

July 12, 2006

Mr. Louis Quintana  
Manager, Licensing  
GE Nuclear Energy  
P. O. Box 780, M/C A-30  
Wilmington, NC 28401

SUBJECT: DRAFT SAFETY EVALUATION (SE) FOR GENERAL ELECTRIC NUCLEAR ENERGY (GENE) TOPICAL REPORT (TR) NEDE-32906P, REVISION 2, "TRACG APPLICATION FOR ANTICIPATED OPERATIONAL OCCURRENCES (AOO) TRANSIENT ANALYSES" (TAC NO. MD0249)

Dear Mr. Quintana:

By letter dated February 14, 2006, GENE submitted TR NEDE-32906P, Revision 2, "TRACG Application for Anticipated Operational Occurrences (AOO) Transient Analyses," to the U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission (NRC) staff for review. Enclosed for GENE review and comment is a copy of the NRC staff's draft SE for the TR.

Pursuant to Section 2.390 of Title 10 of the *Code of Federal Regulations* (10 CFR), we have determined that the enclosed draft SE does not contain proprietary information. However, we will delay placing the draft SE in the public document room for a period of 10 working days from the date of this letter to provide you with the opportunity to comment on the proprietary aspects. If you believe that any information in the enclosure is proprietary, please identify such information line-by-line and define the basis pursuant to the criteria of 10 CFR 2.390. After 10 working days, the draft SE will be made publicly available, and an additional 10 working days are provided to you to comment on any factual errors or clarity concerns contained in the draft SE. The final SE will be issued after making any necessary changes and will be made publicly available. The NRC staff's disposition of your comments on the draft SE will be discussed in the final SE.

To facilitate the NRC staff's review of your comments, please provide a marked-up copy of the draft SE showing proposed changes and provide a summary table of the proposed changes. If you have any questions, please contact Michelle Honcharik at 301-415-1774.

Sincerely,

**/RA/**

Stacey L. Rosenberg, Chief  
Special Projects Branch  
Division of Policy and Rulemaking  
Office of Nuclear Reactor Regulation

Project No. 710

Enclosure: Draft SE

cc w/encl: See next page

July 12, 2006

Mr. Louis Quintana  
Manager, Licensing  
GE Nuclear Energy  
P. O. Box 780, M/C A-30  
Wilmington, NC 28401

SUBJECT: DRAFT SAFETY EVALUATION (SE) FOR GENERAL ELECTRIC NUCLEAR ENERGY (GENE) TOPICAL REPORT (TR) NEDE-32906P, REVISION 2, "TRACG APPLICATION FOR ANTICIPATED OPERATIONAL OCCURRENCES (AOO) TRANSIENT ANALYSES" (TAC NO. MD0249)

Dear Mr. Quintana:

By letter dated February 14, 2006, GENE submitted TR NEDE-32906P, Revision 2, "TRACG Application for Anticipated Operational Occurrences (AOO) Transient Analyses," to the U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission (NRC) staff for review. Enclosed for GENE review and comment is a copy of the NRC staff's draft SE for the TR.

Pursuant to Section 2.390 of Title 10 of the *Code of Federal Regulations* (10 CFR), we have determined that the enclosed draft SE does not contain proprietary information. However, we will delay placing the draft SE in the public document room for a period of 10 working days from the date of this letter to provide you with the opportunity to comment on the proprietary aspects. If you believe that any information in the enclosure is proprietary, please identify such information line-by-line and define the basis pursuant to the criteria of 10 CFR 2.390. After 10 working days, the draft SE will be made publicly available, and an additional 10 working days are provided to you to comment on any factual errors or clarity concerns contained in the draft SE. The final SE will be issued after making any necessary changes and will be made publicly available. The NRC staff's disposition of your comments on the draft SE will be discussed in the final SE.

To facilitate the NRC staff's review of your comments, please provide a marked-up copy of the draft SE showing proposed changes and provide a summary table of the proposed changes. If you have any questions, please contact Michelle Honcharik at 301-415-1774.

