July 12, 2006

Mr. Louis Quintana Manager, Licensing GE Nuclear Energy P. O. Box 780, M/C A-30 Wilmington, NC 28401

SUBJECT: DRAFT SAFETY EVALUATION (SE) FOR GENERAL ELECTRIC NUCLEAR ENERGY (GENE) TOPICAL REPORT (TR) NEDE-32906P, REVISION 2, "TRACG APPLICATION FOR ANTICIPATED OPERATIONAL OCCURRENCES (AOO) TRANSIENT ANALYSES" (TAC NO. MD0249)

Dear Mr. Quintana:

By letter dated February 14, 2006, GENE submitted TR NEDE-32906P, Revision 2, "TRACG Application for Anticipated Operational Occurrences (AOO) Transient Analyses," to the U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission (NRC) staff for review. Enclosed for GENE review and comment is a copy of the NRC staff's draft SE for the TR.

Pursuant to Section 2.390 of Title 10 of the *Code of Federal Regulations* (10 CFR), we have determined that the enclosed draft SE does not contain proprietary information. However, we will delay placing the draft SE in the public document room for a period of 10 working days from the date of this letter to provide you with the opportunity to comment on the proprietary aspects. If you believe that any information in the enclosure is proprietary, please identify such information line-by-line and define the basis pursuant to the criteria of 10 CFR 2.390. After 10 working days, the draft SE will be made publicly available, and an additional 10 working days are provided to you to comment on any factual errors or clarity concerns contained in the draft SE. The final SE will be issued after making any necessary changes and will be made publicly available. The NRC staff's disposition of your comments on the draft SE will be discussed in the final SE.

To facilitate the NRC staff's review of your comments, please provide a marked-up copy of the draft SE showing proposed changes and provide a summary table of the proposed changes. If you have any questions, please contact Michelle Honcharik at 301-415-1774.

Sincerely,

/**RA**/

Stacey L. Rosenberg, Chief Special Projects Branch Division of Policy and Rulemaking Office of Nuclear Reactor Regulation

Project No. 710 Enclosure: Draft SE cc w/encl: See next page Mr. Louis Quintana Manager, Licensing GE Nuclear Energy P. O. Box 780, M/C A-30 Wilmington, NC 28401

SUBJECT: DRAFT SAFETY EVALUATION (SE) FOR GENERAL ELECTRIC NUCLEAR ENERGY (GENE) TOPICAL REPORT (TR) NEDE-32906P, REVISION 2, "TRACG APPLICATION FOR ANTICIPATED OPERATIONAL OCCURRENCES (AOO) TRANSIENT ANALYSES" (TAC NO. MD0249)

Dear Mr. Quintana:

By letter dated February 14, 2006, GENE submitted TR NEDE-32906P, Revision 2, "TRACG Application for Anticipated Operational Occurrences (AOO) Transient Analyses," to the U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission (NRC) staff for review. Enclosed for GENE review and comment is a copy of the NRC staff's draft SE for the TR.

Pursuant to Section 2.390 of Title 10 of the *Code of Federal Regulations* (10 CFR), we have determined that the enclosed draft SE does not contain proprietary information. However, we will delay placing the draft SE in the public document room for a period of 10 working days from the date of this letter to provide you with the opportunity to comment on the proprietary aspects. If you believe that any information in the enclosure is proprietary, please identify such information line-by-line and define the basis pursuant to the criteria of 10 CFR 2.390. After 10 working days, the draft SE will be made publicly available, and an additional 10 working days are provided to you to comment on any factual errors or clarity concerns contained in the draft SE. The final SE will be issued after making any necessary changes and will be made publicly available. The NRC staff's disposition of your comments on the draft SE will be discussed in the final SE.

To facilitate the NRC staff's review of your comments, please provide a marked-up copy of the draft SE showing proposed changes and provide a summary table of the proposed changes. If you have any questions, please contact Michelle Honcharik at 301-415-1774.

Sincerely, /RA/ Stacey L. Rosenberg, Chief Special Projects Branch Division of Policy and Rulemaking Office of Nuclear Reactor Regulation

Project No. 710 Enclosure: Draft SE cc w/encl: See next page

DISTRIBUTION:

PUBLIC (No DPC for 10 working days)

PSPB Reading File RidsNrrPMMHoncharik RidsAcrsAcnwMailCenter RidsNrrDpr RidsNrrLADBaxley RidsNrrDssSnpb RidsNrrDprPspb RidsOgcMailCenter EThrom

ADAMS ACCESSION NO.: ML061800330

*No major changes to SE input. NRR-106

OFFICE	PSPB/PM	PSPB/LA	SNPB/BC*	PSPB/BC	DPR/DD
NAME	MHoncharik	DBaxley	FAkstulewicz	SRosenberg	HNieh
DATE	7/10/06	7/10/06	6/23/06	7/11/06	7/12/06

