

May 31, 2001

Mr. J. A. Scalice  
Chief Nuclear Officer  
and Executive Vice President  
Tennessee Valley Authority  
6A Lookout Place  
1101 Market Street  
Chattanooga, Tennessee 37402-2801

SUBJECT: BROWNS FERRY NUCLEAR PLANT, UNIT 3 - RELIEF FROM ASME BOILER  
AND PRESSURE VESSEL CODE, SECTION XI REQUIREMENTS FOR  
INSPECTION OF REACTOR VESSEL HEAD CLOSURE NUTS  
(TAC NO. MB1773)

Dear Mr. Scalice:

By letter dated May 7, 2001, the Tennessee Valley Authority requested relief from the American Society of Mechanical Engineers Boiler and Pressure Vessel Code, Section XI (the Code) requirements. The Request for Relief No. 3-ISI-10 pertains to the Second 10-Year Interval Inservice Inspection for the Browns Ferry Nuclear Plant, Unit 3.

The U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission (NRC) staff has reviewed the request for relief. Based on its review, the NRC staff has determined that use of the proposed alternative provides an acceptable level of quality and safety. Relief is authorized pursuant to Title 10 of the *Code of Federal Regulations*, Section 50.55a(a)(3)(i). The enclosed Safety Evaluation documents our review.

Sincerely,  
**/RA by R. Hernan Acting for/**

Patrick M. Madden, Acting Chief, Section 2  
Project Directorate II  
Division of Licensing Project Management  
Office of Nuclear Reactor Regulation

Docket No. 50-296

Enclosure: Safety Evaluation

cc w/encl: See next page

May 31, 2001

Mr. J. A. Scalice  
Chief Nuclear Officer  
and Executive Vice President  
Tennessee Valley Authority  
6A Lookout Place  
1101 Market Street  
Chattanooga, Tennessee 37402-2801

SUBJECT: BROWNS FERRY NUCLEAR PLANT, UNIT 3 - RELIEF FROM ASME BOILER  
AND PRESSURE VESSEL CODE, SECTION XI REQUIREMENTS FOR  
INSPECTION OF REACTOR VESSEL HEAD NUTS (TAC NO. MB1773)

Dear Mr. Scalice:

By letter dated May 7, 2001, the Tennessee Valley Authority requested relief from the American Society of Mechanical Engineers Boiler and Pressure Vessel Code, Section XI (the Code) requirements. The Request for Relief No. 3-ISI-10 pertains to the Second 10-Year Interval Inservice Inspection for the Browns Ferry Nuclear Plant, Unit 3.

The U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission (NRC) staff has reviewed the request for relief. Based on its review, the NRC staff has determined that use of the proposed alternative provides an acceptable level of quality and safety. Relief is authorized pursuant to Title 10 of the *Code of Federal Regulations*, Section 50.55a(a)(3)(i). The enclosed Safety Evaluation documents our review.

Sincerely,

**/RA by R. Hernan Acting for/**  
Patrick M. Madden, Acting Chief, Section 2  
Project Directorate II  
Division of Licensing Project Management  
Office of Nuclear Reactor Regulation

Docket No. 50-296

Enclosure: Safety Evaluation

cc w/encl: See next page

**DISTRIBUTION:**

PDII-2 R/F	BClayton (Hard Copy)	PUBLIC	OGC	G Hill (2 Hard Copies)
HBerkow	PMadden, Acting SC	ACRS	DLange	LLund
PFredrickson, RII	SRosenberg (e-mail)	WLong	TChan	

ADAMS ACCESSION NUMBER: ML011510356

OFFICE	PDII-2:PM	PDII-2:LA	EMEB:SC	PDII:SC	OGC
NAME	WLong	BClayton	LLund	RHernan for PMadden	NSt.Amour (NLO)
DATE	05/31/01	05/15/01	05/16/2001	05/30/2001	05/29/2001

OFFICIAL RECORD COPY

SAFETY EVALUATION BY THE OFFICE OF NUCLEAR REACTOR REGULATION  
RELIEF FROM ASME BOILER AND PRESSURE VESSEL CODE SECTION XI  
REQUIREMENTS: RELIEF REQUEST NO. 3-ISI-10  
FOR  
TENNESSEE VALLEY AUTHORITY  
BROWNS FERRY NUCLEAR PLANT, UNIT 3  
DOCKET NUMBER 50-296

