

December 28, 2004

MEMORANDUM TO: Brian W. Sheron  
Associate Director for Project Licensing and Technical Analysis  
Office of Nuclear Reactor Regulation

FROM: Ledyard B. Marsh, Director /RA WRuland for/  
Division of Licensing Project Management  
Office of Nuclear Reactor Regulation

SUBJECT: CLOSEOUT OF DAVIS-BESSE LESSONS LEARNED TASK FORCE  
RECOMMENDATION NUMBER 3.2.3(1)

The subject Davis-Besse Lessons Learned Task Force (LLTF) recommendation states:

The NRC should review a sample of NRC safety evaluations of owners' group submissions to identify whether intended actions that supported the bases of the NRC's conclusions were effectively implemented.

The Division of Licensing Project Management (DLPM) was assigned lead responsibility for the subject recommendation, which is due to be completed by December 30, 2004. I recommend closing this action item based on the actions described below.

The basis for this recommendation was a 1993 request from the Nuclear Regulatory Commission (NRC) to pressurized-water reactor owners groups to provide a safety evaluation (SE) documenting why no unreviewed safety question existed for Alloy 600 nozzle cracking. The Babcock & Wilcox (B&W) Owners Group provided a report that included a statement that B&W plants had developed plans to visually inspect control rod drive nozzles for boric acid deposits. The applicable commitment was not effectively incorporated at Davis-Besse.

In general, the NRC staff does not accept owners' group commitments on behalf of licensees, and it appears that the particular example cited as the basis for Davis-Besse LLTF recommendation 3.2.3(1) was unique. The DLPM lead project managers for each of the owners' groups, through individual research and discussion with their respective vendors, were unable to identify any other NRC SEs of owners group submissions related to a generic issue that required an action to be implemented by industry. DLPM staff also asked the NRR technical staff if they knew of any SEs as described above. The NRR technical staff stated that they also did not have any documentation of this nature.

Therefore, after a thorough search by the owners group lead project managers, vendors, and NRR technical staff, we concluded that other SEs similar to the one described in the recommendation are not available. Therefore, we recommend that LLTF 3.2.3(1) be closed.

CONTACT: Dylanne Duvigneaud, NRR/DLPM, (301) 415-4010

It should be noted that guidelines for accepting owners group responses to generic communications and for periodic audits of licensee commitment management programs have been developed in response to other LLTF recommendations.

NRR EXECUTIVE TEAM CONCURRENCE

I agree that LLTF recommendation 3.2.3(1) can be closed.

***/RA SBlack for/***

***12/28/04***

\_\_\_\_\_  
Brian W. Sheron

\_\_\_\_\_  
Date

It should be noted that guidelines for accepting owners group responses to generic communications and for periodic audits of licensee commitment management programs have been developed in response to other LLTF recommendations.

**NRR EXECUTIVE TEAM CONCURRENCE**

I agree that LLTF recommendation 3.2.3(1) can be closed.

***/RA SBlack for/***

***12/28/04***

\_\_\_\_\_  
Brian W. Sheron

\_\_\_\_\_  
Date

**DISTRIBUTION**

|            |             |           |             |
|------------|-------------|-----------|-------------|
| PDII-2 R/F | WRuland     | JDyer     | BMoroney    |
| WBorchardt | DDuvigneaud | DLPM R/F  | MKotzalas   |
| BClayton   | HBerkow     | MMarshall | CHolden     |
| BSheron    | EHackett    | LRaghavan | JCraig, RES |

ADAMS Accession No.: ML043500679

NRR-106

|        |             |            |            |            |          |          |                       |
|--------|-------------|------------|------------|------------|----------|----------|-----------------------|
| OFFICE | PE/PD III-1 | PM/PD II-2 | LA/PD II-2 | SC/PD II-2 | D/PD II  | D/DLPM   | ADPT/NRR              |
| NAME   | DDuvigneaud | BMoroney   | BClayton   | MMarshall  | EHackett | LMarsh   | SBlack for<br>BSheron |
| DATE   | 12/16/04    | 12/16/04   | 12/16/04   | 12/16/04   | 12/21/04 | 12/28/04 | 12/28/04              |

**OFFICIAL RECORD COPY**