UNITED STATES
NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20555-0001

March 27, 1997

Dr. Paul W. Pomeroy, Chairman
Advisory Committee on Nuclear Waste
U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission
Washington, DC 20555

Dear Dr. Pomeroy:

I am responding to your letter of February 13, 1997, to the Chairman on Flow and Radionuclide Transport at Yucca Mountain (YM). In that letter, the Advisory Committee on Nuclear Waste (the Committee) provided recommendations and suggestions on that portion of the U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission's High-Level Waste (HLW) Program designed to address issues relating to the hydrogeological characteristics, at YM, capable of mitigating the release of radionuclides to the biosphere. In your letter, it is noted that the Committee considers the evaluation of NRC Key Technical Issues (KTIs) dealing with flow and radionuclide transport at YM a high-priority part of the HLW Program. The NRC staff agrees with the Committee on the importance of evaluating flow and radionuclide transport at YM.

However, as the Committee is aware, both NRC and the U.S. Department of Energy (DOE) have had to adjust their respective programs in response to reductions in budget. In adjusting the programs, work in certain areas, recognized as important, was significantly reduced. As part of NRC's adjustment process, for FY97, work on the KTI on "Radionuclide Transport" was stopped at the Center for Nuclear Waste Regulatory Analyses (CNWRA), with the main effect being the suspension of laboratory work on radionuclide sorption. However, critical CNWRA expertise is being sustained through work for others. With respect to staff activities, some activities formerly conducted in the "Radionuclide Transport" KTI now are being addressed under other KTIs. For example, the importance of sorption processes is being evaluated as part of "Performance Assessment" (PA) studies and the retention of radionuclides is also being addressed in the "Evolution of the Near-Field Environment" KTI. The staff intends to reassess the KTI prioritization each year. Those KTIs that were reduced in scope may be reactivated, given adequate resources, if we find, on our reviews of DOE's work and our own sensitivity studies, that new efforts are required in those areas.

As recommended by the Committee, staff will continue to examine available information from DOE to ensure that the abstractions from detailed models to the total system performance assessment (TSPA) models are valid and transparent and that the details of the individual models are clear. Currently, the staff is involved in reviewing synthesis reports as they are made available, including those that consider radionuclide sorption and retardation, near-field environment, and mineralogy/petrology. Further, we are attending the abstraction workshops DOE is having on this and other topics. For example, staff recently returned from the DOE abstraction workshop on nearfield environment held in Las Vegas, Nevada.

1/1
NH16
WM-11

We understand that DOE is not now developing a comprehensive geochemistry model for the site for analyzing transport processes. Instead it is performing sensitivity studies to determine the effects of some coupled processes on site performance. The Committee's recommendation on this topic, that the CNWRA continue its development of coupled chemical and hydrologic transport models to determine whether coupled processes are important to demonstrating compliance with a risk- (or dose-) based standard, is consistent with the staff views. In the "Evolution of the Near-field Environment" KTI, the coupled processes code, MULTIFLO, has been developed by the CNWRA to simulate conditions and processes in a non-isothermal porous medium of variable saturation. Work continues on exercising this code, and the effects of "foreign" materials (such as concrete and steel) on the performance of the repository are currently being evaluated.

The Committee noted the HLW-related work carried out at the University of Arizona (UA). Through the years, the UA efforts have resulted in the development of state-of-the-art methodologies for characterizing and modeling processes and conditions relating to the hydrology of unsaturated fractured rock. However, because of budget constraints, the staff finds it necessary to end work at the Apache Leap site at the end of May 1997. Consequently, NRC cannot implement the Committee's recommendation that NRC use the Apache Leap Research Site as a location for field tests involving colloid transport in fractured unsaturated medium. Moreover, it is uncertain whether the logistics of the Apache Leap Research Site are amenable to long-term testing for colloid transport. Nevertheless, the staff shares the Committee's concern that colloid transport in the unsaturated zone could be important to repository performance. Therefore, we intend to closely follow DOE's approach to colloids in TSPA abstraction workshops and will assess their importance as part of our own PA sensitivity studies.

The staff appreciates the ACNW's concern regarding radionuclide transport. As we continue our reviews and sensitivity studies related to total system performance at YM, we will keep the Committee informed on the status of work performed under the various KTIs and any redirection of staff effort that results from these activities. The current program is based on an annual budget of $14 million; further reduction in its budget would result in a reexamination of our approach to the program.

Sincerely,

Original Signed by

L. Joseph Callan L. J. Callan
Executive Director
for Operations

cc: Chairman Jackson
Commissioner Diaz
Commissioner Rogers
Commissioner McGaffigan
Commissioner Dicus
SECY

DISTRIBUTION: G970103

Central File	NMSS r/f	JThoma	PAHL r/f	EDO r/f	JHolonich	MBell	PSobel	DWM r/f/tf	NMSS Dir. r/f	JHickey
RNelson	HLThompson	CPoland	PUBLIC	DMorrison	EJordan	RBangart	KCyr	PTressler	CNWRA	JMitchell
ACNW	LJCallan	FMiraglia	FRoss							

* See previous concurrence CP/PROOFED/MARCH 11, 1997 s:\dwm\pahl\kim\acnw4

OFC	PAHL*		PAHL*		ENGB*		ENGB*		PMDA*	
NAME	KMcConnell/wd		TMcCartin		JBradbury		DBrooks		EKraus	
DATE	3/6/97		3/6/97		3/6/97		3/6/97		3/6/97	

OFC	PAHL*		DWM*		NMSS*		DEDR		EDO	
NAME	JAustin		MVFederline		CJPaperiello		HLThompson		LJCallan	
DATE	3/6/97		3/11/97		3/17/97		3/21/97		3/27/97	

We understand that DOE is not now developing a comprehensive geochemistry model for the site for analyzing transport processes. Instead it is performing sensitivity studies to determine the effects of some coupled processes on site performance. The Committee's recommendation on this topic, that the CNWRA continue its development of coupled chemical and hydrologic transport models to determine whether coupled processes are important to demonstrating compliance with a risk- (or dose-) based standard, is consistent with the staff views. In the "Evolution of the Near-field Environment" KTI, the coupled processes code, MULTIFLO, has been developed by the CNWRA to simulate conditions and processes in a non-isothermal porous medium of variable saturation. Work continues on exercising this code, and the effects of "foreign" materials (such as concrete and steel) on the performance of the repository are currently being evaluated.