OFFICIAL RECORD COPY

GENE

cc: Mr. George B. Stramback Regulatory Services Project Manager GE Nuclear Energy 175 Curtner Avenue San Jose, CA 95125

Mr. Charles M. Vaughan, Manager Facility Licensing Global Nuclear Fuel P.O. Box 780 Wilmington, NC 28402

Mr. Glen A. Watford, Manager Technical Services GE Nuclear Energy 175 Curtner Avenue San Jose, CA 95125

Andrew A. Lingenfelter, Manager GNF Engineering Global Nuclear Fuels - Americas, LLC P.O. Box 780, M/C F12 Wilmington, NC 28402

DRAFT SAFETY EVALUATION BY THE OFFICE OF NUCLEAR REACTOR REGULATION

TOPICAL REPORT NEDE-32906P, REVISION 2

"TRACG APPLICATION FOR ANTICIPATED OPERATIONAL

OCCURRENCES (AOO) TRANSIENT ANALYSES"

GENERAL ELECTRIC NUCLEAR ENERGY (GENE)

PROJECT NO. 710

1.0 INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND

1

2 3 GENE and its subsidiary Global Nuclear Fuel (GNF) submitted TRACG02A (referred to 4 hereafter as TRACG) for U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission (NRC) review for application to 5 anticipated operational occurrence (AOO) transient events on January 25, 2000 (Reference 1). 6 The submittal included the code model documents related to the TRACG code 7 (References 2(a), 2(b), and 2(c)). The TRACG code is a thermal-hydraulic analysis code 8 intended to be used as a realistic analysis model. The NRC staff approved TRACG for AOO 9 transient events on October 22, 2001 (Reference 3). The approved topical report, 10 NEDE-32906P-A, Revision 1, was provided by GENE on February 6, 2006 (Reference 4). 11

12 The TRAC family of codes began as a pressurized water reactor analysis code developed for 13 the NRC at Los Alamos National Laboratory. A boiling water reactor (BWR) version of the code 14 was developed jointly by the NRC and GENE at the Idaho National Engineering Laboratory as 15 TRAC-BD1/MOD1 (Reference 5). GENE developed a proprietary version of the code 16 designated as TRACG. The objective of the proprietary code development was to have a code 17 capable of realistic analyses of transients, stability, and anticipated transients without scram 18 events. The code was modified to include a three-dimensional kinetic model in addition to the 19 multi-dimensional, two-fluid thermal-hydraulics models. 20

The plant types for which the TRACG code is to be applied include the BWR/2, BWR/3,
BWR/4, BWR/5, and BWR/6 designs. This code has not been submitted for review for
application to any other plant design.

25 GENE submitted a proposed revision to TRACG, in a letter dated February 14, 2006 26 (Reference 6). GENE has corrected a small error in the quantification of the accuracy of the 27 void coefficient, an element of the NRC-approved methodology used in TRACG licensing basis 28 AOO analyses. GENE revised the discussion of item "C1AX Void Coefficient, H" in 29 Subsection 5.1, "Model Parameters and Uncertainties" of NEDE-32906P-A, Revision 1. The 30 responses to related NRC staff requests for additional information (RAIs) during the initial 31 review, particularly RAI 13, were also revised to document the void coefficient correction. In 32 addition, other non-technical changes were made to address typographical errors and provide 33 additional clarifications. Because the error did not involve the model description or qualification studies, there were no changes to the TRACG model and qualification reports (References 2(a) and 2(b)).

GENE supplemented the submittal in response to the May 31, 2006, NRC staff RAI (Reference 7) on June 7, 2006 (Reference 8).

2.0 REGULATORY AND TECHNICAL EVALUATION

1 2

3 4

5

6 7

8

9 TRACG uses a 3-dimensional neutron kinetics model to compute the needed neutronics 10 parameters. The contribution of the change in the water density to the reactivity in a node is 11 computed in terms of the infinite multiplication factor as a function of the void fraction and fuel 12 exposure in the node (modeled volume). 13

14 The overall analysis approach to AOOs in NEDE-32906P followed the Code Scaling 15 Applicability and Uncertainty (CSAU) analysis methodology (Reference 9). In the CSAU 16 process, model uncertainty is derived from the propagation of individual model uncertainties through code calculations and experimental comparisons. The total uncertainty for a figure of 17 18 merit is characterized by a bias and a standard error which allows for the computation of a 19 "best-estimate" value with its uncertainty. This permits a more realistic comparison to 20 regulatory acceptance criteria as opposed to the use of computed conservative values. One 21 such individual model uncertainty of high significance is the void coefficient. The biases and 22 uncertainties in the estimate of the void coefficient are predominantly due to biases and 23 uncertainties in the infinite lattice eigenvalues (k₄) calculated with the TGBLA lattice physics 24 code (Reference 10). 25