Sincerely,  
**/RA/**  
Stacey L. Rosenberg, Chief  
Special Projects Branch  
Division of Policy and Rulemaking  
Office of Nuclear Reactor Regulation

Project No. 710  
Enclosure: Draft SE  
cc w/encl: See next page

DISTRIBUTION:

**PUBLIC (No DPC for 10 working days)**

PSPB Reading File                      RidsNrrDpr                                      RidsNrrDprPspb  
RidsNrrPMMHoncharik                  RidsNrrLADBaxley                              RidsOgcMailCenter  
RidsAcrsAcnwMailCenter              RidsNrrDssSnpb                                      EThrom

**ADAMS ACCESSION NO.: ML061800330**

\*No major changes to SE input.

**NRR-106**

OFFICE	PSPB/PM	PSPB/LA	SNPB/BC*	PSPB/BC	DPR/DD
NAME	MHoncharik	DBaxley	FAkstulewicz	SRosenberg	HNieh
DATE	7/10/06	7/10/06	6/23/06	7/11/06	7/12/06

GENE

Project No. 710

cc:

Mr. George B. Stramback  
Regulatory Services Project Manager  
GE Nuclear Energy  
175 Curtner Avenue  
San Jose, CA 95125

Mr. Charles M. Vaughan, Manager  
Facility Licensing  
Global Nuclear Fuel  
P.O. Box 780  
Wilmington, NC 28402

Mr. Glen A. Watford, Manager  
Technical Services  
GE Nuclear Energy  
175 Curtner Avenue  
San Jose, CA 95125

Andrew A. Lingenfelter, Manager  
GNF Engineering  
Global Nuclear Fuels - Americas, LLC  
P.O. Box 780, M/C F12  
Wilmington, NC 28402

04/18/06

DRAFT SAFETY EVALUATION BY THE OFFICE OF NUCLEAR REACTOR REGULATION

TOPICAL REPORT NEDE-32906P, REVISION 2

"TRACG APPLICATION FOR ANTICIPATED OPERATIONAL

OCCURRENCES (AOO) TRANSIENT ANALYSES"

GENERAL ELECTRIC NUCLEAR ENERGY (GENE)

PROJECT NO. 710

1 1.0 INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND

2  
3 GENE and its subsidiary Global Nuclear Fuel (GNF) submitted TRACG02A (referred to  
4 hereafter as TRACG) for U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission (NRC) review for application to  
5 anticipated operational occurrence (AOO) transient events on January 25, 2000 (Reference 1).  
6 The submittal included the code model documents related to the TRACG code  
7 (References 2(a), 2(b), and 2(c)). The TRACG code is a thermal-hydraulic analysis code  
8 intended to be used as a realistic analysis model. The NRC staff approved TRACG for AOO  
9 transient events on October 22, 2001 (Reference 3). The approved topical report,  
10 NEDE-32906P-A, Revision 1, was provided by GENE on February 6, 2006 (Reference 4).

11  
12 The TRAC family of codes began as a pressurized water reactor analysis code developed for  
13 the NRC at Los Alamos National Laboratory. A boiling water reactor (BWR) version of the code  
14 was developed jointly by the NRC and GENE at the Idaho National Engineering Laboratory as  
15 TRAC-BD1/MOD1 (Reference 5). GENE developed a proprietary version of the code  
16 designated as TRACG. The objective of the proprietary code development was to have a code  
17 capable of realistic analyses of transients, stability, and anticipated transients without scram  
18 events. The code was modified to include a three-dimensional kinetic model in addition to the  
19 multi-dimensional, two-fluid thermal-hydraulics models.

20  
21 The plant types for which the TRACG code is to be applied include the BWR/2, BWR/3,  
22 BWR/4, BWR/5, and BWR/6 designs. This code has not been submitted for review for  
23 application to any other plant design.

