

January 10, 2002

James F. Mallay
Standards Steering Committee
American Nuclear Society
Framatome ANP
3315 Old Forest Road
Lynchburg, VA 24506

Dear Mr. Mallay:

I wish to inform you about questions that have been raised about the uncertainty evaluation in the most recent decay heat standard, ANSI/ANS-5.1-1994. A review by Dr. Michael Brady Raap (current chairman of the ANS5.1 Decay Heat Working Group) and her colleagues and NRC statisticians indicates that some of the uncertainty equations may require further review. In particular:

1. Equation 5b is a straight summation of uncertainties for each fissionable isotope. A statistical review suggests the use of an RMS summation, e.g.:

$$(\Delta P'_d)^2 = \sum_{i=1,4} (\Delta P'_{di})^2$$

2. It is also suggested that the summation symbol in the last term in Equation 9 should probably be outside the brackets so that it too is converted to an RMS summation, e.g.:

$$\sum_{\alpha=1,N} [P_{ia} \Delta F_i(t_\alpha, T_\alpha) / (Q_i P'_{di})]^2$$

3. For Equation 10 to be in RMS form, it should be:

$$\Delta F_i(t, T)^2 = \Delta F_i(t, \infty)^2 + \Delta F_i(t+T, \infty)^2$$

4. Several reviewers have suggested that the denominator in the last term in Equation 13 should not be Q^2 , but should be:

$$(F_{\max} - F_{\min})^2$$

If you have any questions please contact Mr. Lauben (301-415-6762) or myself (301-415-7499).

Sincerely,

/RA/

Farouk Eltawila, Director
Division of Systems Analysis and Regulatory Effectiveness
Office of Nuclear Regulatory Research

January 10, 2002

James F. Mallay
Standards Steering Committee
American Nuclear Society
Framatome ANP
3315 Old Forest Road
Lynchburg, VA 24506

Dear Mr. Mallay:

I wish to inform you about questions that have been raised about the uncertainty evaluation in the most recent decay heat standard, ANSI/ANS-5.1-1994. A review by Dr. Michael Brady Raap (current chairman of the ANS5.1 Decay Heat Working Group) and her colleagues and NRC statisticians indicates that some of the uncertainty equations may require further review. In particular:

1. Equation 5b is a straight summation of uncertainties for each fissionable isotope. A statistical review suggests the use of an RMS summation, e.g.:

$$(\Delta P'_d)^2 = \sum_{i=1,4} (\Delta P'_{di})^2$$

2. It is also suggested that the summation symbol in the last term in Equation 9 should probably be outside the brackets so that it too is converted to an RMS summation, e.g.:

$$\sum_{\alpha=1,N} [P_{ia} \Delta F_i(t_\alpha, T_\alpha) / (Q_i P'_{di})]^2$$

3. For Equation 10 to be in RMS form, it should be:

$$\Delta F_i(t, T)^2 = \Delta F_i(t, \infty)^2 + \Delta F_i(t+T, \infty)^2$$

4. Several reviewers have suggested that the denominator in the last term in Equation 13 should not be Q^2 , but should be:

$$(F_{\max} - F_{\min})^2$$

If you have any questions please contact Mr. Lauben (301-415-6762) or myself (301-415-7499).

Sincerely,

/RA/

Farouk Eltawila, Director
Division of Systems Analysis and Regulatory Effectiveness
Office of Nuclear Regulatory Research

Distribution:

See Attached List

C:\Program Files\Adobe\Acrobat 4.0\PDF Output\Info. ANS.dk.heat.unc01.ltr.wpd

OAR in ADAMS? (Y or N) Y ADAMS ACCESSION NO.: ML020110005 TEMPLATE NO. RES-006

Publicly Available? (Y or N) Y DATE OF RELEASE TO PUBLIC 5 SENSITIVE? N

To receive a copy of this document, indicate in the box: "C" = Copy without enclosures "E" = Copy with enclosures "N" = No copy

OFFICE	SMSAB		C:SMSAB		DD:DSARE		D:DSARE	
NAME	NLabuen:mb		JRosenthal		CAder		FEltawila	
DATE	01/10/02*		01/10/02*		01/10/02*		01/10/02*	

Letter to James Mallay

Distribution:

SMSAB R/F

DSARE R/F

NLauben R/F

PNorian

CAder

MMayfield

JWermiel, NRR

GHolahan, NRR

AThadani/RZimmerman

Suriya Ahmad

Standards Administrator

American Nuclear Society

555 North Kensington Avenue

La Grange Park, IL 60526, USA

Tawfik Raby

Chairman, ANS Consensus Committee N-17

National Institute of Standards and Technology

Reactor Bldg (235), Room A148

100 Bureau Drive, Stop 8561

Gaithersburg, MD 20899-8561

Dimitrios Cokinos

Chairman, ANS-19 Subcommittee

Brookhaven National Laboratory

Building 197C

P.O. Box 5000

Upton, NY 11973-5000

Michael C. Brady Raap

Chairman, ANS5.1 Decay Heat Working Group

Pacific Northwest National Laboratory

902 Battelle Boulevard

P.O. Box 999, MSIN K8-34

Richland, WA 99352