## **Appendix F**

## **Navy Crane Operating Experience**

## Navy Crane Data (1974-1977)

NUREG-0612, Control of Heavy Loads at Nuclear Power Plants (published in 1980) relied heavily on U.S. Navy crane operating experience. The Navy crane data included summaries of 466 crane events covering a period from February 1974 to October 1977. An exact accounting of the number of lifts per year made by each crane was not available from the Navy. Estimates were made of the number of lifts, and of the number of load drops due to changes in the number of facilities and vessels covered in the reporting system.

## Navy Crane Data (1995-1999)

NUREG-1738, *Technical Study of Spent Fuel Pool Accident Risk at Decommissioning Nuclear Power Plants* (published in 2001) relied heavily on U.S. Navy crane operating experience. The Navy crane data included summaries of 66 crane events covering a period from December 1995 to May 1999. An exact accounting of the number of lifts per year made by each crane was not available from the Navy. Once again, estimates were made of the number of lifts, since this information was not available.

Table F1, Reported Navy crane events (1995-1999), provides a listing of the 66 Navy crane events. Each crane event is listed by crane type, accident type, accident cause, responsible group, function being performed at the time of the event, and crane operating mode. A breakdown is also provided showing the end result of the crane event and its cause. Abbreviations used in Table F1 are shown on Table F2, Navy crane data abbreviations.

Caution should be taken when comparing the Navy crane data used in NUREG-0612 and the data used in NUREG-1738 because of (1) the potential for event reporting criteria changes since the mid-1970s, (2) changes in the number of active Naval cranes since the mid-1970s, and (3) the lack of data regarding the number of lifts performed for either set of crane data.

Table F1: Reported Navy crane events (1995-1999)

