

February 16, 2005

Mr. Michael R. Blevins
Senior Vice President &
Principal Nuclear Officer
TXU Generation Company LP
Attn: Regulatory Affairs Department
P. O. Box 1002
Glen Rose, TX 76043

S SUBJECT: COMANCHE PEAK STEAM ELECTRIC STATION, UNIT 2 - STAFF
ASSESSMENT OF THE STEAM GENERATOR TUBE INSPECTION REPORTS
FOR THE SPRING 2002 REFUELING OUTAGE (2RF06) AND FALL 2003
REFUELING OUTAGE (2RF07) (TAC NOS. MC2993 AND MC3738)

Dear Mr. Blevins:

By letters dated April 18, 2002, June 5, 2002, and July 17, 2002, TXU Generation Company, LP (TXU), the licensee for Comanche Peak Steam Electric Station (CPSES), Unit 2, summarized its spring 2002 refueling outage (2RF06) steam generator (SG) tube inservice inspection (ISI) for CPSES, Unit 2. By letters dated November 6, 2003, January 22, 2004, and June 30, 2004, TXU summarized its fall 2003 refueling outage (2RF07) SG tube ISI for CPSES, Unit 2. By letter dated October 14, 2004, the licensee responded to a request for additional information on these submittals.

The Nuclear Regulatory Commission (NRC) staff has assessed the licensee's submittals and concludes that the licensee provided the information as required by its Technical Specifications. In addition, the staff concludes that there are no technical issues that warrant follow-up action at this time since the inspections appear to be consistent with the objective of detecting potential tube degradation and the inspection results appear to be consistent with industry operating experience at similarly designed and operated units.

The NRC staff's assessment is enclosed.

If there are any questions regarding this assessment, please contact me at (301) 415-1476.

Sincerely,

/RA/

Mohan C. Thadani, Senior Project Manager, Section 1
Project Directorate IV
Division of Licensing Project Management
Office of Nuclear Reactor Regulation

Docket No. 50-446

Enclosure: As stated

cc w/encl: See next page

February 16, 2005

Mr. Michael R. Blevins
Senior Vice President &
Principal Nuclear Officer
TXU Generation Company LP
Attn: Regulatory Affairs Department
P. O. Box 1002
Glen Rose, TX 76043

S SUBJECT: COMANCHE PEAK STEAM ELECTRIC STATION, UNIT 2 - STAFF
ASSESSMENT OF THE STEAM GENERATOR TUBE INSPECTION REPORTS
FOR THE SPRING 2002 REFUELING OUTAGE (2RFO6) AND FALL 2003
REFUELING OUTAGE (2RF07) (TAC NOS. MC2993 AND MC3738)

Dear Mr. Blevins:

By letters dated April 18, 2002, June 5, 2002, and July 17, 2002, TXU Generation Company, LP (TXU), the licensee for Comanche Peak Steam Electric Station (CPSES), Unit 2, summarized its spring 2002 refueling outage (2RF06) steam generator (SG) tube inservice inspection (ISI) for CPSES, Unit 2. By letters dated November 6, 2003, January 22, 2004, and June 30, 2004, TXU summarized its fall 2003 refueling outage (2RF07) SG tube ISI for CPSES, Unit 2. By letter dated October 14, 2004, the licensee responded to a request for additional information on these submittals.

The Nuclear Regulatory Commission (NRC) staff has assessed the licensee's submittals and concludes that the licensee provided the information as required by its Technical Specifications. In addition, the staff concludes that there are no technical issues that warrant follow-up action at this time since the inspections appear to be consistent with the objective of detecting potential tube degradation and the inspection results appear to be consistent with industry operating experience at similarly designed and operated units.

The NRC staff's assessment is enclosed.

If there are any questions regarding this assessment, please contact me at (301) 415-1476.

Sincerely,

/RA/

Mohan C. Thadani, Senior Project Manager, Section 1
Project Directorate IV
Division of Licensing Project Management
Office of Nuclear Reactor Regulation

Docket No. 50-446
Enclosure: As stated
cc w/encl: See next page

DISTRIBUTION:

PUBLIC RidsOgcRp RidsNrrDlpmLpdiv (HBerkow)
PDIV-1 Reading LLund RidsAcrsAcnwMailCenter
RidsNrrDlpmLpdiv1 (AHowe) JTerell RidsNrrPMMThadani
RidsNrrLADBaxley RidsRgn4MailCenter (AHowell, WJohnson)
ADAMS Accession No.: ML050410310 *No significant change from input