The Committee noted the HLW-related work carried out at the University of Arizona (UA). Through the years, the UA efforts have resulted in the development of state-of-the-art methodologies for characterizing and modeling processes and conditions relating to the hydrology of unsaturated fractured rock. However, because of budget constraints, the staff finds it necessary to end work at the Apache Leap site at the end of May 1997. Consequently, NRC cannot implement the Committee's recommendation that NRC use the Apache Leap Research Site as a location for field tests involving colloid transport in fractured unsaturated medium. Moreover, it is uncertain whether the logistics of the Apache Leap Research Site are amenable to long-term testing for colloid transport. Nevertheless, the staff shares the Committee's concern that colloid transport in the unsaturated zone could be important to repository performance. Therefore, we intend to closely follow DOE's approach to colloids in TSPA abstraction workshops and will assess their importance as part of our own PA sensitivity studies.

The staff appreciates the ACNW's concern regarding radionuclide transport. As we continue our reviews and sensitivity studies related to total system performance at YM, we will keep the Committee informed on the status of work performed under the various KTIs and any redirection of staff effort that results from these activities. The current program is based on an annual budget of $14 million, further reduction in its budget would result in a reexamination of our approach to the program.

Sincerely,

L. Joseph Callan
Executive Director
for Operations

cc: Chairman Jackson
Commissioner Diaz
Commissioner Rogers
Commissioner McGaffigan
Commissioner Dicus
SECY

DISTRIBUTION: G970103

Central File	NMSS r/f	JThoma	PAHL r/f	EDO r/f	JHolonich	MBell	PSobel	DWM r/f/tf	NMSS Dir. r/f	JHickey
RNelson	HLThompson	CPoland	PUBLIC	DMorrison	EJordan	RBangart	KCyr	PTressler	CNWRA	JMitchell
ACNW	LJCallan	FMiraglia	FRoss							

* See previous concurrence CP/PROOFED/MARCH 11, 1997 s:\dwm\pahl\kim\acnw4

OFC	PAHL*		PAHL*		ENGB*		ENGB*		PMDA*	
NAME	KMcConnell/wd		TMcCartin		JBradbury		DBrooks		EKraus	
DATE	3/6/97		3/6/97		3/6/97		3/6/97		3/6/97	

OFC	PAHL*		DWM*		NMSS*		DEDR		EDO	
NAME	JAustin		MVFederline		CJPaperiello		HLThompson		LJCallan	
DATE	3/6/97		3/11/97		3/17/97		3/ /97		3/ /97	

We understand that DOE is not now developing a comprehensive geochemistry model for the site for analyzing transport processes. Instead it is performing sensitivity studies to determine the effects of some coupled processes on site performance. The Committee's recommendation on this topic, that the CNWRA continue its development of coupled chemical and hydrologic transport models to determine whether coupled processes are important to demonstrating compliance with a risk- (or dose-) based standard, is consistent with the staff views. In the "Evolution of the Near-field Environment" KTI, the coupled processes code, MULTIFLO, has been developed by the CNWRA to simulate conditions and processes in a non-isothermal porous medium of variable saturation. Work continues on exercising this code, and the effects of "foreign" materials (such as concrete and steel) on the performance of the repository are currently being evaluated.

The Committee noted the HLW-related work carried out at the University of Arizona (UA). Through the years, the UA efforts have resulted in the development of state-of-the-art methodologies for characterizing and modeling processes and conditions relating to the hydrology of unsaturated fractured rock. However, because of budget constraints, the staff finds it necessary to end work at the Apache Leap site at the end of May 1997. Consequently, NRC cannot implement the Committee's recommendation that NRC use the Apache Leap Research Site as a location for field tests involving colloid transport in fractured unsaturated medium. Moreover, it is uncertain whether the logistics of the Apache Leap Research Site are amenable to long-term testing for colloid transport. Nevertheless, the staff shares the Committee's concern that colloid transport in the unsaturated zone could be important to repository performance. Therefore, we intend to closely follow DOE's approach to colloids in TSPA abstraction workshops and will assess their importance as part of our own PA sensitivity studies.

The staff appreciates the ACNW's concern regarding radionuclide transport. As we continue our reviews and sensitivity studies related to total system performance at YM, we will keep the Committee informed on the status of work performed under the various KTIs and any redirection of staff effort that results from these activities.

Sincerely,

L. Joseph Callan
Executive Director
for Operations

cc: Chairman Jackson
Commissioner Diaz
Commissioner Rogers
Commissioner McGaffigan
Commissioner Dicus
SECY

DISTRIBUTION: G970103

Central File	NMSS r/f	JThoma	PAHL r/f	EDO r/f	JHolonich	MBell	PSobel	DWM r/f/tf	NMSS Dir. r/f	JHickey
RNelson	HLThompson	CPoland	PUBLIC	DMorrison	EJordan	RBangart	KCyr	PTressler	CNWRA	JMitchell
ACNW	LJCallan	FMiraglia	FRoss							

* See previous concurrence CP/PROOFED/MARCH 11, 1997 s:\dwm\pahl\kim\acnw4

OFC	PAHL*		PAHL*		ENGB*		ENGB*		PMDA*	
NAME	KMcConnell/wd		TMcCartin		JBradbury		DBrooks		EKraus	
DATE	3/6/97		3/6/97		3/6/97		3/6/97		3/6/97	