26 The TGBLA code is used to generate the cross section fits that are evaluated in TRACG. The 27 biases and uncertainties associated with the TGBLA computed infinite multiplication factors 28 were estimated by comparing the TGBLA results to those computed with the continuous energy 29 Monte Carlo code MCNP (Reference 11). The accuracy of MCNP in predicting k₄ has been well established through numerous comparisons to critical experiments. While it is reasonable 30 31 to assume that the MCNP computed void coefficient is the "true" value, the TRACG transient 32 calculation uses TGBLA generated cross sections. Therefore, the approach used in TRACG 33 required a correction factor based on the comparison of the TGBLA and the MCNP calculations 34 of k₄. 35

36 The revised approach to the computation of the correction factor removes an artificially 37 introduced void-fraction dependent variation in the bias and the variance of the correction factor 38 to the TGBLA computed value. The NRC staff reviewed the revised void coefficient description 39 in "C1AX Void Coefficient, H" of Subsection 5.1, "Model Parameters and Uncertainties" in TR 40 NEDE-32906P, Revision 2, and the revised development of the bias and variance correction to 41 the TGBLA computer void coefficient presented in the responses to RAI 13. The NRC staff finds the revised approach consistent with the standard methodology used for incorporating 42 43 data from critical experiments (the "true" value) into core design calculations where the Monte 44 Carlo computed values of k₄ are used to replace measured data from critical experiments. 45

- 46 GENE has revised Table 5-1, "Normality Test P-Values for the Void Coefficient Residual
- 47 Errors," of NEDE-32906P, Revision 2, in response to the NRC staff's RAI. Table 5-1 was 48 updated using the revised void coefficient correction factor to confirm the NRC staff's previous

conclusion in Reference 3 that the "p-values for the Andersen-Darling statistic demonstrates the
 normality at the 5 percent level at each exposure-in-channel void fraction point."

GENE has revised Section 7.5.1, "Conformance with Design Limits," of TR NEDE-32906P, Revision 2, in response to the NRC staff's RAI. The revision clarifies the process by which the statistical results are used to compare key output values to design limits. Cases are defined where (1) the key output should be greater than the design limit and (2) where the key output should be less than the design limit.

10 GENE updated Section 7.6, "Statistical Analysis for Qualification Events," and Section 8.4.1, 11 "Uncertainty Screening," of TR NEDE-32906P, Revision 2, as appropriate to evaluate the proposed revision to the calculation of the void coefficient correction factor. The comparisons 12 13 of the TRACG results to typical licensing analysis data and the deviation from nominal at a ±1 14 sigma uncertainty were updated using the revised void coefficient correction factor. The 15 correction in the void coefficient accuracy typically results in more conservative responses in 16 the licensing analyses, and the TRACG results fall within the 2 sigma band. The NRC staff 17 finds these results acceptable for licensing analyses. 18

3.0 <u>CONCLUSION</u>

21 GENE has documented the quantification of uncertainties as applied to realistic nominal results 22 from TRACG analyses such that less than 0.1 percent of the fuel rods are expected to 23 experience a boiling transition for the most severe AOO. The approach follows the accepted 24 CSAU analysis methodology. GENE has guantified the uncertainties and biases in models 25 associated with those identified and highly ranked phenomena based on experimental data and 26 computation with validated codes. GENE's proposal to revise the computation of the void 27 coefficient, a high ranked phenomenon, correction factor is acceptable. The revised approach 28 to the computation of the correction factor removes an artificially introduced void-fraction 29 dependent variation in the bias and the variance of the correction factor to the TGBLA 30 computed value. The NRC staff finds the revised approach consistent with the standard 31 methodology used for incorporating data from critical experiments (the "true" value) into core 32 design calculations where the Monte Carlo computed values of k₄ are used to replace 33 measured data from critical experiments. The process is acceptable and the quantities are 34 reasonable. These together with the computed sensitivity estimates of the change in the critical 35 power ratio with respect to variation in the model parameters indicate smoothness and stability 36 in the solution to TRACG transient computations within the uncertainties in the models. 37

The conditions and limitations identified in Section 6.0 of the NRC staff's previous safety
 evaluation (Reference 3) are unchanged as a result of the proposed revision to the calculation
 of the void coefficient correction factor.

