

December 22, 2005

LICENSEE: Nuclear Management Company, LLC  
FACILITY: Palisades Nuclear Plant  
SUBJECT: SUMMARY OF TELECONFERENCE CONDUCTED ON NOVEMBER 10, 2005,  
WITH NUCLEAR MANAGEMENT COMPANY, LLC (NMC) TO DISCUSS THE  
SEVERE ACCIDENT MITIGATION ALTERNATIVES (SAMA) REQUEST FOR  
ADDITIONAL INFORMATION (RAI) FOR PALISADES NUCLEAR PLANT  
(TAC NO. MC6434)

The U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission (NRC) staff has reviewed the severe accident mitigation alternatives (SAMA) analysis submitted by the Nuclear Management Company, LLC (NMC) for the Palisades Nuclear Plant (Palisades) and has identified areas where additional information is needed to complete its review. By letter dated August 24, 2005, the NRC sent NMC an RAI regarding its SAMA analysis. NMC responded by letter dated October 21, 2005.

On November 10, 2005, the NRC staff and its contractor from Pacific Northwest National Laboratories (PNNL) held a teleconference with representatives from NMC to discuss the licensee's October 21, 2005, SAMA RAI responses. The specific purpose of the call was to discuss RAI items 3.c.i, 3.c.iii, 7.d, 7.e-iii, 7.e-viii, 7.e-iv, and 7.e-ix. Enclosure 1 contains a listing of teleconference participants. Enclosure 2 contains the NRC staff's additional RAI generated during the teleconference. The teleconference participants reached a mutual understanding of the RAIs, and additional responses were provided from NMC by letter dated November 18, 2005.

/RA/

Bo M. Pham, Project Manager  
Environmental Branch B  
Division of License Renewal  
Office of Nuclear Reactor Regulation

Docket No. 50-255

Enclosures: As stated

cc w/enclosures: See next page

December 22, 2005

LICENSEE: Nuclear Management Company, LLC

FACILITY: Palisades Nuclear Plant

SUBJECT: SUMMARY OF TELECONFERENCE CONDUCTED ON NOVEMBER 10, 2005, WITH NUCLEAR MANAGEMENT COMPANY, LLC (NMC) TO DISCUSS THE SEVERE ACCIDENT MITIGATION ALTERNATIVES (SAMA) REQUEST FOR ADDITIONAL INFORMATION (RAI) FOR PALISADES NUCLEAR PLANT (TAC NO. MC6434)

The U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission (NRC) staff has reviewed the severe accident mitigation alternatives (SAMA) analysis submitted by the Nuclear Management Company, LLC (NMC) for the Palisades Nuclear Plant (Palisades) and has identified areas where additional information is needed to complete its review. By letter dated August 24, 2005, the NRC sent NMC an RAI regarding its SAMA analysis. NMC responded by letter dated October 21, 2005.

On November 10, 2005, the NRC staff and its contractor from Pacific Northwest National Laboratories (PNNL) held a teleconference with representatives from NMC to discuss the licensee's October 21, 2005, SAMA RAI responses. The specific purpose of the call was to discuss RAI items 3.c.i, 3.c.iii, 7.d, 7.e-iii, 7.e-viii, 7.e-iv, and 7.e-ix. Enclosure 1 contains a listing of teleconference participants. Enclosure 2 contains the NRC staff's additional RAI generated during the teleconference. The teleconference participants reached a mutual understanding of the RAIs, and additional responses were provided from NMC by letter dated November 18, 2005.

/RA/

Bo M. Pham, Project Manager  
Environmental Branch B  
Division of License Renewal  
Office of Nuclear Reactor Regulation

Docket No. 50-255

cc w/enclosures: See next page

Enclosures: As stated

DISTRIBUTION: See next page

Adams Accession Number: **ML053570348**

DOCUMENT NAME: E:\Filenet\ML053570348.wpd

OFFICE	LA:DLR	REBA:DLR:GS	REBB:DLR:PM	REBB:BC
NAME	M. Jenkins	C. Guerrero	B. Pham	R. Franovich
DATE	12/ 21 /05	12/ 22 /05	12/22/05	12/22/05

OFFICIAL RECORD COPY

Note to: Licensee: Nuclear Management Company, LLC, from Bo M. Pham, Dated: December 22, 2005

SUBJECT: SUMMARY OF TELECONFERENCE CONDUCTED ON NOVEMBER 10, 2005, WITH NUCLEAR MANAGEMENT COMPANY, LLC (NMC), TO DISCUSS THE SEVERE ACCIDENT MITIGATION ALTERNATIVES (SAMA) REQUESTS FOR ADDITIONAL INFORMATION (RAIs) FOR PALISADE NUCLEAR PLANT (TAC NO. MC6434)

Adams Accession Number: **ML053570348**

**HARD COPY**

Environmental R/F

**E-MAIL:**

RidsOGCMailRoom

C. Guerrero

R. Schaaf

F. Gillespie/P.T. Kuo, RidsNrrDir

R. Franovich, RidsNrrDirRebb

J. Ayala

F. Cameron, RidsOgcMailCenter

K. Cozens

M. Morgan

R. Palla

J. Ellegood, SRI

E. Duncan, RIII

L. Kozak, RIII

B. Pham

V. Mityng, RIII

J. Strasma, RIII

D. Miller (ANL)

L. Fields

LIST OF PARTICIPANTS  
TELECONFERENCE WITH CP&L REGARDING SAMAs

NOVEMBER 10, 2005

**Participants**

Leslie Fields  
Cristina Guerrero  
Robert Palla  
Daryl Turner  
Brian Brogan  
Jim Holthaus  
Steve Short  
Fred Leverenz  
Bruce Schmitt