1.0 INTRODUCTION

Operating License DPR-68, for the Browns Ferry Nuclear Plant Unit 3 (BFN-3) requires that the Tennessee Valley Authority (TVA, the licensee) comply with the Commission's rules and regulations. Title 10 of the *Code of Federal Regulations* (10 CFR) Part 50.55a(g) requires that inservice inspection of American Society of Mechanical Engineers (ASME) Code Class 1, 2, and 3 components shall be performed in accordance with Section XI of the ASME Boiler and Pressure Vessel Code and applicable addenda. Proposed alternatives to the requirements of 10 CFR 50.55a(g) may be used, subject to a demonstration that; pursuant to 50.55a(a)(3)(i), the proposed alternatives would provide an acceptable level of quality and safety, or, pursuant to 50.55a(a)(3)(ii), compliance with the specified requirements would result in hardship or unusual difficulty without a compensating increase in the level of quality and safety.

The regulations require that inservice examination of components and system pressure tests conducted during the first 10-year interval and subsequent intervals comply with the requirements in the latest edition and addenda of Section XI of the ASME Code incorporated by reference in 10 CFR 50.55a(b) 12 months prior to the start of the 120-month interval, subject to the limitations and modifications listed therein.

Pursuant to 10 CFR 50.55a(g)(4)(iv), inservice examination of components and system pressure tests may meet the requirements set forth in subsequent editions and addenda that are incorporated by reference in 10 CFR 50.55a(b), subject to the limitations and modifications listed in 10 CFR 50.55a(b), and subject to Commission approval. Portions of editions or addenda may be used, provided that all related requirements of the respective editions or addenda are met. The applicable edition of Section XI of the ASME Code for the BFN-3 second 10-year inservice inspection (ISI) interval is the 1989 Edition. The second 10-year interval, for BFN-3, runs from November 19, 1996 through November 18, 2005.

By letter dated May 7, 2001, TVA submitted Request for Relief No. 3-ISI-10 for BFN-3. The request relates to the requirement for surface examination of the 92 reactor pressure vessel (RPV) closure head nuts. The information provided by TVA in support of Relief Request 3-ISI-10 has been evaluated. The staff's findings are presented below.

## 2.0 INFORMATION PROVIDED BY LICENSEE

### 2.1 Code Requirement

The 1989 Edition, no Addenda, ASME Section XI, Table IWB-2500-1, Examination Category B-G-1, Item B6.10, RPV Closure Head Nuts requires a surface examination.

### 2.2 Relief Request

Relief is requested from the requirement to perform a surface examination on the RPV closure head nuts, as stipulated in ASME Section XI, 1989 Edition (no Addenda), Table IWB-2500-1, Examination Category B-G-1, Item B6.10.

### 2.3 Basis for Relief

The licensee's basis for relief states:

Extensive cleaning of the RPV nuts is required prior to performing the wet fluorescent magnetic particle examination. This extensive cleaning results in an additional expenditure of resources, and an increased radiological dose for examination personnel.

Also, the 1989 Edition of Section XI does not provide acceptance criteria for the mandated surface examination shown in Table IWB-2500-1. Table IWB-2500-1 was subsequently changed in the 1989 Addenda, and later editions of the code, requiring a visual (VT-1) examination of the closure head nuts, and also providing acceptance criteria for VT-1 examination of bolting greater than 2 inches.

### 2.4 Alternative Examination Proposal

The licensee's request for relief states:

TVA will perform a visual (VT-1) examination of the RPV closure head nuts in accordance with the requirements of the 1995 Edition with the 1996 Addenda of ASME Section XI, Table IWB-2500-1, Examination Category B-G-1, Item B.6.10. TVA considers that its proposed alternative provides an acceptable level of quality and safety.

### 2.5 Justification for the Granting of Relief

The licensee's request further states:

The 1995 Edition with the 1996 Addenda of ASME Section XI has been approved in 10 CFR 50.55a, Industry Codes and Standards, effective November 22, 1999. For these versions of the Code, Table IWB-2500-1, Category B-G-1, Item B6.10, the examination requirement changed from a surface to a visual (VT-1) examination.

Due to design factors, the stripping areas of the female threads (i.e., inside the nut) are approximately 1.3 times the area of the mating male threads (see ASME B1.1, Unified Inch Screw Threads). Consequently, if a defect were to develop during component service, the defects should occur in the threads of the bolt or stud before developing in the threads of the nut because of higher stresses in the male threads. Also, when RPV closure head nuts are tightened for closure or loosened for opening, the studs are tensioned and the nuts are run on/off the threads with no load since the load is taken by the stud or bolt through the tensioning device.

