

November 8, 2005

Mr. Barry Quigley  
3512 Louisiana  
Rockford, IL 61108

Dear Mr. Quigley:

This letter responds to the petition you filed by electronic mail on March 2, 2005, with Mr. Luis Reyes, Executive Director for Operations at the Nuclear Regulatory Commission (NRC), pursuant to Section 2.206 of Title 10 of the *Code of Federal Regulations* (10 CFR 2.206). In your petition you requested that the NRC take enforcement action against Exelon Nuclear's (Exelon's) Byron Station for failure to comply with 10 CFR Part 50, Appendix B, Criterion XVI, because the 1C cold leg loop stop isolation valve (LSIV) has been broken for at least six years and has not been repaired. On March 4, 2005, you provided additional clarifying information during a telephone conference call with the NRC Petition Review Board (PRB). The transcript of the conference call was treated as a supplement to the petition. On March 21, 2005, you attended a public meeting with Exelon to discuss the issues related to the 1C LSIV.

My letter of April 5, 2005, acknowledged receiving your petition and stated that your petition was being referred to me for action pursuant to 10 CFR 2.206 and that it would be acted upon within a reasonable time. I also told you that the NRC would not take any immediate action against Exelon.

By letter dated May 4, 2005, the NRC staff requested Exelon to provide information related to the petition. Exelon responded on May 27, 2005, and the staff considered the information in evaluating your petition.

In your petition you stated that the 1C LSIV can be difficult to close, to the point that the motor's protective features actuated. You stated that the failure mechanism was metal-to-metal contact between the valve disc and a misaligned valve guide that introduced debris into the reactor coolant system. In the NRC's letter of April 5, 2005, you were informed that the LSIV does not serve a safety function; the NRC's concern was whether the valve might fail and introduce loose parts into the reactor coolant system, adversely affecting the safe operation of the plant.

The staff sent a copy of the proposed Director's Decision to you and to Exelon for comment on July 29 and August 1, 2005, respectively. By electronic mail, you responded with comments on August 14, 2005. Exelon responded on August 12, 2005. Your comments and the staff's response to them are enclosed. Exelon's comments clarified the description of certain plant components. After considering the comments, the staff revised selected portions of the Director's Decision.

As documented in the enclosed Director's Decision, the NRC staff considered whether the 1C LSIV had degraded to a point where a loose part could be generated and migrate to the

B. Quigley

- 2 -

reactor vessel and the effect of the introduction of loose parts into the Byron Station, Unit 1, reactor coolant system. The staff concluded that the generation of large loose parts had a low potential of occurrence, and would only become a factor in the event of a large break Loss-of-Coolant Accident. If small loose parts in the RCS compromised the ability of the plant to achieve shutdown by normal means, a safe shutdown could be achieved through the use of safety-grade equipment in accordance with the licensee's compliance with NRC Branch Technical Position RSB 5-1, "Design Requirements of the Residual Heat Removal System." Therefore, the request to take enforcement action against Exelon's Byron Station is denied.

A copy of the Director's Decision (DD-05-05) will be filed with the Secretary of the Commission for the Commission to review in accordance with 10 CFR 2.206(c). As provided for by this regulation, the decision will constitute the final action of the Commission 25 days after the date of the decision unless the Commission, on its own motion, institutes a review of the decision within that time. The documents cited in the enclosed decision are available in ADAMS for inspection at the Commission's Public Document Room, at One White Flint North, 1555 Rockville Pike (first floor), Rockville, Maryland, and from the ADAMS Public Library on the NRC Web site at <http://www.nrc.gov> (the Public Electronic Reading Room).

I have also enclosed a copy of the Notice of Issuance of Director's Decision under 10 CFR 2.206 that has been filed with the Office of the Federal Register for publication.

Please contact George Dick (301-415-3019 or [GFD@NRC.gov](mailto:GFD@NRC.gov)) to discuss any questions about to this petition.

Sincerely,

*/RA/*

J. E. Dyer, Director  
Office of Nuclear Reactor Regulation

Docket No. STN 50-454

Enclosures: 1. Comments  
2. Director's Decision  
3. *Federal Register* Notice

cc w/encl: See next page

reactor vessel and the effect of the introduction of loose parts into the Byron Station, Unit 1, reactor coolant system. The staff concluded that the generation of large loose parts had a low potential of occurrence, and would only become a factor in the event of a large break Loss-of-Coolant Accident. If small loose parts in the RCS compromised the ability of the plant to achieve shutdown by normal means, a safe shutdown could be achieved through the use of safety-grade equipment in accordance with the licensee's compliance with NRC Branch Technical Position RSB 5-1, "Design Requirements of the Residual Heat Removal System." Therefore, the request to take enforcement action against Exelon's Byron Station is denied.

A copy of the Director's Decision (DD-05-05) will be filed with the Secretary of the Commission for the Commission to review in accordance with 10 CFR 2.206(c). As provided for by this regulation, the decision will constitute the final action of the Commission 25 days after the date of the decision unless the Commission, on its own motion, institutes a review of the decision within that time. The documents cited in the enclosed decision are available in ADAMS for inspection at the Commission's Public Document Room, at One White Flint North, 1555 Rockville Pike (first floor), Rockville, Maryland, and from the ADAMS Public Library on the NRC Web site at <http://www.nrc.gov> (the Public Electronic Reading Room).

