

November 21, 2003

Dr. Mario V. Bonaca, Chairman  
Advisory Committee on Reactor Safeguards  
U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission  
Washington, DC 20555

SUBJECT: PROPOSED RECOMMENDATIONS FOR GENERIC ISSUE (GI) - 186,  
"POTENTIAL RISK AND CONSEQUENCES OF HEAVY LOAD DROPS IN  
NUCLEAR POWER PLANTS"

Dear Dr. Bonaca:

Thank you for your September 24, 2003, letter and comments on our technical analysis of GI-186. The ACRS concurred with the staff's conclusion that regulatory action is warranted to reduce the number and potential severity of load drop events, and that while these events do not pose a high nuclear plant safety risk, they do raise significant concerns regarding worker safety. The ACRS also concurred with the recommendations developed by the staff to:

- (1) evaluate the capability of rigging components and materials to withstand rigging errors,
- (2) endorse the American Society of Mechanical Engineers (ASME) NOG-1, "Rules for Construction of Overhead and Gantry Cranes (Top Running Bridge, Multiple Girder)" for Type 1 cranes as an acceptable method of qualifying new or upgraded cranes as single-failure-proof,
- (3) reemphasize the need to follow NUREG-0612 "Control of Heavy Loads at Nuclear Power Plants" Phase 1 guidelines involving good practices for crane operations and load movements, and to continue to assess implementation of heavy load controls in safety-significant applications through the Reactor Oversight Process,
- (4) evaluate the need to establish standardized calculation methodologies for heavy load drops.

As the ACRS noted, the evaluation of operating experience indicates that operating events during heavy load movements do not pose a high nuclear plant safety risk. Therefore, new requirements on a generic basis could not be justified as a cost beneficial safety enhancement nor as actions necessary for adequate protection.

Nevertheless, enhancements to existing NRC guidance, as indicated by the recommendations, would address many of the issues identified by the survey of operating experience. The Office of Nuclear Reactor Regulation will respond to recommendations 1 through 3, while the Office of Nuclear Regulatory Research will respond to recommendation 4. After appropriate actions

Dr. Bonaca

2

have been identified, we will keep the ACRS informed of enhancements to NRC guidance documents and decisions in response to the above recommendations.

Sincerely,

***/RA W. F. Kane for/***

William D. Travers  
Executive Director  
for Operations

cc: Chairman Diaz  
Commissioner McGaffigan  
Commissioner Merrifield  
SECY

Dr. Bonaca

2

have been identified, we will keep the ACRS informed of enhancements to NRC guidance documents and decisions in response to the above recommendations.

Sincerely,

**/RA W. F. Kane for/**

William D. Travers  
Executive Director  
for Operations

cc: Chairman Diaz  
Commissioner McGaffigan  
Commissioner Merrifield  
SECY

Distribution:

REAHFB R/F	WTravers, EDO	JDyer, NRR	KCyr, OGC
DSARE R/F	WKane, DEDHP	BSheron, NRR	SBurns, OGC
PNorian, RES	SCollins, DEDR	SBlack, NRR	RSavio, ACRS
MMayfield, RES	PNorry, DEDMS	ISchoenfeld, OEDO	WDean, AO
CPaperiello, DEDMRS			
OEDO G20030579	TClark (RES-2003210)		

**Package: ML033220572**

\*See Previous Concurrence:

C:\ORPCheckout\FileNET\ML033170083.wpd

OAR in ADAMS? (Y or N) Y ADAMS ACCESSION NO.: ML033170083 TEMPLATE NO. EDO-002  
Publicly Available? (Y or N) Y DATE OF RELEASE TO PUBLIC \_\_\_\_\_ SENSITIVE? NO

To receive a copy of this document, indicate in the box: "C" = Copy without enclosures "E" = Copy with enclosures "N" = No copy

OFFICE	REAHFB	REAHFB	C:REAHFB	NRR/DSSA	D:DSARE	D:RES	EDO
NAME	RLloyd:dfw	HVandermolen	JFlack	SBlack	FEltawila	AThadani	WFKane for WDTTravers
DATE	10/14/03*	10/14/03*	10/15/03*	10/28/03*	10/29/03*	11/12/03*	11/21/03

