Part 21 (PAR)
Event\#
51907


## PART 21 - ANOMALY RELATED TO MICRO SWITCHES

The following report was received via email:
"Based on test data, Rotor believes an unsafe condition may exist as defined under 10CFR21. The adhesive formulation used for the construction of V12 and K5 safety related micro switches was altered by the switch maker's sub-supplier. K5 switches have no reported failures, but are affected because of construction. The altered adhesive formulation outgases an insulating material at elevated temperatures, which coats the switch contacts as it cools, and can prevent the conduction of electricity."

675 Mile Crossing, Ulvd
Rochester, New Yoik 14624
tel: +15852472304
fix: +1 585 2472303
www.rotork.com
mlo@rotork.com
To: NRC Operations Center From:


Dear sir/modame,
please find attweted a Prot 21 notification from Roterte Contrabinc. concerning sofety rellitt miero-saractes Port Nös and deserciction:

$$
\begin{array}{ll}
N 69-921, & N 12 / 3252 \\
N 69-926, & 15 / 3252 \\
N 69-838, & 155 / 3252-A 2
\end{array}
$$

Aho included is Rotort engeincering repart ER857.
Sincercly
Patrick A Alsew
Quality Ansurance Manazer.

# rotorif <br> Controls 

Rotork Controls Inc.
675 Mile Crossing Blva
Rochester, New York
14624
U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission,
tel: +1585 2472304
Washington, DC 20555-0001
fax: +1 5852472308
www.rotork.com
From: Patrick A. Shaw, P.E
To: NRC Operations Center
Datc: May $4^{\text {th }} 2016$

Subject: Rotork Controls Inc. Part 21 Notification, concerning V12 [Pt No N69-921] and K5 [N69838 \& N69-926] safety related micro switches

Dear Sir/Madame,
On January 25 $5^{\text {th }} 2016$ Rotork Controls Inc. opened a formal Part 21 investigation into an anomaly reported by Duke Energy from testing conducted at Kinectrics in Canada. The anomaly related to Basic micro switches incorporated within Rotork safety related NA1E range electric actuators; also referred to as electric Valve Operators. The anomaly description was "switches failed to change state [Pt No N69-921]" and was observed after ten (10) days of thermal aging at 125 Centigrade ( 257 Fahrenheit).

On March $18^{\text {dil }} 2016$ Rotork wrote to the U.S. NRC requesting a 40 day extension to the 60 day investigation period permitted under 10CFR21 (Ref. Event No ML16088A087).

Based on test data, Rotork believes an unsafe condition may exist as defined under 10CFR21. The adhesive formulation used for the construction of V12 and K5 safety related micro switches was altered by the switch maker's sub-supplier. K5 switches have no reported failures, but are affected because of construction. The altered adhesive formulation outgases an insulating material at elevated temperatures, which coats the switch contacts as it cools, and can prevent the conduction of electricity.

The anomaly onset is a function of temperature and time. The anomaly may occur when a switch is maintained above $90^{\circ} \mathrm{C}\left(194^{\circ} \mathrm{F}\right)$ for an extended period of time, and then subsequently cooled below $65^{\circ} \mathrm{C}(150)^{\circ} \mathrm{F}$ (see Rotork Engineering Report ER857 for details). Based on Rotork's NCR data this anomaly has not been reported by any U.S. NRC licensed operator. The anomaly is not observed at normal operating temperatures. Furthermore, all switches are expected to function normally while at elevated temperatures (i.e. above $65^{\circ} \mathrm{C}\left(150^{\circ} \mathrm{F}\right)$ ). The concern is limited to accident design based events that include heating above $90^{\circ} \mathrm{C}\left(194^{\circ} \mathrm{F}\right)$ and subsequent cooling below $65^{\circ} \mathrm{C}\left(150^{\circ} \mathrm{F}\right)$. Tests described within report ER857 suggests the anomaly has a lower limit of $90^{\circ} \mathrm{C}\left(194^{\circ} \mathrm{F}\right)$ (i.e. the switch is expected to function normally if the temperature is maintained below $90^{\circ} \mathrm{C}\left(194^{\circ} \mathrm{F}\right)$ ). To assist the industry with risk assessment, the report includes tests performed using temperature time accident

## rotoris <br> Controls

protiles provided by the industry. The extent of condition affects switches manufactured from 2007 to 2015, inclusive. Product supplied prior to this date was tested and did not exhibit the anomaly.

Below is a summary in accordance with 10CFR Part 21.21(d)(4), which includes a list of all supplied actuators and spare components containing V12 and K5 switches affected by this notification.

## Sincerely



Patrick A. Shaw, P.E
Quality Assurance Manager
Tel (585) 770-1019
Patrick.Shaw@rotork.com


# rotorf <br> Controls 

Required information as per 10CFR Part 21.21 (d)(4) follows:
(i) Name and address of the individual or individuals informing the Commission.

Patrick A. Shaw, P.E.
Rotork Controls Inc, 675 Mile Crossing Blvd, Rochester, New York 14624
(ii) Identification of the facility, the activity, or the basic component supplied for such facility or such activity within the United States which fails to comply or contains a defect.

Rotork part number N69-921 Micro-Switch V12;3252 (RS104) and N69-926 MicroSwitch K5/3252 (RS378) and N69-838 Micro-Switch K5/3252-A2 (RS366) manufactured by Johnson Electric (Formerly Burgess) from 2007 to 2015.
(iii) Identification of the firm constructing the facility or supplying the basic component which fails to comply or contains a defect.

Rotork Controls Ltd
Brassmill Lane
Bath, England
BA1 3JQ
(iv) Nature of the defect or failure to comply and the safety hazard which is created or could be created by such defect or failure to comply.

The supplier (Johnson Electric) incorporates a small amount of adhesive in each switch's construction to secure the two halves of the switch housing together. The specified adhesive \& hardener are AY103 \& HY951, respectively. Both are provided to Johnson Electric by Huntsman. To comply with legislation concerning toxicity, Huntsman altered the formulation and renamed the adhesive AY103-1; the HY951 is unaltered. This change was not formally communicated by Huntsman and the modified adhesive name was not noticed by Johnson Electric.

The altered adhesive formulation outgases at elevated temperatures and deposits an insulating material layer onto the switch internal electrical contacts as it cools (see Rotork Engineering Report ER857 for specifics). The deposit of insulation material results in contact resistances exceeding the supplier acceptance criteria of $25 \mathrm{~m} \Omega$ max, the industry $500 \mathrm{~m} \Omega$ max acceptance criteria and in some cases causes an open circuit.

## rotoris <br> Controls

(v) The date on which the information of such defect or failure to comply was obtained.

January 25 2016
(vi) In the case of a basic component which contains a defect or fails to comply, the number and location of these components in use at, supplied for, being supplied for, or may be supplied for, manufactured, or being manufactured for one or more facilities or activities subject to the regulations in this part.

## V12 switch list

| Order | Part | Qty | Description |  | Custamer_PO | Project |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| $\begin{aligned} & 355818 \\ & \text { fommally } \\ & 840993010301 \end{aligned}$ | NA/3S581801 | I | I4NA IEFAI4A N | WTU202IVNO | $\begin{aligned} & \text { RSP35818 (RCI } \\ & \text { SERVICE) / } \\ & \text { DO108308 (DUKE) } \end{aligned}$ | CATAWBA |
| B38669 | NA/33866901 | 1 | IGNA IFAI4A N | WTU 2023VNO | 00051126 | MCGUIRE |
| B38773 | NNB3877301 | 3 | 30NAX I FAIGA N | WIU 2023VNO | 00078626 | CATAWBA |
| 838786 | NAB38786\%1 | I | 16NA IFAI4A N | WTU 2023VNO | 00079069 | MCGUIRE |
| B38854 | NA/B388.540 | 1 | 90NA 1FA30A N | WTU 202IVNO | 00080357 | MCGUIRE |
| B38854 | NAB3885402 | 1 | 7 NA I FAIOA N | WTU 2023VNO | 00080357 | MCGUIRE |
| B38945 | NA/B3894501 | 3 | IGNA IFAI4A N | WTU 2023VNO | 00081992 | MCGUIRE |
| B38945 | NA/B3894502 | 5 | 7NA 1 FAIOA N | WTU 2023VNO | 00081992 | MCGUIRE |
| 838963 | NA/B3896301 | 6 | IINA IFAIOA N | WTU2023VNO | 00082321 | MCGUIRE |
| 839003 | NAB390030] | 2 | 90NA IFAJOA N | WTU 2021VNO | $0 \times 1083027$ | CATAWBA |
| B39315 | NA/B3931501 | 1 | 70NAX I FA25A N | WTU 2021VNO | 00087663 | CATAWBA |
| B39400 | NA/B3940001 | 1 | 40NA I FA2SA N | WTU 2023VNO | 00088722 | MCGUIRE |
| B39435 | NA/B3943501 | 1 | 14NA IFAIAA N | WTU 202IVNO | 00089037 | CATAWBA |
| B39475 | NA/B3947501 | I | 30NA IFAl6A N | WTU 2023VNO | 00689808 | MCGUIRE |
| B39693 | NA/B3969301 | 6 | 16NA IEFAIAA N | WTU 2023VNO | 00092438 | MCGUIRE |
| B3972S | NAB3972501 | 4 | 30NAX IEFAIGA N | WTU 2023 VNO | 40726 (CRANE) | MCGUIRE |
| B39765 | NA/B3976501 | 1 | 14NA I FAl4A N | WTU 202iVNO | 00093385 | CATAWBA |
| B39836 | NA/B3983601 | 2 | IINA IFAIOA N | WTU202IVNO | 00094314 | CATAWBA |
| B39970 | NA/B3997001 | 1 | 30NAX IEFAIGA N | WTU 2023VNO | 00096162 | CATAWBA |
| B39974 | NA/33997401 | 1 | IINA IEFAIOA N | WTU 2021VNO | 00096233 | MCGUIRE |
| 839974 | NA B3997402 | 1 | 30NAX IEFAI6A N | WTU 2023VNO | 00096233 | MCGUIRE |
| B39975 | NA/B3997501 | 2 | IINA IEFAIOA N | WTU 202IVNO | 00096222 | CATAWBA |
| B39977 | NAB3997701 | 2 | 14NA IEFA14A N | WTU 2021VNO | 00096249 | CATAWBA |
| B40076 | NAB4007601 | 2 | 40NAX I FA25A N | WTU 2021 VNO | 00097864 | CATAWBA |
| B40243 | NA/B4024301 | 2 | IINA I FAIOA N | WTU2023VNO | 00099808 | MCGUIRE |
| B40243 | NA/B4024302 | I | 70NA IFA25A N | WTU 2023VNO | 00099808 | MCGURE |
| B40312 | NA B4031201 | I | 30NA IEFAI6A N | WTU 2023VNO | 00099864 | MCGUIRE |