This request for relief is consistent with one granted to the licensee for BFN-2 by NRC letter dated July 26, 2000.

### 3.0 STAFF'S EVALUATION

The ISI Code of Record for BFN-3 requires 100% surface examination, typically using a fluorescent magnetic particle method, for RPV closure head nuts.

Typical conditions that would require corrective action prior to putting closure head nuts back into service would include corrosion, cracking and deformation. Surface examination procedures are not suitable for detection of corrosion and deformation, but are intended for the detection of cracks and thus have acceptance criteria limited to cracks. Without suitable acceptance criteria, all conditions that require corrective measures may not be adequately identified by surface inspection. The licensee's request for relief is to adopt later ASME Section XI code requirements. The 1995 Edition of Section XI, with the 1996 Addenda changed the requirement from surface examination to visual examination (VT-1) and implemented appropriate acceptance criteria. These VT-1 requirements (Article IWB-3000, Acceptance Standards for Flaw Indications, IWB-3517.1, Visual Examination, VT-1), include criteria for evaluation of not only crack-like indications but other conditions requiring corrective action, such as deformed or sheared threads and corrosion. Therefore, the VT-1 visual examination provides a comprehensive assessment of the condition of the closure head nut. As a result, the staff finds that VT-1 visual examination provides an acceptable level of quality and safety.

Based on the comprehensive assessment that the VT-1 visual examination provides, and considering that more recent editions of the Code require only a VT-1 visual examination on reactor pressure vessel closure head nuts, it is concluded that an acceptable level of quality and safety will be provided by the proposed alternative. Therefore, the licensee's proposed alternative is authorized pursuant to 10 CFR 50.55a(a)(3)(i).

### 4.0 CONCLUSION

The staff has evaluated the licensee's May 7, 2001, request for relief and has concluded that the alternative examination method proposed by the licensee will provide an acceptable level of quality and safety. Therefore, the licensee's Request for Relief No. 3-ISI-10 is authorized pursuant to 10 CFR 50.55a(a)(3)(i).

Principal Contributor: William O. Long

Date: May 31, 2001

Mr. J. A. Scalice  
Tennessee Valley Authority

**BROWNS FERRY NUCLEAR PLANT**

cc:

Mr. Karl W. Singer, Senior Vice President  
Nuclear Operations  
Tennessee Valley Authority  
6A Lookout Place  
1101 Market Street  
Chattanooga, TN 37402-2801

Mr. Jack A. Bailey, Vice President  
Engineering & Technical Services  
Tennessee Valley Authority  
6A Lookout Place  
1101 Market Street  
Chattanooga, TN 37402-2801

Mr. Karl W. Singer, Site Vice President  
Browns Ferry Nuclear Plant  
Tennessee Valley Authority  
P.O. Box 2000  
Decatur, AL 35609

General Counsel  
Tennessee Valley Authority  
ET 10H  
400 West Summit Hill Drive  
Knoxville, TN 37902

Mr. Robert J. Adney, General Manager  
Nuclear Assurance  
Tennessee Valley Authority  
5M Lookout Place  
1101 Market Street  
Chattanooga, TN 37402-2801

Mr. Ashok S. Bhatnagar, Plant Manager  
Browns Ferry Nuclear Plant  
Tennessee Valley Authority  
P.O. Box 2000  
Decatur, AL 35609

Mr. Mark J. Burzynski, Manager

Nuclear Licensing  
Tennessee Valley Authority  
4X Blue Ridge  
1101 Market Street  
Chattanooga, TN 37402-2801

Mr. Timothy E. Abney, Manager  
Licensing and Industry Affairs  
Browns Ferry Nuclear Plant  
Tennessee Valley Authority  
P.O. Box 2000  
Decatur, AL 35609

Senior Resident Inspector  
U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission  
Browns Ferry Nuclear Plant  
10833 Shaw Road  
Athens, AL 35611

State Health Officer  
Alabama Dept. of Public Health  
RSA Tower - Administration  
Suite 1552  
P.O. Box 303017  
Montgomery, AL 36130-3017

Chairman  
Limestone County Commission  
310 West Washington Street  
Athens, AL 35611