

September 9, 2004

STAKEHOLDERS: Nuclear Energy Institute, Industry Representatives,  
and Members of the Public

SUBJECT: SUMMARY OF THE JULY 26, 2004, CATEGORY 2 MEETING WITH  
NUCLEAR ENERGY INSTITUTE (NEI) ON METHODS FOR  
DETERMINING TRIP SETPOINTS AND ALLOWABLE VALUES FOR  
SAFETY-RELATED INSTRUMENTATION

On July 26, 2004, the U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission (NRC) staff held a Category 2 meeting with representatives of the Nuclear Energy Institute (NEI) and the industry in a public meeting at NRC Headquarters in Rockville, Maryland. The attendance list is attached.

The purpose of the meeting was to have the NRC staff make a presentation regarding its concerns about licensees' use of ISA-S67.04-1994, "Setpoints for Nuclear Safety-Related Instrumentation," Part II, Method 3, in the determination of trip setpoints (TSPs) and allowable values (AVs). This same presentation was previously given at a meeting between the NRC staff and NEI on June 23, 2004. The presentation highlighted specific details about a problem statement that was transmitted to NEI in a letter dated June 17, 2004. The NRC problem statement and NRC staff's presentation slides from the June 23, 2004, public meeting can be found in the Agencywide Documents Access and Management System (ADAMS) at Accession No. ML042370830. The ADAMS Accession No. contains links to documents related to the July 26, 2004, public meeting.

Following the NRC staff's presentation, the participants joined in a general discussion of the underlying technical issues. NEI presented the NRC staff with a handout that summarized NEI's concerns regarding the June 17, 2004, problem statement. NEI's handout can also be found at ADAMS Accession No. ML042370830. In summary, NEI indicated disagreement with the technical basis for the NRC's presentation and disagreement with the manner in which the NRC staff is addressing the issue. NEI representatives also offered to share historical documents that support their contention that Method 3 is an acceptable methodology for determining safety-related setpoints and AVs.

At the conclusion of the meeting, NEI stated that they intend to issue a white paper that fully describes the concerns they have with the NRC staff position on the use of Method 3. No schedule was discussed as to when the white paper would be available.

The NRC staff agreed to review and consider the information contained in NEI's handout as long-term actions to resolve this issue are formulated, but did not indicate concurrence with or acceptance of the technical points therein. The NRC staff also agreed to take NEI's procedural concerns into consideration in formulating future actions on this issue.

Based on a question from the public, the NRC staff reiterated that licensing actions involving instrument setpoint changes based on Method 3 were still being actively worked, but that

technical specification changes concerning instrument setpoints will be individually reviewed for concerns related to this issue until a long-term resolution can be implemented. The NRC staff reiterated its concern that AVs computed using Method 3 may not provide adequate assurance that the plant will be operating within the parameters assumed in the safety analyses.

Members of the public were in attendance. One Public Meeting Feedback Form was received. The commentor stated that security officials were not aware of a last-minute room change for the meeting. As a result, there was confusion about where the meeting was being held. This comment was forwarded to the Office of Nuclear Reactor Regulation's Senior Communications Analyst who will forward it to the Office of the Executive Director for Operations for action, as appropriate.

Please direct any questions to Christopher Gratton at 301-415-1055, or [cxg1@nrc.gov](mailto:cxg1@nrc.gov).

Project No. 689

Attachment: As stated

cc: w/att:

Mr. J. Humphreys  
State of New Jersey  
Bureau of Nuclear Engineering  
P.O. Box 415  
Trenton, NJ 08625-0415

technical specification changes concerning instrument setpoints will be individually reviewed for concerns related to this issue until a long-term resolution can be implemented. The NRC staff reiterated its concern that AVs computed using Method 3 may not provide adequate assurance that the plant will be operating within the parameters assumed in the safety analyses.

Members of the public were in attendance. One Public Meeting Feedback Form was received. The commentor stated that security officials were not aware of a last-minute room change for the meeting. As a result, there was confusion about where the meeting was being held. This comment was forwarded to the Office of Nuclear Reactor Regulation's Senior Communications Analyst who will forward it to the Office of the Executive Director for Operations for action, as appropriate.

Please direct any questions to Christopher Gratton at 301-415-1055, or cxg1@nrc.gov.

Project No. 689

Attachment: As stated

cc w/att:

Mr. J. Humphreys  
State of New Jersey  
Bureau of Nuclear Engineering  
P.O. Box 415  
Trenton, NJ 08625-0415

**DISTRIBUTION:**

PUBLIC	RidsOgcRp
PDII-1 R/F	RidsNrrOd (WBorchardt)
RidsNrrAdpt (BSheron)	RidsNrrDlpm (LMarsh/JLyons)
RidsNrrDlpmLpdii (EHackett)	RidsAcrcAcnwMailCenter
RidsNrrDlpmLpdii-1 (MRoss-Lee)	RidsNrrDrip (DMatthews)
RidsNrrDe (RBarrett/CGrimes)	RidsNrrDeDpr
RidsNrrPMCGratton	RidsNrrPMSMonarque
EMarinos	HGarg
PREbstock	SAggarwal
FBurrows	CDoutt

Package Number: ML042370830  
Meeting Notice Number: ML041940007  
NEI Handout Number: ML042150386  
NRC Slides: ML041810346  
Meeting Summary Number: ML042370785

NRC-100

OFFICE	PDII-1/PM	DE/EEIB/SC	PDII-1/SC(A)
NAME	CGratton	EMarinos	MJRoss-Lee
DATE	09/01/04	9/07/04	9/09/04

**OFFICIAL RECORD COPY**

## ATTENDANCE SHEET

July 26, 2004

Meeting

SUBJECT: METHODS FOR THE DETERMINING TRIP SETPOINTS AND ALLOWABLE  
VALUES FOR SAFETY-RELATED INSTRUMENTATION

<u>NAME</u>	<u>ORGANIZATION</u>
Christopher Gratton	NRR/DLPM
Jim Andrachek	Westinghouse
Jack Stringfellow	Southern Nuclear Operating Company
Tom Harding	Constellation
Peter Kokolakis	Entergy
Guatam Sen	Ballard Spahr Andrews and Ingersoll
Mark Flaherty	Constellation
Cornelius Holden	NRR/DLPM
Roy Mathew	NRR/DIPM
Brian Rogers	Nuclear Management Company
Jim Nagell	Nuclear Management Company
Bob Fredrickson	Exelon Nuclear
Tom Hokemeyer	Progress Energy
Stephanie Coffin	NRR/DLPM
Patricia Campbell	Winston and Strawn
Michael Eidson	Southern Nuclear Operating Company
James Nestell	MPR Associates
Carl Schulten	NRR/DIPM
Clitt Doult	NRR/DSSA
Robert Clark	NRR/DLPM
Stephen Dolley	McGraw Hill
Don Woodlan	Stars
Hukam Garg	NRR/DE
Angelo Marinos	NRR/DE
Donald Hoffman	TSTF/SMTF
Steve Weldon	AREVA/Framatome-ANP
Phil Rush	MPR Associates
Altheia Wyche	Serch Licensing/ Bechtel
Mike Schoppman	Nuclear Energy Institute
Ed Hackett	NRR/DLPM
Rick Tuley	Westinghouse
William Sotos	STP Nuclear Operating Company
Jerry Voss	Excell Services/ISA
Richard Barrett	NRR/DE
William Borchardt	NRR
Paul Rebstock	NRR/DE
Deann Raleigh (via telecon)	LIS, Scientech

ATTACHMENT