# rotork 

Controls

| Orider | Part | Qty | Description |  | Customicr_l ${ }^{\text {d }}$ | Projeet |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| B40313 | NA/134031301 | 2 | 14NA IEFAIAA N | WTU 202.3VNO | 00090865 | MCGUIRE |
| B40451 | NA/84(14510) | 2 | 16NA IEFAIAA N | WTU 2023VNO | (10102329 | MCGUIRE |
| B40877 | NA/B4087701 | 2 | IINA IFFAIOA N | WTU 202IVNO | 00106558 | CATAWBA |
| B40877 | NA/34087702 | I | IGNAX IEFAIAA N | WTU 202IVNO | 00106558 | CATAWBA |
| 1340993 | NNB44099301 | 4 | I4NA IEFAIAA N | WTU 202IVNO | 0108308 | CATAWBA |
| B41029 | NA/R4 102\%01 | I | 30NAX IFFAI6A N | WTU 2023VNO | 43604 (CRANE) | MCGUIRE |
| B41560 | NA/B41.56001 | 3 | 16NA IEFAI4A N | WTU 2023VNO | 00115319 | MCGUTRE |
| B41573 | NA/B4157301 | 2 | IINA IEFAIOA N | WTU 2023VNO | 00115417 | MCGURE |
| B41573 | NA/84 157302 | 2 | 40NA IEFA25A N | WTU 2023 VNO | 00115417 | MCGUIRE |
| B41699 | NN/B4 60\%)1 | 1 | IINA IEAIOA N | WIU2023VNO | 00115991 | MCGUIRE |
| B41617 | NA/B4161701 | I | 14NA IEFAI4A N | WTU 2023VNO | 00116103 | MCGUIRE |
| B41785 | NA/34178501 | 1 | IINA IFAIOA N | WTU 2023VNO | 00118959 | MCGUIRE |
| 1341910 | NA/B4141001 | 2 | I6NA IEFAIAA N | WTU 2023 VNO | 00120513 | MCGURE |
| B41981 | NA/B4198101 | I | 14NA IEFAI4A N | WTU 2023VNO | 00121598 | MCGURE |
| B419k] | NAR4158102 | I | 40NA IEFA25A N | WTU 2023VNO | 00121.598 | MCGUIRE |
| B42068 | NA/B4206801 | I | [4NA IEFAI4A N | WTU 202IVNO | 00123289 | CATAWBA |
| B42078 | NA/B4207801 | 1 | 90NA Ifa30a N | WIU2021VNO | 00123469 | MCGUIRE |
| 3422.4 | NAB422.3401 | 2 | 16NA IEFAI4A N | WTU 2023VNO | 00126085 | MCGUIRE |
| B42279 | NA/B42279)1 | 2 | 70NA IEFA2SA N | WTU 2023VNO | 00127067 | MCGUIRE |
| B42279 | NA/B4227902 | 2 | IINA IEFAIOA N | WTU 2023VNO | 00127067 | MCGUIRE |
| B42353 | NA ${ }^{\text {P4235301 }}$ | 2 | I4NA IEFAI4A N | WTU 2021VNO | 00128249 | CATAWBA |
| B42373 | NA/B423730t | I | 90NA IFA30A N | WTU 2023VNO | 00128425 | MCGUIRE |
| B42457 | NA/B4245701 | 1 | 40NA IEFA2SA N | WTU 2023VNO | 00130114 | MCGUIRE |
| B42525 | NA/B4252501 | 1 | I6NAX IEFAI4A N | WTU 2021 VNO | 00131141 | CATAWBA |
| B42525 | NA/B4252502 | 1 | 30NAX IEFAIGA N | WTU 2021 VNO | 00131141 | CATAWBA |
| B42525 | NA/B4252503 | 1 | IINA IEFAIOA N | WTU 202IVNO | 00131141 | CATAWBA |
| B42585 | NA/B4258501 | 1 | 40NA IEFA25A N | WTU2023VNO | 00132277 | MCGUIRE |
| B42696 | NĀB4269601 | 1 | IINA IEFAIOA N | WTU2023VNO | 00133938 | MCGULIRE |
| B42831 | NA'B4283101 | 2 | 14NA IEFAIAA N | WTU2021VNO | 00135938 | CATAWBA |
| B42855 | NA/B4285501 | 6 | 40NA IEFA25A N | WTU 2029VNO | $\begin{aligned} & 97567 \\ & \text { (FLOWSERVE) } \end{aligned}$ | LUNGMEN |
| B42868 | NA/B4286901 | 2 | IINA IEFAIOA N | WTU 2023VNO | 00136550 | MCGUIRE |
| B42871 | NA/B4287101 | I | 40NA IEFA25A N | WTU 2023VNO | 00136593 | MCGUIRE |
| B42918 | NA/B4291801 | 1 | 70NA IEFA2.5A N | WTU 2023VNO | 00137202 | CATAWBA |
| B42918 | NA/B4291802 | 1 | 40NAX IEFA25A N | WTJ 2023 VNO | 00137202 | CATAWBA |
| B4,2922 | NA/B4292201 | 1 | J6NAX IEFAIAA N | WTU 202]VNO | 00137242 | CATAWBA |
| B42922 | NA/B4292202 | 1 | 30NAX IESAIGA N | WTU 202IVNO | 00137242 | CATAWBA |
| B42953 | NA/B4295301 | 1 | 14NA IEFAIAA N | WTU 2023VNO | 00137763 | MCGUIRE |
| B43608 | NA/B4360801 | 1 | IINA IEFAIOA N | WTU 2023VNO | 00142102 | MCGUIRE |

Page 5 of 12

| Order | Pars | Qty | Descriplion | Customer_ro | Project |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| B43661 | WNR2398 | 3 | NAISSE L2SW V12 AOPI | 00142224 | MCGUIRE |
| 843946 | WNX2308 | 12 | NAISSE L2SW V12 AOPI | RSP381104 | DLKF MCGUIRE |
| B44151 | NA B4415101 | 2 | IANA IEFAI4A N WTUZO2IVNO | 00143556 | DUKE Catawba |
| 1344269 | NN/34426901 | 1 | IGNA IEFAI4A N WTU2023VNO | 100143880 | MCGUIRE |
| B451767 | NA/B4506705 | 2 | MÓD3A UUNAI C -WISE SW.MFCH ASSY. | 104962 | OPG |
| 845067 | NA/B4506706 | 2 | MOD8A 12 SW WTU 2029VNO AOPI ASSY. | 104962 | OPG |
| B45074 | NAM64507401 | 2 | IINA ILFAIOA N WTU 2023VNO | 00145881 | MCGUIRE |
| 846016 | NN'B4601601 | 1 | I4NA IEFAIAA N WTU 2023 VNO | 00147120 | MCGUIRE |
| 846022 | NA/B4602201 | 1 | IINA IEFAIOA N WTU2023VNO | 00147790 | MCGUIRE |
| B46028 | WN8239S | 5 | NAl/SE GEW VI2 AOPI | 00147787 | CATAWBA |
| B46724 | NNB4672401 | 1 | gina iefajoa n WTU 2023 VNO | 00148800 | MCGUIRE |
| B46724 | NA/B4672402 | 2 | IGNA IEFA14A N WTU2023VNO | 00148800 | MCGUIRE |
| 847288 | WN82398 | 9 | NAlise I2SW Viz AOPI | $\begin{aligned} & \hline \text { RSP39208 (RCI } \\ & \text { SERVICE): } \\ & 00147756 \text { (DUKE) } \end{aligned}$ | MCGUIRE |
| B473.52 | NA/B4735201 | 1 | IINA IEFAIOA N WTU2023VNO | 00150030 | MCGUIRE |
| B47745 | NA-03-102 | 5 | NAI/5 SWITCH MECH | $\begin{aligned} & \hline 011208 \mathrm{~N}(\mathrm{RCC}) / \\ & 00208959 \text { (OPG) } \end{aligned}$ | OPG |
| B48378 | NA/B4837801 | 8 | IINA SEFIOB4 IWN3 WTU 2021 VNO | 04284SR ECU CORPORATION | NOT KNOWN |
| B48687 | NA/B4868701 | 1 | IINA IEFAIOA N WTU 2023VNO | 00152920 | MCGUIRE |
| B48811 | NNB4881101 | 1 | IGNA LEFAI4A N WTU2023VNO | 00153320 | MCGUIRE |
| B48925 | NA/B4892501 | 2 | IINA IEFAIOA N WTU 202IVNO | 00153564 | CATAWBA |
| B49264 | NA/B4926401 | 1 | I4NA 1EFAI4A N WTU 2021 VNO | 00154397 | CATAWBA |
| B49369 | NA/B4936901 | 2 | IINA IEFAIOA N WIU 2021 VNO | 00155275 | DUKE CATAWBA |
| B49459 | NA/B4945901 | 1 | 14NA IEFA14A N WTU 202IVNO | 00155653 | CATAWBA |
| 849620 | NA/84962001 | 1 | MOD8A 6 SW WTU 202IVNO AOPL ASSY. | 205435 | AK NUCLEAR 1 |
| 849770 | NA/B4977001 | 1 | 14NA IEFAI4A N WTU 2023VNO | 00156719 | MCGUIRE |
| 849774 | WN80262 | 4 | MODILA TIINAl/4 COMP KIT POST 78 | RSP41188 (RCI SERVICE) 0230945 (SEABROOK) | SEABROOK |
| 849774 | NA-03-102 | 1 | NAl/5 SWITCH MECH | RSP4II88 (RCI SERVICE) 0230945 (SEABROOK) | SEABROOK |
| 849777 | WN82398 | 6 | NA1/5E 12SWV12 AOPI | RSP41660(RCl SERVICE): 001S5079 (DUKE) | MCGURE |
| 849779 | WN80262 | 2 | MODILA 7/1INAI/4 COMP KIT POST 78 | RSP41189 (RCI <br> SERVICE)/ <br> 02302948 <br> (SEABROOK) <br> RSPI | SEABROOK |
| 849779 | NA/B497791I | 1 | 7 NA 1 FA10A N WTU 202IVNO | RSP41189 (RCI SERVICE) 0230248 (SEABROOK) | SEABROOK |

Page 6 of 12

# rotorit <br> Controls 

| Order | Part | Qty | Description | Customer_PO | Project |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1349779 | NA/B4)77912 | I | 7NAIFAIOA N WTU202IVNO | $\begin{aligned} & \text { RSP4I189(RCI } \\ & \text { SERVICE) } \\ & \text { 02302948 } \\ & \text { (SEABROOK) } \end{aligned}$ | SEABROOK |
| 849781 | NA/84978101 | 1 | I4NA IEFA14A N WTU2021VNO | $\begin{aligned} & \text { RSE39823 (RCI } \\ & \text { SERVICE) } \\ & 00155773 \text { (DUKE) } \end{aligned}$ | CATAWBA |
| B49783 | NA/B4978301 | I | 14NA JEFAI4A N WTU2023VNO | $\begin{aligned} & \text { RSE39410 (RCI } \\ & \text { SERVICE)! } \\ & 00155086 \text { (DUKE) } \end{aligned}$ | MCGUIRE |
| B49842 | NA/B4984201 | 1 | 90NA IEFA30A N WTU 2023VNO | 00156967 | MCGUIRE |
| B49890 | WN80334 | 1 | MODID I4IIGNAS G/CASE MAINT KIT POST 78 | $\begin{aligned} & \hline 012171 \mathrm{~N} \text { (RCC)/ } \\ & 00214820 \text { (OPG) } \end{aligned}$ | OPG |
| B50131 | NA-03-102 | 2 | NAI/5 SWITCH MECH | 00158579 | MCGUIRE |
| B50641 | NABS064101 | 1 | IINA JEFALOA N WTU2023VNO | 00159726 | MCGUIRE |
| B51066.5 | WN82398 | 8 | NAI/SE I2SW VI2 AOPI | NCR114367(RCI)/ 00157511 (DUKE) | MCGUIRE |
| B50775 | WN81509 | 5 | MOD3B V12 NA'E' S/M | 00160864 | MCGUIRE |
| B51199 | NA/B5119901 | 1 | I4NA IEFAI4A N WTU2023VNO | 00162285 | MCGUIRE |
| BS1201 | NABSi2010] | 1 | IINA IEFAIOA N WTU2023VNO | 00162286 | MCGUIRE |
| B51470 | NA/B514700] | 1 | 90NA IFA30A N WTU 2023VNO | 00163632 | MCGUIRE |
| B51625 | NA-03-102 | 4 | NAl/5 SWITCH MECH | NU02SR748437 | VC SUMMER ST |
| BS1684 | NAB5 168401 | 1 | I6NA IEFAI4A N WTU 2023VNO | 00164715 | MCGUJRE |
| B51902 | NA/B5190201 | 2 | 30NAX IEFAIGA N WTU2023VNO | 00165981 | MCGURE |
| B52307 | NA/B\$230701 | 1 | 14NA IEFAI4A N WTU 202IVNO | $\begin{aligned} & \text { RSE41495 (RCI } \\ & \text { SERVICE )/ } \\ & \text { 00I64457 (DUKE) } \end{aligned}$ | CATAWBA |
| B52439 | NA/B5243001 | I | 90NA IEFA30A N WTU 2023VNO | 00168826 | MCGUIRE |
| 852790 | NA/B5279001 | I | 16NA IEFA14A N WTU 2023VNO | 00170740 | MCGUIRE |
| B52801 | NA/B5280101 | 2 | 30NAX IEFAIGA N WTU2023VNO | $\begin{aligned} & 57081 \\ & \text { CRANE NUKE } \end{aligned}$ | DUKE |
| B53470 | NA/B534700] | 3 | 7 NA IEFAIOB4 IWN3 WTU 2023VNO | 8907060N | DUKE MCGUIRE |
| B53613 | NA/B5361301 | 1 | I4NA IEFAI4A N WTU202]VNO | 00172853 (DUKE) | CATAWBA |
| B54087 | NA/B5408701 | 2 | 30NAX IEFAI6A N WTU 2023VNO | 58666 | CRANE NUKE |
| B54177 | NA/B5417701 | 1 | IANA IEFAI4A N WTU 202!VNO | $\begin{aligned} & \text { RSP4629)(RCI } \\ & \text { SERVICE) } \\ & \text { B441510101 } \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { DUKE } \\ & \text { CATAWBA } \end{aligned}$ |
| B54177 | NA/B5417704 | 1 | I4NA IEFAI4A N WTU 2021VNO | $\begin{aligned} & \text { RSP46290 (RCI } \\ & \text { SERVICE) i } \\ & 00174477 \text { (DUKE) } \end{aligned}$ | CATAWBA |
| B54330 | NA/85433001 | 1 | 14NA IEFAI4A N WTU202IVNO | 00177225 | $\begin{aligned} & \text { DUKE } \\ & \text { CATAWBA } \end{aligned}$ |
| B54444 | WN 2395 | 1 | NA USE 6SW V12 AOPI | NCR136918(RCI) 00176305 (DUKE) | MCGUIRE |

