudley	NRC/NRR/DPR	rfd@nrc.gov
Bert Dunn	AREVA	bert.dunn@areva.com
Tony Pietrangelo	NEI	arp@nrc.gov
Glenn Kelly	NRC/NRR	gbk@nrc.gov
Biff Bradley	NEI	rcb@nei.org
Deann Raleigh	LIS, Scientech	draleigh@scientech.co
Charles Ader	NRC/RES/DRAA	cea@nrc.gov
Hossein Nourbakhsh	NRC/ACRS	hpn@nrc.gov
Jim Lyons	NRC/NRR/DRA	jel@nrc.gov
Gary Holahan	NRC/NRR/ADRA	gmh@nrc.gov
Tim Collins	NRC/NRR	tec@nrc.gov
Steve Dinsmore	NRC/NRR/DRA	scd1@nrc.gov
Ralph Landry	NRC/NRR	rrl@nrc.gov
Steven Dolley	Inside NRC/Platts	steven_dolley@platts.com