OFC	PAHL*		DWM*		NMSS		DEDR		EDO	
NAME	JAustin		MVFederline		CJPaperiello		HLThompson		LJCallan	
DATE	3/6/97		3/11/97		3/17/97		3/ /97		3/ /97	

OFFICIAL RECORD COPY

We understand that DOE is not now developing a comprehensive geochemistry model for the site for analyzing transport processes. Instead it is performing sensitivity studies to determine the effects of some coupled processes on site performance. The Committee's recommendation on this topic, that the CNWRA continue its development of coupled chemical and hydrologic transport models to determine whether coupled processes are important to demonstrating compliance with a risk- (or dose-) based standard, is consistent with the staff views. In the "Evolution of the Near-field Environment" KTI, the coupled processes code, MULTIFLO, has been developed by the CNWRA to simulate conditions and processes in a non-isothermal porous medium of variable saturation. Work continues on exercising this code, and the effects of "foreign" materials (such as concrete and steel) on the performance of the repository are currently being evaluated.

The Committee noted the HLW-related work carried out at the University of Arizona (UA). Through the years, the UA efforts have resulted in the development of state-of-the-art methodologies for characterizing and modeling processes and conditions relating to the hydrology of unsaturated fractured rock. However, because of budget constraints, the staff finds it necessary to end work at the Apache Leap site at the end of May 1997. Consequently, NRC cannot implement the Committee's recommendation that NRC use the Apache Leap Research Site as a location for field tests involving colloid transport in fractured unsaturated medium. Moreover, it is uncertain whether the logistics of the Apache Leap Research Site are amenable to long-term testing for colloid transport. Nevertheless, the staff shares the Committee's concern that colloid transport in the unsaturated zone could be important to repository performance. Therefore, we intend to closely follow DOE's approach to colloids in TSPA abstraction workshops and will assess their importance as part of our own PA sensitivity studies.

The staff appreciates the ACNW's concern regarding radionuclide transport. As we continue our reviews and sensitivity studies related to total system performance at YM, we will keep the Committee informed on the status of work performed under the various KTIs and any redirection of staff effort that results from these activities.

Sincerely,

L. Joseph Callan
Executive Director
for Operations

cc: Chairman Jackson
Commissioner Diaz
Commissioner Rogers
Commissioner McGaffigan
Commissioner Dicus
SECY

DISTRIBUTION: TICKET NO: EDO G970103

Central File	NMSS r/f	JThoma	PAHL r/f	EDO r/f	JHolonich	MBell	PSobel	DWM r/f/tf	NMSS Dir. r/f	JHickey
RNelson	HLThompson	CPoland	PUBLIC	DMorrison	EJordan	RBangart	KCyr	PTressler	CNWRA	JMitchell
MBridgers	ACNW	LJCallan	FMiraglia	FRoss						

* See previous concurrence: s:\dwm\pahl\kim\acnw4

OFC	PAHL*		PAHL*		ENGB*		ENGB*		PMDA*	
NAME	KMcConnell/wd		TMcCartin		JBradbury		DBrooks		EKraus	
DATE	3/6/97		3/6/97		3/6/97		3/6/97		3/6/97	

OFC	PAHL*		DWM		NMSS		DEDR		EDO	
NAME	JAustin		JTGreeves		CJPaperiello		HLThompson		LJCallan	
DATE	3/6/97		3/ /97		/ /97		3/ /97		3/ /97	

OFFICIAL RECORD COPY

performing sensitivity studies to determine the effects of some coupled processes on site performance. The Committee's recommendation on this topic, that the CNWRA continue its development of coupled chemical and hydrologic transport models to determine whether coupled processes are important to demonstrating compliance with a risk- (or dose-) based standard, is consistent with the staff views. In the "Evolution of the Near-field Environment" KTI, the coupled processes code, MULTIFLO, has been developed by the CNWRA to simulate conditions and processes in a non-isothermal porous medium of variable saturation. Work continues on exercising this code, and the effects of "foreign" materials (such as concrete and steel) on the performance of the repository are currently being evaluated.

The Committee noted the HLW-related work carried out at the University of Arizona (UA). Through the years, the UA efforts have resulted in the development of state-of-the-art methodologies for characterizing and modeling processes and conditions relating to the hydrology of unsaturated fractured rock. However, because of budget constraints, the staff finds it necessary to end work at the Apache Leap site at the end of May 1997. Consequently, NRC cannot implement the Committee's recommendation that NRC use the Apache Leap Research Site as a location for field tests involving colloid transport in fractured unsaturated medium. Moreover, it is uncertain whether the logistics of the Apache Leap Research Site are amenable to long-term testing for colloid transport. Nevertheless, the staff shares the Committee's concern that colloid transport in the unsaturated zone could be important to repository performance. Therefore, we intend to closely follow DOE's approach to colloids in TSPA abstraction workshops and will assess their importance as part of our own PA sensitivity studies.

The staff appreciates the ACNW's concern regarding radionuclide transport. As we continue our reviews and sensitivity studies related to total system performance at YM, we will keep the Committee informed on the status of work performed under the various KTIs and any redirection of staff effort that results from these activities.

