

ACRS-3151
PDR

CERTIFIED BY:
George Apostolakis - 6/22/99

CERTIFIED

Date Issued: 6/14/99

**ADVISORY COMMITTEE ON REACTOR SAFEGUARDS
MEETING OF THE JOINT SUBCOMMITTEES ON RELIABILITY AND PROBABILISTIC RISK
ASSESSMENT AND ON REGULATORY POLICIES AND PRACTICES
MEETING MINUTES - APRIL 7, 1999
ROCKVILLE, MARYLAND**

INTRODUCTION

The joint ACRS Subcommittees on Reliability and Probabilistic Risk Assessment and on Regulatory Policies and Practices met on April 7, 1999, at 11545 Rockville Pike, Rockville, MD, in Room T-2B3. The purpose of this meeting was to discuss the staff's proposed approach for revising the Commission's Safety Goal Policy Statement.

The entire meeting was open to public attendance. Mr. Michael T. Markley was the cognizant ACRS staff engineer for this meeting. The meeting was convened at 8:30 a.m. and adjourned at 11:45 a.m.

ATTENDEES

ACRS Members

G. Apostolakis, Chairman
J. Barton, Member
M. Bonaca, Member
M. Fontana, Member
T. Kress, Co-Chairman
D. Miller, Member

D. Powers, Member
R. Seale, Member
W. Shack, Member
R. Uhrig, Member
G. Wallis, Member
M. Markley, ACRS Staff

Principal NRC Speakers

T. King, RES*
J. Murphy, RES

RES Office of Nuclear Regulatory Research

Principal Industry Speakers

None

There were approximately 2 members of the public in attendance at this meeting. A complete list of attendees is in the ACRS Office File, and will be made available upon request. The presentation slides and handouts used during the meeting are attached to the office copy of these minutes.

RSO1

OPENING REMARKS BY THE SUBCOMMITTEE CHAIRMAN

Dr. George Apostolakis, Chairman of the Subcommittee on Reliability and Probabilistic Risk Assessment convened the meeting at 8:30 a.m. He introduced Dr. Kress as Chairman of the Subcommittee on Regulatory Policies and Practices and other Members of the joint Subcommittees in attendance. He stated that the purpose of this meeting was to discuss the staff's proposed approach for revising the Commission's Safety Goal Policy Statement.

Dr. Apostolakis stated that the Subcommittee had received no written comments or requests for time to make oral statements from members of the public.

NRC STAFF PRESENTATION

Mr. Thomas King, RES, led the discussions for the NRC staff. Messrs. Joseph Murphy, RES, and Richard Barrett, NRR, provided supporting discussion. Messrs. Seth Coplan, NMSS, and Gary Mizuno, OGC, also participated. Significant points made during the presentation include:

- In a Staff Requirements Memorandum dated June 30, 1999, the Commission approved the staff's recommendation to modify the Safety Goal Policy Statement and agreed that initiation of this modification should be deferred for a year.
- The staff proposes to expand the scope of Policy Statement to cover all NRC regulated activities (nuclear reactors, materials, waste, etc.).
- Benefits of an "overarching" Policy Statement include:
 - Clarity and consistency in goals, objectives, and approach to NRC safety decisions,
 - Increased public confidence,
 - Regulatory stability through a consistent framework for decisionmaking,
 - Facilitate risk-informed regulation.
- Possible elements of an overarching Policy Statement include:
 - Quantitative goals for public and worker protection,
 - Clarification of issues including: early versus latent fatality risk, goals for defining how safe is safe enough, consideration of populations most at risk, and protection of the environment (land interdiction).

SUBCOMMITTEE COMMENTS, CONCERNS, AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Members of the joint Subcommittees offered the following questions/comments:

Dr. Powers noted that critics of the NRC contend that the Agency does not have a good definition for safety. The staff stated that the answer may be different depending on who is

asked. The staff noted that there are a number of universally accepted answers and stated that the NRC could do better in communicating its meaning than has been done in the past. The staff suggested that it may not be easy to define in a conclusive way that satisfies everyone.

Dr. Apostolakis noted that the Committee had previously recommended revising the Policy Statement for reactors in its report dated May 11, 1999, but questioned whether the staff's revised approach may be overly ambitious. Dr. Apostolakis expressed doubt that an overarching Policy Statement could be accomplished within a year. The staff acknowledged these concerns and questioned whether it was worth doing at all. Dr. Apostolakis suggested that the staff develop a high-level set of principles in the form of qualitative statements within a year and that the quantitative aspects would take much longer. Dr. Miller agreed that the staff should first focus on developing a set of principles. Dr. Seale suggested that the staff might accomplish the reactor portion within one year (i.e., 10 CFR Part 50).

At the conclusion of the meeting, Dr. Apostolakis requested, for the April 1999 ACRS meeting, that the staff discuss a schedule of what might reasonably be accomplished within a year. Dr. Wallis stated that the idea of having an overarching policy statement is conceptually appealing, but noted that a statement of objectives, scope, utility, and assessment of feasibility is not apparent from the staff's presentation.

STAFF AND INDUSTRY COMMITMENTS

None.

SUBCOMMITTEE DECISIONS

The staff requested and the Subcommittees agreed to propose a letter for consideration by the Committee during the 461st ACRS meeting, April 7-10, 1999.

FOLLOW-UP ACTIONS

Dr. Apostolakis requested a copy of the Sandia siting study. The staff agreed to provide a copy of NUREG/CR-2239, "Technical Guidance for Siting Criteria Development."

BACKGROUND MATERIALS PROVIDED TO THE SUBCOMMITTEE PRIOR TO THIS MEETING

1. Subcommittee agenda.
2. Subcommittee status report.
3. Staff Requirements Memorandum dated June 30, 1998, Subject: SECY-98-101, Modifications to the Safety Goal Policy Statement.
4. Report dated May 11, 1998, from R.L. Seale, Chairman, ACRS to Shirley Ann Jackson, Subject: Elevation of CDF to a Fundamental Safety Goal and Possible Revision of the Commission's Safety Goal Policy Statement.

5. Meeting summary dated March 31, 1999, from J. Sorensen, ACRS Fellow, to R. Savio, Deputy Director, ACRS/ACNW, Subject: PRA Steering Committee 3/26/99
6. Safety Goal Policy Statement dated August 4, 1986.
7. Summary - NRC Internet homepage summary, Subject: History of Safety Goals at the NRC.

Note: Additional details of this meeting can be obtained from a transcript of this meeting available in the NRC Public Document Room, 2120 L Street, N.W. Washington, D.C. 20006, (202) 634-3274, or can be purchased from Ann Riley & Associates, Ltd., (Court Reporters and Transcribers) 1025 Connecticut Ave., NW, Suite 1014, Washington, D.C. 20036 (202) 842-0034.