

March 14, 2006

U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission
Attn: Document Control Desk
Mail Stop P1-137
Washington, DC 20555-0001



ULNRC05262

Ladies and Gentlemen:

**REPLY TO NOTICE OF VIOLATION
INSPECTION REPORT NO. 50-483/2005-005
UNION ELECTRIC CO.
Response to finding 2005 005-05**

This responds to Mr. William B. Jones letter dated February 14, 2006, which transmitted Inspection Report 50-483/2005-005. We contest Finding 2005005-05, "Failure to Conduct Simulator Testing in Accordance with ANSI/ANS 3.5-1998". Our response to the finding is presented in the attachment.

None of the material in the response is considered proprietary by Union Electric.

This letter does not contain new commitments.

If you have any questions regarding this response, or if additional information is required, please call me at 573/676-8659 or Michael Evans at 573/676-8258.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Keith D. Young".

Keith D. Young
Manager, Regulatory Affairs

Attachment 1: Response

IE01

ULNRC05262
March 14, 2006
Page 2

Mr. Bruce S. Mallett
Regional Administrator
U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission
Region IV
611 Ryan Plaza Drive, Suite 400
Arlington, TX 76011-4005

Senior Resident Inspector
Callaway Resident Office
U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission
8201 NRC Road
Steedman, MO 65077

Mr. Jack N. Donohew (2 copies)
Licensing Project Manager, Callaway Plant
Office of Nuclear Reactor Regulation
U. S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission
Mail Stop O-7D1
Washington, DC 20555-2738

Missouri Public Service Commission
Governor Office Building
200 Madison Street
PO Box 360
Jefferson City, MO 65102-0360

Contesting of GREEN violation on simulator in NRC report of 14 Feb 2006
--

Statement of Finding:**50-483/2005005****Simulator Facility Performance Failure to adhere to ANSI/ANS 3.5-1998**

Green. The inspectors determined that the failure to adhere to ANSI/ANS 3.5-1998, as endorsed by Regulatory Guide 1.149, "Nuclear Power Plant Simulation Facilities for Use in Operator Training and License Examinations", Revision 3, October 2001, as committed to in the Callaway Plant Simulation certification dated March 13, 2000, was a performance deficiency. Specifically, the simulator performance testing did not meet the standards specified in ANSI/ANS 3.5-1998 in that: (1) all required parameters during the simulator test were not recorded; and (2) simulator to baseline data comparisons were unavailable.

The NRC has determined that traditional enforcement does not apply because the issue did not have any actual safety consequence or potential for affecting the NRC's regulatory function and did not result in any willful violation of NRC requirements or licensee procedures. The performance deficiency is more than minor because it affected the ability of the simulator transient tests to detect fidelity issues with the simulator and affects the Human Performance (Human Error) attributes of the Initiating Events and Mitigating Systems cornerstones.

Response to Finding:

1. ANSI/ANS 3.5-1998, paragraph 4.4.3, "Simulator Performance Testing" states *"A record of the conduct of these tests, and data comparison that the results meet reference unit data, shall be maintained. Simulator performance testing shall be conducted in a fully integrated mode of operation. Simulator performance testing comprises operability and scenario-based testing."* Additionally, paragraph 4.4.3.1, "Simulator Operability Testing" states *"A record of this test and its evaluation shall be maintained."* Additionally, paragraph 4.4.3.2, "Simulator Scenario-Based Testing" states *"A record of the conduct of these tests, typically in the form of a completed scenario or lesson plan checklist, and the evaluation of the test results, shall be maintained."*
2. Part 10CFR55.46 paragraph (c)(3)
"A Simulation facility consisting solely of a plant-referenced simulator must meet the requirements of paragraph (c)(1) of this section and the criteria in paragraphs (d)(1) and (4) of this section for the Commission to accept the plant-referenced simulator for conducting operating tests"

3. Paragraph (d)(1) addresses the required performance testing
“Conduct performance testing throughout the life of the simulation facility in a manner sufficient to ensure that paragraphs (2)(2)(ii), as applicable, and (d)(3) of this section are met. The results of performance tests must be retained for four years after the completion of each performance test or until superseded by updated test results;”
4. Simulator procedure TDP-IS-00002 closely parallels the latest ANSI/ANS-3.5-1998 standard and we presently use hidden text to clearly show the links back to the standard. We do not duplicate the standard details. *“It SHALL be demonstrated that the simulator correctly represents the response of the Callaway Plant at three different power levels.”*

Simulator performance testing results have been recorded and the records have been retained. The performance testing documentation was produced for review by the NRC inspectors during the on-site portion of the inspection. Additional detailed supporting data and individual test results are also available for review. Steady state operations are documented using a combination of tests including: log comparisons, analog monitor tests and a heat balance tests. Although only three different power levels are required to be documented, data has been recorded for many power levels. All analog points (meters), not just those parameters listed in the standard, have also been recorded. This data collection far exceeds the required testing parameter data collection described in the regulation and the standard. We also obtain plant data from various sources such as: plant procedures, surveillances, plant computer and plant pictures.

As a result of a series of miscommunications between the inspectors and simulator staff, an inadequate understanding of how the required performance tests are conducted and documented allowed for the mischaracterization as a failure to record and compare parameters. Callaway is confident that these misunderstandings will be clarified during the scheduled follow-up discussions the week of 20 March 2006.