- 4.0 <u>REFERENCES</u>
- Letter MFN 00-001 from J. F. Klapproth, Manager, Engineering and Technology, GE
 Nuclear Energy, to USNRC, "TRANSMITTAL OF GE PROPRIETARY LICENSING
 TOPICAL REPORT NEDE-32906P, 'TRACG Application for Anticipated Operational
 Occurrences (AOO) Transient Analyses,' Revision 0, dated January 2000," January 25,
 2000 (ADAMS Package Accession No. ML003681270).
- 49

42

43

19

20

1

2

3

4

5

6 7

8

9

10

11

12 13

14 15

16

17

18 19

20

21

22

23

24 25

26

27

28

29 30

31

32

33

2.

- Letter MFN 99-40 from J. F. Klapproth, Manager, Engineering and Technology, GE Nuclear Energy, to USNRC, "TRANSMITTAL OF GE PROPRIETARY LICENSING TOPICAL REPORT NEDE-32176P, 'TRACG Model Description,' Revision 2, dated December 1999," December 15, 1999 (ADAMS Package Accession No. ML993630286).
- (b) Letter MFN 00-002 from J. F. Klapproth, Manager, Engineering and Technology, GE Nuclear Energy, to USNRC, "TRANSMITTAL OF GE PROPRIETARY LICENSING TOPICAL REPORT NEDE-32177P/R2, 'TRACG Qualification,' Revision 2, dated January 2000," January 31, 2000 (ADAMS Accession Package No. ML003682927).
- (c) Letter MFN 00-007 from J. F. Klapproth, Manager, Engineering and Technology, GE Nuclear Energy, to USNRC, "TRANSMITTAL OF GE PROPRIETARY REPORT NEDC-32956P, 'TRACG02A User's Manual,' Revision 0, dated February 2000," February 28, 2000 (ADAMS Package Accession No. ML003688295).
- Letter from S.A. Richards, USNRC, to J.F. Klapproth, Manager, Engineering & Technology, GE Nuclear Energy, "Safety Evaluation Report on General Electric Nuclear Energy Topical Report NEDE-32906P, Revision 0, 'TRACG Application for Anticipated Operational Occurrences (AOO) Transient Analyses" (TAC NO. MA7779)," October 22, 2001 (ADAMS Accession No. ML012740161).
- 4. Letter MFN 06-042 from L.M. Quintana, Manager, Licensing, GE Nuclear Energy, to USNRC, "GE Licensing Topical Report NEDE-32906P-A, Revision 1, 'TRACG Application for Anticipated Operational Occurrences (AOO) Transient Analyses'," February 6, 2006 (ADAMS Package Accession No. ML060390557).
- 5. NUREG/CR-3633, "TRAC-BD1/MOD1: An Advanced Best Estimate Program for Boiling Water Reactor Transient Analysis, Volumes 1-4," Idaho National Engineering Laboratory, April 1984.
- Letter MFN 06-046 from L.M. Quintana, Manager, Licensing, GE Nuclear Energy, to
 USNRC, "GE Licensing Topical Report NEDE-32906P, Revision 2, 'TRACG Application for Anticipated Operational Occurrences (AOO) Transient Analyses'," February 14, 2006 (ADAMS Package Accession No. ML060530560).
- Letter from M.C. Honcharik, Project Manager, USNRC, to L.M. Quintana, Manager, Licensing, GE Nuclear Energy, "Request for Additional Information (RAI) Regarding General Electric Nuclear Energy (GENE) Topical Report (TR) NEDE-32906P, Revision 2, 'TRACG Application for Anticipated Operational Occurrences (AOO) Transient Analyses' (TAC NO. MD0249)," May 31, 2006 (ADAMS Accession No. ML061450405).

- 8. Letter MFN 06-169 from L.M. Quintana, Manager, Licensing, GE Nuclear Energy, to
 USNRC, "Response to Request For Additional Information (RAI) Regarding General
 Electric Nuclear Energy (GENE) Topical Report (TR) NEDE-32906P, Revision 2,
 'TRACG Application For Anticipated Operational Occurrences (AOO) Transient
 Analyses' (TAC No. MD0249)," June 7, 2006 (ADAMS Package Accession
 NUREG/CR-5249, "Quantifying Reactor Safety Margins: Application of Code Scaling,
- 8 9. NUREG/CR-5249, "Quantifying Reactor Safety Margins: Application of Code Scaling,
 9 Applicability, and Uncertainty Evaluation Methodology to a Large-Break, Loss-of-Coolant
 10 Accident," December 1989 (ADAMS Package Accession No. ML030380503).
 11
- General Electric Company, "TGBLA06A: General Electric Lattice Physics Method,"
 DRF A00-05526, October 1994.
- Briemeister, J. G., Ed., "MCNP A General Monte Carlo Code for Neutron, Photon and Electron Transport, Version 3A/3B/4," LA-7396-M, Los Alamos National Laboratory, 1986/Revisions 1988 and 1991.
- 19 Principle Contributor: E. Throm
- 21 Date: July 12, 2006

20