EVALUATION OF PREDICTED AND OBSERVED EFFECTS FOR A 90<sup>°</sup> F MIXED TEMPERATURE LIMIT, BROWNS FERRY NUCLEAR PLANT

# **TENNESSEE** VALLEY **AUTHORITY**

**MARCH 1980** 

999<br>.5745<br>E92

## EVALUATION OF PREDICTED AND OBSERVED EFFECTS FOR A 900 F MIXED TEMPERATURE LIMIT, **BROWNS** FERRY NUCLEAR PLANT

#### Prepared By

B. J. Armitage, W. C. Barr, D. L. Dycus, P. A. Hackney, E. R. Rodgers, and W. R. Wrenn Fisheries and Aquatic Ecology Branch

> **1). R. J,owcrv ant1** M. 1'. **'I'nylor**  Western **Area Vlcld Opcrnt tons**

R. T. Brown, W. L. Harper, and C. D. Ungate Water Systems Development Branch

> Division of Water Resources Office of Natural Resources

W. S. Bain and W. J. Warren Power Projects Staff Office of Power

W. **W.** LaRoche Office of General Council

Tennessee Valley Authority



LLEY A

March 1980

Table of Contents

Page



# **List.** of Tables

Page







V

# List of Figures

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**1** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**1** 

**1** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**1** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 





Ħ

I

l

 $\overline{\phantom{a}}$ 



I

viii



**I** 

**1** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**N** 

**I** 

#

Page

**ix** 

### **<sup>1</sup>.O** lixccutive Sumniary

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**t** 

**1** 

**1** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**1** 

**U** 

**I** 

**1** 

**I** 

**1** 

**I** 

**I** 

As a result of continuing discussions between TVA and EPA, Region IV, concerning thermal discharges at Browns Ferry Nuclear Plant and consistent with EPA's understanding expressed at a meeting on December **20, 1979,** TVA has developed a **316(a)** demonstration to show the 86'F thermal standard at Browns Ferry Nuclear Plant is more stringent than necessary and that a 90'F maximum would satisfactorily protect aquatic life in Wheeler Reservoir. This document and accompanying package include background information on the cooling tower system, costs of alternative cooling systems, a 316(a) demonstration, the final 316(b) demonstration, and support documentation. A summary of cooling tower status and the 316 demonstration follows.

The once-through heat dissipation system was originally designed and constructed to meet maximum water temperature criteria of **93**  *<sup>0</sup>*F and **<sup>a</sup>**  $10<sup>0</sup>$  F temperature rise, judged by TVA to be adequate to protect aquatic life in Wheeler Reservoir. These criteria were consistent with regulatory requirements at the time. In December **1971,** EPA informed TVA that these criteria would be changed for waters of the Tennessee River Basin in Alabama as follows: "Waters of the Tennessee River Basin and portions of the Tallapoosa shall not be increased more than **5'** F, above the natural prevailing background temperatures, nor exceed a maximum **of**  *86'* F."

Consequently, to meet these limitations, TVA installed six 16-cell mechanical draft cooling towers designed to operate in either helper or closed-mode. However, the cooling tower system did not perform as

designed and during some summer months it was necessary to sig<del>-</del> nificantly deratc the **p**  mixed-reservoir thermal standard. **00 ant or risk noncompliance with the**  $86^{\mathrm{o}}$  **F <code>maximum</code>** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**1** 

**1** 

*8* 

**1** 

**D** 

**1** 

**I** 

**1** 

**I** 

TVA asked for, and EPA granted interim relief from the 86<sup>°</sup> F maximum mixed-river temperature on July **13, 1977,** requiring TVA to comply with a 90 $^{\rm o}$  F maximum mixed-reservoir temperature and a  $5^{\rm o}$  F maximum temperature rise any time the upstream temperature exceeded 81<sup>0</sup> F. TVA's initial strategy for long-term resolution of difficulties related to thermal standards and deficient cooling tower performance included structural upgrading of all existing cooling towers. New fill material was installed in one tower at a cost of about one million dollars in expectation of improving thermal performance. Unfortunately it was not significantly improved by the fill addition. Therefore it became necessary to explore other options to obtain long-term resolution of the problems.

One option currently available for meeting the  $86^{\circ}$  F thermal standard is the addition of two mechanical draft cooling towers. This option would cost about \$35 million more (this includes capital cost, operating and maintenance, and plant load reductions during tower construction) than the preferred (base cost) option of improvementing the existing system to meet a **90°F** thermal limit. Another option would be to modify the existing tower system at an incremental cost (over the base cost option) of \$150 million in lieu of adding towers. A third option for meeting the  $86^{\circ}$  F thermal standard is to operate the existing tower system in its current status with derating at an incremental cost of \$250 million.

Options currently available for meeting a **90'** F thermal limit include modifying the existing tower system by upgrading thermal performance in lieu of adding towers. This has the base cost and is the preferred option. Other alternatives **for** meeting a **90** F thermal limit include *0*  addition of two mechanical draft cooling towers at an incremental cost of **\$33** niillion or operating with the **rxistirig** tower system in its current status with derating at an incremental cost of \$100 million.

**I** 

**1** 

I

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

I

**I** 

I

**I** 

I

I

**1** 

**1** 

**I** 

**1** 

**1** 

**1** 

**I** 

TVA, following extensive data evaluation, now believes that permanent relaxation of the **86'F** thermal standard to a **90°F** limit would adequately assure the protection and propagatation **of** a balanced and indigenous population of shellfish, fish, and wildlife in and on the Tennessee River (Wheeler Reservoir). In addition, such a relaxation would avoid the more costly alternatives of either taking large load reductions **or**  installing additional cooling towers at the plant.

**2.0** Background Report on Heat Dissipation System and **Costs** of Alternative Cooling Systems - Browns Ferry Nuclear Plant

### 2.1 Browns Ferry Nuclear Plant

Browns Ferry Nuclear Plant was begun in 1966 as part of TVA's program designed to meet projected load requirements. Construction of the plant began in May 1967 after the Atomic Energy Commission **(AKC)**  issued provisional constructioa permits for units 1 and 2. Unit *3* **was**  given a construction permit in July 1968. Commercial operation was achieved on units 1, 2, and 3 on August 1, 1974; March 1, 1975; and March 1, 1977, respectively. Units 1 and 2 were shutdown in March 1975 because of a cable fire. Following the fire outage, all **3** units were placed in service in September 1976.

## 2.2 History of Heat Dissipation System

The history **of** auxiliary cooling facilities in the face of changing criteria and thermal standards as they were finally adopted by the Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) is described in considerable detail in the final environmental statement (Issued on September 1, 1972). Aspects that pertain to the present situation are repeated herein

2.2.1 Thermal Standards--The heat dispersal system for the Browns Ferry plant was originally designed and constructed to meet standards permitting a temperature rise of 10<sup>°</sup> F with a maximum temperature of **93'** F. These standards were judged by TVA to be adequate to protect aquatic life, and the State of Alabama subsequently proposed identical standards in compliance with the Water Quality Act of 1965

However, in April 1971, the Federal Water Pollution Control Admin $i$ stration (now EPA) recommended that the State of Alabama adopt temperature standards that would limit the maximum temperature rise of a stream by the addition of heat to no more than 5<sup>0</sup> F with a maximum allowable water temperature not to exceed 90° F. Exceptions were made in the Tennessee River Basin and portions of the Tallapoosa River Basin designated by the Alabama Department of Conservation as supporting smallmouth bass, sauger, and walleye. In these areas the temperature was not to exceed 86<sup>0</sup> F. Thus, Wheeler Reservoir was officially designated as supporting this type fishery. The Cahaba River drainage basin was later included in this category. The State of Alabama did not immediately adopt these recommended temperature standards.

While changes to more restrictive standards were often mentioned, it was not until December 17, 1971, that EPA informed TVA that criteria would be more stringent for waters of the Tennessee River Basin in Alabama as follows; "Temperature shall not be increased more than *5'* F above the natural prevailing background temperatures, nor exceed a maximum of **86** F." *0* 

--

These temperature standards, proposed by EPA for the State of Alabama, were published by EPA in the March 11, 1972, Federal Register. Alabama adopted these standards and EPA approved them on September 19, 1972.

*5* 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**1** 

**I** 

**1** 

**1** 

**1** 

**I** 

**I** 

**1** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

As reflected in the **1971** recommendation establishing the **86'** F maximum temperature, EPA's protocol for the application of temperature criteria in setting standards was species dependent. Although temperature criteria havc undergone substantial development since 1971, this protocol has not changed. For example, Brungs and Jones **(1977;** EPA Environmental Research Laboratory-Duluth) reported that the evolution of freshwater temperature criteria has advanced from the search for a single "magic number" to the generally accepted protocol for determining mean and maximum numerical criteria based on the protection of appropriate, desirable and/or important fish species.

Therefore, in the following assessment of a **90'** F thermal standard on the biota of Wheeler Reservoir, it is appropriate to emphasize important fish species, particularly smallmouth bass, sauger, and walleye. This approach is in accord with the rationale established by EPA (Mount, **1969**  Brungs and Jones, **1977).** In general, the rationale followed by EPA is that the sensitivity to thermal increases is greater for selected fish species (in this case sauger, smallmouth bass, and walleye) than for the food producing capacity (plankton and benthos) of their environment.

2.2.2 Diffuser System--It was recognized in the early stages of plant design that condenser circulating water should not be discharged directly into the surface strata of Wheeler Reservoir. Instead, it was decided that by means of a diffuser, the condenser circulating water should be mixed as quickly as possible with as much unheated

*<sup>6</sup>***1** 

**1** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**1** 

**I** 

reservoir water as **possible.** By this procedure, no excessively  $\sqrt{u}$  surface strata would exist and the mixing zone would be restricted to a relatively small area.

Based on extensive TVA studies and the experience of others at the time Browns Ferry was designed, it was concluded that these heat dispersal facilities would adequately protect the waters of Wheeler Reservoir for the following uses: Public water supply, swimming and other whole body water-contact sports, shellfish harvesting, fish and wildlife, agricultural and industrial water supply, and navigation.

In light of EPA's letter of December 17, 1971, and TVA's policy to take appropriate action on a timely basis to meet any further applicable standards, TVA determined that the diffuser system alone was not adequate to ensure acceptable conformance with this proposed standard. The alternatives of mechanical draft cooling towers, natural draft cooling towers, spray canal system, and cooling lake for heat dissipation were reevaluated, and it was decided that mechanical draft cooling towers would provide the best long-term solution to meet the more stringent thermal standards. The towers were designed to supplement the diffuser system by dissipating part or all of the heat directly to the atmosphere.

**2.2.3** Cooling Towers--The heat dissipation system selected consists of six 16-cell rectangular, mechanical-draft cooling towers (Figure 2.2-1)



*0 0 0 2*  ق<br>L **L L m rc**  *0*  **a**  .. **k 3 M** 

**8** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

L

I

I

**1** 

**I** 

**I** <sup>I</sup>

designed to operate in either helper or closed-mode. Conditions requiring operation of the towers occur most commonly during spring and summer months. When cooling towers are not required to comply with thermal water quality standards, the cooling system of the plant is operated in open mode as originally designed.

Once in operation the cooling towers failed *to* meet the design requirements. As a result, during some summer months it was necessary to significantly derate the plant or risk noncompliance with the thermal standards adopted for Wheeler Reservoir. In addition to the operating deficiency, one cooling tower structurally failed on July 10, 1977. Subsequent inspections revealed that all **of** the towers needed structural upgrading. The use of the cooling towers was restricted until structural repairs could be completed in early 1979. For *these*  reasons, **on** July **13,** 1977, TVA asked **EPA** for relief from **Lhc** *86'* F maximum mixed-reservoir temperature. EPA granted such relief on July 15, 1977, requiring that TVA comply with a **90'** F maximum mixedreservoir temperature and a 5<sup>0</sup> F maximum temperature rise at any time the ambient upstream temperature exceeded 81<sup>0</sup> F. EPA also asked TVA to present a strategy for the long-term resolution of the problem. The following section outlines the several alternative means for this resolution.

## **2.3** Currently Available Options for Thermal Compliance

Since the summer of 1977, Browns Ferry has operated to meet a mixedreservoir thermal limit of 90<sup>0</sup> F while studies and investigations were being performed by TVA to determine a permanent solution to inadequacies

in the cooling towers. Figure **2.3-1** shows the incremental costs for meeting either the existing 86<sup>0</sup> F thermal standard in the reservoir or  $\overline{\phantom{a}}$ a 90<sup>0</sup> F limit using modifications of the existing tower system with a **90'** F thermal limit as the base cost option.

Studies conducted show that operation with an **86' F** maximum mixed-reservoir temperature would require TVA to (1) add two round mechanical draft cooling towers at an incremental cost over the base cost of \$35 million (this includes capital cost, operating and maintenance, and plant load reductions necessary during tower construction), **(2)** incur load reductions at an incremental cost of \$250 million over the life of plant if no towers were added, or **(3)** modify the existing tower system and incur load reductions at an incremental cost of \$150 million (includes modifications and plant load reductions). The addition of two round mechanical draft cooling towers is the most cost-effective alternative to meet the **86' F** thermal standard.

For the **90'** F thermal limit, the most cost-effective alternative, and the option which is preferred, would be to modify the existing tower system, thereby minimizing required load reductions. Modifications to the existing cooling towers included testing of one cooling tower with a different fill material which indicated only a small improvement in performance. in the data, however, indicated potential for improved performance at higher ambient conditions than were available during the testing period. trend was identified in test data taken on both the modified and unmodified cooling towers. To quantify this improvement, additional testing will be performed during the summer of **1980. An** extensive study is also underway to investigate methods of narrowing the operating margins of the plant's Trends This

**10** 

**1** 

**1** 

**1** 

**I** 

I

 $\mathbf{I}$ 

I

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**1** 

**I** 

**I** 

**1** 

**1** 

**I** 



Total incremental costs including load reduction penalties, capital costs, O&M costs, etc.

Figure **2.3-1** 

internal constraint temperature. Additional alternatives to modifying the tower system are: (1) Adding two round mechanical draft cooling towers at  $\frac{1}{10}$  incremental cost of \$33 million, or (2) incurring load reductions at an **iiic-rcaiiieiila** I cost **of** \$ 100 **mi 11 ion** with **thc exi sLing** towers **in Lhei r** c.tirrenL condition.

An alternative to adding cooling towers also studied is the construction of a new intake pumping station located on the river to supply water for the plant nuclear safety cooling system. The cost of a new intake pumping station has been estimated to be on the order of \$60 million with a 5-year construction period (\$60 million does not include any load reductions necessary during the construction period). The 5-year period  $c$  could be extended substantially due to activities necessary in the licensing of the new pumping station. Another alternative to adding cooling towers examined is seismic qualification of gate structure **2,** gates 1 and lA, the discharge control structure, and the cool water channel dike. **A**  previous investigation indicated **a** high degree of uncertainty in being able to adequately qualify all of these structures. Neither of these alternatives would be attractive unless the *90'* F thermal limit were obtained in conjunction with operation in helper mode in lieu of closed mode.

#### *2.4* Summary and Conclusions of Options Available

If the Browns Ferry Nuclear Plant is required to operate to meet the *86'* F maximum mixed-reservoir temperature, the most cost-effective approach would be to add two round mechanical draft cooling towers thereby minimizing plant load reductions during summer months.