| Report#        | Date                | Crane      | Accident<br>Type | Accident<br>Cause | Responsible<br>Group | Function | Operating Mode |   | Issue                                   |            |                 |  |
|----------------|---------------------|------------|------------------|-------------------|----------------------|----------|----------------|---|---|------------|-----------------|--|
| 95001          | 5/9/95              | BNS        | DC               | IR                | R                    | Н        | OP             |   | Damaged Crane                           | Cause      | Percent         | # Reports  |
| 95001          | 12/5/95             | BNS        | DROP             | IR                | R                    | Н        | OP             |   |   | 10         | 50.0            | 9  |
| 95002          | 8/30/95             | BNS        | CC               | TC                | M                    | Т        | MAIN           | Ш |   | IR         | 27.8            | 5  |
| 96001          | 2/8/96              | ONS        | DC               | 10                | UNK                  | H        | OP             | Н |   | PROC       | 22.2            | 4  |
| 96002          | 7/1/96              | ONS        | PI<br>CC         | IR<br>II          | SHOP                 | H<br>T   | OP<br>OP       | Н | Crone Collinian                         | Causa      | Darsont         | # Danasta  |
| 96002<br>96004 | 9/9/96<br>4/25/96   | BNS<br>BS  | PI               | IR                | CONT<br>R            | NA       | OP<br>OP       | Н | Crane Collision                         | Cause      | Percent<br>45.5 | # Reports<br>5                                   |
| 96005          | 7/13/96             | BS         | DL               | IR                | R                    | H        | OP OP          | Н |   | PROC       | 18.2            | 2  |
| 96010          | 9/25/96             | BS         | DL               | IR                | R                    | H        | OP OP          | П |   | Others     | 36.4            | 4  |
| 96013          | 7/9/96              | BS         | DC               | IR                | R                    | Н        | OP             |   |   |            |                 |  |
| 96014          | 12/3/96             | BS         | UL               | IO                | 0                    | L        | ODCL           |   | Load Collision                          | Cause      | Percent         | # Reports  |
| 96017          | 9/6/96              | BS         | DL               | EQ                | EC                   | Н        | OP             |   |   | 10         | 55.6            | 5  |
| 96028          | 8/9/96              | BS         | DC               | 10                | 0                    | HT       | OP             |   |   | IR         | 22.2            | 2  |
| 96041          | 11/8/96             | BS         | LC               | IR                | R                    | Н        | OP             |   |   | PROC       | 11.1            | 1  |
| 97001          | 11/4/97             | BNS        | CC               | 10                | 0                    | В        | OP             | Ш |   | VISI       | 11.1            | 1  |
| 97001          | 1/8/97              | BS         | PI               | IR<br>IO          | R                    | IDLE     | OP OP          | Н | Overde ed                               | 0          | Danasat         | # D  |
| 97001          | 2/5/97              | BNS        | OVER             | 10                | 0                    | H        | OP OP          | Н | Overload                                | Cause      | Percent         | # Reports  |
| 97001<br>97001 | 2/10/97<br>4/29/97  | BNS<br>BNS | PI<br>DROP       | IO<br>IR          | O<br>R               | H<br>H   | OP<br>OP       | Н |   | IO<br>IR   | 25.0<br>37.5    | 3  |
| 97001          | 4/18/97             | BNS        | PI               | PROC              | WELD                 | Н        | OP<br>OP       | H |   | PROC       | 37.5            | 3  |
| 97002          | 10/30/97            | BNS        | SHOCK            | IR                | FWORK                | H        | OP OP          | H |   | 11100      | 01.0            | J  |
| 97004          | 2/27/97             | BS         | LC               | VISI              | R                    | Н        | OP             | Н | Personnel Injury                        | Cause      | Percent         | # Reports  |
| 97008          | 10/1/97             | BNS        | CC               | 10                | 0                    | Т        | OP             | П | · c.cccjaj                              | IO         | 20.0            | 1  |
| 97008          | 2/26/97             | BS         | CC               | PROC              | EC                   | Т        | OP             |   |   | IR         | 60.0            | 3  |
| 97009          | 11/19/97            | BNS        | OVER             | PROC              | MG                   | Н        | OP             |   |   | PROC       | 20.0            | 1  |
| 97010          | 10/1/97             | BNS        | CC               | 10                | UNK                  | В        | OP             |   |   |            |                 |  |
| 97013          | 12/1/97             | BS         | DC               | 10                | 0                    | UNK      | OP             |   | Dropped Load                            | Cause      | Percent         | # Reports  |
| 97014          | 6/2/97              | BS         | OVER             | PROC              | MG                   | Н        | OP             |   |   | EQ         | 40.0            | 2  |
| 97016          | 4/30/97             | BS         | DROP             | EQ                | R                    | ROT      | OP             | Ш |   | IR         | 60.0            | 3  |
| 98001          | 4/28/98             | BNS        | DC               | 10                | 0                    | TROL     | OP             |   |   |            | _               |  |
| 98001          | 2/26/98             | BNS        | DC               | PROC              | MECH                 | L        | MAIN           | Н | Two-Blocking                            | Cause      | Percent         | # Reports  |
| 98001<br>98001 | 1/13/98             | BNS<br>BNS | DC<br>DROP       | IO<br>EQ          | O<br>R               | H<br>H   | OP<br>OP       | Н |   | IO<br>PROC | 66.7<br>33.3    | 1  |
| 98001          | 1/6/98              | BS         | DROP             | IR                | R                    | L        | OP OP          | Н |   | FRUC       | 33.3            | '  |
| 98002          | 2/18/98             | BS         | DR               | IR                | R                    | Н        | OP OP          | Н | Damaged Load                            | Cause      | Percent         | # Reports  |
| 98002          | 3/13/98             | GNS        | DC               | IO                | MG                   | N/A      | OP             | П |   | EQ         | 33.3            | 1  |
| 98004          | 8/4/98              | GNS        | DC               | PROC              | ISP                  | Н        | OP             |   |   | IR         | 66.7            | 2  |
| 98004          | 5/5/98              | GNS        | CC               | 10                | 0                    | Т        | OP             |   |   |            |                 |  |
| 98004          | 2/2/98              | BNS        | DC               | 10                | 0                    | В        | MAIN           |   | Damaged Rigging                         | Cause      | Percent         | # Reports  |
| 98004          | 11/18/98            | BNS        | DC               | IR                | R                    | Н        | OP             |   |   | IR         | 1.0             | 1  |
| 98004          | 2/11/98             | BNS        | LC               | 10                | 0                    | L        | OP             | Ш |   |            |                 |  |
| 98005          | 1/8/98              | BNS        | TB               | IO                | CONT                 | H        | UNK            | Н | Uncontrolled Lowering                   | Cause      | Percent         | # Reports  |
| 98006<br>98006 | 12/9/98<br>4/10/98  | GNS<br>BNS | CC<br>DC         | VISI<br>IR        | R<br>R               | T<br>L   | OP<br>OP       | Н |   | Ю          | 1.0             | 1  |
| 98007          | 5/15/98             | BS         | LC               | IO<br>IO          | R                    | В        | OP<br>OP       | Н | Shock                                   | Cause      | Percent         | # Reports  |
| 98007          | 7/29/98             | BNS        | OVER             | PROC              | MG                   | Н        | OP OP          | H | GHOOK                                   | IR         | 1.0             | # Reports  |
| 98008          | 6/26/98             | BS         | TB               | PROC              | M                    | Н        | MAIN           | Н |   |            | 0               | <del>                                     </del> |
| 98009          | 7/21/98             | BS         | CC               | 10                | 0                    | В        | OP             | Н | Other                                   | Cause      | Percent         | # Reports  |
| 98010          | 7/2/98              | BS         | LC               | 10                | 0                    | L        | OP             |   |   | PROC       | 1.0             | 1  |
| 98010          | 12/22/98            | BS         | OVER             | 10                | R                    | Н        | OP             |   |   |            |                 |  |
| 98013          | 8/28/98             | BS         | OVER             | IR                | R                    | Н        | OP             |   |   |            |                 |  |
| 98017          | 11/6/98             | BS         | OTHER            | PROC              | CONT                 | T        | OP             |   |   |            |                 |  |
| 98018          | 12/11/98            | BS         | OVER             | IR                | R                    | H        | OP             | Ш |   |            |                 |  |
| 98029          | 12/14/98            | BS         | CC               | PROC              | 0                    | T        | OP<br>OB       | Н |   |            |                 |  |
| 99001<br>99001 | 10/30/98<br>3/30/99 | BNS<br>BNS | LC<br>LC         | IO<br>IO          | O<br>R               | H<br>H   | OP<br>OP       | Н |   |            |                 |  |
| 99001          | 4/12/99             | BNS        | DC               | IR                | IR                   | H        | OP<br>OP       | Н |   |            |                 |  |
| 99003          | 2/22/99             | MONO       | TB               | IO IO             | 0                    | H        | OP OP          | Н |   |            |                 |  |
| 99003          | 4/13/99             | BS         | OVER             | IR                | R                    | H        | OP             | Н | Summary by Cause                        | Cause      | Percent         | # Reports  |
| 99003          | 10/15/98            | BNS        | DC               | 10                | 0                    | T        | OP             | Н | , | IO         | 37.9            | 25   |
| 99004          | 10/15/98            | BNS        | DC               | 10                | 0                    | Н        | OP             |   |   | IR         | 30.3            | 20   |
| 99005          | 3/9/99              | BS         | LC               | PROC              | R                    | HOLD     | TEST           |   |   | PROC       | 19.7            | 13   |
| 99007          | 1/29/99             | BNS        | DC               | PROC              | M                    | T        | MAIN           |   |   | EQ         | 4.5             | 3  |
| 99008          | 3/30/99             | BS         | LC               | IR                | R                    | Т        | OP             |   |   | Misc       | 7.6             | 5  |
| 99008          | 3/20/99             | BNS        | DC               | PROC              | MG                   | T        | OP             | Ш |   | Total      | 100.0           | 66   |
| 99013          | 5/8/99              | BS         | CC               | COMM<br>ro. obov  | ISP<br>We in Tah     | TROL     | ISP            |   |   |            |                 |  |