I have also enclosed a copy of the Notice of Issuance of Director's Decision under 10 CFR 2.206 that has been filed with the Office of the Federal Register for publication.

Please contact George Dick (301-415-3019 or [GFD@NRC.gov](mailto:GFD@NRC.gov)) to discuss any questions about to this petition.

Sincerely,  
/RA/

J. E. Dyer, Director  
Office of Nuclear Reactor Regulation

Docket No. STN 50-454

Enclosures: 1. Comments  
2. Director's Decision  
3. *Federal Register* Notice

cc w/encl: See next page

DISTRIBUTION: See next page

**ADAMS Accession Nos.:** ML052940330 - Package  
G20050160/ML050680255 - Incoming  
ML052860159 - Response  
ML052860285 - Comments  
ML052940091 - Director's Decision  
ML052860091 - Federal Register Notice

OFFICE	PDIII-2/PM	PDIII-2/LA	TECH ED	SRXB/SC	FMEB/SC
NAME	GDick	PCoates	PKleene	JNakoski	SLee/DFischer
DATE	10/21/05	10/21/05	10/19/05	10/17/05	10/18/05
OFFICE	PDIII-2/SC	PDIII/D	OE	DLPM/D	NRR/D
NAME	GSuh/JHopkins	HNieh	JLuehman	LMarsh	JDyer
DATE	10/19/05	10/20/05	11/1/05	10/24/05	11/8/05

OFFICIAL RECORD COPY

Byron Station Units 1 and 2

cc:

Regional Administrator, Region III  
U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission  
2443 Warrenville Road, Suite 210  
Lisle, IL 60532-4351

Illinois Emergency Management  
Agency  
Division of Disaster Assistance &  
Preparedness  
110 East Adams Street  
Springfield, IL 62701-1109

Document Control Desk - Licensing  
Exelon Generation Company, LLC  
4300 Winfield Road  
Warrenville, IL 60555

Mr. Dwain W. Alexander, Project Manager  
Westinghouse Electric Company  
Post Office Box 355  
Pittsburgh, PA 15230

Joseph Gallo  
Gallo & Ross  
1025 Connecticut Ave., NW, Suite 1014  
Washington, DC 20036

Howard A. Learner  
Environmental Law and Policy  
Center of the Midwest  
35 East Wacker Drive  
Suite 1300  
Chicago, IL 60601-2110

U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission  
Byron Resident Inspector's Office  
4448 North German Church Road  
Byron, IL 61010-9750

Ms. Lorraine Creek  
RR 1, Box 182  
Manteno, IL 60950

Chairman, Ogle County Board  
Post Office Box 357  
Oregon, IL 61061

Mrs. Phillip B. Johnson  
1907 Stratford Lane  
Rockford, IL 61107

Attorney General  
500 S. Second Street  
Springfield, IL 62706

Byron Station Plant Manager  
Exelon Generation Company, LLC  
4450 N. German Church Road  
Byron, IL 61010-9794

Site Vice President - Byron  
Exelon Generation Company, LLC  
4450 N. German Church Road  
Byron, IL 61010-9794

Senior Vice President - Nuclear Services  
Exelon Generation Company, LLC  
4300 Winfield Road  
Warrenville, IL 60555

Vice President of Operations - Mid-West  
Pressurized Water Reactors  
Exelon Generation Company, LLC  
4300 Winfield Road  
Warrenville, IL 60555

Chairman  
Will County Board of Supervisors  
302 North Chicago Street  
Will County Board Courthouse  
Joliet, Illinois 60434

Mr. Barry Quigley  
3512 Louisiana  
Rockford, IL 61108

Director - Licensing and Regulatory Affairs  
Exelon Generation Company, LLC  
4300 Winfield Road  
Warrenville, IL 60555

Regulatory Assurance Manager - Byron  
Exelon Generation Company, LLC  
4450 N. German Church Road  
Byron, IL 61010-9794

Associate General Counsel  
Exelon Generation Company, LLC  
4300 Winfield Road  
Warrenville, IL 60555

Vice President -  
Licensing and Regulatory Affairs  
Exelon Generation Company, LLC  
4300 Winfield Road  
Warrenville, IL 60555

Manager Licensing - Braidwood and Byron  
Exelon Generation Company, LLC  
4300 Winfield Road  
Warrenville, IL 60555

Barry Quigley  
Byron, Unit 1, 2.206 Petition Regarding Station/1C RCS Cold Leg Loop Stop Isolation Valve

DISTRIBUTION: G20050160

PUBLIC

PDIII-2 R/F

EDO Reading

RidsOgcRp

RidsOiMailCenter

RidsOeMailCenter

RidsNrrOd

RidsNrrAdpt

RidsEdoRp

VYanez

LCox

RidsNrrDlpmLpdiii

RidsNrrWpcMail

RidsNrrDlpmLpdiii2

RidsNrrPMDWilliams

RidsAcrsAcnwMailCenter

RidsOpaMail

RidsOcaMail

RidsNrrLAPCoates

RidsNrrPMGDick

RidsRgn3MailCenter

NRCWEB [Director Decision **only**]