**Assuming a permanent 90<sup>0</sup> F thermal variance, tower additions can**  $be avoided by increasing the existing tower capability by about$ **6 percent. Recent tests indicated that tower capability increases with increasing wet bulb temperatures which prevail in summer. Additional testing will be performed in the summer of 1980 to quantify the actual capability at these extreme conditions. Adoption of a 90' F limit may make the addition** *of* **new cooling towers unnecessary. This** *is* **the perferred** option.

 $\mathbf{I}$ 

**1 3.0** Hydrothermodynamics and Biotic Aspects of Wheeler Reservoir

**Wheeler Reservoir was formed in 1936 by the closure of Wheeler Dam at** Tennessee River **Mile** (TRM) **27.5.0.** Water surfarc> elevation in Wheeler Reservoir normally varies six feet or less annually. From approximately April through July, reservoir elevation is near maximum (556 feet above mean sea level) and fluctuates only slightly, while during the remainder of the year it is approximately five to six feet lower. Normal minimum pool is 550 feet above mean sea level.

Reservoir depths vary from about 50 feet near Wheeler Dam to about 25-30 feet in the main river channel near the plant site. Reservoir widths vary from 5,000 to 10,000 feet in the 19 miles between the plant and the dam. Approximately 60 percent of the reservoir's total volume of 1,120,000 acre-feet at normal maximum **pool** is downstream **of** the plant. From the vicinity of the plant upstream, Wheeler Reservoir is characterized by a main river channel of about 2000 foot width and *20-30* foot depth and extensive, shallow (5-15 feet) overbank areas on either side of the main channel.

### 3.1 Hydrothermodynamics of Wheeler Reservoir

The average annual river flow past the plant site can be estimated from a streamflow gaging station at Whitesburg, Alabama, about 39 miles above the Browns Ferry site, which the U.S. Geological Survey has maintained since **1937.** The average daily streamflow at this station for *46* years of record is about *42,500* cfs. At the Browns Perry site the estimated average annual streamflow is about *45,000* 

 $\mathbf{r}$ 

**I** *<sup>14</sup>*

cfs. Table **3.1-1** lists the percentage of days the mean daily flows at the Browns Ferry site could be below the indicated discharge based on the Whitesburg gage data for the period 1951 to **1970.** 

Instantaneous river flows in the vicinity of the plant are primarily dependent upon discharges from Guntersville Dam (TRM **349),** which is **55** miles upstream, and from Wheeler Dam (TRM **275),** which is **19**  miles downstream of the plant. The hourly releases from Guntersville and Wheeler Dams for 10 years of record **(1959-68)** are illustrated by the flow duration curves of Figures **3.1-1** and **3.1-2.**  These hourly records show that the periods of low or no flow are only a few hours duration. Low or no flow occurrences can be eliminated by adjusting the daily operation of **Guntersvjlle**  and Wheeler Dams.

Wheeler Reservoir stratifies because water depth is greater than the depth of the surface layer affected by solar radiation. This stratification is usually weak because of the relatively short transit time in Wheeler Reservoir **(1-2** weeks) and the fact that the turbine intakes on Wheeler Dam withdraw water from the entire vertical depth of the reservoir.

**I** 

**1** 

**I** 

**i** 

Tables **3.1-2** to **3.1-7** summarize temperature extremes and stratification in lower Wheeler Reservoir by month from **1974** to **1979.**  Temperature data were collected by hourly water temperature monitors at *TRM* **275.0** near Wheeler Dam and at TRM **286.0** just

## **Table 3.1-1. Frequency of river flows near** Browns **Ferry Nuclear** Plant, **1959-1968.**



Table **3.1-2.**  Summary of temperature extremes and stratification frequencies in Lower Wheeler Reservoir during 1974.



Note: For a given hour, the difference between the maximum and minimum temperatures is computed and sorted by range (eg., 0-1.5). of observations to give the precent of time in each range. The number of occurrences in each range is divided by the number

1

*c1* 



**Table 3.1-3. Summary of temperature extremes and stratification frequencies In Lower Wheeler Reservoir during 1975.** 

Note: For a given hour, the difference between the maximum and minimum temperatrues is computed and sorted by range (eg., 0-1.5). The number of occurrences in each range is divided by the number of observations to give the percent of time in each range.

I

 $\overline{8}$ 



**Table** *3.1-4.* **Summary of temperature extremes and stratification frequencies in** Lower **\'heeler Reservoir** during **1976.** 

Note: For a given hour, the difference between the maximum and minimum temperatures is computed and sorted by range *(eg.,* 0-1.5). The number of occurrences in each range is divided **by** the number of observations to vege the percent of time in each range.



Table **3.1-5.** Summarv of temperature extremes and stratification frequencies in Lower Vheeler Reservoir during 1977.

Note: For a given hour, the difference between the maximum and minimum temperatures *is* computed and sorted **by** range (eg., 0-1.5). The number of occurrences in each range is divided by the number of observations to give the percent of time in each range.

 $\overline{0}$ 



Table **3.1-6.** Summary of temperature extremes and stratification frequencies in Lower Wheeler Reservoir during 1978.

Note: For a given hour, the difference between the maximum and minimum temperatures is computed and sorted by range (eg., 0-1.5). of observations to give the percent of time **!r** ezch range. The number of occji-rences in each range is divided **by** the number



Table 3.1-7. Summary of temperature extremes and stratification frequencies in Lower Wheeler Reservoir during 1979.

Note: For a given hour, the difference between the maximum and minimum temperatures is computed and sorted by range (eg., 0-1.5). The number of occurrences in each range is divided by the number of observations to give the percent of time in each range.

,



**Figure 3. I** - **I** : **Frequency of Guntersville Dam Discharge 1959- 1968** 

**I** 

**1** 

**I** 

**I** 

*8* 

**I** 

**1** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**i** 

**I8** 

**I** 



**Figure 3. I** - **2** : **Frequency of Wheeler Darn Discharge 1959- I968** 

upstream from the mouth of Elk River. Data collected from March **1975** to September **1976** (Tables **3.1-3** and **3.1-4)** show ambient temperature for lower Wheeler Reservoir because the Browns Ferry plant did not operate during that period. Surface temperatures as high as **92.3OF** were recorded. Stratification is usually weak **(0-5OF),** but can occasionally be moderately strong (May **1975,**  June **1976).** Surface temperature extremes are generally higher **near thc** Elk River inflow, probably rel letting **solar ticbat iiiR of low Elk River flow resulting from shutdown periods at Tims Ford** Dun. Stratification **is** generally stronger near Wheelcr Dam where water depths are greatest.

Overbank areas in the vicinity of the plant and upstream respond quickly to diurnal heating and cooling because of shallow depth. Cooler water temperatures in the main river channel are the result of the greater water depth and the temperature of releases from Cuntcrsville **Dam. As** discussed **hy Ihgate (1978)** , **the di flerwrcr. in temperature between main channel and overbank areas make** determination of plant effects **011** water temperature di f'ficult.

Table **3.1-8** shows the frequency of high ambient river temperatures at the five-foot depth during summer months of **1969-1977,**  as recorded hourly by a water temperature monitor at TRM **297.8.**  Data from this monitor were used to compute ambient river temperatures for purposes of demonstrating compliance with thermal standards at the plant. Temperatures in excess of **90.0°F**  have been recorded at the five-foot depth at this location. In

Table 3.1-8. Frequency of high ambient river temperatures, **five** foot depth - TRM 297.8.



Note: All numbers are percent of time in given period.
July of an extremely hot year (eg., 1969 and 1977), water temperatures at the five-foot depth can exceed 86°F more than 40 percent of the time. Temperatures at the five-foot depth exceeded 86°F during each year of the period examined.

 $\hat{\mathcal{L}}_k$  ,  $\hat{\mathcal{L}}_k$ 

# 3.2 Aquatic Biota in Wheeler Reservoir

## 3.2.1 Plankton Commun **tY**

**'I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**1** 

**I** 

**1** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**Wheeler Reservoir, with a normal flow through time of about** one to two weeks, is typical of other Tennessee Hiver mainstream reservoirs in that productivity and standing stock of phytoplankton and zooplankton generally increases in the lower reachesof the reservoir. Similar increases in Chickamauga Reservoir, as well as general increases from upper to lower mainstream Tennessee River reservoirs, were summarized by Urban \_- et al. (1979).

**As** in most other Tennessee River mainstream reservoirs, the phytoplankton community in Wheeler Reservoir is usually dominated numerically by the Chrysophyta in winter and early spring, Chlorophyta in spring and early summer, and Cyanophyta in summer and fall. The zooplankton community is frequently dominated by Rotifera, although Cladocera or Copepoda occasionally dominate. Distinct seasonal trends for zooplankton are not apparent as for phytoplankton.

#### 3.2.2 Benthic Macroinvertebrate community

Abundant aquatic macroinvertebrates observed in the vicinity of BFNP before plant operation were: Asiatic clams (Corbicula manilensis), oligochaetes, Hexagenia sp., Caenis sp., Chironomidae, Chaoborus **sp.,** snails, sponges, byrozoans, and a few mussels and crayfish (Browns Ferry Environmental Statement, Volume 3, September 1972). With the exception of Corbicula manilensis, all of these organisms are widespread geographically, and are

*Lt)* 

ubiquitous in reservoirs or slow-flowing rivers. The Asiatic clam, Corbicula is not indigenous to North America, but is very abundant in the Tennessee River basin and has spread north at least as far as Ohio.

#### **3.2.3.** Fish community

**'I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

*8* 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**1** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**1** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

centrarchids (Stauffer et al., 1976; Reynolds and Casterlin 1976; Wrenn in press). The fish community in Wheeler Reservoir is dominated by warmwater species. With the exception of sauger and walleye, all the important game and commercial species are in this category, including smallmouth bass. Sauger and walleye are recognized by fisheries scientists and managers **as** coolwater species (Hokanson 1977; Kendall 1978). Species in this category occur in conjunction with both warmwater and coldwater species. Definitive thermal-effects data for smallmouth bass, compiled since **1972,** indicate that a "coolwater" classification for this species is not warranted. Recent studies show that the temperature requirements for smallmouth bass, particularly in relation to growth, survival, and preference, are essentially the same as those for largemouth bass and other warmwater

Although the temperature requirements for sauger and walleye are essentially the same (Hokanson 1977), sauger is the dominant species in Wheeler Reservoir. Walleye is of marginal concern in Wheeler Reservoir, since: (1) The species is rare in the reservoir, (2) there is no established walleye fishery, and

(3) occurrence is sporadic throughout the mainstream Tennessee River system. Adult sauger are neither common nor widely distrihuted in **she1 low ovcrbank artbas** or embayments **whcre**  substrates are primarily mud and/or silt. select areas of moderate current over rock, gravel, and mixed rubble substrate in streams and tailraces or about reefs in deep water zones of lakes and reservoirs. They may move between or among various habitat types and substrate zones but apparently spend little time in nonpreferred areas. To our knowledge no reefs exist in the deep pool water above Wheeler Dam (TRM *275-287),* and sauger are seldom caught there. Most netting and cove rotenone records indicate that less than one percent of They prefer and all fish captured by these methods are sauger. In the Wheeler Reservoir transition zone between pool and river channel (TRM *287-308)* sauger are captured by netting near heated water outfalls, largest numbers occur in fall and winter. Nearly all efforts by sport fishermen are expended between TRM *308.0* and Guntersville Dam at TRM *384.8.* 

Sauger, especially maturing individuals, may be spread throughout the reservoir, but sampling indicates relatively few adult sauger downstream of the plant site. When sauger begin moving in early winter on annual spawning runs, they generally move in such a way that by November or early December they concentrate near dams, existing municipal, industrial, and steam plant thermal discharges. These concentrations are of such common occurrence that sauger fishermen in the Tennessee River basin

**30** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

 $\blacksquare$ 

concentrated efforts below the dams and in and about steam plant discharge basins in November. Good sauger fishing often continues through April and even early May.

Smallmouth bass generally are not migratory; rather, they are considered resident in an area. Usually they move locally in a vertical plane along shoreline features and show a seasonal response (i.e., depth selection) to temperature. Smallmouth bass are distributed in two distinct, well separated zones of Wheeler Reservoir, neither of which should experience much effect from the Browns Ferry Nuclear Plant's warmwater effluent. The upstream population appears to prefer the tailrace and river channel below Guntersville Dam (TRM *348.8-308.0).* The downstream population is associated with the limestone bluffs from TRM *288.0* to Wheeler Dam (TRM *274.9),* and in the Elk River, (the main Wheeler tributary) from its mouth (TRM *284.5)*  to its source. In its upper portions, Elk River is principally a smallmouth bass-rock bass stream.

Fish monitoring investigations, conducted quarterly since the winter of *1968,* have shown the following to be important in the sport harvest: Largemouth bass, smallmouth bass, spotted bass, white bass, crappie, bluegill, and sauger. Important commercial fish are; bigmouth buffalo, smallmouth buffalo, channel catfish, flathead catfish, blue catfish, carp, drum, and paddlefish. Although striped bass occasionally appear in Wheeler Reservoir and its tailwaters, the species is not discussed here since it

**31** 

**I** 

**1** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**E** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**1** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

## 4.0 Hydrothermodynamics and Biotic Interactions for a 90°F Thermal Limit

#### 4.1 Hydrothermodynamics

Three 600-foot long submerged multiport diffusers discharge condenser cooling water to the river. As proposed, the condenser cooling water system will be operated in either open or helper modes. In open mode, the plant pumps 4350 cfs from the reservoir through steam condenser where the cooling water is heated approximately 25°F before discharge through diffusers. Open mode will be used when plant induced temperatures do not exceed the 5°F rise or 86°F maximum standard. In helper mode, condenser cooling water is routed to six mechanical draft cooling towers before discharge to the diffusers. Helper mode will be used to meet the 5°F rise criterion whenever the standard cannot be met in open mode. In addition, helper mode will be used whenever natural temperatures approach or exceed 86°F, in which case a maximum mixed river temperature of 90°F applies. If the 5°F rise or the 90°F maximum criteria cannot be met in helper mode, the plant will be derated.

#### 4.1.1 Near Field Effects

Mixed reservoir temperature downstream of the plant depends on flow rate and temperature of both the diffuser discharge and the reservoir. The induced dilution from the diffuser system was predicted using analytical models developed by MIT (Jirka and Harleman, 1973) and TVA. Calculations

assumed a diffuser system discharge of 1450 cfs per unit for open mode cooling and 1225 cfs per unit for helper mode cooling at various reservoir flow rates. Ambient reservoir temperatures varying from 81°F to 90°F were also assumed. The discharge temperature was calculated for open mode cooling using a condenser temperature rise of 25°F and was assumed to be a constant 94°F for helper mode cooling. Schematic representations of diffuser-induced mixing are shown in Figure 4.1-1. Generally speaking, diffuser-induced mixing falls into one of two regimes: Stratified or well mixed. In the stratified flow regime, which is strongest during periods of low or **zero** river flow, the buoyant diffuser effluent rises immediately to the surface, entraining cool reservoir water from the lower layers as it rises. Heated effluent may flow both upstream and downstream in a buoyant surface layer, and mixing water may be drawn from both upstream and downstream as illustrated in Figure 4.1-la. When reservoir flow is large, the role of buoyancy in diffuser performance is much smaller, and the effluent may become well mixed over the full depth of the reservoir as illustrated in Figure 4.1-lb. In this case, the diffuser effluent mixes with virtually all water which would naturally pass over it and induces additional entrainment flow, which is usually limited by the available reservoir flow.