Sincerely,

L. Joseph Callan
Executive Director
for Operations

cc: Chairman Jackson
Commissioner Diaz
Commissioner Rogers
Commissioner McGaffigan
Commissioner Dicus
SECY

DISTRIBUTION: TICKET NO: EDO GO70103

Central File	NMSS r/f	JThoma	PAHL r/f	EDO r/f	JHolonich	MBell	PSobel	DWM r/f/tf	NMSS Dir. r/f	JHickey
RNelson	HLThompson	CPoland	PUBLIC	DMorrison	EJordan	RBangart	KCyr	PTressler	CNWRA	JMitchell
MBridgers	ACNW	LJCallan	FMiraglia	FRoss						

* See previous concurrence: s:\dwm\pahl\kim\acnw4

OFC	PAHL*		PAHL*		ENGB*		ENGB*		PMDA*	
NAME	KMcConnell/wd		TMcCartin		JBradbury		DBrooks		EKraus	
DATE	3/6/97		3/6/97		3/6/97		3/6/97		3/6/97	

OFC	PAHL*		DWM		DEDR		EDO			
NAME	JAustin				HLThompson		LJCallan			
DATE	3/6/97		/ /97		/ /97		/ /97		/ /96	

OFFICIAL RECORD COPY

In small Box on "DATE:" line enter: M = E-Mail Distribution Copy H = Hard Copy

PDR : YES __ NO x Category: Proprietary __ or CF Only x
ACNW: YES __ NO x
IG : YES __ NO x Delete file after distribution: Yes x No __

non-isothermal porous medium of variable saturation. Work continues on exercising this code, and the effects of "foreign" materials (such as concrete and steel) on the performance of the repository are currently being evaluated.

The Committee noted the HLW-related work carried out at the University of Arizona (UA). Through the years, the UA efforts have resulted in the development of state-of-the-art methodologies for characterizing and modeling processes and conditions relating to the hydrology of unsaturated fractured rock. However, because of declining budgets, the staff has chosen to end work at the Apache Leap site at the end of May 1997. Consequently, NRC cannot implement the Committee's recommendation that NRC use the Apache Leap Research Site as a location for field tests involving colloid transport in fractured unsaturated medium. Nevertheless, the staff shares the Committee's concern that colloid transport in the unsaturated zone could be important to repository performance. Therefore, we intend to closely follow DOE's approach to colloids in TSPA abstraction workshops and will assess their importance as part of our own PA sensitivity studies.

The staff appreciates the ACNW's concern regarding radionuclide transport. As we continue our reviews and sensitivity studies related to total system performance at YM, we will keep the Committee informed on the status of work performed under the various KTIs and any redirection of staff effort that results from these activities.

Sincerely,

L. Joseph Callan
Executive Director
for Operations

cc: Chairman Jackson
Commissioner Rogers
Commissioner Dicus
Commissioner Diaz
Commissioner McGaffigan
SECY

DISTRIBUTION: TICKET NO: EDO GO70103
* See previous concurrence:

Central File	NMSS r/f	JThoma	PAHL r/f	EDO r/f	JHolonich	MBell	PSobel	DWM r/f/tf	NMSS Dir. r/f	JHickey
RNelson	HLThompson	CPoland	PUBLIC	DMorrison	EJordan	RBangart	KCyr	PTressler	CNWRA	JMitchell
MBridgers	ACNW	LJCallan	FMiraglia	FRoss						

s:\dwm\pahl\kim\acnw4
* See previous concurrence:

OFC	PAHL*		PAHL*		ENGB*		ENGB*		PMDA*	
NAME	KMcConnell/wd		TMcCartin		JBradbury		DBrooks		EKraus	
DATE	3/6/97		3/6/97		3/6/97		3/6/97		3/6/97	

OFC	PAHL*		DWM		DEDR		EDO			
NAME	JAustin				HLThompson		LJCallan			
DATE	3/6/97		/ /97		/ /97		/ /97		/ /96	

@4. 3/7/97 OFFICIAL RECORD COPY

In small Box on "DATE:" line enter: M = E-Mail Distribution Copy H = Hard Copy
PDR : YES __ NO X Category: Proprietary __ or CF Only X
ACNW: YES __ NO X
IG : YES __ NO X Delete file after distribution: Yes X No __

non-isothermal porous medium of variable saturation. Work continues on exercising this code, and the effects of "foreign" materials (such as concrete and steel) on the performance of the repository are currently being evaluated.

The Committee noted the HLW-related work carried out at the University of Arizona (UA). Through the years, the UA efforts have resulted in the development of state-of-the-art methodologies for characterizing and modeling processes and conditions relating to the hydrology of unsaturated fractured rock. However, because of declining budgets, the staff has chosen to end work at the Apache Leap site at the end of May 1997. Consequently, NRC cannot implement the Committee's recommendation that NRC use the Apache Leap Research Site as a location for field tests involving colloid transport in fractured unsaturated medium. Nevertheless, the staff shares the ACNW's concern that colloid transport in the unsaturated zone could be important to repository performance. Therefore, we intend to closely follow DOE's approach to colloids in TSPA abstraction workshops and will assess their importance as part of our own PA sensitivity studies.

The staff appreciates the ACNW's concern regarding radionuclide transport. As we continue our reviews and sensitivity studies related to total system performance at YM, we will keep the Committee informed on the status of work performed under the various KTIs and any redirection of staff effort that results from these activities.

Sincerely,

L. Joseph Callan
Executive Director
for Operations

cc: Chairman Jackson
Commissioner Rogers
Commissioner Dicus
Commissioner Diaz
Commissioner McGaffigan
SECY

DISTRIBUTION: TICKET NO: EDO GO70103

Central File	NMSS r/f	JThoma	PAHL r/f	EDO r/f	JHolonich	MBell	PSobel	DWM r/f/tf	NMSS Dir. r/f JHickey
RNelson	HLThompson	CPoland	PUBLIC	DMorrison	EJordan	RBangart	KCyr		
CNWRA	MBridgers	ACNW	LJCallan						

s:\dwm\pahl\kim\acnw4

* See previous concurrence:

OFC	PAHL		PAHL*		ENGB*		ENGB		PMDA*	
NAME	KMcConnell/wd		TMcCartin		JBradbury		BBrooks		EKraus	
DATE	3/6/97		3/6/97		3/6/97		3/6/97		3/6/97	

OFC	PAHL	E	DWM		DEDR		EDO			
NAME	JAustin				HLThompson		LJCallan			
DATE	3/6/97	H	/ /97		/ /97		/ /97		/ /96	

OFFICIAL RECORD COPY

In small Box on "DATE:" line enter: M = E-Mail Distribution Copy H = Hard Copy

PDR : YES __ NO x Category: Proprietary __ or CF Only x

ACNW: YES X NO __

IG : YES __ NO x Delete file after distribution: Yes x No __

porous medium of variable saturation. Work continues on exercising this code and the effects of "foreign" materials (such as concrete and steel) on the performance of the repository are currently being evaluated.