Controls

| Order | Parl | Qty | Description | Customer PO | Project |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| B54444 | WN82348 | 10 | NAI/SE 12SW VI2 AOPI | NCR136914 (RCl) 00176305 (DUKE) | MCGUIRE |
| 854727 | NA/B5472701 | 2 | I4NA IEFAI4A N WTU202IVNO | 00179165 | $\begin{aligned} & \text { DUKE } \\ & \text { CATAWBA } \end{aligned}$ |
| B54727 | NA/B5472702 | 2 | 14NA IEFA14A N WTU 2021 VNO | 00179165 | DUKE CATAWBA |
| B. 4848 | NA-03-102 | 6 | NALIS SWITCH MECH | 00179639 | CATAWBA |
| B56398 | NA B 5639801 | 2 | I4NA IEFAI4A N WTU 2021 VNO | 00186461 | CATAWBA |
| B56437 | NA/B5643706 | I | IINA IEFAIOA N WTU2023VNO | RSP48672 | DUKE <br> MCGURIE |
| B56515 | NABB56S1501 | I | IINA IEFAIOA N WTU 2023VNO | 00186989 | DUKE MCGUIRE |
| B57235 | NA/B5723501 | 1 | 90NA IEFA30A N WTU 2023VNO | 00189572 | DUKEMCGUIRE |
| B57239 | NABB572301 | 3 | I6NA IEFAI4A N WTU 2023VNO | 00189629 | DUKEMCGUIRE |
| B57239 | NABS5723902 | 1 | 90 NA IEFA30A N WTU 2023VNO | 00189629 | DUKEMCGUIRE |
| B57239 | NABE5723903 | 1 | 90NA IEFA30A N WTU 2023VNO | 00189629 | DUKEMCGUIRE |
| BS7443 | NA/B5;44301 | 3 | TNA SEFAlOB4 IWN3 WTU 2220 VNO | 1193547 | OPG ESW STRA |
| B57603 | NA/B5760301 | 1 | 70NAX I FA2SA N WTU 202IVNO | 00191051 | CATAWBA |
| 857687 | WN803,34 | 1 | MODID 14I]6NA5 GICASE MAINT KIT POST 78 | $\begin{aligned} & \text { P0012240-4 (RCC) } \\ & 00286201 \text { (OPG) } \end{aligned}$ | OPG |
| 857722 | NA/B577220] | 1 | 40NA IEFA25A N WTU 2023 VNO | 00191584 | MCGUIRE |
| B58332 | NA/B5833201 | 2 | I4NA IEFAI4A N WTU 2023VNO | 00193561 | DUKEMCGUIRE |
| B58901 | NA/B5890101 | I | IINA JEFAIOA N WTU2023VNO | 00195572 | DUKE <br> MCGUIRE |
| B59205 | NA/B5920501 | 4 | 16NA IEFA14A N WTU2023VNO | 00196629 | DUKE. OCONEE |
| B59205 | NA/85920502 | 1 | 16NA IEFAI4A N WTU2023VNO | 00196629 | DUKE. OCONEE |
| 859319 | NA/B5931901 | 1 | IGNA IEFAI4A N WTU202IVNO | 00197087 | CATAWBA |
| 859392 | NA/B5939201 | 1 | 70NA IEFA25A N WTU2023VNO | 00197274 | DUKE MCGUIRE |
| 859392 | NA/B5939202 | 1 | IINA IEFAIOA N WTU 2023VNO | 00197274 | DUKE MCGUIRE |
| 859879 | NA/B5987901 | 1 | IINA IEFAIOA N WTU 202iVNO | 00199184 | DUKE CATAWBA |
| B60213 | NA/B602130l | 1 | 7 NA SEFALOA N WTC 202lVNO | $\begin{aligned} & \text { POOK139 (RCI)/ } \\ & \text { P1500268 (NEWMAN } \\ & \text { HATTERSLEY) } \\ & \hline \end{aligned}$ | OPG |
| B69896 | NA/B6089601 | 2 | 11NA IEFAIOA N WTU 2023VNO | 03003170 | MCGUIRE |
| B61560 | WN81509 | 2 | MOD3B VI2 NA'E'S/M | 03007832 | CATAWBA |
| B61 721 | N69-921 | 6 | SWITCH-M VI2/3252 | $\begin{aligned} & \hline \text { RSP54951/ } \\ & \text { NCR164927 (RCI } \\ & \text { SERVICE } \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { O13962010301) } \\ & \text { OPG } \end{aligned}$ |
| B61721 | NA/B6172301 | i | 7 NA SEFA10A N WrC 2023VNO | $\begin{aligned} & \text { RSPS4951/ } \\ & \text { NCRI64927 (RCI } \\ & \text { SERVICE) } \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { O13962010301 - } \\ & \text { OPG } \end{aligned}$ |

Page 8 of 12

## rotoris Controls

| Order | 1'art | Qty | Description | Cuslamer_PO | Projert |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| B61721 | WNS150\% | 1 | MOD3 3 VI2 NA'E' SM | $\begin{aligned} & \text { RSP5495II } \\ & \text { NCRI64927 (RCI } \\ & \text { SFRVICE) } \end{aligned}$ | O13962010301NEWMAN HATTERSLEY OPG |
| D12989 | NADDI298501 | 2 | 30NA IFAI6A N WTC WDI8016 | 00153869 | OPG |
| D13140 | NADI314001 | 2 | 30NA IFAJ6A N WTC WDIR016 | 00159480 | OPG |
| D13151 | NADDI31.5101 | 1 | 40NA 1FA25Z N WTC WD03142 | (1)155590 | OPG |
| 016979 | NAIO1097901 | 1 | IGNA IEFAI4A N WTC 2029VNO | $\begin{aligned} & \text { Pl100211 } \\ & \text { NEWMAN } \\ & \text { HATTERSLEY. } \end{aligned}$ | CFRNAVODA |
| 013359 | NAMO135\%01 | 1 | 7NA IEFAIOB4 IWN3 WTC 2024 VNO | P1200360 (NEWMAN HATTERSLEY) | EMBALSENPP |
| 013159 | NADO133592 | 1 | 7NA IEFAIOB4 IWN. 3 WTC 2024 VNO | FI200360 (NEWMAAN HATTERSLEY) | EMBALSE NPP |
| 01338.5 | NAOI338501 | I | 7 NA SEFALOB4 IWN3 WTC 2020VNO | 12-12079 (RITEPRO) | FMBALSE NPP |
| 013962 | NANO139620] | 3 | 7 NA SEFAIOA N WTC 202IVNO | PI.300202 (NE WMAN HATTERSLEY) | OPG |
| SD)393 | NA/SD939302 | ] | MOD3A 90NAI C -WISE SM.MECH ASSY. | $\begin{aligned} & \text { 216341, } \\ & \text { REPLACMENT FOR } \\ & \text { IO156515 } \\ & \text { (ENTERGY) } \end{aligned}$ | ENTERGY |
| WE2984 | NA-03-102 | 3 | NAISS SWITCH MECH | 114800 CURTIS WRIGHTENERTECH, | PALO VERDE |
| WE3110 | NA-03-102 | 3 | NA1/5 SWITCH MECH | $\begin{aligned} & \text { ESD8468N (RCC)/ } \\ & 00151524 \text { (OPG) } \end{aligned}$ | OPG |
| WE3167 | NA- 3 - 40 | 1 | NAI/5 SWITCH MECH | $\begin{aligned} & \text { ESD8630N(RCC)/ } \\ & 00154615(\mathrm{OPG}) \end{aligned}$ | OPG |
| WE3267 | $\text { NAVWE } 32670$ $1$ | 1 | N00-03-020 NA1 SWITCH MECH | 4500362690 | PSEG |
| WE3747 | NA-03-102 | 3 | NAL/5 SWITCH MECH | $\begin{aligned} & \text { ESD9023N(RCC) } \\ & 0016228 \text { (OPG) } \end{aligned}$ | OPG |
| WE3873 | NA-03-102 | I | NAl/5 SWITCH MECH | $\begin{aligned} & \text { ESD9070N (RCC) } \\ & 00163571 \text { (OPG) } \end{aligned}$ | OPG |
| WE3907 | NA-03-102 | 2 | NA1/5 SWITCH MECH | 4500428140 | PSEG |
| WE3910 | NA-03-102 | 2 | NA1/5 SWITCHMECH | EDI3239R (RCC) | OPG TRAINING PURPOSES PER PO, |
| WE4022 | NA-03-102 | 1 | NA1/S SWITCHMECH | $\begin{aligned} & \text { ESD9135N(RCC)/ } \\ & 00158829 \text { (OPG) } \end{aligned}$ | OPG |
| WE4037 | NA-03-502 | 2 | NA I/S SWITCH MECH | 00098888 | MCGUIRE |
| WE4246 | NA-03-102 | 1 | NAl/5 SWITCH MECH | SJ15871 | ENTERGY |

Page 9 of 12

## rotork <br> Controls

| Order | Part | Q4 | Descripiloir | Cuslamer_PO | Project |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| WEA396 | NA-03-102 | 1 | NA1/S SWITCII MECII |  | OPG |
| WE4869 | N A -03-102 | 2 | NA1/S SWITCH MECH | $\begin{aligned} & \text { ESD94in (RCC) } \\ & \mathbf{0 0 1 7 3 2 5 9 ( O P G )} \end{aligned}$ | OPG |
| W15621 | NA-13-102 | * | NAI/S SWITCli MECLI | $\begin{aligned} & \text { ESDPROIN (RCC)/ } \\ & 00181008 \text { (OPG) } \end{aligned}$ | OPG |
| WEFh60) | NA-(13-102 | 6 | NAI/S SWITCH MECII | ESDDO2SN/REV2 (RCC) / 00186.517 (OPG) | OPG |
| WE6152 | NA-03-102 | 2 | NAl/S SWITCIT MECII | $\begin{aligned} & \text { ESD } 0092 \mathrm{~N}(\mathrm{RCC}) / \\ & \text { 101882012 (OPG) } \end{aligned}$ | OPG |
| WE6660 | NA-03-102 | 1 | NAL/S SWITCII MECH | 501356062 | APS - PALO VERDE |
| WE6822 | NA-08-706 | 1 | NAI 6 SW VIz AOPI ASS | RSP35818 (RCI SERVICE) (B0132331 (DUKE) | RCISERVICE/ CATAWBA |
| WE6904 | WN82395 | 4 | NAl/SE 6SW VI2 AOPI | 00136411 | CATAWBA |
| WF7023 | WN82395 | 5 | NAl/5F 6SW VI2 AOPI | 00137764 | CATAWBA |
| WE708S | WN82398 | 15 | NAI/SE I2SW VI2 AOPI | 00138769 | MCGUIRE |
| WE7139 | WN80262 | 1 | MODIA 7/11NAI/4 COMP KIT POST 78 | 02263579 | SEABROOK |
| WE7247 | WN82398 | 3 | NAI/SE I2SW VI2 AOPI | 00140435 | MCGULIRE |

Controls

## K5 switch list

| Orucr | l'art | Q13 | Descriplion | Customer PO | Praject |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| B4641102 | N56484 | 2 | NAI SWITCH MECH SPEC | 010634 N (RCC) 4503054188 (Hydm Quebse) | HYOROQUBEC /CENTRALE GENTILLY II |
| 1349458 | WN80653 | 11 | NAI SW MEC11 K5-3252-A2 | Ol1965N(RCC)/ 00171079 (BRUCE POWER) | BRUCE POWER |
| B49779 | NASO3B0 OHIA | 2 | NAI/S SWITCH MECH KS | RSP41189(RCI SERVICE)/ 02302948 (SEABROOK) | SEABROOK |
| B49524 | NS6484 | 3 | NAI SWITCII MECII SPEC | Ol1998N(RCC)/ 1065218 (MOBLLE VALVE) / 4500370878 (NEW BRUNSWICK POWER) | MOBIL VALVE / NEW BRUNSWICK POWER |
| B50333 | WN806S3 | 6 | NA1 SW MECH K.5-32.52-A2 | $\begin{aligned} & \text { O124I0N (RCC) / } \\ & 00216597 \text { (OPG) } \end{aligned}$ | OPG |
| 851532 | WN80653 | 8 | NAI SW MECII KS-3252-A2 | OI2969N (RCC) / 00177514 (BRUCE POWER) | BRUCE POWER |
| B52075 | N56484 | 3 | NAI SWITCH MLCII SPEC | O13329N(RCC)/ 00179616 (BRUCE POWER) | BRLCE POWER |
| 853208 | NASO3B- 0005 | 1 | SWITCH MECH NAI KS DAP. ANNEALED RYTON | $\begin{aligned} & \text { O13968N (RCC) / } \\ & 00226962 \text { (OPG) } \end{aligned}$ | OPG |
| 853575 | N56484 | 1 | NAI SWITCH MECH SPEC | $\begin{aligned} & \text { O13877N (RCC) } \\ & 00183812 \text { (BRUCE } \\ & \text { POWER) } \end{aligned}$ | BRUCE POWER |
| B54843 | N56484 | 3 | NA1 SWITCH MECH SPEC | O14684N(RCC) <br> II7746\| (MOBILE <br> VALVE)/ <br> 4500398343 (NEW BRUNSWICK POWER) | BRUNSWICK POWER |
| B55380 | N56483 | 1 | NAI SWITCH BANK SPEC | $\begin{aligned} & \text { P000623-1 (RCC)/ } \\ & 00232427 \text { (OPG) } \end{aligned}$ | OPG |
| B56689 | N56484 | 1 | NAI SWITCH MECH SPEC | NCR148775 | NCR SPARES |
| B56643 | NA/B5664301 | 5 | MOD3A 90NAIC-WISESW.MECH ASSY. | $\begin{aligned} & \text { P002330-1 (RCC)/ } \\ & \text { O0235579 (OPG) } \end{aligned}$ | OFC |
| B55572 | $\begin{aligned} & \text { NAS03B- } \\ & 0005 \end{aligned}$ | I | SWITCHMECH NAI KS DAP. ANNEALED RYTON | $\begin{aligned} & \text { P000918-1 (RCC)/ } \\ & 00233354 \text { (OPG) } \end{aligned}$ | OPG |
| 012090 | NA/O120900t | 3 | 7 NA 5EFAIOB4 IWN3 WTC 2040-NO | 202546 (BRAY) | BRAY, BRUCE POWER |
| 014002 | NA/O1400201 | 1 | I4NA IFAI4A N WTC 2024-NO | $00183784 \text { (BRUCE }$ POWER) | BRUCE POWER |

## rotoris <br> Controls

(vii) The corrective action which has been, is being, or will be taken; the name of the individual or organization responsible for the action; and the length of time that has been or will be taken to complete the action.