-

**I** *<sup>34</sup>*

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**m** 

**I** 



Figure 4.1-1: Diffuser Flow Regimes

Figures *4.1-2* and *4.1-3* show the predicted mixed temperature at the diffuser for open and helper mode cooling, respectively. "Mixed tempcrature" is defined here **as** the temperature of the mixed effluent and reservoir water at the edge of the diffuser mixing zone at a five-foot depth. Figure *4.1-2* shows mixed temperatures greater than 90'F do not occur €or open mode cooling when ambient river temperatures are less than 85'F. Figure *4.1-3* shows that mixed temperatures greater than **90'F** do not occur for helper mode cooling when ambient reservoir temperatures are less than 88'F. **As** flow increases, even higher ambient reservoir temperatures do not cause mixed temperature *to*  exceed 90'F for either helper or open mode cooling. For all ambient reservoir temperatures from *81'F* to 90°F, a mixed temperature rise in excess of 5°F will not occur for most flow conditions. If low or reverse flow conditions persist for sustained periods (i.e., longer than three hours), reentrainment of the diffuser plume may occur and mixed temperatures greater than those predicted may result.

Using the analytical model of diffuser performance, the frequency of high plant-induced mixed temperatures was predicted for the summer months of **1969-1977** in Table *4.1-1.* Hourly flows from Guntersville and Wheeler Dams and hourly water temperatures at the five-foot depth at *TRM* 297.8 (Table 3.1-8) were used in the analysis. If hourly reservoir flows at the Browns Ferry site were calculated



**Figure 4.1-2:Predicted Mixed Temperature at Diffuser**  Open Cycle-Discharge Temperature 25°F Above Ambient  $\mathfrak{L}$ 

**NOTE: TEMPERATURES GREATER THAN PREDICTED CAN OCCUR AT LOW RIVER FLOWS IF SUCH FLOWS PERSIST FOR SUSTAINED PERIODS.**  SEE TEXT. **3 UNITS OPERATING** 

**W**  *OD* 





to be less than **10,000** cfs due to zero flow periods at the dams, flow at the plant site was set equal to **10,000** cfs in accordance with current **TVA** release practices to minimize cooling tower usage at Browns Ferry. Full plant operation was assumed and hourly wetbulb temperatures were used to characterize cooling tower performance. Assumptions for the use of helper and open mode cooling discussed earlier were also used.

Table **4.1-1** shows that mixed temperatures are greater than **86OF** from **0.4** to **29.8** percent of the time in a given summer, as compared to from **0.1** to **16.5** percent of the time for ambient conditions (Table **3.1-8).** During July, mixed temperatures are greater than **86OF** from **1.4** to **59.2** percent of the time in a given summer, as c'ompared to from **0.4** to **44.0** percent of the time for ambient conditions (Table **3.1-8). A** summary of the frequency of high ambient and mixed reservoir temperatures in the summer months for **1969-1977** is given in Table **4.1-2.**  High ambient temperatures exceed **86°F 4.8** percent of the time on average, while high mixed temperatures at the edge of the mixing zone exceed 86°F 9.2 percent of the time.

The proposed mixing zone for the plant **is 1800** feet wide and extends **2200** feet downstream of the diffusers over the entire water depth. The mixing zone has been defined on the basis of field studies which show that diffuser induced

Table 4.1-1. Predicted frequency of high mixed river temperatures

at edge of diffuser mixing zone (five foot depth) Browns Ferry Nuclear Plant.



Note: All numbers are percent of time in given period.

\*Less than 0.05 percent of the time

### Table 4.1-2. Frequency of high ambient and mixed river temperatures at the five foot depth near Browns Ferry Nuclear Plant, 1969-1977.



I

mixing takes place within one diffuser length of the discharge point (Ungate 1978, Johnson and Clift 1974, and Almquist et. al. 1978). The thermal structure of the mixing zone is often partially stratified. This is illustrated in Figures 4.1-4 to 4.1-6, which show summer 1977 temperature records at an hourly water temperature monitor situated at the downstream edge of the proposed mixing zone (TRM 293.5).

June 1977 temperatures are shown in Figure 4.1-4. The bottom temperatures from the upstream station at TRM 297.8 are also shown for comparison. Bottom temperatures at Browns Ferry were 1-2°F warmer than those upstream. Surface temperatures from the 0.5-foot, 3-foot and 5-foot depth sensors were elevated 1-4°F above bottom temperatures most of the time. This persistent stratification appears to be the result of the diffuser discharge. Some of the stratification may be natural since the surface temperatures at the upstream station were 1-2°F above bottom temperatures. In general the diffuser apparently increased reservoir temperatures 1-2°F and also added 1-3°F to surface tempera-In no case was more than 5°F added to surface tures. temperatures at the plant site. Bottom temperatures at the plant site were 83-84°F by the end of June. Although the diffuser discharge is a major influence near the plant, the prevailing meteorology can also dominate the thermal structure. A storm event of June 6-7 with the accompanying high winds produced fully mixed river temperatures that decreased 3°F by June 7.



**Figure** 4.1-4 : **Temperature Data at T.R.M. 293.5 During June 1977** 



**Figure 4.1-5** : **Temperature Data ot T.R.M. 293.5 During July 1977** 



Figure 4.1-6: Temperature Data at T.R.M 293.5 During August 1977

Plant site temperatures **for** July 1977 are shown in Figure 4.1-5. Stratification was less than during June because the plant **was** operated **in** clos~d or **htblpcr** mock to **minimize tieat** disrliarge to **the** rcservoir. **During the** second half **of**  July, Wheeler Reservoir was more strongly stratified because the plant returned to open cycle operation. Bottom temperatures from the upstream station are plotted for comparison with those at the edge of the mixing zone. Bottom temperatures in July were much closer to bottom temperatures upstream than during June. The contrast between June and July plant site temperatures shows that the diffuser discharge significantly affects water temperatures near the site when the plant **is** in open mode.

August **1977** water temperatures at the plant site are shown in Figure 4.1-6. They exhibited stratification of 2-3°F which is characteristic of open mode operation. Bottom temperatures were again  $1-2^{\circ}F$  above those at the upstream location. Bottom temperatures at the edge of the proposed mixing zone were very stable throughout August, varying between 83°F and 86°F. Bottom temperatures upstream were even more constant at between 82°F and 84°F. This suggests that relatively little natural heating was occurring at this depth during August although diurnal heating was significant in the surface layer.

*46* 

**1** 

**1** 

**1** 

**I** 

**I** 

#### **4.1.2** Far Field Effects

The heat discharged by Browns Ferry Nuclear Plant is mixed in the reservoir by flow- and wind-induced turbulence and is rejected to the atmosphere by surface heat exchange processes as it is transported downstream. Simultaneously, the reservoir is warmed and cooled naturally by solar and atmospheric radiation.

**As** discussed in Section **3.1,** Tables **3.1-2** through **3.1-7**  summarize temperature extrema and stratification in lower Wheeler Reservoir by month from **1974-1979,** respectively. Temperature data were collected by hourly water temperature monitors at TRM 275.0 near Wheeler Dam and at TRM 286.0 immediately upstream from the mouth of the Elk River. Data collected from March 1975 to September **1976 (Tables 3.1-3** and **3.1-4)** show ambient temperatures for lower Wheeler Reservoir because the Browns Ferry Plant was not operated during this period. Plant effects are included in the temperature data for the remainder of the monitoring period.

Tables 3.1-5 and **3.1-6** show stratification data for **1977** and **1978,** respectively, two of the three warmest years in the ten year period from **1969-1978** (Table **3.1-8).** Maximum surface temperatures these years were higher than for any other year, peaking at 94.9OF in August **1977** at TRM **286.0.** The degree of stratification, however, was similar

to other years. Browns Ferry was operated with a 90°E  $maximum$  temperature limit and without cooling towers during **aost of this pcariod. 'l'ill)l(~** *3.* **1-7 shows tliil:l fronl 1070 I'or**  similar plant operating conditions. Temperature extrema for **1979** are lower than those for **1975,** a year in which Browns Ferry did not operate after March **22.** Stratification in **1979**  was similar to that of other years. Thus, it is difficult to conclude what, if any, plant effects exist in lower Wheeler Reservoir from examination of Tables **3.1-2** to **3.1-7.** 

In an attempt to quantify **plant effects in** lower **Wheeler Reservoir, an hourly heat balance model for Wheeler Reservoir** downstream of the Browns Ferry diffuser was applied to compare the natural and heated temperature patterns characteristic of the far field region of the discharge. **An** unsteady flow model for Wheeler Reservoir was combined with an hourly surface heat exchange and mixing model to produce a far field temperature model. Natural and plant induced temperatures were routed from the diffuser location to Wheeler Dam on an hourly time scale. The hourly simulations allow diurnal heating and cooling and the effects of peaking power operation on water temperatures to be studied.

Wheeler Reservoir below the Browns Ferry diffuser is schematized as ten fully mixed volume elements, each with a length of about two miles and variable in width and depth. The surface area and volume of each element changes with

*48* 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**a** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

*8* 

**U** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**1** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

reservoir elevation. The volumes and surface areas of the volume elements near the plant were adjusted to account for the gradual spread of the thermal plume from the diffusers to the banks of the reservoir.

The model concurrently simulates natural and heated temperatures beginning at the diffuser site. Natural upstream boundary conditions (without the plant) are the ambient temperature data from the recorder at TRM 297.8. The upstream boundary conditions (with plant operation) are calculated from the proposed plant operating strategy at full load and the natural temperature record. The additional heat is assumed to be fully mixed in the first volume element. Calculated heat transfer from surfaces of the volumes is based on hourly meteorology and the hourly calculated natural or heated water temperatures.

Vertical temperature stratification was not included in this model. Because Wheeler Reservoir is stratified, two sets of model calculations were made: One with fully mixed volume elements over the entire depth and one with fully mixed volume elements that encompassed only the stratified surface layer of 10 foot depth. Comparison of the two sets of calculations should show the effects of the plant discharge on stratified temperature profiles in lower Wheeler Reservoir. The summer of *1977* was selected for study because persistently warm meteorology was observed. Comparisons of actual temperature data **for July** *1977* with model results are given for fully mixed and stratified layer volume elements at TRM *292.5* in Figures *4.1-7* and *4.1-8,* respectively; at TRM *286.0* near the mouth of the Elk River in Figures *4.1-9* and *4.1-10,* respectively; and at TRM *275.0* near Wheeler Dam in Figures *4.1-11* and *4.1-12,* respectively. Model results are based on hypothesized maximum plant output and thus are not directly comparable with temperature data, which were for actual plant operating conditions. However, plant conditions in the latter half of July *1977* were close to assumed conditions.

Actual temperatures at TRM *292.5* (Figures *4.1-7* and *4.1-8)*  showed almost no nighttime stratification, but exhibited daytime surface heating of *2-5'F,* with surface temperatures exceeding 90'F. Modeled temperatures which include plant effects are about **0.6'F** higher than temperatures without plant effects for fully mixed volumes (Figure *4.1-7)*  and about **1.2'F** higher for stratified layer volumes (Figure *4.1-8).*  The stratified layer elements show better agreement with actual temperature data than the fully mixed elements. Diurnal fluctuations in temperature in the stratified element 10 feet thick show a wide variation similar to the variation in actual data from surface to bottom. Surface temperature peaks were not adequately modeled because the ten-foot

**I <sup>50</sup>**

**1** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**1** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**-I** 







**-mm-=====I~=======m** 



Ln N



*Cn*  W





 $\mathbb{Z}^7$ 

**Figure 4.** I - **10** : **Comparison of Modeled Temperature using Stratified Layer Volume Elements with Temperature Data at T.R.M. 286.0** 



Figure 4.1-11: Comparison of Modeled Temperature using Fully Mixed Volume Elements with **Temperature Data at T.R.M. 275.0** 



**Figure 4.1 -12** : **Comparison of Modeled Temperature using Stratified Layer Volume Elements with Temperature Data at T.R.M. 275.0** 

thick stratified element does not respond as quickly to meteorological conditions as the one to two-foot thick layer measured in the prototype.

From a comparison of field data and model results in Figures 4.1-7 and 4.1-8, it can be inferred that the primary temperature effects of the Browns Ferry thermal discharge are in the surface laver of the reservoir. This corroborates observations noted in the discussion of near field diffuser effects.

Actual temperatures at TRM 286.0 near the mouth of the Elk River (Figures  $4.1-9$  and  $4.1-10$ ) showed diurnal heating effects of 2-5°F in the surface temperature. Surface temperatures exceeded 90°F on several occasions. Modeled temperatures which include plant effects are about  $0.5^{\circ}$ F higher than temperatures without plant effects for fully mixed volume elements (Figure 4.1-9) and about  $0.7^{\circ}$ F higher for stratified layer volumes (Figure 4.1-10). Ten-foot stratified layer volume elements again show better agreement with actual temperature data than the fully mixed volume elements, supporting the conclusion that plant temperature effects are primarily evident in the surface layer. Because the modeled temperatures agree well in absolute magnitude with actual temperature data, it can also be inferred that plant-induced temperature effects are probably evident from bank to bank in the surface layer downstream of the plant. This is

**I supported by the fact that from 66 to 100 percent of the** *Church* **control of the** *Church* **control of**  $\Gamma$  **and**  $\Gamma$  $\Gamma$  **and**  $\Gamma$  $\Gamma$ flow is entrained by the Browns Ferry diffusers. the river

> Temperatures at TRM 275.0 near Wheeler Dam (Figures 4.1-11 and 4.1-12) during July 1977 were more stratified than at TRM 286.0 at the mouth of the **Elk** River. Surface temperatures exceeded 86°F most of the month. Modeled temperatures which included plant effects were still about **O.S°F** higher at TRM 275.0 (the same as at TRM 286.0) than temperatures without plant effects for fully mixed volume elements (Figure 4.1-11). This shows the effect of assuming fully mixed volume elements, which dampen temperature dynamics and distort surface heat transfer processes. Stratified elements show temperatures about 0.4°F higher for the case with plant effects than the case without plant effects (Figure 4.1-12). The stratified layer volume elements again fit the actual temperature data better than the fully mixed volume elements.

In summary, the far field temperature effects of the Browns Ferry thermal discharge are primarily evident in the full width of the stratified surface layer of lower Wheeler Reservoir. The magnitude of this effect is on the order of **1°F** or less. Insignificant effects on the vertical structure **of** the stratified layer were noted.

