

From: <Richard.Olsson@ski.se>  
To: OWFN\_DO.owf4\_po(RFD)  
Date: Tue, Apr 25, 2000 10:42 AM  
Subject: VB: Comments nr 2. to Draft Final Technical Study SFP Risks at De com NPPs

RECEIVED  
2000 MAY -1 PM 5:16  
HOLE'S & LINE BRANCH  
US NRC

Dear Mr Dudley,

During our study of the report, we have found a couple more questions/comments and would appreciate if you can comment on them.

65 FR 8752  
Feb. 22, 2000  
5

Best regards

Richard Olsson

-----Ursprungligt meddelande-----

Från: ferenc@eskonsult.se [mailto:ferenc@eskonsult.se] Skickat: den 25 april 2000 16:07  
Till: Richard.Olsson@ski.se; mats@eskonsult.se  
Ämne: Comments nr 2. to Draft Final Technical Study SFP Risks at Decom NPPs

Bifogar ytterligare comments till NRC  
Mvh  
Ferenc Muller

Template: ADM-013

E-RIS = ADM-03  
Add Richard Dudley (RFD)  
George Hubbard (GTH)

**Memorandum**

Date  
2000-04-25

Page  
1(1)

Client

Project

Subject

To

Copy

Issued by  
Mats Sjöberg/ Ferenc Müller

Reviewed by

Approved by

**Questions/Comments on the NRC "Draft final technical study of spent fuel accidents risk at decommissioning nuclear power plants", 7590-01-P.**

Dear Mr Dudley,

During our study of the report, we have found a couple more questions/comments and would appreciate if you can comment on them.

1. Page A1-7 in the report says:

“When zirconium reaches temperatures where air oxidation is significant, the heat source is dominated by oxidation. The energy of the reaction is 262 kcal per mole of zirconium. In air, the oxidation rate and the energy of the reaction is higher than zirconium-steam oxidation.”

We can transfer 262 kcal to other units:  
 $262 \text{ kcal per mol Zr} = 1.1 \text{ MJ per mol Zr}$  (1 mol Zr = 91.2 kg Zr) =  
 $1.1\text{E}+06/91.2 = 1.2\text{E}+04 \text{ J/kg Zr}$ . We can conclude that the air oxidation energi according to the report is =  $1.2\text{E}+04 \text{ J per kg Zr}$

The corresponding values for Zr-steam reaktion in the Melcor manual =  
 $6.43\text{E}+06 \text{ J/kg Zr}$   
(Ref. Bottom Head Package, Reference Manual, Table 3.6. Heats of reaction at 1,700 K)  
The Maap code uses  $6.18\text{E}+08 \text{ J per mol Zr} = 6.78\text{E}+06 \text{ J/kg Zr}$ , for Zr-steam reaktion i.e. near the same as Melcor.

There is a factor 500 difference in the oxidaton energi and to the wrong direction.

2. Release Fractions, Page A4-5, Table A4-3.

100 % release is assumed for noble gases, iodine and cesium.

We feel that this is too conservative. The latest estimates by the Swedish Radiation Protection Institute for the Tjernobyl case says that 100 % of the noble gases, 50-60 % of the iodine and 20-40% of the cesium were released

at the accident.

Received: from igate ([148.184.176.31])  
by smtp (GroupWise SMTP/MIME daemon 4.1 v3)  
; Tue, 25 Apr 00 10:43:29 EDT  
Received: from nrc.gov  
by smtp-gateway ESMTPœ id KAA25549  
for <RFD@nrc.gov>; Tue, 25 Apr 2000 10:45:41 -0400 (EDT)  
From: Richard.Olsson@ski.se  
Received: from ANKIEAS-NT (ankieas-nt [192.36.213.31])  
by miranda.ski.se (8.9.3/8.9.1) with SMTP id QAA16511  
for <RFD@nrc.gov>; Tue, 25 Apr 2000 16:41:50 +0200 (MET DST)  
Message-Id: <TFSLAJBZ@ski.se>  
Date: Tue, 25 Apr 2000 16:42:54 +0200  
To: RFD@nrc.gov  
Subject: VB: Comments nr 2. to Draft Final Technical Study SFP Risks at De com NPPs  
MIME-version: 1.0  
Content-Type: multipart/mixed; boundary="TFS-with-MIME-and-DIME"  
X-Mailer: TFS Secure Messaging /450950013/400610145/320610265/  
X-Mailer: Version 4.51 Build 220