OFFICE	PDIV-1/PM	PDIV-1/LA	EMCB/SC	PDIV-1/SC
NAME	MThadani	DBaxley	LLund*	AHowe
DATE	2/15/05	2/15/05	11/23/05	2/16/05

OFFICIAL RECORD COPY

STAFF ASSESSMENT BY THE OFFICE OF NUCLEAR REACTOR REGULATION

COMANCHE PEAK STEAM ELECTRIC STATION, UNIT 2

TXU GENERATION COMPANY, LP

SPRING 2002 AND FALL 2003 STEAM GENERATOR TUBE INSERVICE INSPECTIONS

DOCKET NO. 50-446

By letters dated April 18, 2002 (ML021210473)¹, June 5, 2002 (ML021640618), and July 17, 2002 (ML022060178), TXU Generating Company, LP (TXU), the licensee for Comanche Peak Steam Electric Station (CPSES), Unit 2, summarized its spring 2002 refueling outage (2RF06) steam generator (SG) tube inservice inspection (ISI) for CPSES, Unit 2. By letters dated November 6, 2003 (ML033180430), January 22, 2004 (ML040290102), and June 30, 2004 (ML041890306), TXU summarized its fall 2003 refueling outage (2RF07) SG tube ISI for CPSES, Unit 2. By letter dated October 14, 2004 (ML042930638), the licensee responded to the Nuclear Regulatory Commission staff request for additional information.

CPSES, Unit 2 has four Westinghouse Model D5 SGs. Each SG contains 4,570 thermally treated Alloy 600 tubes. Each tube has a nominal outside diameter of 3/4 inch and a nominal wall thickness of 0.043 inch. The tubes were hydraulically expanded at both ends for the full length of the tubesheet and are supported by a number of Type 405 stainless steel supports with quatrefoil shaped holes.

The licensee provided the scope, extent, methods, and results of its SG tube ISIs in the documents referenced above. In addition, the licensee described corrective actions taken in response to the inspection findings.

One finding of note was the single volumetric indication (SVI), found during 2RF06, in the U-bend apex in tube SG3-R6-C80. The depth estimate of the SVI was 46 percent. A special interest +Point™ inspection confirmed a possible loose part (PLP). The licensee stated that, since the upper bundle was not opened due to lack of access, the PLP was neither located nor removed. Although the licensee did not indicate whether the tube was stabilized, an engineering evaluation (documented in WPT-16312, "Foreign Object Wear Indications at Comanche Peak Unit 2 RF06 Outage," dated April 24, 2002) determined that the PLP could be left in place, and the tube was plugged.

1 To access the document, go to www.nrc.gov, click on "Electronic Reading Room," then "Documents in ADAMS," then "Web-Based Access," then "Advanced Search," and enter the Accession number into the Accession Number box near the top of the page. Click on the "Search" button near the bottom of the page. Click on the icon under "Image File" on the search results page. NOTE: You will need Adobe Acrobat Reader to open this file.

Based on the assessment of the submittals provided, the staff concludes that the licensee provided the information required by its Technical Specifications. In addition, the staff concludes that there are no technical issues that warrant follow-up action at this time since the inspections appear to be consistent with the objective of detecting potential tube degradation and the inspection results appear to be consistent with industry operating experience at similarly designed and operated units.

Principal Contributor: J. Terrell

Date: February 16, 2005

Comanche Peak Steam Electric Station

cc:

Senior Resident Inspector
U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission
P. O. Box 2159
Glen Rose, TX 76403-2159

Regional Administrator, Region IV
U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission
611 Ryan Plaza Drive, Suite 400
Arlington, TX 76011

Mr. Fred W. Madden, Director
Regulatory Affairs
TXU Generation Company LP
P. O. Box 1002
Glen Rose, TX 76043

George L. Edgar, Esq.
Morgan Lewis
1111 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW
Washington, DC 20004

County Judge
P. O. Box 851
Glen Rose, TX 76043

Environmental and Natural
Resources Policy Director
Office of the Governor
P. O. Box 12428
Austin, TX 78711-3189

Mr. Richard A. Ratliff, Chief
Bureau of Radiation Control
Texas Department of Health
1100 West 49th Street
Austin, TX 78756-3189

Mr. Brian Almon
Public Utility Commission
William B. Travis Building
P. O. Box 13326
1701 North Congress Avenue
Austin, TX 78701-3326

Ms. Susan M. Jablonski
Office of Permitting, Remediation
and Registration
Texas Commission on Environmental
Quality
MC-122
P. O. Box 13087
Austin, TX 78711-3087

Terry Parks, Chief Inspector
Texas Department of Licensing
and Regulation
Boiler Program
P. O. Box 12157
Austin, TX 78711