# 4.2 Potential and Measured Biotic Responses and "Worst Case" Predictions  $for a 90° F (32.2° C) The *rand Limit*$

**<sup>A</sup>inonj** tori **rig program** rcqui **rc~d** by **NHC Knvirorimciiliil 'I'tvhni c'a I Spccif** ications **was** initiated at **Lhc** Browns Ferry Nuclear **Plant (BFNP)**  in **1969.** Quarterly samples of the phytoplankton, zooplankton, and benthic macroinvertebrate communities have continued since the winter of **1969.**  Larval fish surveys were initiated in **1971,** while juvenile and adult fish surveys were initiated in **1969** as part **of** this monitoring program. Sample stations and methodologies currently used for plankton and benthic macroinvertebrate surveys are summarized in Table *4.2-1;*  stations and methodologies for fishcries surveys are summarized in subsequent sections

Results of this monitoring program have been compiled into semiannual and annual reports that are on file in the Division of Water Resources Western Area Office in Muscle Shoals, Alabama. Site specific rationales and state-of-the-art technology advances resulted in some methodology alterations. These changes as well as current sample and data analysis methodologies are described in detail in reports cited in section 6.0.

In the following text these data are summarized and discussed briefly to evaluate the effects of permanently operating BFNP at a 90<sup>°</sup> F (32.2 $^{\text{o}}$  C) maximum temperature. These evaluations emphasize summers during the **90'** F interim variance which was established on July **15, 1977,** by **EPA** and **NRC** and on July **18, 1977** by AWIC. The summer sample period has been emphasized in this evaluation because June-September is the only time that the Alabama standard of *86'* F *(30'* C) is exceeded.



Table 4. . Number **of** samples collected from each station as specified in the quarterly biological monitoring required by **NRC** Environmental Technical Specifications for Browns Ferry Nuclear Plant used in this evaluation.

**a.** Duplicate samples from **0.3, 3.0,** and 5 m collected with Kemmerer sampler.

**b.** Duplicate bottom-to-surface tows with net (0.5 m, **80** pm mesh) equipped with flowmeter.

c. Nine randomly collected Ponar grab samples.

#### 4.2.1 Phytoplankton

Moderate increases in water temperature toward an algal species' optimum growth range increase its productivity and importance in the phytoplankton community (Patrick 1974). Cairns (1956) has reported that chrysophytes dominate up to  $86^{\circ}$  F, chlorophytes dominate from  $86^{\circ}$  F to 95<sup>°</sup> F (35<sup>°</sup> C), and cyanophytes dominate when water temperatures exceed  $95^{\circ}$  F. These general limits can be shifted by site variations such as relative nutrient enrichment (Bush et al. 1974). Reid (1961) stated that blue-greens can predominate in southern temperate aquatic communities when water temperatures exceed 66°F. In Wheeler Reservoir Chrysophyta usually dominate the phytoplankton in winter and early spring, Chlorophyta in spring and early summer, and Cyanophyta in summer and fall. Of the three algal groups mentioned, diatoms and green algae are superior to blue-green algae as food sources.

Evaluations of the effects of operating BFNP at a permanent 90°F  $(32.2^{\circ}$  C) limit on phytoplankton are based on community parameter comparisons between upstream and downstream stations and between preoperational and operational vears with emphasis on the two years (1978 and 1979) during the temporary variance period. Samples in 1977 were collected prior to obtaining the thermal variance. As previously stated, only summer samples are included in this evaluation.

The most probable plant effect would be changes in parameters at downstream stations. Downstream increases would be expected for

**Lhe** intcbraction of **added** heat wiLh other factors **such** as inrreased nutrient availability. Dycus and Ungate (1979) showed that **flows**  from the north overbank are entrained into BFNP and that this water has a much more abundant plankton community than that in the river channel proper. Taylor and Dycus (1980) showed that most plankton entrained into the intake during summer is apparently killed and most zooplankton disintegrated. They hypothesized an increased supply of nutrients available for algal uptake in the river channel after discharge through the diffusers and decomposition of organism fragments. Hence, larger phytoplankton numbers would be expected downstream.

Plant generation levels, sample date, and the five preceding days are shown in Table 4.2-2. The 1972 and 1973 samples were taken during the preoperational phase. During the 1974-1977 operational phase monitoring the 86 $^{\mathrm{o}}$  F (30 $^{\mathrm{o}}$  C) maximum river temperature limit was adhered to by BFNP. Only one unit **was** in operation in 1074; either one or **two** units were **iri** operation (luring **parts** of 1975 and 1976, however, neither operated at the time samples were taken; but all three units operated during the 1977 monitoring survey (unit 3 only at a low level). During the interim variance period with 90<sup>°</sup> F (32.2<sup>°</sup> C) limit for which phytoplankton data are available (summers of 1978 and 1979), operational monitoring surveys were conducted with all three units operating. If thermal effects are to occur from operation of BFNP at the 90<sup>°</sup> F (32.2<sup>°</sup> C) temperature limit, they should have been evident during 1978 and 1979.


**Table** 4.2-2. **Reactor power levels for Browns Ferry Nuclear Plant (units 1, 2, and 3) during sample periods,** 1974-1979.

**\*N/A** - **Not applicable, unit still under construction.** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**u** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**1** 

**I** 

**B** 

**I** 

**1** 

**I** 

**I** 

Water temperatures measured at the time plankton samples were collected are summarized in Table 4.2-3. These temperatures are instantaneous measurements which emcompass time **01** day **di** fferenccs induced by solar heating (i.e., differences in temperatures between stations cannot be attributed solely to operation of BFNP). These data show that during summers of 1972, 1973, 1974, 1975, 1976, and 1979, 86' F **(30'** C) was not exceeded at any station at the time of sample collection. During the other two years, 1977 and 1978, 30<sup>0</sup> C was exceeded at some stations downstream of BFNP. However, those high temperatures did not occur at stations immediately downstream of BFNP, rather they occurred several miles downstream in the forebay of Wheeler Reservoir and were probably the result of solar heating.

The phytoplankton assemblage in Wheeler Reservoir was diverse (Table *4.2-4)* with *33* Chrysophyta, 56 Chlorophyta, and 23 Cyanophyta taxa identified from summer samples. Phytoplankton composition by major group is shown in Table 4.2-5 for (1) the preoperational sample period, (2) the operational sample period with  $86^{\circ}$  F (30<sup>o</sup> C) standard, and (3) the operational period with 90' F *(32.2'* C) limit. Blue-green algae (Cyanophyta) were usually dominant (50 percent of the standing crop). This occurred from 1972-1976 at both upstream and downstream locations but dominance was consistent and highest  $($  > 75 percent of community numbers) during 1977, 1978, and 1979. Since blue-green algal dominance occurred prior to plant operation both up and downstream of BFNP, it is evident that plant operation,

**1** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**m** 

**I** 

**I** 

**1** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**1** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 



Table 4.2-3. Wheeler Reservoir Temperatures (F) during summer phytoplankton sample periods, 1972-1979.

**(OF** Through Profile)

**65** 

**1** 

**I** 

**1** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**1** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**e** 

**1** 

**8** 

**I** 

**I** 

July 7, 1975



Table 4.2-3 (Continued)

 $(1300)*$  $(1221)*$  $(1152)^{*}$  $(1122)*$  $(1058)*$  $(1028)*$  $(1001)^*$  $(0920)*$  $\mathbf 1$  $\mathbf{3}$  $\overline{\mathbf{5}}$  $10\,$  $\perp$   $\perp$ July 5, 1979  $(1607)*$  $(1532)*$  $(1505)*$   $(1435)*$  $(1200)*$  $(1130)*$  $(0938)*$  $(0852)*$  $\mathbf{1}$  $\mathfrak{Z}$  $10\,$  $\perp$   $\perp$  $\omega =$  $\div$  $\sim$   $\sim$  $\overline{a}$  $8\sqrt{1}$  $30\,$  $\overline{\phantom{a}}$  . 

\*Collection times, CDT \*\*Dash indicates measurements were not taken at that depth

July 5, 1978

Table 4.2-4. List of phytoplankton genera collected from Wheeler Reservoir in summer, 1972-1979.

# **CHRYSOPHYTA**



### **CHLOROPHYTA**







 $\mathcal{L}^{\mathcal{L}}$  and  $\mathcal{L}^{\mathcal{L}}$  are the set of  $\mathcal{L}^{\mathcal{L}}$ 

irrespective of applicable thermal maximums, was not totally responsible for this condition.

Estimates of phytoplankton standing crop from 1972 through 1979 are shown in Table 4.2-6. For all years, there was a general increase in numbers in a downstream direction. **A** comparison of data by station through time shows numbers to be relatively stable in 1972, 1973, and 1974, increasing at downstream stations in 1975 and 1976 when the plant did not operate, followed by an additional increase at most upstream and all downstream stations during 1977, 1978, and 1979 (Figure 4.2-1). Most of this increase was due to greater numbers of cyanophyte cells. **<sup>A</sup>**bloom of the blue-green alga Merismopedia occurred at TRM 295.87 (upstream) during 1978 where over 80 million cells/2 of the total 110 million cells/2 were this one genus. However, numbers of Merismopedia cells were less than 9 million/ $\ell$  at the next station (TRM 293.70) which is immediately downstream from **RFNP.** 

Increases in numbers at both upstream and downstream stations, especially this unusual bloom, show that heightened numbers during 1977 and 1978 must be related *to* factors other than operation of **BFNP.** Increases during 1979 occurred primarily at downstream stations, although upstream stations did show slight increases. Since 1979 was a cool wet year, reservoir water temperatures were relatively low and flows relatively high. **At**  least two explanations for the downstream increases exist: (1) Increases were due to plant operation, as previously described;



 $\blacksquare$ 

mine a f

and a strike in the second series of the series of the

an an a



34.7 *2* 

# Table 4.2-6. (Continued)



a. Single samples were taken in 1972.

b. Mean of duplicate samples.

c. Mean of samples at all depths.

d. Data not available.



Phytoplankton cell numbers (sample mean from surface to 5m depth) collected Figure  $4.2-1$ . at each station in Wheeler Reservoir, Alabama, in summer samples from 1972 to 1979.

or (2) high flows produced velocities in the upstream reach too great for large phytoplankton standing crops to develop; however, decreased velocities in the lacustrine portion of Wheeler Reservoir provided favorable conditions and phytoplankton numbers increased substantially at stations in this reach. Because of numerous interacting factors, delineation **of** the exact cause is not possible.

Phytoplankton productivi **Ly** data from 1972 through 1979 **are sum**marized in Table 4.2-7. In 1972, 1973, and 1975, the lower reaches of Wheeler Reservoir were eutrophic [based on criteria developed by Wetzel (1975) of 1000 mg  $C/m^2/day$ ]. In 1974, 1976, and 1979, an even greater carbon assimilation rate occurred in both the lower and middle reaches and in 1977 and 1978 Wheeler Reservoir was hypereutrophic throughout most of the study area including some thermally unaffected stalions (TRM **295.8). This**  clearly suggests causative factors not related to the plant.

Slightly eutrophic conditions during early and mid-1970's changed to highly eutrophic conditions during the late 1970's. Available data for all years studied except 1979 indicate this was the result of factors not related to operation of BFNP since parallel changes occurred both upstream and downstream of the plant. These data indicate that Wheeler Reservoir nutrient loading currently is probably borderline for a healthy balanced biota. An earlier evaluation by TVA (Mallard-Fox Creek EIS 1979) identified this condition and arrived at similar conclusions regarding the status of Wheeler Reservoir. The large increase in

**Table** 4.2-7. **Estimated daily phytoplankton productivity measured in summer samples from Wheeler Reservoir, Alabama, during** 1972-1979 **(measured by carbon-14 incorporation).** 

		$mgC/m^2/day$								
		Preoperational		Operational $30^{\circ}$ F Zero Unit One Unit			Standard Three Unit	Operational 32.2 <sup>O</sup> F Limit Three Unit		
	TRM	1972	1973	1974	1975	1976	1977	1978		1979
Stations	277.98	2202	1899	3784	1661	2072	5092	5728		2716
Below	283.94	2702	2539	5496	1935	2705	3393	7020		3545
<b>BFNP</b>	288.78	1167	452	2957	887	3803	4545	7076		5307
	291.76	1143	227	2791	691	1271	3309	7116		4333
	293.70	587	157	1872	374	1926	4779	5571		2373
Control	295.87	511	220	2129	419	888	6126	11778		2350
Stations	301.06	445	52	1789	294	515	1991	8390		797
	307.52	350	89	425	127	156	1358	1059		546

 $\overline{5}$ 

phytoplankton cell numbers during **1979** at downstream stations as compared to upstream stations cannot be easily reconciled, **but**   $\mathbf{L}$  the potential exists that operation of BFNP at the 90  $^\mathrm{O}$  F (32.2  $^\mathrm{O}$  C)  $^\mathrm{O}$ **limit** could have influenced this increase. Even if this was the case, the phytoplankton community was not substantially different from that in **1977** when the **86'** F **30'** C) standard was in effect, and no adverse effects should accrue from **a 90' F** thermal limit for Wheeler Reservoir.

Data summarized in this section do not allow finite determination of the effects of operation of **BFNP** on Wheeler Reservoir phytoplankton at at **90' F (32.2' C)** limit. These data do show eutrophic conditions in most of Wheeler Reservoir during periods **of** no plant operation and plant operation **at thc 86**  Hence, eutrophic conditions will probably exist whether **BFNP** is granted a permanent 90<sup>°</sup> F (32.2<sup>°</sup> C) limit or not. conditions in most of Wheeler Reservoir during periods of no<br>plant operation and plant operation at the 86<sup>°</sup> F (30<sup>°</sup> C) standard.<br>Hence, eutrophic conditions will probably exist whether BFNP is

**76** 

**I** 

**I** 

**1** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

#### 4.2.2 Zooplankton

Water temperatures that reach 90<sup>°</sup> F are not expected to have adverse effects on zooplankton density or species composition. Assuming short exposure periods, temperatures in heated discharge zones generally must exceed **93** F before impact occurs (Benda and *0*  Gulvas 1976; Carlson 1974; Wrenn et al. 1979).

Evaluation of the effects on zooplankton of operating BFNP at a permanent  $90^{\circ}$  F (32.2<sup>o</sup> C) limit are similar to those used for phytoplankton. Community parameter comparisons were made between upstream and downstream stations and between preoperational and operational years. Zooplankton samples were collected concurrently with phytoplankton samples, and therefore, plant generation levels and water temperatures discussed in section 4.2.1 apply here

The zooplankton assemblage was diverse during all years studied (Taylor et al. 1979). limit period (1978-1979) are shown in Table 4.2-8. There were 19 cladoceran, 12 copepod, and 33 rotifer taxa collected at the eight stations during these two years. Only two cladoceran, one copepod, and three rotifer taxa were collected above but not below BFNP, while four cladoceran, four copepod, and seven rotifer taxa were found below but not above **BFNP.** More taxa at the lower stations would be expected because of the lacustrine nature **of** that portion of the reservoir. lankton assemblage was diverse during all years studied<br>et <u>al</u>. 1979). Taxa collected during the 90° F (32.2° C)

Table 4.2-8.

I

Species of zooplankton collected from Wheeler Reservoir, Alabama, near Browns Ferry Nuclear Plant during summer, 1978 and 1979.