The Committee noted the HLW-related work carried out at the University of Arizona (UA). Through the years, efforts of the UA have resulted in the development of state-of-the-art methodologies for characterizing and modelling processes and conditions relating to the hydrology of unsaturated fractured rock. However, due to declining budgets, the staff has chosen to end work at the Apache Leap site at the end of May 1997. Consequently, NRC cannot implement the Committee's recommendation that NRC use the Apache Leap Research Site (ALRS) as a location for field tests involving colloid transport in fractured unsaturated medium. Nevertheless, the staff shares the ACNW's concern that colloid transport in the unsaturated zone could be important to repository performance. Therefore, we intend to closely follow DOE's approach to colloids in TSPA abstraction workshops and will assess their importance as part of our own PA sensitivity studies.

The staff appreciates the concern the ACNW has expressed with regard to radionuclide transport. As we continue our reviews and sensitivity studies related to total system performance at YM we will keep the Committee appraised of the status of work performed under the various KTIs and any redirection of staff effort that results from these activities.

Sincerely,

L. Joseph Callan
Executive Director
for Operations

cc: Chairman Jackson
Commissioner Rogers
Commissioner Dicus
Commissioner Diaz
Commissioner McGaffigan
SECY

DISTRIBUTION: TICKET NO: EDO GO70103

Central File	NMSS r/f	JThoma	PAHL r/f	EDO r/f	JHolonich	MBell	PSobel	DWM r/f/tf	NMSS Dir. r/f	JHickey
RNelson	HLThompson	CPoland	PUBLIC	DMorrison	EJordan	RBangart	KCyr	WRussell	JBlaha	JMilhoan
CNWRA	MBridgers	ACNW	LJCallan							

s:\dwm\pahl\kim\acnw4

OFC	PAHL		PAHL		ENGB		ENGB		PMDA	
NAME	KMcConnell/wd		TMcCartin		JBradbury		DBrooks		EKraus	
DATE	/ /97		3/6/97		3 /6/97		/ /97		/ /97	

OFC	PAHL		DWM		DEDR		EDO			
NAME	JAustin				HLThompson		LJCallan			
DATE	/ /97		/ /97		/ /97		/ /97		/ /96	

OFFICIAL RECORD COPY

In small Box on "DATE:" line enter: M = E-Mail Distribution Copy H = Hard Copy
PDR : YES __ NO x Category: Proprietary __ or CF Only x
ACNW: YES __ NO x
IG : YES __ NO x Delete file after distribution: Yes x No _

We understand that DOE is not now developing a comprehensive geochemistry model for the site for analyzing transport processes. Instead it is performing sensitivity studies to determine the effects of some coupled processes on site performance. The Committee's recommendation on this topic, that the CNWRA continue its development of coupled chemical and hydrologic transport models to determine whether coupled processes are important to demonstrating compliance with a risk- (or dose-) based standard, is consistent with the staff views. In the "Evolution of the Near-field Environment" KTI, the coupled processes code, MULTIFLO, has been developed by the CNWRA to simulate conditions and processes in a non-isothermal porous medium of variable saturation. Work continues on exercising this code, and the effects of "foreign" materials (such as concrete and steel) on the performance of the repository are currently being evaluated.

The Committee noted the HLW-related work carried out at the University of Arizona (UA). Through the years, the UA efforts have resulted in the development of state-of-the-art methodologies for characterizing and modeling processes and conditions relating to the hydrology of unsaturated fractured rock. However, because of budget constraints, the staff finds it necessary to end work at the Apache Leap site at the end of May 1997. Consequently, NRC cannot implement the Committee's recommendation that NRC use the Apache Leap Research Site as a location for field tests involving colloid transport in fractured unsaturated medium. Moreover, it is uncertain whether the logistics of the Apache Leap Research Site are amenable to long-term testing for colloid transport. Nevertheless, the staff shares the Committee's concern that colloid transport in the unsaturated zone could be important to repository performance. Therefore, we intend to closely follow DOE's approach to colloids in TSPA abstraction workshops and will assess their importance as part of our own PA sensitivity studies.

The staff appreciates the ACNW's concern regarding radionuclide transport. As we continue our reviews and sensitivity studies related to total system performance at YM, we will keep the Committee informed on the status of work performed under the various KTIs and any redirection of staff effort that results from these activities. The current program is based on an annual budget of $14 million; further reduction in its budget would result in a reexamination of our approach to the program.

Sincerely,

L. Joseph Callan
Executive Director
for Operations

cc: Chairman Jackson
Commissioner Rogers
Commissioner Dicus
Commissioner Diaz
Commissioner McGaffigan
SECY

rec'd 2/19

CLOSED 3/27 as per ltr. to Pomeroy. WJS 4/1

ACTION

EDO Principal Correspondence Control

FROM: Paul W. Pomeroy, ACNW

DUE: 03/13/97

EDO CONTROL: G970103
DOC DT: 02/13/97
FINAL REPLY:

TO:

Chairman Jackson

FOR SIGNATURE OF : ** GRN **

CRC NO:

Executive Director

DESC:

COMMENTS ON FLOW AND RADIONUCLIDE TRANSPORT AT YUCCA MOUNTAIN

DATE: 02/14/97

ASSIGNED TO: NMSS

CONTACT: Paperiello

ROUTING:

Thompson
Jordan
Norry
Blaha
Miraglia, NRR
Morrison, RES
Ross, AEOD
Cyr, OGC
Mitchell, OEDO
ACNW File

Paperiello
Knapp
Lineb
Poland

SPECIAL INSTRUCTIONS OR REMARKS:

Prepare response to ACNW for EDO signature. Add Commissioners and SECY as cc's (shown on original for reply).

