

March 5, 2001

MEMORANDUM TO: Robert A. Spence  
Regulatory Effectiveness and Human Factors Branch  
Division of Systems Analysis and Regulatory Effectiveness  
Office of Nuclear Regulatory Research

FROM: William D. Travers */RA/*  
Executive Director for Operations

SUBJECT: DIFFERING PROFESSIONAL OPINION ON  
STEAM GENERATOR TUBE INTEGRITY ISSUES

The purpose of this memorandum is to acknowledge your identification of technical concerns related to resonant vibrations in steam generator tubes during a main steam line break depressurization event. Your concerns along with the other steam generator issues raised in a differing professional opinion by Dr. J. Hopenfeld have been reviewed by an Advisory Committee on Reactor Safeguards' Ad Hoc Subcommittee. The Ad Hoc Subcommittee's conclusions and recommendations are documented in its summary report, "Voltage-Based Alternative Repair Criteria," NUREG-1740 dated February 2001. The Subcommittee found that the alternative repair criteria and the condition monitoring program endorsed by the staff can adequately protect public health and safety and that no immediate regulatory actions are necessary. Regarding your specific concerns, the Subcommittee recommended that the staff develop a better understanding of the dynamic processes associated with depressurization and how the processes could lead to damage progression.

I concur in the ACRS's conclusions and recommendations and have issued a tasking memorandum for the staff to develop an action plan to address the conclusions and recommendations in the summary report. Where additional technical effort is recommended the staff is developing or will develop additional activities under a controlled process to ensure the issues are prioritized and evaluated in accordance with established procedures and consistent with agency goals. I wish to thank you for bringing to my attention technical issues based on your first-hand experience with a steam line depressurization event.

cc: W. Kane, DEDR  
C. Paperiello, DEDMRS  
A. Thadani, RES  
M. Federline, RES  
S. Collins, NRR  
R. Zimmerman, NRR  
B. Sheron, NRR

March 5, 2001

MEMORANDUM TO: Robert A. Spence  
Regulatory Effectiveness and Human Factors Branch  
Division of Systems Analysis and Regulatory Effectiveness  
Office of Nuclear Regulatory Research

FROM: William D. Travers */RA/*  
Executive Director for Operations

SUBJECT: DIFFERING PROFESSIONAL OPINION ON  
STEAM GENERATOR TUBE INTEGRITY ISSUES

The purpose of this memorandum is to acknowledge your identification of technical concerns related to resonant vibrations in steam generator tubes during a main steam line break depressurization event. Your concerns along with the other steam generator issues raised in a differing professional opinion by Dr. J. Hopenfeld have been reviewed by an Advisory Committee on Reactor Safeguards' Ad Hoc Subcommittee. The Ad Hoc Subcommittee's conclusions and recommendations are documented in its summary report, "Voltage-Based Alternative Repair Criteria," NUREG-1740 dated February 2001. The Subcommittee found that the alternative repair criteria and the condition monitoring program endorsed by the staff can adequately protect public health and safety and that no immediate regulatory actions are necessary. Regarding your specific concerns, the Subcommittee recommended that the staff develop a better understanding of the dynamic processes associated with depressurization and how the processes could lead to damage progression.

I concur in the ACRS's conclusions and recommendations and have issued a tasking memorandum for the staff to develop an action plan to address the conclusions and recommendations in the summary report. Where additional technical effort is recommended the staff is developing or will develop additional activities under a controlled process to ensure the issues are prioritized and evaluated in accordance with established procedures and consistent with agency goals. I wish to thank you for bringing to my attention technical issues based on your first-hand experience with a steam line depressurization event.

cc: W. Kane, DEDR  
C. Paperiello, DEDMRS  
A. Thadani, RES  
M. Federline, RES  
S. Collins, NRR  
R. Zimmerman, NRR  
B. Sheron, NRR

Distribution:  
EDO R/F  
DEDR R/F

DOCUMENT NAME: G:\DEDR\DPO memo to Spence.wpd

\*See previous concurrence

To receive a copy of this document, indicate in the box: "C" = Copy without enclosures "E" = Copy with enclosures "N" = No copy

OFFICE	ROPMS*		C:ROPMS*		DEDR*		EDO			
NAME	DTerao		MSatorius		WKane		WTravers			
DATE	3/05/01		3/05/01		3/05/01		3/05/01			

OFFICIAL RECORD COPY