By this notification Rotork is informing all Utilities and listing affected customer orders. Utilities may contact their local Rotork office or the undersigned for support relating to their specific units. Rotork recommends the replacement of switches in the affected orders.

Rotork is currently evaluating options regarding replacement switches with the supply chain. The switch assembly's design will be changed by Johnson Electric so that the adhesive AY103-1 is no longer used.
(viii) Any advice related to the defect or failure to comply about the facility, activity, or basic component that has been, is being, or will be given to purchasers or licensees.
U.S. Licensees with installed or in storage actuators, switch mechanisms or Add-On-Pak (AOP) spares modules containing V12 and K5 switches identified in section (vi) should evaluate the impact of a high contact resistance or open circuit condition on safety related systems.
(ix) In the case of an early site permit, the entities to whom an early site permit was transferred

Not Applicable

## rotork

Rotork Controls Limited

Nuclear Engineering Report No.
ER857 Issue 1

Approved by Engineering

Date: $3^{\text {rd }}$ May 2016

## REVISION SHEET

| ORIGIN | Priyang Jadav \& Patrick Shaw |
| :--- | :--- |
| DATE OF ISSUE | $\underline{03 / 05 / 2016}$ |
| TITLE | Part 21 Investigation. Anomaly of V12 Micro-Switch N69-921. |


| Prepared | Checked | Approved |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Priygang fadaw |  |  |
| Priyang Jadav <br> Product Engineer - <br> Nuclear | Patrick Shaw <br> Quality Assurance <br> Manager | Kevin Sweet <br> Engineering Manager <br> Nuclear |


| Issue No | Date | Revision | By |
| :---: | :---: | :--- | :---: |
| 1 | $03 / 05 / 16$ | Original | PUJ |
|  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |

## rotork

Nuclear Engineering Report No.

## Page 2 of 48

ER857 Issue 1

Rotork Controls Limited
Rotork Controls Limited Approved by EngineeringDate: 3 ${ }^{\text {rd }}$ May 2016
CONTENTS

1. Summary ..... 3
2. Deviation description ..... 3
3. Micro-switch function ..... 4
4. Review of orders affected ..... 4
5. Summary of tests performed ..... 7
5.1. Air volume of actuator electrical enclosure ..... 9
6. Tests replicating the anomaly ..... 11
6.1. Procedure for thermal aging switches inside an enclosure ..... 11
6.2. Test $1-125^{\circ} \mathrm{C}\left(257^{\circ} \mathrm{F}\right)$ aging of V 12 switches manufactured in 2015 ..... 12
6.3. Test 2 - Volt ramp on aged switches from Test 1 ..... 14
6.4. Test $3-125^{\circ} \mathrm{C}\left(257^{\circ} \mathrm{F}\right)$ aging of V 12 switches manufactured in 2007 ..... 14
6.5. Test $4-125^{\circ} \mathrm{C}\left(257^{\circ} \mathrm{F}\right)$ aging of V 12 contacts only ..... 14
7. Supporting information and post-curing ..... 16
7.1. Procedure for post-curing tests ..... 17
7.2. Test 5-Post-curing ..... 17
7.3. Test $6-125^{\circ} \mathrm{C}\left(257^{\circ} \mathrm{F}\right)$ aging of K 5 switches manufactured in 2012 ..... 18
8. Tests of unglued and glued switches using different adhesives ..... 19
8.1. Test $7-125^{\circ} \mathrm{C}\left(257^{\circ} \mathrm{F}\right)$ aging of a switch without adhesive ..... 19
8.2. Test $8-125^{\circ} \mathrm{C}\left(257^{\circ} \mathrm{F}\right)$ aging of switch assembled with Duralco 4525 ..... 19
8.3. Test $9-125^{\circ} \mathrm{C}\left(257^{\circ} \mathrm{F}\right)$ aging of switches assembled with AY105-1/HY991 ..... 20
8.4. Test $10-125^{\circ} \mathrm{C}\left(257^{\circ} \mathrm{F}\right)$ aging of switch assembled with Raychem S 1264 . ..... 21
8.5. Test $11-125^{\circ} \mathrm{C}\left(257^{\circ} \mathrm{F}\right)$ aging of switch assembled with X 60 ..... 21
9. Anomaly effect upon switch operation ..... 22
9.1. Factors Causing Anomaly ..... 22
9.2. Estimated Anomaly Onset ..... 23
9.3. Switch performance under accident profiles ..... 25
10. Results from independent test lab ..... 30
11. Conclusion ..... 35
12. References ..... 36

# rotork 

Rotork Controls Limited

Nuclear Engineering Report No.

ER857 Issue 1
Approved by Engineering

Date: 3 ${ }^{\text {rd }}$ May 2016

## 1. Summary

This report documents work performed to support a Part 21 investigation opened by Rotork Controls Inc. ref. tracking number NCR173472. Measurements and tests were performed to establish the operational reliability of Rotork safety related micro-switches. Non-compliant switches were identified from a batch manufactured in 2015 against Rotork purchase order PO128459. The investigation has confirmed that the defect is only attributed to batches received in 2007 and later.

The switch supplier (Johnson Electric) incorporates a small amount of adhesive in each switch's construction to secure the two halves of the switch housing together. The adhesive formulation was altered in 2003 by the adhesive supplier (Huntsman). Tests detailed in this report show that the altered formulation outgases at elevated temperatures and deposits an insulating material layer onto the switch internal electrical contacts as it cools.

## 2. Deviation description

On January 25, 2016 Rotork Controls Inc. opened a formal Part 21 investigation into an anomaly relating to a Basic micro-switch - Part No. N69-921 (RS104), description "V12". The anomaly is high resistance or loss of electrical continuity and was first observed following a customer thermal aging test of Rotork Safety Related NA Range electric Actuators; also referred to as an electric Valve Operator. Following 10 days at $125^{\circ} \mathrm{C}\left(257^{\circ} \mathrm{F}\right)$ a significant percentage of micro-switches in the test actuators exhibited open circuit.

Subsequent in-house testing has revealed that the anomaly also relates to Basic micro-switches with the following Part Nos. as they are constructed using the same adhesive.
N69-838 (RS366), description "K5" (screw terminals)
N69-926 (RS378), description "K5" (fast-on terminals)

Drawings of the three switches can be found in Appendix A.

Rotork Controls Limited

## 3. Micro-switch function

The micro-switch has four functions:

- Rotork actuators can be set to operate to a maximum torque level of opening or closing a valve. When the torque sensing mechanism in the actuator registers this maximum torque, the micro-switch will be tripped to turn off the motor.
- Rotork actuators can also be set to operate to a maximum travel limit. The mechanism inside the actuator will register when the maximum travel in the open or close direction is reached and the micro-switch will be tripped to turn off the motor.
- In the Add-on-Pak (AOP) the switch is intended for indication purposes but can also be used for interlocks and permissives to start other equipment such as pumps and valves. AOP switches can be set to trip at any point during valve travel. The AOP can also be used for torque switch bypass. If the circuit is "open" then the MOV could stop before achieving "end of travel".
- Switches must be "closed" to initiate travel.


## 4. Review of orders affected

The following are details of the affected switches.

- 11000 V12 switches N69-921 supplied to Rotork against the following purchase orders.

| Purchase order no. | Quantity | Rotork Lot reference | Manufacture Year |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| P0081139 | 700 | LC006383 | 2007 |
|  | 1050 | LC006391 |  |
|  | 1500 | LC006398 |  |
|  | 725 | LC006399 |  |
|  | 2025 | LC006402 |  |
| PO128459 | 183 | LC010448 | 2015 |
|  | 500 | LC010464 |  |
|  | 700 | LC010483 |  |
|  | 483 | LC010509 |  |
|  | 612 | LC010539 |  |
|  | 1 | LC010540 |  |
|  | 639 | LC010547 |  |
|  | 640 | LC010566 |  |
|  | 640 | LC010570 |  |
|  | 448 | LC010576 |  |
|  | 154 | LC010638 |  |
|  | 11000 |  |  |

Rotork Controls Limited

Nuclear Engineering Report No.
ER857 Issue 1

## Page 5 of 48

Approved by Engineering

Date: $3^{\text {rd }}$ May 2016

- 1900 K5 switches N69-838 supplied to Rotork against the following purchase orders.

| Purchase order no. | Quantity | Rotork Lot reference | Manufacture Year |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| PO084220 | 200 | LC006390 | 2007 |
| PO086172 | 100 | LC006539 |  |
| PO087057 | 100 | LC006603 | 2008 |
| PO089251 | 200 | LC007024 |  |
| PO090778 | 100 | LC007135 |  |
| PO092646 | 20 | LC007254 | 2009 |
|  | 80 | LC007255 |  |
| PO095664 | 100 | LC007450 |  |
| PO100333 | 100 | LC007682 | 2010 |
|  | 200 | LC007693 |  |
|  | 240 | LC008194 | 2011 |
|  | 183 | LC008250 | 2012 |
|  | 277 | LC008271 |  |

- 1503 K5 switches N69-926 supplied to Rotork against the following purchase order.

| Purchase order no. | Quantity | Rotork Lot reference | Manufacture Year |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| PO106615 | 175 | LC008192 | 2011 |  |
|  | 325 | LC008193 | 2012 |  |
|  | 476 | LC008203 |  |  |
|  | 149 | LC008207 |  |  |
|  | 253 | LC008233 |  |  |
|  | 125 | LC008253 |  |  |
|  | 1503 |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |

- Suspect V12 and K5 switches have date code ending with 07 K to 15 K stamped at the location shown below. The code refers to week (43) and year (2015).


Figure 1: Location of date code on V12 switch


Figure 2: Location of date code on K5 switch N69-838

ER857 Issue 1
Date: $3^{\text {rd }}$ May 2016

## 5. Summary of tests performed

A range of tests were conducted as part of the investigation in order to:
a. Replicate the anomaly
b. Identify root cause
c. Evaluate switches from previously supplied batches
d. Attempt salvaging defect switches
e. Experiment with alternative adhesives
f. Evaluate the effect of the anomaly on switch operation

Table 1 provides a summary of tests performed to cover points a to e above. Further details on each test are provided in subsequent sections which are referenced within the table itself. The experiments were performed using two programmable test ovens. Test switches were placed in metallic enclosures and heated to a fixed temperature for a defined time (thermal aging). The testing was destructive, and new switches and metallic enclosures were used for every test. Prior to use, the metallic enclosures were thermally cleaned to remove any volatile materials remaining from their manufacture. The metallic enclosure construction does not incorporate any non-metallic seals or non-metallic coatings.

Part f is a study of the 1) factors causing the anomaly, 2) estimated anomaly onset, and 3) switch performance under accident profiles. This work is detailed in section 9.

| Test no. | Test description | No. of switches tested | Test parameters | Concentration factor $(C f)$ | Result | Full test details |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | Thermal aging of V12 <br> switches manufactured in 2015. | 5 switches, date code 3715 K , in a metal container of volume $1680 \mathrm{~cm}^{3}$. | 5.75 days at $125^{\circ} \mathrm{C}\left(257^{\circ} \mathrm{F}\right)$ | $\begin{gathered} 1680 \mathrm{~cm}^{3} \\ \text { test } \\ \text { container. } \\ 336 \mathrm{~cm}^{3} \\ \text { per switch. } \\ C f=1.78 \end{gathered}$ | Switch anomaly occurs even when the switch is aged in isolation, therefore cause lies within the switch itself. <br> Contamination is present on NO and NC contact rivets. UV images suggest it may be coming from adhesive. | See Section 6.2 6.2 |
| 2 | Volt ramp on aged switches from Test 1. | 2 aged switches taken from Test 1. | Volt ramp up to 60VDC across the NO contact with $4.3 \mathrm{k} \Omega$ fixed resistor in series (14mA max across contacts). | N/A | Volt ramp up to 60VDC, 14 mA does not reliably clean the contacts. | See Section 6.3 |

Rotork Controls Limited

Nuclear Engineering Report No.