USE SUBJECT LINE IN RESPONSE.

ACTION: Austin
Due to DWM Director's Office: 3/6/97
Input: Bell (to Austin by 3/5)
cc: Greeves
Fedorline
Sobel
R. Johnson

2/14

DWM Action
Due to NMSS Director's Office
By 3/10/97

UNITED STATES
NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION
ADVISORY COMMITTEE ON NUCLEAR WASTE
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20555

February 13, 1997

The Honorable Shirley Ann Jackson
Chairman
U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission
Washington, DC 20555-0001

Dear Chairman Jackson:

SUBJECT: COMMENTS ON FLOW AND RADIONUCLIDE TRANSPORT AT YUCCA MOUNTAIN

Evaluation of the strategy for dealing with disposal of high-level radioactive wastes will require a license applicant to demonstrate convincingly that a site has hydrogeological characteristics that are appropriate for mitigating releases of radionuclides to the biosphere. Consequently, the Advisory Committee on Nuclear Waste (ACNW) continues to hold as a high priority the evaluation of NRC Key Technical Issues that relate to flow of water and the transport of radionuclides at Yucca Mountain. The ACNW held a working group on flow and radionuclide transport on September 26, 1996. The Committee heard from representatives of the Los Alamos National Laboratory, the Lawrence Livermore National Laboratory, the Lawrence Berkeley Laboratory, the Electric Power Research Institute, the Department of Energy (DOE) Yucca Mountain Project Office, and the University of Arizona.

Following the presentations at the working group, and on the basis of other experience as well, the ACNW has several recommendations that reflect our continuing interest in the important issue of transport of radionuclides at the site.

- Because of the importance of radionuclide transport and the effects of sorptive processes on radionuclide concentrations in groundwater, as recognized in the DOE Waste Containment and Isolation Strategy, the NRC should maintain a critical level of expertise within its staff and at the Center for Nuclear Waste Regulatory Analyses (CNWRA) related to flow and radionuclide transport.

- The NRC staff should examine available information from DOE to ensure that the abstraction from detailed models to the total system performance assessment (TSPA) models are valid and transparent and that the details of individual models are clear. As part of this examination, the NRC should

follow closely the appropriate DOE expert elicitations and TSPA abstraction workshops.

- It is not clear that DOE is developing a comprehensive chemistry model for the site for analyzing transport processes. Accordingly, the staff should ensure that the CNWRA continues to develop coupled chemical and hydrologic transport models to determine whether these coupled processes are important to demonstrating compliance with a risk- (or dose-) based standard. As part of this model development, the staff should continue to support the work at the CNWRA to determine the potential importance of "foreign" materials (such as concrete and steel) in the performance of the repository.

- The Apache Leap Research Site (ALRS) could be used as a location to collect important data on colloid migration through a fractured unsaturated tuff. The NRC should consider supporting work to observe naturally occurring colloids and possibly to introduce colloidal "tracers" at the ALRS to generate data useful for bounding calculations at Yucca Mountain.

DETAILED COMMENTS

Total System Performance Assessment Issues

Radionuclide transport by subsurface water at the Yucca Mountain site is thought to be the most significant pathway in terms of risk to the critical group. The evaluation of risk will be accomplished through TSPA. It is necessary to establish the important processes and mechanisms for retaining and retarding the release and transport of radionuclides from the repository. These processes attenuate radionuclide concentrations in the ground water and thus reduce the calculated dose to a member of the critical group. To be effective in evaluating of the expected license application for Yucca Mountain, the NRC staff will have to be able to understand and critically evaluate the work of DOE and its contractors on transport phenomena. The ACNW is concerned that the NRC staff had to eliminate radionuclide transport work at the CNWRA. The issue remains critical to assessment of the repository, and we encourage reinstatement of CNWRA activities in this area.

An evaluation of the Yucca Mountain site with respect to standards will require the framework of a risk assessment. The ACNW is not convinced that the DOE program is strongly integrated. We are concerned that the transition from models developed in somewhat isolated "science" programs of DOE contractors to those required for practical, "engineering" system-level performance assessment may be opaque. It is essential that the NRC staff fully understand the abstraction process. Currently, DOE is planning and conducting a series of expert elicitations related to the performance assessment resource

base. The NRC staff needs to continue evaluating these activities, as well as the DOE abstraction workshops.

Flow and Transport in the Vadose Zone and the Saturated Zone

Samples recovered from the Yucca Mountain Exploratory Studies Facility (ESF) show apparent "bomb-pulse" ^{36}Cl on or near some faults that are mapped at the surface[1]. The isotopic data, which provide important insights into transport processes, reinforce the notion that an interconnected set of fractures forms a transport pathway for radionuclides at Yucca Mountain. DOE models for flow and transport in the vadose zone must employ flow along faults and fractures and diffusion from the fractures into the matrix as important processes. There appears to be a paucity of critical information on hydrological characteristics of fractures and faults and their impact on the transport of radionuclides.

Models for the vadose zone employed by DOE necessarily rely on integrated average values of percolation fluxes of water through the repository horizon. The generally accepted average flux values have crept upward over the past years, covering a range between 1 and 20 mm/yr. In the saturated zone, models use "dual continuum" methods to approximate flow in fractures and diffusion into the surrounding rock matrix. The available data related to hydrological characteristics of rocks in the saturated zone may not be adequate to constrain models in a credible way. The NRC and CNWRA staffs need to maintain their efforts in flow and transport modeling in the vadose zone and the saturated zone, and on the use of data to determine parameters in the models, to ensure that they will have the capability to conduct an assessment at the time of license application.