# Table 4.2-8 (Continued)



Control Stations  $\overline{a}$  $\overline{\phantom{0}}$ 

The zooplankton community changed from cladoceran to rotifer domination immediately downstream of BFNP for all years studied, especially during **1978** and **1979** (Table *4.2-9).* When group numbers are calculated from total zooplankton numbers (Table *4.2-lo),* it is apparent that this change resulted from very large increases in rotifer numbers. Cladocera increased moderately in number but decreased in proportion (percentage) of total zooplankton numbers because of the very large increase in rotifers. This suggests ideal conditions for rotifers, an important aspect of which is an abundant, high quality food supply. Most planktonic rotifers feed on algae or detritus. An abundant supply of phytoplankton was available, although most were blue-greens which are of relatively poor food value. **A** possible source of detritus could be the zooplankton entrained by BFNP intake, disintegrated during condenser passage, and returned to the reservoir through the **di** ffusers (Taylor **i~r~d** Dycus **1980).** 1,argc. **iiict-c:iscs** in roLi f(br nrinihcrs in **1978** anti **1079** *(32.2O* **C limit) I~irl riot iii 1977 (30"** <sup>C</sup> standard) when phyroplankton numbers were also high suggest that thermal enrichment may increase reproductive success for rotifers. However, rotifer numbers increased in a downstream direction and became dominant during **1973, 1975,** and **1976** sample periods when the plant did not operate. Therefore, if thermal "stimulation" is a factor it appears to only slightly accentuate an ongoing trend or process unrelated to the presence of BFNP. Data sum marized in this section coupled with thermal plume dispersion data in section *4.1* show that operation of BFNP at a permanent **32.2'** C *(90'* **F)** limit should not significantly affect Wheeler Reservoir zooplankton.



Table 4.2-9. Zooplankton composition (percent) for major groups during summer in Wheeler Reservoir, Alabama, by river mile and year.





*co*  N

4.2.3 Ichthyoplankton

Larval fish and egg surveys in Wheeler Reservoir were initiated in 1971 as part of the overall monitoring program. Preoperational data were gathered to determine existing or baseline conditions and to assess the potential for effects of BFNP on these biota. Three previous TVA documents address ichthyoplankton investigations in detail. Baseline data (1971-1973) are summarized in the BFNP Preoperational Fisheries Resources Report, May 1978. Operational monitoring ichthyoplankton studies (1974-1977) are discussed in Biological Effects of Intake (BFNP), Volume 4, January 1978. The third document, "Fish Entrainment and Impingement at BFNP, Wheeler Reservoir, Alabama, for 1978 and 1979," updates larval fish and egg investigations.

Site specific rationales and state-of-the-art technology advances resulted in some methodology alterations during the 9-year monitoring period. These changes, as well as current sample and data analysis methodology, are described in detail in the above reports.

The two full years of larval fish data collected during the 90° F (32.2° C) limit period (1978-1979) showed species composition, density, and relative abundance to be similar to previous sample years (TVA 1978A, 1978B, and 1980). Table  $4.2-11$  shows relative abundance for dominant larval taxa collected during the complete monitoring period. Data from TRM 293 (plant transect) during 1978-1979 should show effects, or lack thereof, resulting



**I** 

**Table 4.2-11. Relative abundance** (%) **for dominant taxa of larval fish collected from Wheeler Reservoir, 1971-1972.** 

from the increased river temperature allowed hy the 90' F *(32.2'* **C)**  limit. Density of dominant taxa and concurrent temperature data for TRM *293 (1978-1979)* are shown in Figures *4.2-2* to *4.2-12.* 

Clupeids were the dominant taxa collected during the variance period. This was the case for all previous years sampled. Catostomids and percichthyids were the dominant early spawners and were not subjected to temperatures exceeding **A1** abama State standards for the Tennessee River drainage (Figures *4.2-3, 4.2-4, 4.2-8,* and *4.2-9).* 

Spawning times for Stizostedion spp. (probably sauger) coincided with that of percichthyids and catostomids. Stizostedion spp. were the only larval "coolwater" taxa collected during the 9-year monitoring period and were present all years except *1971* and *1972*  (Table *4.2-12).* Highest densities occurred in *1973, 1974, 1975,*  and *1977* and were later reflected in large young-of-the-year numbers in cove samples and gill net catches (Table *4.2-21* in section *4.2.5)* of adults in the plant vicinity. Larval Stizostedion spp. densities were low in *1976, 1978,* and *1979.*  Their apparent absence in *1971* and *1972* was the result of initiating the sample program too late; i.e., after the period of larval Stizostedion spp. occurrence.

Temperature data gathered concurrently with larval samples show that water temperatures did not exceed  $71.6^{\circ}$  F (22<sup>°</sup> C) during periods when Stizostedion spp. larvae were present in Wheeler

**I** 



Total numbers, density, latest occurrence, and temperature Table 4.2-12. data for Stizostedion spp. (probably sauger) larvae collected from Wheeler Reservoir, 1971-1979.

\*Mean of day-night water temperature on date of latest occurrence. \*\*Sampling not begun until after the period of larval Stizostedion spp. occurrence.



Figure 4.2-2. Water temperature and density (no./1000  $m^3$ ) of clupeid larvae collected from Wheeler Reservoir (TRM 293) during March through August, 1978.







**Figure** *4.2-4.* **Water temperature and density (no./1000 m 3** ) **of percichthyid larvae collected from Wheeler Reservoir** (TRM **293) during March through August 1978.** 











**3 Figure** *4.2-7.* **Water temperature and density (no. /lo00** ) **of clupeid larvae collected from Wheeler Reservoir** (TRM **293) during March through August 1979.** 



**<sup>3</sup>Figure** *4.2-8-* **Water temperature and density (no./1000 m** ) **of catostomid larvae collected from Wheeler Reservoir** (TRM **293) during March through August 1979.** 



*4.2-9.* **Water temperature and density (no./1000 m 3** ) **of percichthyid larvae collected from Wheeler Reservoir** (TRM **293) during March through August 1979.** 

 $\mathfrak{d}$ 



Figure 4.2-10. Water temperature and density (no./1000  $m^3$ ) of centrarchid larvae collected from Wheeler Reservoir (TRM 293) during March through August 1979.

ه<br>ه



Water temperature and density (no./1000 m<sup>3</sup>) of Stizostedion spp. larvae collected from<br>Wheeler Reservoir (TRM 293) during March through August 1979.



**Figure** *4.2-12.* **Water temperature and density (no./1000 m 3** ) **of freshwater drum larvae collected from Wheeler Reservoir (TRM 293) during March through August 1979.** 

 $\mathfrak{g}_7$ 

*0*  Reservoir. Since the permissible mixed temperature rise of 5 **F (2.8'** C) will be met as required by State standards and Stizostedion spp. larvae do not occur at temperatures greater than **71.6'** F, they will be unaffected by a permanent limit of  $90^{\circ}$  F (32.2<sup>°</sup> C).

Centrarchids, clupeids, and freshwater drum were the dominant taxa collected from early to late summer during the **90' F (32.2O** C) limit period. This pattern was typical for previous sample years (TVA **1978A, 1978B,** and **1980).** 

Water temperatures taken at TRM **293** concurrently with larval samples did not exceed **86' F** until mid-August in **1978** and **1979.**  Temperature extreme data derived from temperature monitors at TRM **275.0** and TRM **286.0** (Tables **3.1-6** and **3.1-7)** show that water temperatures reached **86'** F in June **1978** and **1979.**  Clupeids and freshwater drum were the dominant taxa collected when water temperatures were **86O F (30"** C) **or** greater. Densities of Clupeids were on the decline at this time. These densities peaked **on** May **30, 1978,** and May **7, 1979.** Larval freshwater drum peak densities occurred during mid-June in both **1978** and **1979.**  Relative abundance of these larvae was **0.82** and 2.12 percent in **1978** and **1979,** respectively. Therefore, entrainment in thermal plumes of greater than 86° F should be minimal and no effects are expected for a *90°* F **(32.2O** C) limit.
#### *4.2.4* Benthic Macroinvertebrates

Potential responses of the macrobenthic organisms in Wheeler Reservoir to temperaturrs ranging between **86**  *<sup>0</sup>*and **90'** F include mortality, avoidance, community composition changes, and productivity rate changes.

**1.** Mortality. Temperatures at which benthic organisms are eliminated, presumably by mortality, from thermal discharge zones, rarely fall below 90<sup>0</sup> F (Wurtz 1961; Benda and Proffitt<br>1974; Durrett and Pearson 1975; and Miller <u>et al</u>. 1976). Letha temperatures have been documented in laboratory studies for a variety of macroinvertebrate species. Those species whose lethal temperatures in short-term laboratory experiments are much **lcss**  than **86 F** do not occur in Wheeler Reservoir. In the Browns *0*  1974; Durrett and Pearson 1975; and Miller et al. 1976). Lethal Ferry biothermal research channels, two organisms which occur in Wheeler Reservoir suffered population declines at temperatures lower than **90'** F. In studies conducted in **1978,** Caenis **sp.**  declined approximately **90** percent in channels with mean daily temperatures ranging from about **89** to **96' F.** Corbicula *0*  manilensis held in cages in the channels were completely eliminated when mean daily temperatures rose from **71**  *0*  to **89'** F. The whole macroinvertebrate community excluding Mollusca showed a significant decline in numbers (ca. **65%)** at temperatures ranging between **87'** and **93' F** (Rogders, in press).

*<sup>0</sup>*2. Avoidance. Certain organisms avoid temperatures between **<sup>86</sup>** and **90' F** either by actively seeking or drifting to cooler areas.

100<br>The snail, <u>Lymnaea</u> stagnalis, moved from a 95<sup>°</sup> to 77<sup>°</sup> laboratory study gradient (Bovbjerg **1975).**  to 77 F area in a

> **3.** Community compositiou changes. Species diversity and species composition are not likely to be significantly influenced by composition are not likely to be significantly influenced by<br>temperatures between 86<sup>0</sup> and 90<sup>0</sup> F. Alston <u>et al</u>., (1978) noted reduced diversity of macroinvertebrates in artificial channels whose water temperature reached a maximum of 96<sup>0</sup> F, while in channels whose maximum temperature was 87 *<sup>0</sup>*F diversity was not reduced. Shannon-Weaver **(H1)** diversity was unrelated to temperature treatment in experiments in the biothermal channels with temperatures ranging to 93<sup>°</sup> F (Wrenn et al. 1979). biotherm<br><u>et al</u>. 1

> *4.* Productivity rate changes. There is little available literature relating benthic production to specific temperatures. Estimates of Caenis sp. production in the biothermal channels in **1978** indicated progressively less production with the addition of heat. Caenis production in channels experiencing 108 days at mean temperatures ranging from 86<sup>°</sup> to 97<sup>°</sup> F was 29 percent of that in ambient channels where temperatures did not reach 86<sup>°</sup> F.

Although these are potential responses, none are expected to occur because bottom temperatures in the mixing zone (the worst case area) are only elevated 1-2<sup>0</sup> F above upstream bottom temperatures (see section *4.1.1.).*  The most likely avenue of direct effect would be to drifting organisms or to insects which pass through the water column to emerge.

**I** 

*0*  Evaluation of the effects **of** operating **BFNP** at a permanent **90 F**  (32.2<sup>°</sup> C) limit were based on community comparisons between up and downstream stations and between preoperational and operational years. Emphasis was placed on summer periods during the temporary variance **(1978** and **1979).** For discussion purposes, dominant macroinvertebrates have been grouped into two categories: Organisms which experience drift (Hexagenia and chironomid midges) and sedentary organisms (Corbicula and oligochaetes).

The burrowing mayfly (Hexagenia bilineata) inhabits soft sediments and emerges as the adult stage in large numbers, typically in late June and early July. Optimum habitat does not exist at Wheeler Reservoir forebay stations (TRM's **277.98** and **283.94)** or riverine stations (TRM 301.06 and **307.52),** and relatively low numbers were present in samples from these locations (Table *4.2-13).*  Largest populations typically were found at stations immediately upstream and **up** to six miles downstream of Browns Ferry Nuclear Plant during all plant operating regimes. Even though this trend was consistent throughout the study period, Hexagenia numbers were generally lower at stations within the six mile reach downstream of BFNP during **1977, 1978,** and **1979** than in preceding years. This difference is thought to reflect emergence as adults prior to sample collection in these years since this species is known to be tolerant of relatively high temperatures. Studies at Cumberland Steam-electric Plant on Lake Barkley demonstrated that nymphs of H. bilineata survive thermal plume drift for prolonged periods (up to *4.5* **hours)** at temperatures of *94.6'* F

**<sup>101</sup>I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

Table 4.2-13. Mean benthic macroinvertebrate numbers per square meter (10 samples) collected at Tennessee River locations during 1974-1979, Wheeler Reservoir, Alabama.









ł

I

I



**m** 

**U** 

**1** 

**I** 

**1** 

**1** 





*(34.8'* **C)** and higher (TVA **1977).**  Recent laboratory studies have documented that H. bilineata eggs will develop and hatch at **93.2'** F *(34'* C) (Tennessen **1979).**  It therefore appears that thermal effluent from Browns Ferry Nuclear Plant does not affect the <u>H. bilineata</u> population for either a 86<sup>0</sup> F (30<sup>0</sup> C) standard **or 90' F (32.2'** C) limit.

Chironomid midges, depending upon species, may have two or more complete life cycles during summer. Hence, aquatic population densities are subject to marked natural variations. Fluctuations **in** population number occurred at both upstream and downstream stations under all plant operating regimes. These fluctuations showed no cause-effect relationship for plant operation at either the  $86^{\circ}$  F (30<sup>°</sup> C) or  $90^{\circ}$  F (32.2<sup>°</sup> C) limit.

**I** 

*8* 

**I** 

**I** 

**1** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**'1** 

Corbicula manilensis, the Asiatic clam, with the exception of **a**  short initial semiplanktonic stage, is sedentary. Largest popula tions of <u>C</u>. <u>manilensis</u> were generally found at stations immediately upstream and up to six miles downstream of BFNP except for **1979**  (Table 4.2-13). This distribution closely parallels that of <u>H</u>. bilineata. If thermal effluent affected this species, the station where changes would be expected to be most prominent was the station immediately downstream of the diffusers (TRM **293.70).**  The data do show reduced numbers at this station during **1977, 1978, 1979** compared to previous years. However, reductions were evident at other downstream stations not significantly affected by the plume. These reductions are not thought to indicate **a** 

thermal effect, rather they are thought to reflect year-to-year sample variability caused by the contagious distribution pattern of this species.

Aquatic oligochaetes, depending upon taxon and abundance, may be classified as nuisance species and/or species indicative of organic pollution. Data in Table *4.2-13* show population fluctuations unrelated to BFNP with increases and decreases during periods of similar plant Operation. Hence, it appears that the thermal effluent from Browns Ferry Nuclear Plant has not affected oligochaete populations.

Benthic macroinvertebrate data do not show that operation of Browns Ferry Nuclear Plant has affected maintenance of a balanced and indigenous benthic macroinvertebrate community for operation at either the  $86^{\circ}$  F  $(30^{\circ}$  C) standard or  $90^{\circ}$  F  $(32.2^{\circ}$  C) limit. These data, coupled with thermal data in section *4.1,* show that a permanent 90 F (32.2 **C)** thermal limit should not significantly *0 0*  affect the benthic macroinvertebrate community in Wheeler Reservoir.

