RAS1662

DOCKETED April 17, 2000

> Kula Andra ADJU De Calendar

O

'00 APR 21 A8:54

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION BEFORE THE COMMISSION

))

)

In the Matter of

HYDRO RESOURCES, INC. P.O Box 15910 Rio Rancho, NM 87174 Docket No. 40-8968-ML

ASLBP No. 95-706-01-ML

INTERVENORS' MOTION FOR LEAVE TO REPLY TO HYDRO RESOURCES, INC.'S RESPONSE IN OPPOSITION TO MOTION TO REOPEN <u>AND SUPPLEMENT THE RECORD</u>

Pursuant to 10 C.F.R. § 2.1237 and the Commission's general authority to ensure the establishment of a meaningful record, Intervenors Eastern Navajo Diné Against Uranium Mining ("ENDAUM") and Southwest Research and Information Center ("SRIC") hereby request the Commission to allow leave to reply to the Nuclear Regulatory Commission ("NRC") Staff's Response to Motion to Reopen and Supplement the Record (April 4, 2000) (hereinafter "Staff's Response").

Although the right to reply to a response to a motion is not permitted under 10 C.F.R.
2.730(c), a party may seek leave to reply. <u>Detroit Edision Co.</u> (Enrico Fermi Atomic Plant, Unit
2), ALAB-469, 7 NRC 470, 471 (1978). Leave to reply is granted "sparingly, and then only
upon a strong showing of good cause." <u>Commonwealth Edison Co.</u> (Byron Station, Units 1 and
2), LBP-81-30A, 14 NRC 364, 372 (1981).

Intervenors submit that they have good cause to reply here, in order to correct incorrect statements by NRC Staff regarding (a) whether Intervenors have demonstrated that they have

Template = SECY-041

1

SEC-02

raised an exceptionally grave safety issue; (b) the qualifications of Intervenors' expert, Dr. John Fogarty, to provide expert testimony regarding the chemical toxicity of uranium; and (c) whether Intervenors have impermissibly attacked an NRC regulation. All three of these issues are fundamental to the disposition of the Intervenors' Motion to Reopen.

2

First, Intervenors seek to correct Staff's inaccurate assertion that the health effects of uranium have been appropriately dealt with and the Intervenors have not raised an exceptionally grave safety issue. Staff's Response at 12. The Staff admits that (1) in setting the uranium groundwater restoration standard for uranium, it relied upon a regulatory standard that does not take into account the chemical toxicity of uranium; and (2) that it relied on outdated and flawed studies from an EPA database that has not been updated in over ten years. See Affidavit of Christepher A. McKenney at 4-5, and Intervenors' Reply to NRC Staff's Response to Motion to Reopen and Supplement the Record (April 17, 2000) Attachment A.

Second, Intervenors seek to correct the NRC's objections to the consideration of the testimony of Dr. John Fogarty. Dr. Fogarty is well-qualified to conduct research on the subject and to comment on the literature survey discussed in his Affidavit. Further, he is well-qualified as a physician with 15 years of experience in basic science and clinical research to render an expert opinion on the chemical toxicity of chronic, low doses of uranium in drinking water and how it affects the kidney.

Third, Intervenors seek leave to correct the assertion that Intervenors have impermissibly attacked a regulation. Staff's Response at 15-16. Intervenors have only attacked the inappropriate application of a standard that does not govern the situation as a matter of law. Therefore, its applicability as a groundwater restoration standard in this case is open to challenge.

2

Given the importance of the safety issue involved here, *i.e.*, the appropriate standard for restoration of groundwater, it is essential for the Commission to have a full and accurate record on these questions in order to make an informed decision whether to reopen the record. See Pacific Gas and Electric Co. (Diablo Canyon Nuclear Power Plant, Units 1 and 2), ALAB-756, 16 NRC 1340, 1343 (1983). Accordingly, the Commission should grant Intervenors' request to file the attached Reply to the NRC Staff's Response to Motion to Reopen and Supplement the Record.

Respectfully submitted,

Geoffrev H. Fettus Douglas Meiklejohn Lila Bird NM ENVIRONMENTAL LAW CENTER 1726 M Street, N.W., Suite 600 1405 Luisa Street, Suite 5 Santa Fe NM 87505 (505) 989-9022

zer fHF VIIM

Diane Curran HARMON, CURRAN, SPIELBERG, & EISENBERG, LLP Washington DC 20036 (202) 328-6874

April 17, 2000

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION BEFORE THE COMMISSION

)

)

In the Matter of

HYDRO RESOURCES, INC. P.O. Box 15910 Rio Rancho, NM 87174 Docket No. 40-8968-ML ASLBP No. 95-706-01-ML

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on April 17, 2000, I caused to be served copies of the foregoing:

Motion for Leave to Reply to Nuclear Regulatory Commission Staff's Response to Motion to Reopen and Supplement the Record

upon the following persons by U.S. mail, first class, and in accordance with the requirements of 10 C.F.R. § 2.712. Service was also made via e-mail to the parties marked below by an asterisk. The envelopes were addressed as follows:

Office of the Secretary U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission* Washington, D.C. 20555-0001 Attn: Rulemakings and Adjudications Staff

Richard A. Meserve, Chairman U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission Washington, D.C. 20555

Greta J. Dicus, Commissioner U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission Washington, D.C. 20555

Nils J. Diaz, Commissioner U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission Washington, D.C. 20555 Edward McGaffigan, Jr., Commissioner U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission Washington, D.C. 20555

Jeffrey S. Merrifield, Commissioner U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission Washington, D.C. 20555

Administrative Judge Thomas S. Moore* Atomic Safety and Licensing Board Mail Stop T-3 F23 U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission Washington D.C. 20555-0001

Office of Commission Appellate Adjudication U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission Washington, D.C. 20555 Administrative Judge Thomas D. Murphy* Special Assistant Atomic Safety and Licensing Board Mail Stop - T-3 F23 U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission Washington DC 20555

Mitzi Young, Esq. John T. Hull, Esq. Office of the General Counsel* Mail Stop - O-15 B18 U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission Washington, DC 20555

Diane Curran, Esq. HARMON, CURRAN, SPIELBERG & EISENBERG, LLP* 1726 M Street, N.W., Suite 600 Washington DC 20036

William Paul Robinson Chris Shuey SRIC P.O. Box 4524 Albuquerque, NM 87106

Kathleen Tsosie ENDAUM P.O. Box 150 Crownpoint, NM 87313

Eric Jantz, Esq. DNA - People's Legal Services PO Box 116 Crownpoint, NM 87313-0116

Levon Henry, Attorney General Steven J. Bloxham, Esq. Navajo Nation Department of Justice P.O. Drawer 2010 Window Rock, AZ 86515 Anthony J. Thompson, Esq. Frederick Phillips, Esq. David Lashway, Esq. SHAW PITTMAN 2300 "N" Street, N.W. Washington, D.C. 20037-1128

Jep Hill, Esq. Jep Hill & Associates P.O. Box 30254 Austin, TX 78755

Dated at Santa Fe, New Mexico, April 17, 2000

rolling H. Fettos