Table F1 abbreviations are shown in Table F2

**Table F2: Navy crane data abbreviations** 

| В         | Bridge movement           | M       | Maintenance (personnel)          |
|-----------|---------------------------|---------|----------------------------------|
| BS        | Bridge crane              | MAIN    | Maintenance (mode of             |
| BNS       | Bridge crane              |         | operation)                       |
|           | <b>G</b>                  | MECH    | Mechanic (personnel)             |
| CC        | Crane collision           | MG      | Management/supervision           |
| COMM      | Communication problem     | MONO    | Monorail crane                   |
| CONT      | Contractor                |         |                                  |
|           |                           | 0       | Operator (personnel)             |
| DC        | Damaged crane             | ODCL    | Surveillance                     |
| DL        | Damaged load              | ONS     | Overhead crane                   |
| DR        | Damaged rigging           | OP      | Operation (mode of               |
| DROP      | Load drop                 | O1      | operation)                       |
| DIXOI     | Load drop                 | OTHER   | Not directly related to a        |
| EC        | Personnel other than shop | OTTILIX | crane                            |
| LO        | personnel                 |         | Clane                            |
| EQ        | Equipment failure         | PI      | Personal injury                  |
| LQ        | Equipment failure         | PROC    | Procedure failure                |
| FWORK     | Foundry worker            | 1100    | 1 rocedure failure               |
| IVVOICE   | I dulidly worker          | R       | Rigger                           |
| GNS       | Gantry crane              | ROT     | Load rotation                    |
| ONO       | Cantry Crane              | IXO1    | Load Totation                    |
| Н         | Hoisting                  | Shock   | Shock load (similar to drop)     |
| HOLD      | Holding                   | OHOOK   | chock load (sirmar to drop)      |
| HT        | Hoisting/travel           | Т       | Crane travel/movement            |
| 111       | 1 loisting/travel         | TB      | Two-blocked                      |
| IDLE      | Idle                      | TC      | Track condition                  |
|           |                           | TEST    |                                  |
|           | Improper installation     | TROL    | Testing (mode of operation)      |
| IO        | Improper operation        | IROL    | Trolley/bridge movement          |
| IR<br>ISB | Improper rigging          | 1.11    | l la a saturalla el la considera |
| ISP       | Inspection/maintenance    | UL      | Uncontrolled lowering            |
|           | (mode of operation)       | UNK     | Unknown                          |
|           | Lauranina                 | \/ICI   | locale avate vielbility          |
| L         | Lowering                  | VISI    | Inadequate visibility            |
| LC        | Load collision            | WELD    | Maldon (noncons)                 |
|           |                           | WELD    | Welder (personnel)               |
|           |                           |         |                                  |