ER857 Issue 1

Approved by Engineering

Date: $3^{\text {rd }}$ May 2016

| $\begin{aligned} & \text { Test } \\ & \text { no. } \end{aligned}$ | Test description | No. of switches tested | Test parameters | Concentration factor $(C f)$ | Result | Full test details |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 3 | Thermal aging of V12 switches manufactured in 2007. | 4 switches, date code 2807K. | 3.93 days at $125^{\circ} \mathrm{C}\left(257^{\circ} \mathrm{F}\right)$. | $1680 \mathrm{~cm}^{3}$ <br> test <br> container. $420 \mathrm{~cm}^{3}$ <br> per switch. $C f=1.42$ | The 2007 manufactured switches exhibit the same anomaly as the 2015 switches. | See Section 6.4 |
| 4 | Thermal aging of V12 contacts only. | 3 switches, date code 3613K, had their NO, NC and moving contacts removed to be aged. | 6 days at $125^{\circ} \mathrm{C}\left(257^{\circ} \mathrm{F}\right)$. | $2552 \mathrm{~cm}^{3}$ <br> test <br> container. $851 \mathrm{~cm}^{3}$ <br> per switch. $C f=0.70$ | There is no issue with the silver plating process of the rivets. | See Section 6.5 |
| 5 | Post-curing of V12 switches manufactured in 2015. | 6 switches, date code 4315K. | Post-cured at $125^{\circ} \mathrm{C}\left(257^{\circ} \mathrm{F}\right)$ for up to 8 days. Then aged inside container for 3.77 days. | $245 \mathrm{~cm}^{3}$ <br> test container. 1 switch per container. $C f=2.44$ | After 8 days of postcuring, outgassing still occurs causing the switch to exhibit the anomaly. | See Section 7.2 |
| 6 | Thermal aging of K5 switches N69-838 manufactured in 2012. | 2 switches, date code 0612K. | 6 days at $125^{\circ} \mathrm{C}\left(257^{\circ} \mathrm{F}\right)$. | $1680 \mathrm{~cm}^{3}$ <br> test <br> container. $840 \mathrm{~cm}^{3}$ <br> per switch. $C f=0.71$ | The K5 switch N69-838 exhibits the same anomaly as the V12. K5 N69-926 is constructed of the same glue thus is also affected. | See Section 7.3 |
| 7 | Thermal aging of a switch without adhesive. | 1 switch, assembled without adhesive applied. | 7 days at $125^{\circ} \mathrm{C}\left(257^{\circ} \mathrm{F}\right)$. | $245 \mathrm{~cm}^{3}$ <br> test <br> container. <br> 1 switch <br> per <br> container. $C f=2.44$ | Switch performance is acceptable if no adhesive is present. | See Section 8.1 |
| 8 | Thermal aging of switch assembled with Duralco 4525. | 1 switch | 10 days at $125^{\circ} \mathrm{C}\left(257^{\circ} \mathrm{F}\right)$. | $245 \mathrm{~cm}^{3}$ <br> test <br> container. <br> 1 switch per <br> container. $C f=2.44$ | Duralco 4525 outgasses to an extent that the switch will exhibit the anomaly. | See Section 8.2 |

Date: $3^{\text {rd }}$ May 2016

| Test no. | Test description | No. of switches tested | Test parameters | Concentration factor $(C f)$ | Result | Full test details |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 9 | Thermal aging of switches assembled with AY1051/HY991. | 3 switches | Up to 14.2 days at $125^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ ( $257^{\circ} \mathrm{F}$ ). | $245 \mathrm{~cm}^{3}$ <br> test <br> container. <br> 1 switch <br> per <br> container. $C f=2.44$ | Switch performance is acceptable if assembled using a small quantity of AY105-1/HY991. | $\begin{gathered} \text { See } \\ \text { Section } \\ 8.3 \end{gathered}$ |
| 10 | Thermal aging of switch assembled with Raychem S1264. | 1 switch | $\begin{aligned} & 10 \text { days at } \\ & 125^{\circ} \mathrm{C}\left(257^{\circ} \mathrm{F}\right) . \end{aligned}$ | $245 \mathrm{~cm}^{3}$ <br> test <br> container. <br> 1 switch <br> per <br> container. $C f=2.44$ | Switch performance is acceptable if assembled using a small quantity of Raychem S1264. | $\begin{gathered} \text { See } \\ \text { Section } \\ 8.4 \end{gathered}$ |
| 11 | Thermal aging of switches assembled with X 60 . | 1 switch | 10 days at $125^{\circ} \mathrm{C}\left(257^{\circ} \mathrm{F}\right)$. | $245 \mathrm{~cm}^{3}$ test container. 1 switch per container. Cf $=2.44$ | X60 outgasses to an extent that the switch will exhibit the anomaly. | See Section 8.5 |

Table 1: Summary of tests performed

### 5.1. Air volume of actuator electrical enclosure

During the investigation it was observed that the air volume per switch is an important factor which needs to be considered in aging tests since it can influence the length of aging time before onset of the anomaly. Experimental data demonstrated, for a given temperature, the anomaly would manifest itself in a shorter time period when switches were placed in a smaller enclosure. This is further discussed in section 9 . It is necessary to know the air volume in the actuator electrical enclosure in order to relate the test results to the application. To be conservative a small size actuator was used for the calculation, giving a worse switch to air volume ratio. Using CAD the air volume in an empty electrical enclosure was estimated to be $11960 \mathrm{~cm}^{3}$ (Figure 3).

Similarly, the volume of the switch mechanism and AOP were estimated $594 \mathrm{~cm}^{3}$ from CAD ( $5 \%$ of enclosure volume). It is assumed another $5 \%$ of enclosure volume is consumed by the heater, looms and other components within the enclosure. The air volume to which a small actuator fitted with a switch mechanism and 12 switch AOP would outgas to is:
$11960-594-594=10772 \mathrm{~cm}^{3}$
The maximum number of switches available in an actuator are 18. Therefore the estimated volume of air per switch is:
$10772 / 18=598 \mathrm{~cm}^{3}$

Rotork Controls Limited

Nuclear Engineering Report No.

ER857 Issue 1

Different sizes of enclosures were utilised. Most of the tests listed in Table 1 were performed using $245 \mathrm{ml}\left(=245 \mathrm{~cm}^{3}\right.$ ) enclosures (Figure 4). The term concentration factor ( $C f$ ) is introduced to relate the actuator air volume per switch to the test enclosure volume per switch:
$C f=\frac{\text { actuator air volume per switch }}{\text { test enclosure volume per switch }}=\frac{598 \mathrm{~cm}^{3}}{245 \mathrm{~cm}^{3}}=2.44$
The concentration factor for each test is also specified in Table 1.


Figure 3: Air volume inside actuator electrical enclosure


Figure 4: 245 ml enclosure

## 6. Tests replicating the anomaly

### 6.1. Procedure for thermal aging switches inside an enclosure

In-house thermal aging tests were performed to replicate the anomaly. The tests were performed according to the following procedure.
a) Remove screw terminals.
b) Using milliohm meter, record resistance across NC contacts. (Meter used applied 9V, 5mA max. Figure 5). Manufacturer's end-of-line acceptance level is $25 \mathrm{~m} \Omega$ max.


Figure 5: Milliohm meter
c) Operate and hold switch plunger.
d) Record resistance across NO contacts.
e) Release plunger.
f) Repeat steps $b-e$ until 3 NC and 3 NO measurements are obtained for each switch.
g) Fasten screw terminals
h) Place switches inside a metallic container.
i) Thermally age the container at $125^{\circ} \mathrm{C}\left(257^{\circ} \mathrm{F}\right)$. (Total aging time varied for each test and is stated in subsequent sections of the report)
j) Once thermal aging complete, remove container from oven and allow to cool. It is important that the container remains closed until cooled so that any outgassing can condense.
k) Remove switches and repeat resistance check following steps a-g

### 6.2. Test $\mathbf{1 - 1 2 5 ^ { \circ }} \mathrm{C}\left(257^{\circ} \mathrm{F}\right)$ aging of V12 switches manufactured in 2015

5 switches, Rotork part no. N69-921, date code 3715 K , labelled F - J, were tested following the procedure in section 6.1. A drawing of switch N69-921 is shown in Appendix A. Thermal aging time was 138 hrs ( 5.75 days).

Results are shown in Appendix B. Before aging, the switches were within the manufacturer's $25 \mathrm{~m} \Omega$ acceptance. After aging, the NO contacts exhibited open circuit, indicated by a dash in the result field. Switch $H$ recovered on the second operation post-aging. $A^{*}$ in the result field indicates that the resistance value was fluctuating between several ohms, to hundreds of ohms, to open circuit.

Green cells identify readings below the $25 \mathrm{~m} \Omega$ manufacturer's end-of-line acceptance. Yellow cells identify readings below the $500 \mathrm{~m} \Omega$ industry acceptance. Red cells identify unacceptable reading.

Switch F was opened for examination of the contacts (Figure 6 - Figure 9). Blue plastic particles were formed only as a result of breaking the switch apart. A pale yellow layer appears to have formed on the surface of the NC and NO contact rivets, Figure 6 and Figure 8. At the very centre of the NC and NO rivet, i.e. the point of contact, the layer has broken away and the normal silver appearance of the rivet is visible. The white powder on the moving contact, Figure 7 and Figure 9, indicates that there was transfer of the broken layer from the stationary contacts to the moving contact.

Contacts from aged switches were observed under UV light. Figure 10 indicates the contamination is formed only on the NC and NO stationary contacts. Under UV light the contamination is a similar colour to the residue in the area where adhesive is applied, Figure 11. The conjecture for this is that the NC and NO contact tabs extend outside of the switch housing where the surrounding temperature is lower than the temperature inside the switch. Thus through loss of heat by conduction, the NO and NC contacts would cool quicker than other components enclosed within the switch housing. This would mean that the NO and NC contacts act as heat sinks causing vapours released from the adhesive to condense onto the contacts. The NC and NO stationary contacts are made from Silver-CadmiumOxide ( $\mathrm{AgCdO} \mathrm{)} \mathrm{which} \mathrm{provides} \mathrm{the} \mathrm{best} \mathrm{known} \mathrm{performance} \mathrm{for} \mathrm{switching} \mathrm{off} \mathrm{electrical} \mathrm{current} \mathrm{quickly}$ and cleanly (Ref 1).

An independent investigation was performed by an external laboratory Exova in an effort to identify the source of contamination (Section 10). However, due to differences in chemical composition between the non-metallics and the contaminant, the source could not be confirmed by analysis. Nevertheless, literature (section 7), test results of an unglued switch (section 8.1) and UV images identify the adhesive being the root cause.

## Summary

- The V12 switch anomaly occurs even when the switch is aged in isolation, therefore the cause lies within the switch itself.
- Contamination is present on the NO and NC contact rivets, and UV images suggest it may be coming from the adhesive.


## rotor*

Rotork Controls Limited

Nuclear Engineering Report No.
ER857 Issue 1

Page 13 of 48

Approved by Engineering

Date: $3^{\text {rd }}$ May 2016


Figure 6: Switch F, NC contact rivet


Figure 8: Switch F, NO contact rivet


Figure 10: Contact rivets under UV light


Figure 7: Switch F, NC side of moving contact


Figure 9: Switch F, NO side of moving contact


Figure 11: Separated switch housing under UV light

Rotork Controls Limited
Approved by Engineering

Nuclear Engineering Report No.
ER857 Issue 1
Date: $3^{\text {rd }}$ May 2016

### 6.3. Test 2 - Volt ramp on aged switches from Test 1

A volt ramp up to 60 VDC was performed across the NO contact of switch $G$, using a $4.3 \mathrm{k} \Omega$ fixed resistor in series. Switch G maintained open circuit.
$\frac{60 \mathrm{~V}}{4300 \Omega}=14 \mathrm{~mA}$ max across contacts.

The volt ramp was repeated across the NO contact of switch I. At 60VDC the switch started to conduct. The plunger was released for 5 mins before repeating the test. During the second volt ramp switch I began to conduct at 27VDC.

## Summary

- Volt ramp up to $60 \mathrm{VDC}, 14 \mathrm{~mA}$ does not reliably clean the contacts.


### 6.4. Test $\mathbf{3}-125^{\circ} \mathrm{C}\left(257^{\circ} \mathrm{F}\right)$ aging of V12 switches manufactured in 2007

4 switches N69-921, date code 2807 K , labelled $P, Q, S$ and $T$, were tested following the procedure in section 6.1. Thermal aging time was 94.25 hrs ( 3.93 days).

Results are shown in Appendix B. Before aging, the switches were within the manufacturer's $25 \mathrm{~m} \Omega$ acceptance. After aging, the NO contacts exhibited high resistance or open circuit. Resistance readings up to $500 \mathrm{~m} \Omega$ are generally acceptable in the industry.

## Summary

- The 2007 manufactured switches exhibit the same anomaly as the 2015 switches.


