



UNITED STATES NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION

Package Performance Study: Developments Since PATRAM 13

Bret Tegeler^a
Amy Snyder^a
Robert Lewis^a
Ken Sorenson^b

^a U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission, Washington D.C. USA

^b Sandia National Laboratories, Albuquerque, NM USA

September, 2004



UNITED STATES NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION

BRIEFING OUTLINE

- Briefing Objective
- PPS Evolution
- Commission Direction and Current Staff Proposal
- Current Schedule



UNITED STATES NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION

BRIEFING OBJECTIVE

- Describe USNRC current and planned activities associated with the Package Performance Study (PPS)



UNITED STATES NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION

Goal of PPS Program

- Demonstrate the inherent robustness of full-scale spent nuclear fuel transportation casks by conducting confirmatory research using an enhanced public participation process



UNITED STATES NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION

PPS EVOLUTION

- PPS Test Protocols Report, NUREG-1768, Feb 2003
- 90 Day Public Comment Period ended 30 May 2003
 - Four Dominant Themes
 - Full scale testing to regulatory limits
 - Conduct a realistic demonstration test based on realistic accident scenarios
 - Test cask to failure
 - Terrorism



UNITED STATES NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION

PPS EVOLUTION (cont'd)

- Staff developed five test concepts that were consistent with public comments:
 - Extra Regulatory
 - Impact and fire test for a full-scale rail and truck cask
 - Regulatory Rail Test
 - 10 CFR Part 71
 - Regulatory Truck Test
 - Demonstration Rail Test
 - Full-scale rail cask on its conveyance under realistic accident conditions (i.e., railcar collision with a bridge abutment)
 - Demonstration Truck Test
 - Full-scale truck cask on its conveyance under realistic accident conditions (i.e., grade crossing collision)



UNITED STATES NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION

Commission Direction

- Commission approved the testing of a full-scale, NRC certified rail transportation cask, May 2004
 - Authorized staff to purchase a single NRC certified rail cask
 - Realistically conservative test
 - Sufficient instrumentation to collect data for validating analytical methods, including scaling
 - Fully engulfing fire



UNITED STATES NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION

DEMONSTRATION TEST PLAN DEVELOPMENT

- What Can the PPS Demonstration Accomplish?
 - Provide a realistically conservative test of a rail transportation cask
 - Demonstrate the robustness of a rail transportation cask
 - Provide sufficient instrumentation for analytical comparison
 - Demonstrate the ability of analytical methods to predict cask response in complex accident scenarios



UNITED STATES NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION

DEMONSTRATION TEST PLAN DEVELOPMENT

- Staff developed a proposal for Commission approval
- Scenario Development
 - Cask transportation accidents are low probability events
 - 8 accidents involving transportation of casks, 1.6 M miles, no releases (2002)
 - 4 truck accidents, 4 train accidents
 - Over 1300 spent fuel shipments in NRC certified packages have taken place in the last 20 years
 - Department of Transportation (DOT) Volpe Center data (1988-1995)
 - Provides a relative ranking of rail accident scenarios
 - Highest conditional probabilities are train derailments resulting in impacts or collisions with soil, roadbeds, rock, structures, railcars, or locomotives



UNITED STATES NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION

DEMONSTRATION TEST PLAN DEVELOPMENT

- Staff considered hypothetical cask and railcar accident derailment scenarios:
 - Cask and railcar impact with a rock outcrop
 - Cask and railcar impact with a tunnel entrance
 - Cask and railcar impact with a bridge abutment
 - Collision of a locomotive and a cask (attached to a railcar)



UNITED STATES NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION

DEMONSTRATION TEST PLAN DEVELOPMENT

– Evaluation of scenarios

- Impacts with soil are not likely to represent a conservative challenge (i.e., impart significant energy to the cask)
- Impacts with hard rock outcrops judged low probability
- Impacts with bridge abutments and tunnel entrances are not likely to represent a conservative challenge to the cask
- A collision with a locomotive has the potential for a realistically conservative challenge to the cask



UNITED STATES NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION

NRC STAFF PROPOSED TEST PLAN

- Scenario based on an actual rail accident event (Effingham, IL, 1995)
 - Resulted in a derailment of a railcar and subsequent impact by a locomotive
- Test Plan
 - Affix a certified transportation rail cask to a railcar
 - Fully instrument cask, locomotive, and railcar with accelerometers, strain gauges, thermocouples, and displacement transducers for comparison with analysis
 - Impact rail cask and railcar combination with a locomotive
 - Speed and orientation will be determined after further staff assessment
 - Post-impact inspection



UNITED STATES NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION

NRC STAFF PROPOSED TEST PLAN

- Subsequent Fire Test
 - Staff recommends the test be a fully-engulfing, optically dense hydrocarbon fire of a 30-minute duration as specified in Title 10, Section 71.73, of the Code of Federal Regulations (10 CFR 71.73)
 - Constitutes a conservative fire test with well-controlled conditions
- Extensive pre and post-test analysis will be conducted
 - Initial assessment of the instrumentation package and ranges of parameters will be provided to the Commission six months after Commission approval
 - Staff to develop a collaborative analysis efforts with domestic and international stakeholders



UNITED STATES NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION

TEST PLAN CHALLENGES

- Realism
 - NRC staff believe that a fully-engulfing fire may not be realistic based on observations from accidents
 - Staff has considered options such as a tanker car fire to improve the realism of the fire test
- The ability to validate scaling methodology
 - For engineering analysis, validation involves the comparison of analysis results with well-defined experiments
- Uncertainties
 - Nonlinear nature of collision (i.e., yielding impact surface)
 - Analysis predictions (railcar behavior, cask tie-downs, friction)



UNITED STATES NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION

Concluding Remarks

- Cask certification process provides protection of public health and safety
- NRC staff has developed a test plan for Commission approval
- NRC staff will keep the Public informed of progress



UNITED STATES NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION

QUESTIONS/DISCUSSION