24  
25 GENE submitted a proposed revision to TRACG, in a letter dated February 14, 2006  
26 (Reference 6). GENE has corrected a small error in the quantification of the accuracy of the  
27 void coefficient, an element of the NRC-approved methodology used in TRACG licensing basis  
28 AOO analyses. GENE revised the discussion of item "C1AX Void Coefficient, H" in  
29 Subsection 5.1, "Model Parameters and Uncertainties" of NEDE-32906P-A, Revision 1. The  
30 responses to related NRC staff requests for additional information (RAIs) during the initial  
31 review, particularly RAI 13, were also revised to document the void coefficient correction. In  
32 addition, other non-technical changes were made to address typographical errors and provide  
33 additional clarifications. Because the error did not involve the model description or qualification

1 studies, there were no changes to the TRACG model and qualification reports (References 2(a)  
2 and 2(b)).

3  
4 GENE supplemented the submittal in response to the May 31, 2006, NRC staff RAI  
5 (Reference 7) on June 7, 2006 (Reference 8).

6  
7 2.0 REGULATORY AND TECHNICAL EVALUATION

8  
9 TRACG uses a 3-dimensional neutron kinetics model to compute the needed neutronics  
10 parameters. The contribution of the change in the water density to the reactivity in a node is  
11 computed in terms of the infinite multiplication factor as a function of the void fraction and fuel  
12 exposure in the node (modeled volume).

13  
14 The overall analysis approach to AOOs in NEDE-32906P followed the Code Scaling  
15 Applicability and Uncertainty (CSAU) analysis methodology (Reference 9). In the CSAU  
16 process, model uncertainty is derived from the propagation of individual model uncertainties  
17 through code calculations and experimental comparisons. The total uncertainty for a figure of  
18 merit is characterized by a bias and a standard error which allows for the computation of a  
19 "best-estimate" value with its uncertainty. This permits a more realistic comparison to  
20 regulatory acceptance criteria as opposed to the use of computed conservative values. One  
21 such individual model uncertainty of high significance is the void coefficient. The biases and  
22 uncertainties in the estimate of the void coefficient are predominantly due to biases and  
23 uncertainties in the infinite lattice eigenvalues ( $k_4$ ) calculated with the TGBLA lattice physics  
24 code (Reference 10).

25  
26 The TGBLA code is used to generate the cross section fits that are evaluated in TRACG. The  
27 biases and uncertainties associated with the TGBLA computed infinite multiplication factors  
28 were estimated by comparing the TGBLA results to those computed with the continuous energy  
29 Monte Carlo code MCNP (Reference 11). The accuracy of MCNP in predicting  $k_4$  has been  
30 well established through numerous comparisons to critical experiments. While it is reasonable  
31 to assume that the MCNP computed void coefficient is the "true" value, the TRACG transient  
32 calculation uses TGBLA generated cross sections. Therefore, the approach used in TRACG  
33 required a correction factor based on the comparison of the TGBLA and the MCNP calculations  
34 of  $k_4$ .

35  
36 The revised approach to the computation of the correction factor removes an artificially  
37 introduced void-fraction dependent variation in the bias and the variance of the correction factor  
38 to the TGBLA computed value. The NRC staff reviewed the revised void coefficient description  
39 in "C1AX Void Coefficient, H" of Subsection 5.1, "Model Parameters and Uncertainties" in TR  
40 NEDE-32906P, Revision 2, and the revised development of the bias and variance correction to  
41 the TGBLA computer void coefficient presented in the responses to RAI 13. The NRC staff  
42 finds the revised approach consistent with the standard methodology used for incorporating  
43 data from critical experiments (the "true" value) into core design calculations where the Monte  
44 Carlo computed values of  $k_4$  are used to replace measured data from critical experiments.