### 6.5. Test $4-125^{\circ} \mathrm{C}\left(257^{\circ} \mathrm{F}\right)$ aging of V12 contacts only

UV images of switch internals post-aging (Figure 10) showed that the contamination is deposited only on the NO and NC contact rivets. It was thus thought that the contamination may be related to the silver plating process of the rivets.

3 switches N69-921, date code 3613K, had their NO, NC and moving contacts removed to be aged in isolation inside a metal container. The contacts were resistance checked (Figure 12) pre and postaging. Thermal aging time was 144 hrs ( 6 days).

Rotork Controls Limited
Page 15 of 48

Approved by Engineering

Nuclear Engineering Report No.
ER857 Issue 1
Date: $3^{\text {rd }}$ May 2016


Figure 12: Resistance checks of contacts removed from switches
Thermal aging the contacts in isolation did not influence their ability to conduct current. Pre and postaging contact resistances were 3 to $4 \mathrm{~m} \Omega$.

The contacts were also observed under an optical microscope but there were no signs of contamination. The rivets were similar in appearance pre-aging (Figure 13) and post-aging (Figure 14).


Figure 13: Contact rivet pre-aging


Figure 14: Contact rivet post-aging

## Summary

- The results indicate there is no issue with the silver plating process of the rivets.

Page 16 of 48
Rotork Controls Limited
Approved by Engineering

Nuclear Engineering Report No. ER857 Issue 1 Date: 3 May 2016

## 7. Supporting information and post-curing

A technical report on an adhesive related issue (Ref 2) in the Large Hadron Collider (LHC) provides information supporting this Part 21 investigation. Araldite AY103-1 was used in the construction of a LHC component. The component shows an outgassing effect which has been tracked back to the adhesive. Different adhesives were investigated using a setup for measuring the amount of outgassing after 24 hrs aging at $125^{\circ} \mathrm{C}\left(257^{\circ} \mathrm{F}\right)$. The two part epoxy AY103-1 with its hardener HY951 is also used in construction of the V12 switch.

In summary the technical report states the following:

- AY103-1 is a replacement of AY103 which is no longer manufactured.
- Adhesive AY103 did not outgas but AY103-1 does.
- Higher ambient temperatures accelerate the outgassing.
- $68 \%$ of the outgas is water but the remainder isn't identified.
- Curing at $40^{\circ} \mathrm{C}\left(104^{\circ} \mathrm{F}\right)$ for two weeks and extracting the condensate reduces the effect.

The adhesive manufacturer, Huntsman, confirmed that AY103 was indeed withdrawn in February 2003 and replaced by AY103-1. In accordance with the 28th adaptation of the EU Dangerous Substances Directive (Directive 2001/59/EC), all products containing $>0.5 \%$ DBP (Dibutyl phthalate) are to be classed toxic. AY103 would have fallen into this category therefore its formulation was changed. AY103-1 is free of DBP and phthalate esters.

Another technical paper (Ref 3) identifies the plastifiers present in the chemical makeup of the two epoxies. The report states:

- AY103 contained the plastifier dibutyl-phthalate (DBP) which is toxic.
- In the AY103-1 formulation, DBP was replaced with plastifier di-isopropyl-naphthalene (DIPN)
- The plastifier DIPN does not take part in the curing process with the hardener and is expected to remain volatile close to the surface of the hardened epoxy.
- AY105-1 is another epoxy but without any plastifier. See section 8.3 for thermal aging test results with this adhesive.

Based on technical literature, the following conjecture was formed to explain the mechanism which leads to the anomaly. The adhesive is thought to outgas at temperature releasing water vapour, and with it the gaseous plastifier. The water vapour is the carrier of the contaminating material. After thermal aging the NO and NC contacts are thought to cool first (as explained in section 6.2). The contacts thus act as a heat sink enabling water vapour to condense onto them and deposit the contaminating material.

### 7.1. Procedure for post-curing tests

It has been confirmed from literature that the adhesive AY103-1 used in the construction of the V12 switch outgasses. The literature also indicates that a post-curing process where the condensate is extracted during thermal aging may solve the issue. The following test procedures describes the tests performed to investigate post-curing.
a) Remove screw terminals.
b) Using milliohm meter, record resistance across NC contacts. (Meter used applied 9V, 5mA max. Figure 5). Manufacturer's end-of-line acceptance level is $25 \mathrm{~m} \Omega$ max.
c) Operate and hold switch plunger.
d) Record resistance across NO contacts.
e) Release plunger.
f) Repeat steps $\mathrm{b}-\mathrm{e}$ until 3 NC and 3 NO measurements are obtained for each switch.
g) Fasten screw terminals
h) Place all switches freely in a fan assisted oven and thermally cure at $125^{\circ} \mathrm{C}\left(257^{\circ} \mathrm{F}\right)$. Post-curing time for each switch is different as shown in Table 2.
i) Remove each switch when its post-curing time is complete and allow to cool.
j) Repeat resistance check following steps a - g.
k) Place each switch in its own aluminium container and perform subsequent aging at $125^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ $\left(257^{\circ} \mathrm{F}\right)$ as shown in Table 2.

| Switch Identification | Date code | Post-curing time at $125^{\circ} \mathrm{C}\left(257^{\circ} \mathrm{F}\right)$ | Subsequent aging inside container at $125^{\circ} \mathrm{C}\left(257^{\circ} \mathrm{F}\right)$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | 4315K | 1 day | 90.5 hrs (3.77 days) |
| 2 |  | 4 days |  |
| 3 |  | 5 days |  |
| 4 |  | 6 days |  |
| 5 |  | 7 days |  |
| 6 |  | 8 days |  |

Table 2: Post-curing time
I) Repeat resistance check following steps $\mathrm{a}-\mathrm{g}$.

### 7.2. Test 5 - Post-curing

6 switches N69-921, date code 4315K, labelled 1 to 6 , were tested following the procedure in section 7.1. As detailed in the procedure and in Table 2 the switches were post-cured for different number of days up to 8 days in a fan assisted oven. Following post-curing each switch was removed, resistance checked, then placed in a separate container. The containers were further aged to see if after being post-cured each switch would still outgas and exhibit the anomaly in a closed volume of air.

Results are shown in Appendix C. Before any aging the switches were all within the manufacturer's $25 \mathrm{~m} \Omega$ acceptance. After post-curing, the NO contacts showed resistance values above $25 \mathrm{~m} \Omega$ in most operations, however, this would not affect switch performance in the field. All switches remained

## rotork

Rotork Controls Limited

Nuclear Engineering Report No.

ER857 Issue 1

Approved by Engineering
functional after the post-curing process. However, after further aging in containers the switches exhibited open circuit / unacceptable high resistance across the NO contacts.

## Summary

- After 8 days of post-curing, outgassing still occurs causing the switch to exhibit the anomaly.


### 7.3. Test $6-125^{\circ} \mathrm{C}\left(257^{\circ} \mathrm{F}\right)$ aging of K 5 switches manufactured in 2012

2 switches N69-838, date code 0612K, labelled 16 and 17, were tested following the procedure in section 6.1. A drawing of switch N69-921 is shown in Appendix A. Thermal aging time was 6 days.

Results are shown in Appendix D. Before aging, the switches were within the $500 \mathrm{~m} \Omega$ industry acceptance. After aging, the NO contacts exhibited high resistance or open circuit. Resistance readings above the $500 \mathrm{~m} \Omega$ acceptance level are highlighted red.

## Summary

- K5 switches N69-838 exhibit the same anomaly as the V12.
- The only difference between the two types of K5 switches N69-838 and N69-926 are the contact terminals. Therefore, switches N69-926 also fall within the scope of this Part 21.


## rotork

## 8. Tests of unglued and glued switches using different adhesives

### 8.1. Test $7-125^{\circ} \mathrm{C}\left(257^{\circ} \mathrm{F}\right)$ aging of a switch without adhesive

1 switch N69-921, assembled in 2016 without adhesive applied, and labelled 18, was tested following the procedure in section 6.1. Results are shown in Appendix E. After aging for 2 days at $125^{\circ} \mathrm{C}\left(257^{\circ} \mathrm{F}\right)$ in a container the resistance readings were still below manufacturer's acceptance. The switch was placed back into the container and aged for a further 4.96 days. This made the NO resistance higher but still acceptable for in-field use. The switch was again placed back into the container and aged for a further 3.98 days. Contact resistances remained acceptable for in-field use.

Total aging of unglued switch $=2$ days +4.96 days +3.98 days $=10.94$ days

## Summary

- The switch performance is acceptable if no adhesive is present.


### 8.2. Test $8-125^{\circ} \mathrm{C}\left(257^{\circ} \mathrm{F}\right)$ aging of switch assembled with Duralco 4525

A switch labelled 21 was assembled using Duralco 4525 (Figure 15) and cured in a fan assisted oven for 1 hour at $121^{\circ} \mathrm{C}\left(250^{\circ} \mathrm{F}\right)$, as per the adhesive's datasheet. The switch was then left for 15 hours before being tested to the procedure in section 6.1.


Figure 15: Switch 21, 4 drops of Duralco 4525
Results are shown in Appendix F. After being aged for 10 days at $125^{\circ} \mathrm{C}\left(257^{\circ} \mathrm{F}\right)$ the switch exhibited open circuit mode across the NO contacts.

## Summary

- Duralco 4525 outgasses to an extent that the switch will exhibit the anomaly after 10 days aging at $125^{\circ} \mathrm{C}\left(257^{\circ} \mathrm{F}\right)$.


### 8.3. Test $9-125^{\circ} \mathrm{C}\left(257^{\circ} \mathrm{F}\right)$ aging of switches assembled with AY105-1/HY991

The Araldite manufacturer Huntsman suggested an alternative adhesive/hardener system.

Used by switch manufacturer: AY103-1/HY951
Suggested alternative: AY105-1/HY991

AY105-1/HY991 has been found to be low outgassing in NASA tests. 2 switches labelled 19 and 20 were assembled using AY105-1/HY991 and cured in a fan assisted oven for 35 mins at $60^{\circ} \mathrm{C}\left(140^{\circ} \mathrm{F}\right)$, as per the adhesive's datasheet. The switches were then left for 3 hours before being tested to the procedure in section 6.1.

Results are shown in Appendix G.
Switch 19 was aged for 2 days at $125^{\circ} \mathrm{C}\left(257^{\circ} \mathrm{F}\right)$ and remained functional.
Switch 20 was aged for 6 days at $125^{\circ} \mathrm{C}\left(257^{\circ} \mathrm{F}\right)$ and remained functional.
The switches were placed back into the containers and aged further.
Switch 19 was aged for a total of 14.2 days, following which the NO contact exhibited open circuit. Switch 20 was aged for a total of 10.1 days, following which the NO contact exhibited open circuit.

It was believed that using less adhesive would reduce the effect of outgassing. Therefore, the test was repeated with switch 50, which was assembled with just 3 small droplets of AY105-1/HY991. Figure 16 and Figure 17 compare the quantity of adhesive applied to Switch 20 vs. Switch 50 . With reduced amount of adhesive the switch passed the $125^{\circ} \mathrm{C}\left(257^{\circ} \mathrm{F}\right) 10$ day aging test (results in Appendix G).


Figure 16: Switch 20, 4 drops of AY105-1/HY991


Figure 17: Switch 50, 3 small drops of AY105-1/HY991

## Summary

- The extent of the anomaly is reduced by reducing the amount of adhesive used.
- AY105-1/HY991 in reduced quantity passed the 10 days aging at $125^{\circ} \mathrm{C}\left(257^{\circ} \mathrm{F}\right)$.

Rotork Controls Limited

Nuclear Engineering Report No.
ER857 Issue 1

Date: $3^{\text {rd }}$ May 2016

### 8.4. Test $10-125^{\circ} \mathrm{C}\left(257^{\circ} \mathrm{F}\right)$ aging of switch assembled with Raychem S1264

A switch labelled 49 was assembled using 3 small droplets of Raychem S1264 (Figure 18) and cured in a fan assisted oven for 1 hour at $85^{\circ} \mathrm{C}\left(185^{\circ} \mathrm{F}\right)$, as per the adhesive's datasheet. The switch was then left for 3 hours before being tested to the procedure in section 6.1.


Figure 18: Switch 49, 3 small drops of Raychem S1264
The switch passed the $125^{\circ} \mathrm{C}\left(257^{\circ} \mathrm{F}\right) 10$ day aging test. Results are shown in Appendix H .

## Summary

- Raychem S 1264 used in small quantity passed 10 days aging at $125^{\circ} \mathrm{C}\left(257^{\circ} \mathrm{F}\right)$.


### 8.5. Test $11-125^{\circ} \mathrm{C}\left(257^{\circ} \mathrm{F}\right)$ aging of switch assembled with X 60

A switch labelled 59 was assembled using 3 small droplets of X60. The adhesive has a very quick cure time of 2 mins at room temperature. The assembled switch was left for 2 hours 40 mins before being tested to the procedure in section 6.1.

The switch did not pass 10 days aging test at $125^{\circ} \mathrm{C}\left(257^{\circ} \mathrm{F}\right)$. NO contacts exhibited open circuit. Results are shown in Appendix H .