**Affiliations**

U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission (NRC)  
NRC  
NRC  
Nuclear Management Company (NMC)  
NMC  
NMC  
Pacific Northwest National Laboratory (PNNL)  
PNNL  
PNNL

**Request for Additional Information Regarding the Analysis of  
Severe Accident Mitigation Alternatives (SAMAs)  
for the Palisades Nuclear Plant**

3.c.i - NMC response is that the importance list did not disclose any instances where the level of redundancy for actuation logic was an issue. Why was this the case? Did the NMC model evaluate this redundancy and determine it wasn't important or does the NMC model not evaluate this redundancy?

3.c.iii - NMC response is that at time of CST depletion it is possible to align the power to this equipment to a safety related power supply that would be supplied by a diesel generator. This response suggests that this SAMA is applicable to Palisades. Does this mean that NMC will investigate the benefits of developing a procedure to do this and, if beneficial, add it to the Palisades Severe Accident Management Guidelines?

7.d - NMC response provided an estimate of the cost of a new dedicated cooling loop to serve as the primary source of EDG cooling. The response is confusing because SAMA 18 already evaluated the cost of a dedicated pump and line for EDG cooling. How is the RAI response cost estimate different than the SAMA 18 estimate? Is the RAI response cost estimate for a permanent or temporary line? It is still not clear whether it is feasible to install an additional line or temporary connection directly from the FPS (by-passing the SW lines).

7.e-iii and 7.e-viii - Clarify what is meant in the last sentence of the responses to these RAIs (i.e., that the respective failures did not meet the criteria for SAMA consideration).

7.e-iv - Is it accurate to characterize NMC's response as a commitment to further evaluate the SAMA (flashing the EDG field) as an additional, potentially-cost-beneficial SAMA?

7.e-ix - NMC response provided a cost estimate to replace one of the containment sump AOVs with an MOV. This response suggests that the SAMA is applicable to Palisades. Based on the cost estimate, is the SAMA cost beneficial? (This can't be determined from the response because a risk reduction and benefit estimate was not provided).

Palisades Nuclear Plant

cc:

Robert A. Fenech, Senior Vice President  
Nuclear, Fossil, and Hydro Operations  
Consumers Energy Company  
1945 Parnall Rd.  
Jackson, MI 49201

Arunas T. Udrys, Esquire  
Consumers Energy Company  
1 Energy Plaza  
Jackson, MI 49201

Regional Administrator, Region III  
U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission  
801 Warrenville Road  
Lisle, IL 60532-4351

Supervisor  
Covert Township  
P.O. Box 35  
Covert, MI 49043

Office of the Governor  
P.O. Box 30013  
Lansing, MI 48909

U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission  
Resident Inspector's Office  
Palisades Plant  
27782 Blue Star Memorial Highway  
Covert, MI 49043

Michigan Department of Environmental  
Quality  
Waste and Hazardous Materials Division  
Hazardous Waste and Radiological  
Protection Section  
Nuclear Facilities Unit  
Constitution Hall, Lower-Level North  
525 West Allegan Street  
P.O. Box 30241  
Lansing, MI 48909-7741

Michigan Department of Attorney General  
Special Litigation Division  
525 West Ottawa St.  
Sixth Floor, G. Mennen Williams Building  
Lansing, MI 48913

Manager, Regulatory Affairs  
Nuclear Management Company, LLC  
27780 Blue Star Memorial Highway  
Covert, MI 49043

Director of Nuclear Assets  
Consumers Energy Company  
Palisades Nuclear Plant  
27780 Blue Star Memorial Highway  
Covert, MI 49043

Mr. Daniel J. Malone  
Site Vice President  
Palisades Nuclear Plant  
27780 Blue Star Highway  
Covert, MI 49043

Mr. Douglas F. Johnson  
Director, Plant Life Cycle Issues  
Nuclear Management Company, LLC  
700 First Street  
Hudson, WI 54016

John Paul Cowan  
Executive Vice President & Chief Nuclear  
Officer  
Nuclear Management Company, LLC  
700 First Street  
Hudson, WI 54016

Jonathan Rogoff, Esquire  
Vice President, Counsel & Secretary  
Nuclear Management Company, LLC  
700 First Street  
Hudson, WI 54016

Palisades Nuclear Plant

cc:

Douglas E. Cooper  
Senior Vice President - Group Operations  
Palisades Nuclear Plant  
Nuclear Management Company, LLC  
27780 Blue Star Memorial Highway  
Covert, MI 49043

Robert A. Vincent  
Licensing Lead - License Renewal Project  
Palisades Nuclear Plant  
27780 Blue Star Memorial Highway  
Covert, MI 49043

Darrel G. Turner  
License Renewal Project Manager  
Palisades Nuclear Plant  
27780 Blue Star Memorial Highway  
Covert, MI 49043

Ms. Lois Bemis  
South Haven Memorial Library  
314 Broadway St.  
South Haven, MI 49090