45  
46 GENE has revised Table 5-1, "Normality Test P-Values for the Void Coefficient Residual  
47 Errors," of NEDE-32906P, Revision 2, in response to the NRC staff's RAI. Table 5-1 was  
48 updated using the revised void coefficient correction factor to confirm the NRC staff's previous

1 conclusion in Reference 3 that the "p-values for the Andersen-Darling statistic demonstrates the  
2 normality at the 5 percent level at each exposure-in-channel void fraction point."  
3

4 GENE has revised Section 7.5.1, "Conformance with Design Limits," of TR NEDE-32906P,  
5 Revision 2, in response to the NRC staff's RAI. The revision clarifies the process by which the  
6 statistical results are used to compare key output values to design limits. Cases are defined  
7 where (1) the key output should be greater than the design limit and (2) where the key output  
8 should be less than the design limit.  
9

10 GENE updated Section 7.6, "Statistical Analysis for Qualification Events," and Section 8.4.1,  
11 "Uncertainty Screening," of TR NEDE-32906P, Revision 2, as appropriate to evaluate the  
12 proposed revision to the calculation of the void coefficient correction factor. The comparisons  
13 of the TRACG results to typical licensing analysis data and the deviation from nominal at a  $\pm 1$   
14 sigma uncertainty were updated using the revised void coefficient correction factor. The  
15 correction in the void coefficient accuracy typically results in more conservative responses in  
16 the licensing analyses, and the TRACG results fall within the 2 sigma band. The NRC staff  
17 finds these results acceptable for licensing analyses.  
18

### 19 3.0 CONCLUSION

20  
21 GENE has documented the quantification of uncertainties as applied to realistic nominal results  
22 from TRACG analyses such that less than 0.1 percent of the fuel rods are expected to  
23 experience a boiling transition for the most severe AOO. The approach follows the accepted  
24 CSAU analysis methodology. GENE has quantified the uncertainties and biases in models  
25 associated with those identified and highly ranked phenomena based on experimental data and  
26 computation with validated codes. GENE's proposal to revise the computation of the void  
27 coefficient, a high ranked phenomenon, correction factor is acceptable. The revised approach  
28 to the computation of the correction factor removes an artificially introduced void-fraction  
29 dependent variation in the bias and the variance of the correction factor to the TGBLA  
30 computed value. The NRC staff finds the revised approach consistent with the standard  
31 methodology used for incorporating data from critical experiments (the "true" value) into core  
32 design calculations where the Monte Carlo computed values of  $k_4$  are used to replace  
33 measured data from critical experiments. The process is acceptable and the quantities are  
34 reasonable. These together with the computed sensitivity estimates of the change in the critical  
35 power ratio with respect to variation in the model parameters indicate smoothness and stability  
36 in the solution to TRACG transient computations within the uncertainties in the models.  
37

38 The conditions and limitations identified in Section 6.0 of the NRC staff's previous safety  
39 evaluation (Reference 3) are unchanged as a result of the proposed revision to the calculation  
40 of the void coefficient correction factor.  
41

### 42 4.0 REFERENCES

- 43  
44 1. Letter MFN 00-001 from J. F. Klapproth, Manager, Engineering and Technology, GE  
45 Nuclear Energy, to USNRC, "TRANSMITTAL OF GE PROPRIETARY LICENSING  
46 TOPICAL REPORT NEDE-32906P, 'TRACG Application for Anticipated Operational  
47 Occurrences (AOO) Transient Analyses,' Revision 0, dated January 2000," January 25,  
48 2000 (ADAMS Package Accession No. ML003681270).  
49