## Summary

- X60 outgasses to an extent that the switch will exhibit the anomaly after 10 days aging at $125^{\circ} \mathrm{C}\left(257^{\circ} \mathrm{F}\right)$.

Page 22 of 48

Rotork Controls Limited
Approved by Engineering

Nuclear Engineering Report No. ER857 Issue 1
Date: $3^{\text {rd }}$ May 2016

## 9. Anomaly effect upon switch operation

This element of the Part 21 investigation assesses 1) factors causing the anomaly, 2) estimated anomaly onset, and 3 ) switch performance under accident profiles.

### 9.1. Factors Causing Anomaly

The anomaly is attributed to outgassing from the adhesive AY103-1/HY951 used in the switch construction, specifically meaning the migration of the plasticizer within the adhesive's phenol base material to the air volume contained within the actuator's electrical enclosure.

By review of published literature a number of papers were found on the subject of modelling outgassing expressed as mass flow rate. Most of the models have exponential forms that are functions of temperature and time with constant bases on material properties e.g. activation energy, gas constant, molecular mass etc. The reviewed papers all appeared to model outgassing to an infinite volume. In actuality the actuator electrical enclosure volume is finite and thus the partial pressure of outgassed material may influence the rate of outgassing. Experimental data demonstrated, for a given temperature, the anomaly would manifest itself in a shorter time period when switches were placed in a smaller enclosure. Based on the aforementioned it is determined the anomaly is a function of temperature, time, and electrical enclosure volume. A series of experiments were thus performed to assess these three factors.

The experiments were performed using three programmable test ovens and sealed metallic enclosures. Test switches were placed in sealed metallic enclosure and heated to a fixed temperature for a defined time (thermal aging). The testing was destructive, and new switches and metallic enclosures were used for every test. Prior to use, the metallic enclosures were thermally cleaned to remove any volatile materials remaining from their manufacture. The metallic enclosure construction does not incorporate any non-metallic seals or non-metallic coatings. Switch contact operation was measured using a EXTECH 380560 milliohm meter [calibrated $6 / 18 / 2015$, Due $6 / 18 / 2016$ ] which provided discrimination from $1 \mathrm{~m} \Omega$ to $20,000 \Omega$ (open circuit); alternative methods of assessing circuit continuity were assessed but dismissed. Switch contact resistance was measured prior to and post each thermal aging test (temperature $x$ time). All resistance measurements were performed at room temperature. The switch was considered to exhibit the anomaly when the milliohm meter registered a resistance exceeding $20,000 \Omega$. The switch maker's acceptance criteria is $<25 \mathrm{~m} \Omega$. The industry acceptance criteria is $500 \mathrm{~m} \Omega$ or less.

The relationship between the three factors was assessed by varying their levels in experiments, recording the point of anomaly onset, and plotting scatter diagrams. Using regression analysis and correlation coefficient, the relation between temperature, time, enclosure volume, and anomaly onset was progressively established.

Nuclear Engineering Report No. ER857 Issue 1 Date: 3rd May 2016

### 9.2. Estimated Anomaly Onset

The test data reveal two forms of switch anomaly: 1) the normally open ( NO ) contact failed to change state, 2) the normally closed (NC) contact failed to change state. Failure to change state means the electrical contacts become sufficiently coated with outgassed material to prevent conduction of electricity. As thermal aging progresses, at any fixed temperature, the anomaly is first observed in the NO contact and then later in the NC contact when measured at room temperature. An open contact is more susceptible to the anomaly because the two contact working surfaces are fully exposed. A closed contact partly masks each working surface and requires a higher outgas concentration to become fully coated. Given the switch contacts have identical contact geometry, it is more accurate to state the anomaly occurs first in the contact that is open and later in the contact that is closed during thermal aging. Thus no distinction should be made between NO and NC contacts.

The best fit of data was obtained by plotting temperature $(T)$ against time $(t)$ with a correction factor applied to time ( t ) that represented the difference between the actuator "switch to air volume" ratio and the metallic test enclosure "switch to air volume" ratio. Smaller than actuator enclosure test volumes were used to increase the "switch to air volume" ratio and accelerate the onset of the anomaly. The term concentration factor $(C f)$ was thus developed and multiplied the experiment duration time, measured in seconds ( $T$ versus $t * C f$ ). The electrical enclosure volume in the Rotork NA actuator is slightly different for each model size. To be conservative the smallest NA actuator enclosure volume was used to develop the best fit equation. The line displayed in Figure 19 is the estimated boundary at which the anomaly onset would be observed. Above the line both open and closed contact anomalies were observed. Below the line anomalies were not observed.

## Open Contact Anomaly



Rotork Controls Limited

Nuclear Engineering Report No.

ER857 Issue 1

The boundary was found by performing a series of experiments at fixed temperatures. The duration of each experiment was progressively reduced until only the NO contacts started to exhibit the anomaly. The activity was repeated for different temperatures to develop the graph in Figure 19.

Figure 20 displays the accumulated test data from which the following can be concluded:

1. At time $t=0$ all the switches functioned correctly.
2. Switches function correctly from $t=0(\mathrm{sec})$ to any green triangles on a constant temperature line.
3. Switches function correctly from temperature $T=0^{\circ} \mathrm{C}\left(32^{\circ} \mathrm{F}\right)$ to any green triangles on a constant time line.
4. Switches function correctly where constant temperature and constant time lines intersect and green triangles straddle the intersection points; two blue extension lines showing one intersection example.
5. Based on Rotork NCR data no utility has reported unreliable switch operation, thus at $49^{\circ} \mathrm{C}\left(120^{\circ} \mathrm{F}\right)$ and below the switches function correctly.
6. The effect of temperature is non-linear upon anomaly onset.
7. At $175^{\circ} \mathrm{C}\left(347^{\circ} \mathrm{F}\right)$ the onset of open contact and closed contact anomaly is less distinguishable.
8. At lower temperatures the Log anomaly onset boundary overstates the anomaly onset.
9. At $90^{\circ} \mathrm{C}\left(194^{\circ} \mathrm{F}\right)$ the anomaly was not observed. However, the test for $3,300,000$ seconds at $90^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ $\left(194^{\circ} \mathrm{F}\right)$ exhibited elevated contact resistance in $50 \%$ of the open contacts. The measured resistances exceeded the supplier acceptance criteria of $<25 \mathrm{~m} \Omega$ but did not exceeded the industry $500 \mathrm{~m} \Omega$ acceptance criteria.

## rotork



Figure 20

### 9.3. Switch performance under accident profiles

The figures in the following pages show a number of temperature time profiles applicable to nuclear power plants that use Rotork NA actuators that use Rotork NA actuators. Each test was performed using eight new test switches placed in a new metallic enclosure having a volume of one US gallon. The enclosure volume and number of switches provided a concentration factor of 1.125 thus assuring margin in the testing. In all cases the switches operated after the test and met the industry acceptance criteria of $500 \mathrm{~m} \Omega$ or less. A large proportion of the switches met the supplier acceptance criteria of $<25 \mathrm{~m} \Omega$. Switch resistances were measured before and after test at room temperature. All test instruments were calibrated under the Rotork Appendix B quality program. The data below demonstrates the test switch temperatures either exceeded the computed actuator switch temperature or equaled the oven air temperature.

Three temperature lines are displayed in each graph:

- $T_{\text {aopint }}$ is the computed temperature time profile of the switches in an actuator switch mechanism and add-on-pack, based on the environmental air temperature time profile.
- $T_{\text {air }}$ is the measured environmental (oven) air temperature for the provided profile.
- $T(8$ test switches) is the measured temperature profile of 8 test switches, within the closed metallic enclosure, exposed to the $T_{\text {air }}$ temperature time profile.

ER857 Issue 1
Date: $3^{\text {rd }}$ May 2016

Priority 1


Figure $21 a$

| Sample No-> | Measured at 20 C |  | 4/15/16 |  |  |  | Priority1 test data |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | As provided resistance data mili ohms |  |  |  |  |  | - | 4/15-4 | , | 4/15-5 | * | 4/15-6 | - | 4/15-7 | $*$ | 4/15-8 |
|  |  | 4/15-1 |  | 4/15-2 | ' | 4/15-3 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  | NC | No | NC | No | NC | No | NC | No | NC | NO | NC | NO | NC | No | NC | NO |
|  | 5.8 | 4.2 | 4.0 | 3.3 | 3.3 | 4.0 | 2.4 | 5.2 | 3.4 | 3.6 | 4.8 | 3.4 | 3.2 | 4.2 | 3.0 | 3.0 |
|  | 5.1 | 3.4 | 4.7 | 2.8 | 4.0 | 3.5 | 2.8 | 3.6 | 3.7 | 3.5 | 3.5 | 3.2 | 3.8 | 3.9 | 2.9 | 3.0 |
|  | 4.4 | 2.9 | 4.4 | 3.0 | 3.9 | 3.3 | 2.9 | 3.2 | 3.1 | 3.0 | 3.9 | 3.2 | 3.6 | 3.6 | 2.9 | 2.8 |
|  | 4.1 | 2.8 | 4.0 | 2.9 | 3.6 | 3.4 | 2.9 | 3.4 | 3.0 | 3.2 | 4.7 | 3.1 | 3.9 | 3.9 | 2.9 | 2.8 |
|  | 4.2 | 2.8 | 4.0 | 2.8 | 3.6 | 3.3 | 3.0 | 3.2 | 3.3 | 3.5 | 4.1 | 3.1 | 3.8 | 4.0 | 3.0 | 2.8 |
|  | 4.2 | 2.8 | 4.0 | 2.6 | 3.1 | 2.8 | 3.0 | 3.1 | 3.4 | 3.0 | 4.1 | 3.0 | 4.1 | 3.7 | 3.0 | 2.7 |
|  | 3.9 | 2.7 | 4.3 | 2.5 | 3.5 | 3.0 | 3.0 | 3.0 | 3.4 | 2.9 | 4.6 | 2.9 | 4.4 | 3.3 | 3.2 | 2.7 |
| Ave | 4.5 | 3.1 | 4.2 | 2.8 | 3.6 | 3.3 | 2.9 | 3.5 | 3.3 | 3.2 | 4.2 | 3.1 | 3.8 | 3.8 | 3.0 | 2.8 |
| Std | 0.7 | 0.5 | 0.3 | 0.3 | 0.3 | 0.4 | 0.2 | 0.8 | 0.2 | 0.3 | 0.5 | 0.2 | 0.4 | 0.3 | 0.1 | 0.1 |
|  | Measured at 60C (140F) |  |  | 4/18/16 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  | Post thermal aging using Priority 1 temp time profile |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Sample No-> |  | 4/15-1 |  | 4/15-2 |  | 4/15-3 | ' | 4/15-4 | - | 4/15-5 | ' | 4/15-6 | ' | 4/15-7 | ' | 4/15-8 |
|  | NC | NO | NC | No | NC | No | NC | NO | NC | No | NC | NO | NC | No | NC | NO |
|  | 2.2 | 3.9 | 2.3 | 4.2 | 2.6 | 3.9 | 2.6 | 4.1 | 2.4 | 72.0 | 2.3 | 3.3 | 2.3 | 4.7 | 2.2 | 7.2 |
|  | Measured at 20 C |  | 4/19/16 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  | Post thermal aging using Priority 1 temp time profile |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Sample No-> |  | 4/15-1 |  | 4/15-2 |  | 4/15-3 |  | 4/15-4 |  | 4/15-5 | ' | 4/15-6 | ' | 4/15-7 |  | 4/15-8 |
|  | NC | NO | NC | No | NC | No | NC | No | NC | No | NC | NO | NC | No | NC | No |
|  | 2.6 | 30.0 | 3.0 | 14.0 | 3.4 | 6.2 | 3.3 | 5.0 | 2.8 | 30.0 | 3.3 | 3.8 | 3.4 | 5.3 | 2.8 | 6.0 |
|  | 2.9 | 12.0 | 3.0 | 5.5 | 3.8 | 6.0 | 3.0 | 5.2 | 3.1 | 75.0 | 3.2 | 3.9 | 3.6 | 4.0 | 3.1 | 4.3 |
|  | 3.0 | 6.0 | 3.0 | 4.8 | 4.1 | 7.3 | 3.6 | 5.9 | 3.0 | 80.0 | 3.2 | 3.2 | 3.6 | 4.1 | 3.2 | 3.6 |
|  | 2.9 | 3.3 | 3.0 | 5.2 | 4.2 | 7.6 | 4.1 | 4.0 | 3.1 | 55.0 | 3.6 | 3.0 | 3.6 | 4.0 | 3.3 | 4.0 |
|  | 3.0 | 3.4 | 2.9 | 3.9 | 4.4 | 7.0 | 4.9 | 3.5 | 3.0 | 50.0 | 3.0 | 2.9 | 3.7 | 4.1 | 3.3 | 3.4 |
|  | 3.1 | 3.0 | 2.8 | 3.7 | 4.2 | 10.2 | 4.1 | 3.2 | 3.3 | 30.0 | 3.0 | 2.7 | 3.8 | 3.9 | 3.2 | 3.2 |
|  | 3.1 | 3.1 | 2.9 | 3.1 | 5.0 | 6.6 | 4.0 | 3.1 | 2.9 | 55.0 | 3.1 | 2.8 | 3.8 | 4.1 | 3.3 | 3.1 |
| Ave | 2.9 | 8.7 | 2.9 | 5.7 | 4.2 | 7.3 | 3.9 | 4.3 | 3.0 | 53.6 | 3.2 | 3.2 | 3.6 | 4.2 | 3.2 | 3.9 |
| Std | 0.2 | 9.9 | 0.1 | 3.7 | 0.5 | 1.4 | 0.6 | 1.1 | 0.2 | 19.5 | 0.2 | 0.5 | 0.1 | 0.5 | 0.2 | 1.0 |