**109** 

**I** 

#### 4.2.5 Juvenile and Adult Fish

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**1** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**1** 

**1** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

Water temperatures that reach  $90^{\circ}$  F would not be lethal to important commercial, prey, and game fish species (including sauger and smallmouth bass). Recent studies show that the upper lethal temperature (50 percent mortality) for walleye is 94<sup>0</sup> F (Wrenn and Forsythe 1978; Wrenn et al. 1979; Hokanson 1979). Since sauger are reported to have a slightly higher thermal tolerance than walleye (Hokanson 1979), the lethal limit for sauger is at least 94<sup>0</sup>F. The upper lethal temperature for smallmouth bass is greater than 95<sup>0</sup> F (Horning and Pearson<br>1973; Stauffer <u>et al</u>. 1976; Wrenn, in press)*.* 

The most likely response under these temperature conditions would be avoidance by sauger, which generally avoid thermal discharge zones when the temperature exceeds 86<sup>0</sup> F (Wrenn 1975; Yoder and Gammon 1976). Most of the other species would be unaffected; some species would actually seek these temperature levels. For example, in the Ohio River, Yoder and Gammon (1976) reported that channel catfish, flathead catfish, gizzard shad, smallmouth buffalo, white crappie, bluegill, and largemouth bass frequently select temperatures equal to or greater than 90' F during summer. **Also,** smallmouth bass would not exhibit a strong avoidance response since the summer temperature preference for this species is  $86-88^\circ$  F (Barans and Tubb, 1973; Reynolds and Casterlin, 1976). Trembley (1960) collected smallmouth bass from heated discharge zones at temperatures up to 94<sup>0</sup> F. In Pickwick Reservoir (Tennessee River drainage),

temperatures that reached **92'** F in a heated discharge channel did not create a thermal barrier to movement of smallmouth bass (Wrenn, **1976).** 

As indicated by the avoidance response of sauger and probably other species, local changes in the species composition of the fish community might occur. However, these changes would not have a significant or irreversible impact on the total fish community. In general, seasonal shifts in the composition Of fish species in relation to thermal discharge zones are common (Wrenn **1975).** These shifts occur without changing important community characteristics and only represent adaptations of the community along **an** environmental gradient (Teppen and Gammon **1976).** 

**I** 

**I** 

-- **I** 

**I** 

**I** 

Historical fisheries data from Wheeler Reservoir date back to **1949** when cove rotenone surveys were first implemented to characterize this fish community. Rotenone surveys are effective for all species and sizes of fish but sample pelagic species less consistently because the surveys are typically taken in coves. Information for pelagic or open water species must be supplemented with data from entanglement and entrapment gear. Preoperational fisheries data included 18 years of reservoir standing stock surveys (from 1949 continuous through **1961** and from **1969** through **1973)** and gill and trap net surveys **(1970-1973).**  All these surveys have continued as part of the Browns Ferry Nuclear Plant fisheries monitoring program described in the NRC technical specifications. Creel census surveys were implemented in 1970 to obtain information regarding the sport tisliery in **Wheeler** Reservoir. Fish species and methodologies used to collect them are shown in Table 4.2-14.

#### 4.2.5.1 Rotenone

**I** 

Chemical sampling of fishes is an effective method of obtaining standing stock information such as densities, yearclass strength, reproductive success, species composition, and relative abundance. The majority of historical fisheries information for Wheeler Reservoir is cove rotenone data and sample procedures have remained relatively constant throughout the years.

Three locations (TRM 275, TRM 286, and ERM 2.7) were designated for preoperational and operational monitoring. The sites are all located downstream from **BFNP** (Figure 4.2-13) ; however, none are located within the expected zone of greatest thermal influence.

Historical data show natural cycles from year to year with **a**  gradual escalating trend for total stock estimates from 1951 through 1960. Cove rotenone surveys were not conducted from 1962 through 1968. Standing stock estimates decreased progressively from 1969 through 1973. Stock estimates during the operation period of **BFNP** increased in a cyclic fashion from 349.05 kg/ha in 1974 to 745.33 kg/ha in 1977 with a peak of 821.5 kg/ha in 1976.



Location of gill net, trap net, and cove rotenone sample stations on Wheeler Reservoir<br>near Browns Ferry Nuclear Plant. Figure 4.2-13.



Cove rotenone estimates of total standing stock (kg/ha) of Wheeler Reservoir fishes,<br>1949-1979.



Table 4.2-14. Common and scientific names\* of fishes collected from Wheeler Reservoir during 1969 to **1979,** preoperational and operational monitoring for Browns Ferry Nuclear Plant.

\*Taken from Common and Scientific Names of Fishes, American Fisheries Society Special Publication No. *6,* Third Edition, 1970.

\*\*Indicates prey  $(P)$ , commercial  $(C)$ , or game  $(G)$ .

\*\*\*Ictiobus sp. - larval fish; species not known.





Standing stock (rotenone) data gathered during **the**  period (1978-1979; samples in 1977 were taken efore the variance was in effect) BFNP was operated with a 90<sup>0</sup> F  $(32.2^{\circ}$  C) limit showed a decrease to 404.44 in 1978 and an increase to 549.45 kg/ha in 1979. This is thought to be a natural cycle unrelated to the current interim variance at **BFNP.**  This hypothesis is supported by historical data which show similar cyclic fluctuations (Figure 4.2-14). Standing stock biomass values for 1978 and 1979 were not significantly different from the 24-year average (577.42 kg/ha) for all data.

Fish species occurrence, mean numbers, and mean weights for 1979 are shown in Table 4.2-15. Dominant taxa found during preoperational and operational monitoring are shown in Figure 4.2-15. Gizzard shad (Dorosoma cepedianum) were always dominant in terms of biomass. The second most abundant species by weight was bluegill (Lepomis macrochirus), and carp (Cyprinus carpio) was the third most abundant taxon in 1979. Smallmouth buffalo (Ictiobus bubalus) and freshwater drum (Aplodinotus grunniens) were also abundant.

The arbitrary categories **of** game, commercial, and prey species are shown during the 10-year monitoring period in Figure 4.2-16. Standing stocks for all three groups tend to vary in parallel, showing a definite trend. Game species had a gradual but significant decline until the initiation of







 $T = \text{trace}$ 

Figure 4.2-15. Dominant taxa (by weight) of fishes collected from Wheeler Reservoir cove rotenone surveys (1970-1979).







generation by BFNP and an equally gradual and significant increase during operation of the plant. Warmwater centrarchids (e.g., bluegill, redear, sunfish, and largemouth bass) were the dominant game fishes. Stocks of comercial and prey species showed similar trends, the prey species being somewhat more variable than the other two groups.

Density and distribution patterns for sauger and smallmouth bass are key to determining any adverse impact of the  $90^{\circ}$ F (32.2' **C)** thermal limit. Walleye have not been collected in cove rotenone samples since 1954 and are sufficiently rare to preclude potential impact from thermal enrichment; however, smallmouth bass frequently occur at all sample locations. Sauger are common in the two coves sampled **off** the Tennessee River proper but occur infrequently at the Elk River cove **(ERM** 2.7).

Biomass data and species composition for sauger and small-\_. mouth bass are shown in Figures 4.2-17 and 4.2-18. The mean standing stock for smallmouth bass during the 10-year monitoring period was 1.77 kg/ha. Smallmouth bass standing stocks from 1970 through 1972 were greater than the 10-year mean. The extremely high biomass in the TRM 275 cove in 1971, a definite outlier, accounted for this relatively high average. Sauger biomass was greatest in 1976 and 1977, 2.61 and **2.55** kg/ha, respectively. Although these data show a decrease in 1978 and 1979, biomass during these two years was greater than



**Figure 4.2-17. Sauger biomass (kg/ha) in cove rotenone samples from Wheeler Reservoir (average of three coves).** 



**I** I

**Figure 4.2-18. Smallmouth bass biomass (kR/ha) in cove rotenone samples from Wheeler Reservoir (average of three coves). Mean** (x) **excludes the one unusual sample at** *TRM* **275 in 1971.** 

**that of the first five years of monitoring (1970-1974). It is unlikely that this reduction was due to higher mixed-river temperatures, but was probably related to low recruitment.** 

**Largemouth bass stocks showed greater variation during the**  10-year monitoring period than did smallmouth bass and sauger **(Figure 4.2-19). Number, biomass, and sizeclass data for sauger and smallmouth bass at three coves are shown in Tables 4.2-16 and 4.2-17. The greatest number of young-of-the-year**  sauger found was in 1977 at TRM 275 and 286. No increase in **the harvestable sizeclass was noted at either station in 1978 and 1979. Number and biomass of smallmouth bass increased markedly during 1977-1979 at** TRtl **286. Data from** TRpi **275, except for the unusually high biomass in 1971, were the most consistent throughout all years sampled for all sizeclasses. Standing stock of smallmouth bass at the Elk River cove was relatively low for all years.** 

**Standing stocks of prey fishes were variable throughout the 10-year monitoring period (Figure 4.2-16). Clupeids (threadfin and gizzard shad) were the dominant prey species collected. Biomass estimates decreased from 515.71 kg/ha in 1977 to 143.39 kg/ha in 1978, but increased to 242.19 kg/ha in 1979.** 

**Adult or harvestable sizeclasses were the major portion of total biomass collected (Figure 4.2-20). Figure 4.2-21 shows stock levels for dominant young-of-the-year taxa during the** 

Table 4.2-16. Numbers and biomass of sauger per hectare taken in cove-rotenone samples, Wheeler Reservoir. YOY = young of year (<200 mm TL);  $I =$  intermediate (200-300 mm);  $H =$  harvestable (>300 mm). Coves at TRM 275, 286, and ERM (Elk River) 2.7 are preoperational and operational monitoring sites for BFNP.



Table 4.2-17. Number and biomass of smallmouth bass per hectare taken in cove-rotenone samples, Wheeler Reservoir. YOY = young of year (<125 mm TL);  $l =$  intermediate (125-200 mm); H = harvestable  $(200 \text{ mm})$ . Coves at TRM 275, 286, and ERM (Elk River) 2.7 are preoperational and operational monitoring sites for BFNP.



 $4.2 - 19.$ Largemouth bass biomass (kg/ha)<br>from Wheeler Reservoir (average <u>م</u>  $\frac{1}{5}$ three coves). cove rotenone samples

Figure





Standing stock estimates (kg/ha) by size class of fishes taken in Wheeler Reservoir cove rotenone surveys from 1970-1979 (average of three coves) Figure 4.2-20.



Figure  $4.2-21$ . Four dominant young-of-the-year taxa collected in Wheeler Reservoir cove rotenone surveys<br>during 1970-1979 (average of three coves).

**I** 

**1** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

 $\vert$ 

**I** 

10-year monitoring period. Bluegill, redear sunfish, and freshwater drum were very consistent in their occurrence and showed no effect of plant operation. Young-of-the-year gizzard shad were more variable with several highs and **lows,**  the greatest deviations occurring during the period of plant operation.

Figure *4.2-22* shows relative abundance of adult and young-ofthe-year gizzard shad. Adult gizzard shad constituted from *46* to *88* percent of the fish community biomass during the 10-year monitoring period. Clupeids dominated the total standing stock consistently throughout all sample years. In 1975, extremely low numbers of young-of-the-year gizzard shad were found. This was possibly due to: (1) Interspecific competition with threadfin shad young-of-the-year since they comprised *40.6* percent of total fish collected in 1975; and *(2)* patchiness; i.e., rotenone samples in 1975 simply may not have been in areas where young gizzard shad were abundant.

Historical rotenone data clearly illustrate recurrent stock fluctuations in Wheeler Reservoir during the period records are available. Fluctuations during the period of plant operation were indiscernible from those of the twenty-five year period preceding operation of BFNP, and any impact to the fish community of Wheeler Reservoir owing to the operation of this facility is judged to be nonsignificant.

Figure 4.2-22. Percent composition of young-of-the-year and adult<br>gizzard shad in cove rotenone samples from Wheeler<br>Reservoir (average of three coves). (average



#### *4.2.5.2* Gill Nets

**I** 

**1** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

Quarterly gill net surveys were conducted at Browns Ferry Nuclear Plant as part of preoperational and operational monitoring requireacnts in the **NHC** technical spccifications for BFNP. Gill nets used in these surveys were standard *3.8*  centimeter bar mesh, *2.4* meters deep by *30.4* meters long. Gill nets are highly selective for harvestable size fish but allow different physical areas of a water body (channel, pelagic zones, overbanks, etc.) to be sampled. Sample locations in Wheeler Reservoir are shown in Figure *4.2-13.* 

Sampling at station *4,* located at the diffuser discharge, began in 1975. This is the only location sampled within the zone of maximum thermal influencc. Figure *4.2-23* shows catch per unit effort (c/f) for **all** species rombined during the 10-year monitoring period. Plotted values are means for spring and summer surveys combined. Comparisons between operational periods were made from surveys taken between May 1 and September **30** of each year. Fall and winter quarter surveys were excluded from these comparisons since there is no potential for thermal impacts during those periods. Table *4.2-18* summarizes summer quarter gill net data from *1969* to *1979.* 

The c/f at station *1* (TRM *293)* was consistent through the 10-year monitoring period, ranging during plant operation from a low of *16* in *1974* to **a** high of *23* fish per net night

**I** *<sup>134</sup>*
**Table** 4.2-18. **Summary of summer quarter gill net sampling, preoperational**  (1969-1973) **and operational monitoring** (1973-1979) **at BFNP, Wheeler Reservoir.** 

		STATIONS-							
								ムネ	
		N	c/f	N	c/f	N	c/f	N	c/t
Preoperation	$1969 - 1973$	1146	28.65 306		8.18 1158 29.87				
Unit 1 on Line 1973-1974		316	7.90	85	2.83	643	-16.08		
Shutdown	1975-1976	816	20.89	-14	4.13 1051		26.27	173	9.06
90° F Variance	1977-1979	621	15.70	306	8.22	1706	42.65	191	12.07

**"Sampling at station** 4 **began in** 1975.



Figure *4.2-23.* Catch per unit effort of gill net surveys conducted in the vicinity of **BFNP**  during the years 1970-1979. Data include surveys taken between May *1* and September *30* **for** each year.

in 1979. The c/f at station **3 (TRM** 294) decreased to a low of 14.9 in 1972 but increased progressively to a peak of 60 fish per net night in 1977. The c/f for 1978 and 1979 remained high at 51.92 and 31.52 fish per net night, respectively. Differences between station 1 and station **3** may reflect thermal effects; i.e., relatively high c/f during 1977-1979 suggests that station **3** might serve as a refuge from the: thermal plume. However, c/f at station 4 **(TRM** 294), located in the discharge, was higher from 1977-1979 during springsummer than in 1975 and 1976 when the plant was not operating. The c/f ranged from 14.53 to 19.57 fish per net night during the 4-year operational period. Surprisingly, the control station (station **3, TRM** 299) showed greater variation in c/f than any other station. At no time was the control station subjected to the thermal plume. Variations in data from the control station corresponded more closely to those of rotenone standing stock estimates. Consistency of the c/f data observed at station 4 may be due to attraction to the discharge structure. Physical structures in aquatic habitats have long been known to attract fish, particularly game or sport species. Extensive fish attractor placement activities, presently ongoing in TVA, have this as their basis.

Gizzard shad was consistently the dominant taxon collected at stations outside the thermal plume zone (stations 2 and 3). From 1977 through 1979, channel catfish dominated the catch at station 1 during May 1 to September *30* (Figure 4.2-24).