The Role of Chemistry in Evaluating Risk

In February 1995, a group of DOE and contractor scientists prepared a "white paper" outlining the needs for quantifying chemical reactions at Yucca Mountain.[2] The report notes that "the key performance issue for the Yucca Mountain site is radionuclide transport. Transport, in turn, consists of the coupling of flow (hydrology) and retardation (geochemistry)." This report describes how chemical studies involving concrete, waste canisters, and other "foreign" materials in the near field are essential ingredients of a program. In such a program, solubility, speciation, and sorption must all be adequately quantified in the near and far fields. We could not determine from material presented to us at the working group the extent to which DOE is taking into account the effect that these "foreign" materials have on reactions and speciation of important nuclides (e.g., Np, Tc, U, Pu, I, and perhaps Se). The chemical state of the repository needs to be evaluated to

---

[1] Fabryka-Martin, J.T., Dixon, P.R., Levy, S., Liu, B., Turin, H.J., and A.V. Wolfsberg. 1996. Systematic sampling for chlorine-36 in the Exploratory Studies Facility. Draft material presented to the ACNW.

[2] Simmons, A.M., Nelson, S.T., Cloke, P.L., Crump, T.R., Duffy, C.J., Glassley, W.E., Peterman, Z.E., Siegel, M.D., Stahl, D., Steinkampf, W.C., and B.E. Viani. 1995. The Critical Role of Geochemistry in the Program Approach. Unpublished paper.

determine whether these materials exercise a significant buffering effect on the chemical environment in terms of the calculated consequences.

The role of geochemistry in radionuclide transport has become crucial to demonstrating compliance. The understanding of the hydrologic system at Yucca Mountain has evolved from a model based primarily upon fluid flow through the rock matrix, with very slow transport pathways, to a model that includes, and may be dominated by, fluid flow through an interconnected network of fractures, with relatively fast pathways. What is needed is a comprehensive chemical model for the site. The NRC staff should evaluate DOE's efforts in this area and determine the advisability of DOE's developing a site chemistry model. We are concerned that DOE may be relying too much on laboratory-scale experiments. We urge the NRC staff to investigate the appropriate use of data from intermediate-scale field tests and from natural analogs to build confidence in modeling results.

Colloids and Radionuclide Transport

The transport of colloids through unsaturated rocks is a poorly understood phenomenon. We received no information at our working group to counter the 1995 conclusion of Manaktala, et al[3]: "Based on reports in the available literature, it may be possible for colloids to form in the Yucca Mountain environment, but the extent to which they could contribute to overall radionuclide transport remains unclear." We do not know whether colloid migration could be an important consideration in either enhancing or inhibiting radionuclide transport at Yucca Mountain. We believe that it is important to deal with the colloid issue in a direct fashion. The importance of colloid transport may be negligible, but an initiative must be taken to assess whether this is true.

The ALRS is in a fractured tuff but has an annual rainfall of more than twice that at Yucca Mountain. In a sense, the ALRS is an "analog" for Yucca Mountain under pluvial conditions, which are anticipated to occur within the time frame of a few tens of thousands of years. Because the ALRS is wetter than Yucca Mountain, it should be possible to collect water samples of flow through fractures in the vadose zone and determine colloid concentrations. Because there is a known connection along a fracture to a surface expression in a stream channel, it should also be possible to introduce colloidal "tracers" at the surface and monitor samples at depth to quantify transport. Data from the ALRS should prove to be very valuable in performing bounding calculations for Yucca Mountain that may resolve the colloid issue.

---

[3] Manaktala, H., Turner, D.,Ahn, T. Colten-Bradley, V., and E. Bonano. 1995. Potential Implications of Colloids on the Long-Term Performance of a High-Level Radioactive Waste Repository, CNWRA 95-015.

We trust that our comments and suggestions will be helpful in assessing the potential risks associated with the proposed high-level waste repository at Yucca Mountain.

Sincerely,

Paul W. Pomeroy,
Chairman

UNITED STATES
NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20555-0001

March 27, 1997

Dr. Paul W. Pomeroy, Chairman
Advisory Committee on Nuclear Waste
U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission
Washington, DC 20555

Dear Dr. Pomeroy:

I am responding to your letter of February 13, 1997, to the Chairman on Flow and Radionuclide Transport at Yucca Mountain (YM). In that letter, the Advisory Committee on Nuclear Waste (the Committee) provided recommendations and suggestions on that portion of the U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission's High-Level Waste (HLW) Program designed to address issues relating to the hydrogeological characteristics, at YM, capable of mitigating the release of radionuclides to the biosphere. In your letter, it is noted that the Committee considers the evaluation of NRC Key Technical Issues (KTIs) dealing with flow and radionuclide transport at YM a high-priority part of the HLW Program. The NRC staff agrees with the Committee on the importance of evaluating flow and radionuclide transport at YM.

However, as the Committee is aware, both NRC and the U.S. Department of Energy (DOE) have had to adjust their respective programs in response to reductions in budget. In adjusting the programs, work in certain areas, recognized as important, was significantly reduced. As part of NRC's adjustment process, for FY97, work on the KTI on "Radionuclide Transport" was stopped at the Center for Nuclear Waste Regulatory Analyses (CNWRA), with the main effect being the suspension of laboratory work on radionuclide sorption. However, critical CNWRA expertise is being sustained through work for others. With respect to staff activities, some activities formerly conducted in the "Radionuclide Transport" KTI now are being addressed under other KTIs. For example, the importance of sorption processes is being evaluated as part of "Performance Assessment" (PA) studies and the retention of radionuclides is also being addressed in the "Evolution of the Near-Field Environment" KTI. The staff intends to reassess the KTI prioritization each year. Those KTIs that were reduced in scope may be reactivated, given adequate resources, if we find, on our reviews of DOE's work and our own sensitivity studies, that new efforts are required in those areas.

As recommended by the Committee, staff will continue to examine available information from DOE to ensure that the abstractions from detailed models to the total system performance assessment (TSPA) models are valid and transparent and that the details of the individual models are clear. Currently, the staff is involved in reviewing synthesis reports as they are made available, including those that consider radionuclide sorption and retardation, near-field environment, and mineralogy/petrology. Further, we are attending the abstraction workshops DOE is having on this and other topics. For example, staff recently returned from the DOE abstraction workshop on nearfield environment held in Las Vegas, Nevada.