- 1 2. (a) Letter MFN 99-40 from J. F. Klapproth, Manager, Engineering and Technology,  
2 GE Nuclear Energy, to USNRC, "TRANSMITTAL OF GE PROPRIETARY  
3 LICENSING TOPICAL REPORT NEDE-32176P, 'TRACG Model Description,'  
4 Revision 2, dated December 1999," December 15, 1999 (ADAMS Package  
5 Accession No. ML993630286).  
6
- 7 (b) Letter MFN 00-002 from J. F. Klapproth, Manager, Engineering and Technology,  
8 GE Nuclear Energy, to USNRC, "TRANSMITTAL OF GE PROPRIETARY  
9 LICENSING TOPICAL REPORT NEDE-32177P/R2, 'TRACG Qualification,'  
10 Revision 2, dated January 2000," January 31, 2000 (ADAMS Accession Package  
11 No. ML003682927).  
12
- 13 (c) Letter MFN 00-007 from J. F. Klapproth, Manager, Engineering and Technology,  
14 GE Nuclear Energy, to USNRC, "TRANSMITTAL OF GE PROPRIETARY  
15 REPORT NEDC-32956P, 'TRACG02A User's Manual,' Revision 0, dated  
16 February 2000," February 28, 2000 (ADAMS Package Accession  
17 No. ML003688295).  
18
- 19 3. Letter from S.A. Richards, USNRC, to J.F. Klapproth, Manager, Engineering &  
20 Technology, GE Nuclear Energy, "Safety Evaluation Report on General Electric Nuclear  
21 Energy Topical Report NEDE-32906P, Revision 0, 'TRACG Application for Anticipated  
22 Operational Occurrences (AOO) Transient Analyses' (TAC NO. MA7779)," October 22,  
23 2001 (ADAMS Accession No. ML012740161).  
24
- 25 4. Letter MFN 06-042 from L.M. Quintana, Manager, Licensing, GE Nuclear Energy, to  
26 USNRC, "GE Licensing Topical Report NEDE-32906P-A, Revision 1, 'TRACG  
27 Application for Anticipated Operational Occurrences (AOO) Transient Analyses',"  
28 February 6, 2006 (ADAMS Package Accession No. ML060390557).  
29
- 30 5. NUREG/CR-3633, "TRAC-BD1/MOD1: An Advanced Best Estimate Program for Boiling  
31 Water Reactor Transient Analysis, Volumes 1-4," Idaho National Engineering  
32 Laboratory, April 1984.  
33
- 34 6. Letter MFN 06-046 from L.M. Quintana, Manager, Licensing, GE Nuclear Energy, to  
35 USNRC, "GE Licensing Topical Report NEDE-32906P, Revision 2, 'TRACG Application  
36 for Anticipated Operational Occurrences (AOO) Transient Analyses'," February 14, 2006  
37 (ADAMS Package Accession No. ML060530560).  
38
- 39 7. Letter from M.C. Honcharik, Project Manager, USNRC, to L.M. Quintana, Manager,  
40 Licensing, GE Nuclear Energy, "Request for Additional Information (RAI) Regarding  
41 General Electric Nuclear Energy (GENE) Topical Report (TR) NEDE-32906P,  
42 Revision 2, 'TRACG Application for Anticipated Operational Occurrences (AOO)  
43 Transient Analyses' (TAC NO. MD0249)," May 31, 2006 (ADAMS Accession  
44 No. ML061450405).  
45

- 1 8. Letter MFN 06-169 from L.M. Quintana, Manager, Licensing, GE Nuclear Energy, to  
2 USNRC, "Response to Request For Additional Information (RAI) Regarding General  
3 Electric Nuclear Energy (GENE) Topical Report (TR) NEDE-32906P, Revision 2,  
4 'TRACG Application For Anticipated Operational Occurrences (AOO) Transient  
5 Analyses' (TAC No. MD0249)," June 7, 2006 (ADAMS Package Accession  
6 No. ML061600297).  
7
- 8 9. NUREG/CR-5249, "Quantifying Reactor Safety Margins: Application of Code Scaling,  
9 Applicability, and Uncertainty Evaluation Methodology to a Large-Break, Loss-of-Coolant  
10 Accident," December 1989 (ADAMS Package Accession No. ML030380503).  
11
- 12 10. General Electric Company, "TGBLA06A: General Electric Lattice Physics Method,"  
13 DRF A00-05526, October 1994.  
14
- 15 11. Briemeister, J. G., Ed., "MCNP - A General Monte Carlo Code for Neutron, Photon and  
16 Electron Transport, Version 3A/3B/4," LA-7396-M, Los Alamos National Laboratory,  
17 1986/Revisions 1988 and 1991.  
18

19 Principle Contributor: E. Throm  
20

21 Date: July 12, 2006