**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

Figure *4.2-24.* Percent composition of two dominant taxa (gizzard shad and channel catfish) at gill net stations in the vicinity of **BFNP.**  Data are samples taken between May 1 (early) and September 30 (late) for each year. Station 1 = TRM 293 (right shoreline overbank) Station *2* = TRM *299* (right shoreline overbank) Station *3* = TRM *294* (left shoreline overbank) and Station 4 = TRM 294 (diffuser discharge)

During summer samples in 1975, 1976, and 1977, ictalurids  $(blue and channel catfish) were the dominant taxa collected.$ at station 4. In 1978 and 1979, gizzard shad were the dominant taxon at station *4* with catfish the second **most** abundant taxa. This apparent decrease was the result of an increase in nuhbers of gizzard shad, not a reduction in catfish abundance. Species occurrence in gill net samples may be found in previous quarterly and annual reports (TVA 1969-1979).

Gill net samples of sauger, walleye, and smallmouth bass are shown in Tables *4.2-19* and *4.2-20.* Gill nets are apparently effective for sauger but not smallmouth bass. Walleye are too rare to **be** encountered with any degree of' regularily.

Sauger catches from gill nets at the discharge station **show**  large numbers present in fall and winter; however, substantial numbers were present during spring and summer months (Table *4.2-20).* The c/f for sauger during summer at station *4* was higher than at station 1, with fall and winter c/f much higher at station *4* than station 1. Sauger are evidently attracted to this area (diffuser discharge), even in summer. This is probably due to attraction to the diffuser structure, concentration of prey species, and related turbulence of the water; however, it is clear that plant-induced temperature maximums have not caused this species to avoid even the mixing zone. ulence of<br>temperatu<br><u>even</u> the

**139** 

**II** 

**I** 

**B** 

**I** 

**1** 

**I** 

**1** 

**I** 

**I** 



Table 4.2-19. Summary of catch **(N)** and catch per unit of effort (c/f) for smallmouth bass, walleye, and sauger during preoperational and operational monitoring at Browns Ferry Nuclear Plant. Data are from gill net catches at station 1, **TRM** 293.



**Table** 4.2-19. **(Continued)** 

1 **SMB** = **smallmouth bass, Micropterus dolomieui** - **W** = **walleye, Stizostedion v. vitreum**  B = smallmouth bass, <u>Micropter</u><br>W = walleye, <u>Stizostedion v. v.</u><br>S = sauger, S. canadense th b.<br><u>Sti:</u><br><u>S. c.</u>

**2 Data not available** -

**Table** *4.2-20.* **Summary** of **catch (N) and catch per unit effort (c/f)** of **sauger by season at Browns Ferry Nuclear Plant. Data are from gill net catches at station** *4* **(diffuser discharge), TRM** *294, 1975-1979.* 



**\$:Data not available** 

Table 4.2-21 shows ten years of gill net data collected during spring and summer quarters (May 1-September 30). From 1970 to 1974, the presence of sauger at all stations was low. From 1975 to 1979, number and c/f of sauger increased progressively at all stations. Both the highest numbers and  $c/f$  for sauger were found at the diffuser station (station 4) during the 1977-1979 period.

Gill net catch was plotted against standing stock data for a test of bivariate correlation. The degree of correlation is a statistical measure of the relationship between variables. Figures 4.2-25 through 4.2-28 show gill net-standing stock correlations. A positive correlation was observed at all stations and increased gill net catches clearly reflected population changes observed in rotenone samples. Correlation coefficients ranged from 0.42 at the left overbank (station 3) to 0.71 at station 4; however, none were statistically significant at the 95-percent level of confidence. These correlations (gill net with cove rotenone) were positive as expected for the two sampling methodologies and, although not statistically significant, the two sampling methods are apparently a measure of the same attributes in the fish community; however, use of one to predict the other is unwarranted because of the lack of significance in a statistical sense.

Table *4.2-21.* Number **(N)** and catch per unit effort (c/f) of sauger, walleye, and smallmouth bass in gill nets at BFNP from *1970-1979* annual surveys. Only data from spring and summer quarters (May 1-September *30)*  are included.



 $+$ <br> $+$ **Station 1 = TRM 293** 

 $\mathbf{r}$ 

**t** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

= *TRM 299* 

 $3 = TRM 294$ 

zoTRM *294* (Diffuser)

fc%btairicd *90* F variance from **NRC** on .July *15, 1977;* **earlier gill** net **samples**  during 1977 were collected before obtaining the 90<sup>0</sup> F variance.



Figure 4.2-25. Correlation of gill net catches at Station 1 (TRM 293) with cove rotenone standing **stock estimates** (average of three coves) in **the** vicinity **of** RFNP **during** the years 1070-1978.







**Figure** 4.2-28. Correlation of gill **net** catches at Station 4 (diffuser discharge, **TRV** 294) **with cow** rotenone standing stock estimates **(avera:;e** of three coves) in the vicinity of BFYP during the years 1975-1978.

Analyses of data from the ten-year gill net monitoring program at **BFNP** indicate no adverse impacts to local fish populations owing to thermal enrichment during periods when either the  $86^{\circ}$  **F** (30.0<sup>°</sup> C) standard or 90<sup>°</sup> **F** (32.2<sup>°</sup> C) limit was in cffect. Species composition and **c/f** data from these gill net surveys for sample locations outside zones of greatest thermal influence showed little or no difference from stations in zones of maximum thermal influence. Attraction of sauger to the diffuser discharge was observed even **during** warmest water temperatures.

# *4.2.5.3* Trap Nets

Trap netting was initiated on Wheeler Reservoir in 19b9 as part **of the** preoperational fisheries investigations at BFNP. Trap net locations are shown in Figure 4.2-13. No trap net daLa **wcro** collected in **1973** and *1974.* **Trap** net sampling resumed in 1975 and has continued as part of the BFNP fisheries monitoring program. Data of catch per effort are shown in Figure *4.2-29.* 

An attempt was made to correlate these data with standing **stock**  rotenone estimates in concurrent years (Figures *4.2-30* through *4.2-32).*  Rotenone data were compared to each of three trap net stations. Stations **A** and B were located downstream from the plant and a control station (station C) was located 9.7 kilometers upstream from the plant. Correlation coefficients for stations A and **R** were *0.49* and *0.64,* respectively.



**Station C** = **TRM 284** 





Figure 4.2-31. Correlation of trap net catches at station B (TRM 293) with cove rotenone standing stock estimates (average of three coves) in the *vicinity of EFAP* during it 1970-1978.





Figure *4-2-32.* Correlation of trap net catches at Station C **(Tm** 299) to cove rotenone standing stock estimates (average of three coves) in the vicinity of BFNP during the years 1970-1978.

Positive correlation was observed as expected but neither value was statistically significant. Station C had a negative r value. Trap nets are extremely selective **arid** are riot well suited to general **stock** assessment. Additionally, high variability of BFNP trap net data precludes a valid assessment of fish populations in the vicinity of this plant.

## 4.2.5.4 Crcv **1 Census**

Wheeler Reservoir creel census surveys began in July 1970, *3s*  one segment of monitoring investigations at BFNP. Figure 4.2-33 shows the survey area. Bank and boat fishermen surveys were conducted at randomly chosen times during the census period. Counts of fishermen were used to derive estimates of fishing pressure (hours) for each census period. Quarterly and total fishing pressure for the 19,800 ha of Wheeler Reservoir surveyed is shown in Table 4.2-22. Fishing pressure **was** hi **gticst** during 1070-1973. **'Ilic.** mc.in number **01** hours for 1971-1073 was 449,446 hours. Data from 1970 included the summer and fall quarters only. In 1974, fishing pressure decreased to 178,234 estimated hours, more than a 50 percent reduction. In 1975, the spring fishing pressure increased greatly to bring the total for the year to 398,157 hours. In 1976, spring fishing pressure was the lowest recorded in eight years; consequently, a decrease in fishing pressure for the year was observed (169,904 hours). In 1977 and 1978, fishing pressure was 407,957 and 299,198 hours, respectively. Maximum effort occurred during spring (April-June) in every



Figure  $4.2-33$ . Location of the six creel survey areas on Wheeler Reservoir.



%- **Beginning of creel survey procedures as described by the Institute of Statistics, North Carolina State University, Raleigh, North Carolina.** 

**t Hours fished.** 

year except in 1972 when pressure was higher in winter (January-March).

White crappie was the most common species harvested **in** terms of number and biomass. For sauger, smallmouth bass, and walleye, estimated harvest showed only the smallmouth to be important in the census area (Table  $4.2-23$ ). Smallmouth bass and sauger harvest by area is shown in Tables 4.2-24 and 4.2-25. Only a single walleye was censused in the harvest, fall of 1970.

Smallmouth bass were collected every quarter surveyed from 1970-1979, except in the fall of 1973. Estimated numbers taken per quarter ranged from 85 to 6,424. From 1973 to 1979, smallmouth bass harvest from areas **1** and 2 was sporadic and numbers taken were relatively low except in fall of 1970.

Sauger harvest during this same period was sporadic. From 1970 to mid-1974, saugcr harvest was found during only **two**  quarters. From 1974 through 1977, numbers harvested ranged from 52 to *336* per quarter. During 1978 and 1979, sauger harvest was found only in one quarter (fall 1978) when **an**  estimated 414 sauger were harvested. This was consistent with cove rotenone estimates of trends in the sauger stock, but was the highest number recorded during the 10-year census. Sauger harvest was greatest at areas 4, 1, and 3. No sauger were harvested during the first eight months of 1979.

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 



**Table** 4.2-23. **Estimated smallmouth bass, sauger, and walleye sportfishing harvest, Wheeler Reservoir, July** 1970 **through July** 1979.



Table 4.2-24. Estimated smallmouth fishing harvest by area, Wheeler Reservoir, April 1973 through August 1979.

**--II-==m-m=rn-~m=~~~=** 

 $\breve{\circ}$ 



Table 4.2-25. Estimated sauger sportfishing harvest by area, Wheeler Reservoir, April 1973 through August 1979.

Creel census data show no effect of RFNP on the Wheeler Reservoir fishery. However, the data are sufficiently imprecise to preclude the possibility of detecting **subtle**  changes in stock densities.

## 4.2.6 Expected Hydrothermodynamic and Fish Interactions

**Rased** on the size of the mixing zone **and** the infrequent occurrence **of** temperatures that approach 90 **F** at the five-foot *0*  depth, no significant impact to the fish community, including sauger and smallmouth bass, in Wheeler Reservoir is expected. For example, in July when maximum temperatures are most likely to occur, mixed river temperatures will exceed 88<sup>0</sup> F only about **two** percent of the time in a small pelagic zone less than one percent of the volume of Wheeler Reservoir. Surface temperatures (0.5 ft) within this zone, or elsewhere in the reservoir, that occasionally exceed 90<sup>0</sup> F are not thought to cause any unnatural fish distributions. Fish species, such **as** shad, that inhabit the pelagic zone would readily tolerate these temperatures. Sauger would not be expected to occur in this zone, regardless of prevailing temperatures since they are bottom-dwelling. However, even the heated plume should have no significant impact on the distribution of this species as shown by the presence of sauger in the summer gill net catch in the immediate vicinity of the diffuser. Although smallmouth bass readily tolerate  $90^{\circ}$  F waters, this species normally inhabits the littoral zone or off-shore rocky shelves.

**I** 

**I** 

**Il** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

 $\vert$ 

**m** 

**I** 

#### Summary and Conclusions  $5.0$

The intent of thermal discharge limitations is the protection and propagation of balanced and indigenous populations of aquatic organisms in the receiving water body. According to protocol established by EPA, this is best accomplished by protecting the most temperature sensitive fish species judged important, desirable or both. For the Tennessee River drainage basin, sauger, smallmouth bass, and walleye were initially classified as coolwater species. Recent data show that smallmouth bass do not warrant this classification. Walleve are rare in Wheeler Reservoir and are of minimal concern. However, sauger are common and the potential for thermal impact to this species was investigated at length.

Extensive preoperational and operational monitoring investigations of adult fish stocks identified natural flucuations in fish stocks in the vicinity of BFNP. Data gathered prior to operation and during operation under both the 86°F standard and 90°F limit were similar. The attraction of some species, including sauger, to the discharge structure was observed during all seasons. Surface water temperatures in the zone of thermal influence occasionally exceed 90°F, a temperature which occurs naturally in both overbank and channel surface areas in summer months. Coolwater species could avoid these areas but cove rotenone data do not document such an avoidance. The presence of sauger and smallmouth bass in areas with surface temperatures that exceed 90°F naturally and sauger near the diffusers during all periods suggest that there were no adverse thermal effects for either the 86°F standard or 90°F limit.

Stizostedion spp. (probably sauger) were the only "coolwater" ichthyoplankton collected during the 9-year monitoring period. Temperature data gathered concurrently with larval samples showed that water temperatures. **did not exceed 71.6<sup>o</sup>F (22<sup>o</sup>C) during periods when Stizostedion larvae were** present in Wheeler Reservoir. As a consequence, they would be unaffected by a permanent **90°F** variance.

Clupeids and freshwater drum were the dominant ichthyoplankters collected when water temperatures were 86°F or greater. Densities of both taxa were at naturally low levels in these temperature regimes because these temperatures occur after peak spawning. Therefore only a minor portion of clupeids and freshwater drum larvae are subjected to entrainment in thermal plumes exceeding 86°F and no effects to either would be expected for a permanent **90°F** thermal limit.

Phytoplankton data revealed that slightly eutrophic conditions in Wheeler Reservoir during early and mid-1970's changed to eutrophic conditions during the Late 1970's. Available data for all years except 1979 indicate this was the result of factors not related to operation of BFNP since parallel changes occurred throughout the reservoir upstream and downstream of the plant. In 1979, a wetter and cooler year than average, there were indications of stimulation of phytoplankton at stations downstream of BFNP. If this was the case, there was no substantial difference in the phytoplankton community downstream of BFNP from that in 1977 when the 86°F standard was in effect.

**163** 

**II** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**1** 

**I** 

 $\mathbf{r}$ 

**I** 

**I** 

The zooplankton assemblage was diverse but changed from Cladocera to Rotifera domination immediately downstream of BFNP, especially during 1978 and 1979. Whereas Cladocera abundance also increased downstream of the. plant, a disproportionate increase in rotifer numbers resulted in Rotifera becoming dominant. Available data suggested that thermal enrichment may have increased reproductive success for rotifers in 1978 and 1979 when the **90°F** limit was in effect. However, if thermal enrichment was a factor, it appeared to only somewhat accentuate an ongoing trend or process unrelated to the presence of BFNP.

 $165 / 64$ 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**1** 

**I** 

Data for benthic macroinvertebrates tended to be variable. Because **known**  thermal tolerances for these organisms are higher than bottom temperatures measured in Wheeler Reservoir, population fluctuations were thought to reflect emergence of adults prior to sample collections and/or sample variability caused by contagious distribution patterns. Benthic macroinvertebrate data do not show that operation of Browns Ferry Nuclear Plant has affected maintenance of a balanced and indigenous benthic macroinvertebrate community during operation at either the 86°F standard or 90°F limit.