UNITED STATES
NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20555-0001

March 27, 1997

Dr. Paul W. Pomeroy, Chairman
Advisory Committee on Nuclear Waste
U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission
Washington, DC 20555

Dear Dr. Pomeroy:

I am responding to your letter of February 13, 1997, to the Chairman on Flow and Radionuclide Transport at Yucca Mountain (YM). In that letter, the Advisory Committee on Nuclear Waste (the Committee) provided recommendations and suggestions on that portion of the U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission's High-Level Waste (HLW) Program designed to address issues relating to the hydrogeological characteristics, at YM, capable of mitigating the release of radionuclides to the biosphere. In your letter, it is noted that the Committee considers the evaluation of NRC Key Technical Issues (KTIs) dealing with flow and radionuclide transport at YM a high-priority part of the HLW Program. The NRC staff agrees with the Committee on the importance of evaluating flow and radionuclide transport at YM.

However, as the Committee is aware, both NRC and the U.S. Department of Energy (DOE) have had to adjust their respective programs in response to reductions in budget. In adjusting the programs, work in certain areas, recognized as important, was significantly reduced. As part of NRC's adjustment process, for FY97, work on the KTI on "Radionuclide Transport" was stopped at the Center for Nuclear Waste Regulatory Analyses (CNWRA), with the main effect being the suspension of laboratory work on radionuclide sorption. However, critical CNWRA expertise is being sustained through work for others. With respect to staff activities, some activities formerly conducted in the "Radionuclide Transport" KTI now are being addressed under other KTIs. For example, the importance of sorption processes is being evaluated as part of "Performance Assessment" (PA) studies and the retention of radionuclides is also being addressed in the "Evolution of the Near-Field Environment" KTI. The staff intends to reassess the KTI prioritization each year. Those KTIs that were reduced in scope may be reactivated, given adequate resources, if we find, on our reviews of DOE's work and our own sensitivity studies, that new efforts are required in those areas.

As recommended by the Committee, staff will continue to examine available information from DOE to ensure that the abstractions from detailed models to the total system performance assessment (TSPA) models are valid and transparent and that the details of the individual models are clear. Currently, the staff is involved in reviewing synthesis reports as they are made available, including those that consider radionuclide sorption and retardation, near-field environment, and mineralogy/petrology. Further, we are attending the abstraction workshops DOE is having on this and other topics. For example, staff recently returned from the DOE abstraction workshop on nearfield environment held in Las Vegas, Nevada.

We understand that DOE is not now developing a comprehensive geochemistry model for the site for analyzing transport processes. Instead it is performing sensitivity studies to determine the effects of some coupled processes on site performance. The Committee's recommendation on this topic, that the CNWRA continue its development of coupled chemical and hydrologic transport models to determine whether coupled processes are important to demonstrating compliance with a risk- (or dose-) based standard, is consistent with the staff views. In the "Evolution of the Near-field Environment" KTI, the coupled processes code, MULTIFLO, has been developed by the CNWRA to simulate conditions and processes in a non-isothermal porous medium of variable saturation. Work continues on exercising this code, and the effects of "foreign" materials (such as concrete and steel) on the performance of the repository are currently being evaluated.

The Committee noted the HLW-related work carried out at the University of Arizona (UA). Through the years, the UA efforts have resulted in the development of state-of-the-art methodologies for characterizing and modeling processes and conditions relating to the hydrology of unsaturated fractured rock. However, because of budget constraints, the staff finds it necessary to end work at the Apache Leap site at the end of May 1997. Consequently, NRC cannot implement the Committee's recommendation that NRC use the Apache Leap Research Site as a location for field tests involving colloid transport in fractured unsaturated medium. Moreover, it is uncertain whether the logistics of the Apache Leap Research Site are amenable to long-term testing for colloid transport. Nevertheless, the staff shares the Committee's concern that colloid transport in the unsaturated zone could be important to repository performance. Therefore, we intend to closely follow DOE's approach to colloids in TSPA abstraction workshops and will assess their importance as part of our own PA sensitivity studies.

The staff appreciates the ACNW's concern regarding radionuclide transport. As we continue our reviews and sensitivity studies related to total system performance at YM, we will keep the Committee informed on the status of work performed under the various KTIs and any redirection of staff effort that results from these activities. The current program is based on an annual budget of $14 million; further reduction in its budget would result in a reexamination of our approach to the program.

Sincerely,

Original Signed by

L. Joseph Callan
Executive Director
for Operations

cc: Chairman Jackson
Commissioner Diaz
Commissioner Rogers
Commissioner McGaffigan
Commissioner Dicus
SECY

DISTRIBUTION: G970103

Central File	NMSS r/f	JThoma	PAHL r/f	EDO r/f	JHolonich	MBell	PSobel	DWM r/f/tf	NMSS Dir. r/f	JHickey
RNelson	HLThompson	CPoland	PUBLIC	DMorrison	EJordan	RBangart	KCyr	PTressler	CNWRA	JMitchell
ACNW	LJCallan	FMiraglia	FRoss							

* See previous concurrence CP/PROOFED/MARCH 11, 1997 s:\dwm\pahl\kim\acnw4

OFC	PAHL*		PAHL*		ENGB*		ENGB*		PMDA*	
NAME	KMcConnell/wd		TMcCartin		JBradbury		DBrooks		EKraus	
DATE	3/6/97		3/6/97		3/6/97		3/6/97		3/6/97	

OFC	PAHL*		DWM*		NMSS*		DEDR		EDO	
NAME	JAustin		MVFederline		CJPaperiello		HLThompson		LJCallan	
DATE	3/6/97		3/11/97		3/17/97		3/ /97		3/27/97	