The proposed mixing zone for Browns Ferry Nuclear Plant is 1800 feet wide and extends 2200 feet downstream of the diffusers over the entire water depth. The mixing zone is often paritally stratified. Mixed temperatures greater than 90°F do not occur at the downstream edge of the mixing zone at the five foot depth for open mode cooling when ambient river temperatures are **less** than **85OF** or for helper mode cooling when ambient river temperatures are **less** than 88'F. A mixed temperature rise **in excess** of 5'b' will



**I** 

**II** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

not occur for most river flow conditions. If low or reverse river flows persist for sustained periods, re-entrainment of the diffuser plume may result. In this case, increased river flows or decreased plant heat discharge will prevent plume re-entrainment.

If the Browns Ferry Nuclear Plant is required to meet the 86<sup>o</sup>F maximum mixed-reservoir temperature, two round mechanical draft cooling towers would need to be constructed to lessen plant load reductions required during summer months. However, assuming a **90°F** thermal variance, tower additions can be avoided by increasing existing tower performance by about 6 percent. Adoption **of** a **90°F** thermal limit along with increased tower performance is the preferred option and has **a** cost advantage of **\$33** million over the next lowest option.

TVA, following extensive evaluation of data collected before and during the 90°F variance period, now believes that permanent relaxation of the 86°F thermal standard to a **90°F** limit would assure the protection and propagation of aquatic biota in Wheeler Reservoir. In addition, such a relaxation would avoid the necessity to either take large load reductions or install additional cooling towers at the plant. Environmental losses would not accrue for a **90°F** limit whereas economic advantages to **TVA** and its customers would **be** substantial.

### 6.0 References

- Almquist, C. W., C. D. Ungate, and W. R. Waldrop. 1978. Field and model results for multiport diffuser plume. Presented at the American Society of Civil Engineers Hydraulic Division Specialty Conference on Verification of Mathematical and Physical Models in Hydraulic Engineering, College Park, Maryland, August 9-11, 1978.
- Alston, D. E., J. M. Lawrence, D. R. Bayne, and F. F. Campbell. 1978. The effects of thermal enrichment on macroinvertebrate fauna in three artificial channels. Dept. of Fisheries and Allied Aquacultures, Agriculturial Expt. Sta., Auburn U., Auburn, AL.
- Barans, C. A. and R. A. Tubb. 1973. Temperatures selected seasonally by four fishes from western Lake Erie. Jour. Fish. Res. Bd. Canada  $30: 1967 - 1703.$
- Benda, R. S. and J. Gulvas. 1976. Effects of the Palisades Nuclear Power Plant on Lake Michigan. In: Thermal Ecology II, G. W. Esch and R. W. McFarlane (Eds.), pp. 243-250. Dept. of Energy Symposium Series (CONF-75025), National Tech. Information Ser., Springfield, VA.
- Benda, R. S. and M. A. Proffitt. 1974. Effects of thermal effluents on fish and invertebrates. In: Thermal Ecology, pp. 438-447, J. W. Gibbons and R. R. Sharitz (Eds.). AEC Symp. Ser. (NTIS-CONF-1730505).
- Bovbjerg, R. V. 1975. Dispersal and dispersion of pond snails in an experimental environment varying to three factors, singly and in combination. Physiol. Zool. 48: 203.
- Brungs, W. A. and B. R. Jones. 1977. Temperature criteria for freshwater fish: protocol and procedures. United States Environmental Protecion Agency, Duluth, MN. EPA-600/3-77-061. 130 pp.

- Buchanan, J. P., B. B. Carroll, B. G. Grinstead, G. E. Hall, W. A. Hubert, F. H. Taylor, C. W. Voigtlander, and M. C. Warner. 1978. Browns Ferry Nuclear Plant Preoperational Fisheries Resources Report. Tennessee Valley Authority, Norris, Tennessee: Division of Forestry, Fisheries, and Wildlife Development, Fisheries and Waterfowl Resources Branch. Buchanan, J. P. and W. C. Barr. 1980. Fish Entrainment and Impingement
- at Browns Ferry Nuclear Plant in 1978 and 1979. Supplement to: Effect of the Browns Ferry Cooling Water Intake on the Fish Populations of Wheeler Reservoir. Volume 4: Biological Effects of Intake, Browns Ferry Nuclear Plant. Norris, Tennessee: Division of Water Resources, Fisheries and Aquatic Ecology Branch.
- Bush, R. M., E. B. Welch, and B. W. Mar. 1974. Potential effects of thermal discharges on aquatic systems. Envir. Sci. Technol.  $8(6)$ :  $561 - 568$ .
- Cairns, J., Jr. 1956. Effects of increased temperature on aquatic organisms. Indus. Wastes.  $1(4)$ : 150-152.
- Carlson, D. M. 1974. Responses of planktonic cladocerans to heated waters. In: Thermal Ecology, J. W. Gibbons and R. R. Sharitz (Eds.)., pp. 186-206. Dept. of Energy Symp. Series (CONF-730505), National Tech. Inform. Services, Springfield, VA.
- Durrett, C. W. and W. D. Pearson. 1975. Drift of macroinvertebrates in a channel carrying heated water from a power plant. Hydrobiologia  $46(1): 33-43.$
- Dycus, D. L. and C. D. Ungate. 1979. Influence of Plankton Distribution in Wheeler Reservoir on Plankton Entrainment by Browns Ferry Nuclear Plant. TVA Report WR50-10-8001, 66 pp. September 1979.
- Hokanson, K. E. F. 1977. Temperature requirements of some percids and adaptations to the seasonal temperature cycle. Jour. Fish. Res. Bd. Canada 34: 1524-1550.

Hokanson, K. E. F. 1979. Method alters walleye thermal response. Jan.-Mar. 1979. Qtr. Report. EPA Environ. Res. Lab.-Duluth.

- Horning, W. B. and R. E. Pearson. 1973. Growth temperature requirements and lower lethal temperatures for juvenile smallmouth **bass.**  Fish. Res. Bd. Canada 30(8): 1226-1230. Jour.
- **Jirka,** G., and D. R. F. Harleman. 1973. Mechanics of Suhmerged Hultiport Diffuser for Buoyant Discharges in Shallow Water. Massachusetts Institute of Technology, Ralph M. Parsons Laboratory. Report No. 169, March 1973.
- Johnson, B. E., and B. J. Clift. 1974. Browns Ferry Nuclear Plant, Water Temperature Surveys. TVA Division of Water Control Planning, Engineering Laboratory, Report No. 63-49, October 1974.
- Kendall, R. I,. (Ed.). 1978. **A** symposium on selected coolwater fishes of North America. Special Publ. No. 11, Amer. Fish. *SOC.,* Wash. D.C., 437 pp.
- Miller, M. C., G. *H.* Hater, T. W. Federle, and .J. P. Reed. 1976. Effects of power-plant operation on the biota of a thermal discharge channel. In: Thermal Ecology II, G. W. Esch and R. W. McFarlane (Eds.)., pp. 251-258. Dept. of Energy Symp. Ser. (CONF-750425), NTIS, Springfield, VA .
- Mount, D. I. 1969. Development of thermal requirements for freshwater fishes. In: Biological Aspects of Thermal Pollution. P. A. Krenkel and F. L. Parker (Eds.). Vanderbilt University Press, Nashville, Tennessee.
- Patrick, R. 1974. Effects of abnormal temperatures on algal communities, In: Thermal Ecology, J. E. Gibbons and R. R. Shartz (Eds.). pp. 335-349. USAEC Technical Information Center, Oak Ridge, TN.

**I <sup>168</sup>**

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**t** 

**I** 

**II** 

- Reid, G. K. 1961. Ecology of Inland Waters and Estuaries. Van Nostrand Reinhold Co., New York, New York. 375 pp.
- Reynolds, W. W. and M. E. Casterlin. 1976. Thermal preferenda and behavioral thermoregulation in three centrarchid fishes. In: Thermal Ecology II: G. W. Esch and R. W. McFarlene (Eds.). pp. 185-190. Department of Energy Symposium Series (CONF-75025), National Technical Information Service, Springfield, VA.
- Rodgers, E. B. (In press). Effects of elevated temperatures on macroinvertebrate populations in the Browns Ferry Experimental In: Microcosms in Ecological Research. J. P. Giesy Ecosystems. (Ed.). DOE Symp. Ser. (CONF-781101), NTIS, Springfield, VA.
- Stauffer, J. R., Jr., K. L. Dickson, J. Cairns, Jr., and D. S. Cherry. 1976. The potential and realized influences of temperature on the distribution of fishes in the New River, Glen Lyn, VA. Wildlife Monographs, Number 50. 40 pp.
- Taylor, M. P., J. R. Mullins, D. L. Meinert, R. W. Schneider, and R. B. Ferguson. 1979. Water Quality and Biological Conditions in Wheeler Reservoir During Operation of Browns Ferry Nuclear Plant, January 1, 1978-December 31, 1978. Tennessee Valley Authority. Muscle Shoals, Alabama: Division of Water Resources, Water Quality and Ecology Branch.
- Taylor, M. P. and D. L. Dycus. 1980. Viability of Plankton Entrained by Browns Ferry Nuclear Plant. TVA Report WR-42-1-01, 30 pp. March 1980.
- Tennessee Valley Authority. 1972. Final Environmental Statement Browns Ferry Nuclear Plant, Units 1, 2, and 3. TVA-OHES-EIS-72-6 Office of Health and Environmental Science, Chattanooga, Tennessee. September 1, 1972.

1974A. Water Quality and Biological Conditions in Wheeler Reservoir During Operation of Browns Ferry Nuclear Plant (Unit 1), August 17, 1973-February 17, 1974. Chattanooga, Tennessee: Division of Environmental Planning, Water Quality Branch.

1974B. Water Quality and Biological Conditions in Wheeler Reservoir During Operation of Browns Ferry Nuclear Plant (Unit 1), February 18, 1974-June 30, 1974. Chattanooga, Tennessee: Division of Environmental Planning, Water Quality Branch.

1975A. Water Quality and Biological Conditions in Wheeler Reservoir During Operation of Browns Ferry Nuclear Plant (Unit 1 and 2), July 1, 1974-December 31, 1974. Chattanooga, Tennessee: Division of Evironmental Planning, Water Quality Branch.

1975B. Water Quality and Biological Conditions in Wheeler Reservoir During Operation of Browns Ferry Nuclear Plant (Units 1 and 2), January 1, 1975-June 30, 1975. Chattanooga, Tennessee: Division of Environmental Planning, Water Quality Branch.

1976. Water Quality and Biological Conditions in Wheeler Reservoir During Operation of Browns Ferry Nuclear Plant (Units 1 and 2), July 1, 1975-December 31, 1975. Chattanooga, Tennessee: Division of Environmental Planning, Water Quality Branch.

1977A. Water Quality and Biological Conditions in Wheeler Reservoir During Operation of Browns Ferry Nuclear Plant, January 1, 1976-December 31, 1976. Chattanooga, Tennessee: Division of Environmental Planning, Water Quality Branch.

1977B. 316(a) and 316(B) Demonstration, Cumberland Steam Plant. Volume 3: Response of Biological Communities of Barkley Reservoir to Thermal Effluents from Cumberland Steam Plant. Chattanooga, Tennessee: Division of Environmental Planning, Water Quality and Ecology Branch. March 1977.

1978A. Water Quality and Biological Conditions in Wheeler Reservoir During Operation of Browns Ferry Nuclear Plant, January 1, 1977-December 31, 1977. Chattanooga, Tennessec: Division of Environmental Planning, Water Quality Branch.

1978B. Biological Effects of Intake, Browns Ferry Nuclear Plant. Volume 4: Effect of the Browns Ferry Cooling Water Intake on the Fish Populations of Wheeler Reservoir. Norris, Tennessee: Division of Forestry, Fisheries, and Wildlife Development, Fisheries and Waterfowl Resources Branch.

(In Preparation) Proposed Development and Use of Mallard-Fox Creek Area in North Alabama Environmental Impact Statement.

- Tennessen, K. J. and J. L. Miller. 1978. Effects of Thermal Discharges on Aquatic Insects in the Tennessee Valley. EPA-600/7-78-128. TVA/EP-78/09. 44 pp.
- Tennessen, K. J. and J. L. Miller. 1979. Response of H. bilineata Say to thermal enrichment from electric generating stations in the Tennessee Valley. TVA Internal Report. WR-50-27-01.
- Teppen, T. C. and J. R. Gammon. 1976. Distribution and abundance of fish populations in the middle Wabash River. In: **Thermal** Ecology II, G. W. Esch and R. W. McFarlane (Eds.), pp. 273-283. Dept. of Energy Symp. Ser. (CONF-750425), National Tech. Information Ser., Springfield, VA.
- Trembly, F. J. 1960. Research project on effects of condenser discharge water on aquatic life. Progress Report, 1956-1959. The Institute of Research, Lehigh University, 154 pp.
- Ungate, C. D. 1978. Assessment of Water Temperature Monitoring at Browns Ferry Nuclear Plant. Report No. WM28-1-67-101. TVA Division of Water Management, Water Systems Development Branch, August 1978.
- Urban, **R.** D., J. M. Higgins, and R. H. Brooks, 1979. Longrun and shortrun environmental effects of operating the TVA reservoir system. In: Proceedings: lnternational Symposium on Environmental Effects of Hydralic Engineering Works. pp. **370-382,** Knoxville, Tennessee. September **12-14,** 1978.
- Wetzel, R. G. 1975. Limnology. W. B. Saunders Co., Philiadelphia, **PA.** 743 pp.
- Wrenn, W. B. (In press). Effects of elevated temperature on growth and survival of smallmouth bass. Trans. Amer. Fish. Soc.
- Wrenn, W. **B.** 1975. Seasonal occurrence and diversity of fish in a heated discharge channel, Tennessee River. Proc. of the Southeastern Assoc. of Game and Fish Comm. 29: 235-247.
- Wrenn, W. B. 1976. Temperature preference and movement of fish in , W. B. 1976. Temperature preference and movement of fish in<br>relation to a long heated discharge channel. <u>In</u>: Thermal Ecology II, G. W. Esch and R. W. McFarlane (Eds.), pp. 191-194. Dept. of Energy Symp. Ser. (CONF-75025), National Tech. Information Ser., Springfield, **VA** .
- Wrenn, W. **B. and** T. **D.** Forsythe. 1978. Effects of temperature on production and yield of juvenile walleyes in experimental ecosystems. Amer. Fish. Soc. Special Publ. 11: 66-73.
- Wrenn, W. **B., B.** J. Armitage, E. B. Rodgers, T. D. Forsythe, and K. L. Grannemann. 1979. Browns Ferry Biothermal Research Series 11. Effects of temperature on bluegill and walleye, and periphyton, macroinvertebrate, and zooplankton communities in experimental ecosystems. United States Environmental Protection Agency, Duluth, MN. EPA-600/3-79-092. 172 pp.
- Wurtz, C. B. 196a. The effects of heat discharges on aquatic life and water use. **ASME** paper 61-WH-142, 8 pp.

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**I** 

**1** 

**I** 

**1** 

**Yoder, C. 0. and J. R. Gammon. 1976. Seasonal distribution and abundance of Ohio River fishes at the** J. **M. Stuart Electric Generating Station.**  In: Thermal Ecology II, G. W. Esch and R. W. McFarlane (Eds.), pp. *284-295.* **Dept. fo Energy Symp. Series (CONF-75025), Nat ionaI** 'Tech. **lnformatipn Ser., Springficld, VA.** 

.