[^0]memo: the contact resistance meets the supplier acceptance criteria of $<25$ mili ohms

Rotork Controls Limited

Nuclear Engineering Report No.
ER857 Issue 1

Priority2


5000
0000
ime (sec)
50000
200000

Figure 22a


## Measured at $60 C$ (140F) $\quad 4 / 23 / 2016$



Measured at 2OC 4/25/2016
Post thermal aging using Priority 2 temp time profile

| Sample No-> | "4/19 |  | 4/19 |  | 4/19 |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | NC | No | NC | No | NC | No |
|  | 3 | 8.3 | 4.7 | 5.6 | 4.1 | 4.4 |
|  | 3.6 | 7.1 | 3.3 | 4 | 3.9 | 3.7 |
|  | 3.9 | 6.2 | 3.9 | 3.7 | 3.3 | 3.7 |
|  | 3.8 | 4.9 | 6 | 4.2 | 5 | 2.7 |
|  | 4.1 | 4.9 | 3.6 | 3.3 | 5.5 | 3.7 |
|  | 3.5 | 3.9 | 5.5 | 3.5 | 4.2 | 3.5 |
|  | 4.2 | 4 | 6.6 | 3.6 | 4.7 | 3 |
| Ave | 3.9 | 5. 2 | 4.8 | 3.7 | 4.4 | 3.4 |
| Std | 0.27 | 1.26 | 1.39 | \%.33 | 0.79 | 0.4 |


| 4/19-4 |  | ${ }^{4 / 19-5}$ |  | *4/19-6 |  | 4/19-7 |  | '4/19-8 |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| NC | no | NC | No | NC | No | NC | No | NC | No |
| 5.6 | 13 | 2.4 | 5 | 3 | 5.3 | 3.3 | 4.6 | 3.1 | 7.9 |
| 5.2 | 12 | 2.8 | 4.8 | 3.2 | 4.9 | 3.6 | 3.5 | 4 | 7.7 |
| 6.3 | 5.6 | 3.2 | 6.3 | 3.5 | 4.6 | 3.8 | 4.5 | 3.8 | 5.9 |
| 6.5 | 4.4 | 3.1 | 4 | 3.4 | 4.3 | 3.7 | 4 | 4.6 | 4.5 |
| 6.5 | 5.1 | 3.2 | 4 | 3.4 | 3.8 | 4.2 | 2.9 | 4.1 | 4.5 |
| 6.8 | 5.9 | 3.5 | 4.2 | 3.5 | 3.9 | 3.7 | 28 | 5.2 | 5.1 |
| 6.7 | 6 | 4 | 3.3 | 3.5 | 3.6 | 3.9 | 2.7 | 4.4 | 5.3 |
| 6.3 | 6.5 | '3.3 | 4.4 | 3.4 | 4.2 | 3.8 | 3.4 | 4.4 | 5.5 |
| 0.58 | 2.76 | \%.41 | 1.03 | \% 0.12 | \% 0.50 | 0.21 | 0.73 | 0.50 | 1.20 |

memo: the contact resistance meets the industry acceptance criteria of 500 mili ohms
memo: the contact resistance meets the supplier acceptance criteria of $<25$ mili ohms
Figure 22b


Figure 23a
mesureder $20 x$

| Messured at 20 C |  | $\begin{aligned} & 4 / 25 / 2016 \\ & \text { miliohms } \end{aligned}$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| As pros | sistan |  |
| 4/25 |  | 4/25-2 |
| NC | No | NC |
| 5.0 | 9.4 | 3.5 |
| 42 | 5.8 | 4.7 |
| 3.8 | 4.4 | 3.2 |
| 4.6 | 3.7 | 3.4 |
| 4.1 | 3.3 | 3.0 |
| 3.5 | 3.1 | 3.1 |
| 4.0 | 3.2 | 3.0 |
| 4.2 | 4.7 | 3.4 |
| 0.50 | 2.28 | 0.60 |

## Measured at 60 (1406)

| 4/25-1 |  | '4/2s |  | '4/25-3 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| NC | No | NC | No | NC |
| 2.4 | 5.1 | 2.4 | 3.8 | 2.4 |

Measured at $200 \quad 4 / 27 / 2016$

## Post thermal aging using Prioity 3 ter




$\begin{array}{ll}4 / 25-5 & \\ \text { NC } & \text { NO } \\ 2.3 & 4.0\end{array}$


| N० |
| :--- |
| 3.8 |


'4/25-8
NC
2.4 No
11.0




No
12.9
9.1
3.8
3.4
3.3
3.3
3.5
4.4
2.31 memo: the contact eastance meets the industry acceptance cutens of 50 mili ohms

Figure 23b

# rotork 

## Summary

Three factors cause the anomaly onset namely temperature, time, and enclosure volume (concentration factor). An equation relating the three factors to anomaly onset has been developed and is provided for information purposes only - not for prediction. The equation accuracy has not been verified against an adequate sample of design based temperature time accident profiles. The equation is not linear. Testing demonstrated anomalies were not observed at $90^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ and below. Published literature suggest that some level of outgassing always occurs.

When temperature varies with time, estimating anomaly onset is far more complicated and requires the integration of the outgassed material mass. Furthermore, it would be necessary to established if an elevated temperature for a brief period of time would then permit the outgassing of material at lower temperatures for an extended period. Given the available time, the latter could not be accomplished and verified by experimentation. Switch performance was thus evaluated by experimentation. Switches within closed metallic enclosures having an actuator representative volume were thermally aged using accident condition temperature time profiles. The test results indicate the switches, though degraded, would operate correctly after completing the thermal aging profiles displayed in Figure 21 through Figure 23.

## 10. Results from independent test lab

An independent test laboratory, Exova, was requested to investigate the contamination on contact rivets of micro-switches that had exhibited the anomaly after being thermally aged in-house at $125^{\circ} \mathrm{C}\left(257^{\circ} \mathrm{F}\right)$. Contacts were analysed by FTIR (Fourier-Transform Infra-Red) spectroscopy and by SEM-EDX (Scanning Electron Microscope/Energy Dispersive Using X-Ray) analysis.

FTIR spectroscopy is a valuable tool to study the molecular structure of organic materials. SEM-EDX enables an elemental analysis of the contamination.

Figure 24 compares the infrared spectra of the residue collected from the NO contact of an aged switch manufactured in 2015 vs. an aged switch manufactured in 2007. Both infrared fingerprints virtually mirror each other which suggest that they appear to be the same type of contaminant. The following infrared bands were observed:

- 2915, 2850, $1415 \mathrm{~cm}^{-1}$ which are likely to relate to alkyl groups (CH2, CH3)
- $1535 \mathrm{~cm}^{-1}$ which could relate to alkyl groups ( $\mathrm{CH} 2, \mathrm{CH} 3$ ) or amide ( $\mathrm{NH}-\mathrm{C}=\mathrm{O}$ ) groups
- $1650 \mathrm{~cm}^{-1}$ which could relate to alkene ( $\mathrm{C}=\mathrm{C}$ ), aromatic groups ( $)$, amide ( $\mathrm{NH}-\mathrm{C}=\mathrm{O}$ ) or amine groups (R-NH-)
- $1310 \mathrm{~cm}^{-1}$ which could relate to amine groups (R-NH-) or alcohol groups (-OH)
- $1030 \mathrm{~cm}^{-1}$ which could relate to carbonyl groups ( $\mathrm{C}=\mathrm{O}$ ) or alcohol groups ( -OH )
- $720 \mathrm{~cm}^{-1}$ which could relate to aromatic groups () , chlorinated compounds or methylene groups (CH2)

The infrared spectrum of the residue collected from the NO contact rivet of the 2007 switch was compared to the infrared fingerprints of the Araldite adhesive (Figure 25), the DAP case (Figure 26) and the nylon 66 operating plunger (Figure 27) as they are the only organic components and therefore the only possible direct or indirect sources of contamination. The infrared spectrum of the residue did not match any of the organic materials.

## Rotork Controls Limited

Nuclear Engineering Report No.

ER857 Issue 1

Approved by Engineering

Date: $3^{\text {rd }}$ May 2016


Figure 24: Infrared spectra of residue on NO contact rivets


Figure 25: Infrared spectra of residue from NO contact rivet and Araldite adhesive

## Rotork Controls Limited

Nuclear Engineering Report No.

ER857 Issue 1

Approved by Engineering
Date: 3 ${ }^{\text {rd }}$ May 2016


Figure 26: Infrared spectra of residue from NO contact rivet and DAP case


Figure 27: Infrared spectra of residue from NO contact rivet and nylon 66 operating plunger

## rotork

Rotork Controls Limited

Nuclear Engineering Report No.

ER857 Issue 1

SEM photographs of the NO and moving contact rivets of an unaged 2015 switch, an aged 2015 switch and an aged 2007 switch are shown in Table 3. The SEM photographs show clear contamination on both the NO and moving contact rivets of aged switches. The pattern was consistently different between the NO and moving rivets and suggests the contamination deposited on the NO contact is then transferred to the moving contact during operation. This observation is in line with the results observed from in-house tests (Figure 6 to Figure 9).

| Switch | NO contact rivet |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Unaged, manufactured in <br> 2015 |  | Moving contact rivet |
| Aged, manufactured in |  |  |
| 2015 |  |  |

Table 3: SEM photographs
Elemental analysis results are compiled in Table 4. Results show the presence of a significantly higher level of carbon ( $C$ ) on the aged contacts relative to the unaged contacts. This suggests that the contaminant appears to be mainly organic, which is in line with FTIR results. A significantly higher level of oxygen ( O ) was observed on the aged contact rivets, especially the sample from 2007, which could suggest the presence of oxidative products.

Rotork Controls Limited

Nuclear Engineering Report No.
ER857 Issue 1

| Switch | Contact | Location | C | 0 | Mg | Ag | Cd | Si | Ca | Cr | Fe | Ni | Cu | Br |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Unaged, manufactured in 2015 | NO | 1 | 2.9 | 3.5 | 0.5 | 83.1 | 9.3 | - | - | - | - | - | - | - |
|  | Moving | 1 | 2.2 | 1.0 | 0.4 | 94.5 | 1.9 | - | - | - | - | - | - | - |
| Aged, manufactured in 2015 | NO | 1 | 54.1 | 5.4 | - | 28.8 | 11.7 | - | - | - | - | - | - | - |
|  |  | 2 | 53.0 | 4.7 | - | 31.4 | 11.0 | - | - | - | - | - | - | - |
|  |  | $3^{(*)}$ | 7.5 | 2.4 | - | 84.2 | 5.9 | - | - | - | - | - | - | - |
|  | Moving | 1 | 45.2 | 6.5 | - | 42.3 | 6.0 | - | - | - | - | - | - | - |
|  |  | 2 | 42.8 | 6.9 | - | 44.8 | 5.6 | - | - | - | - | - | - | - |
|  |  | $3^{(*)}$ | 4.5 | - | 0.5 | 93.3 | 1.8 | - | - | - | - | - | - | - |
| Aged, manufactured in 2007 | NO | 1 | 19.9 | 13.0 | - | 62.0 | 5.1 | - | - | - | - | - | - | - |
|  |  | 2 | 31.3 | 10.5 | 0.2 | 52.1 | 5.9 | - | - | - | - | - | - | - |
|  |  | $3^{(*)}$ | 2.8 | 2.9 | 0.5 | 89.9 | 3.8 | - | - | - | - | - | - | - |
|  | Moving | 1 | 29.2 | 17.0 | 0.3 | 47.8 | - | 0.6 | 0.3 | - | - | - | - | 4.9 |
|  |  | 2 | 32.6 | 12.2 | 0.3 | 47.7 | - | - | - | 1.2 | 4.3 | 0.5 | - | 1.3 |
|  |  | $3^{(*)}$ | 12.1 | 11.1 | 0.3 | 73.2 | 2.9 | - | - | - | - | - | 0.3 | - |

${ }^{*}$ ) away from main contaminated area
Table 4: EDX elemental analysis results indicating \% of each element at spectrum location

## Summary

- The contaminant appears to be mainly organic. This is in agreement with literature (section 7), test results of an unglued switch (section 8.1) and UV images (Figure 10 and Figure 11) which all identify the adhesive being the root cause.
- The contaminating residue is not formed on the moving contact rivet but is transferred from the NO contact during operation.


## 11. Conclusion

The altered adhesive formulation outgases at elevated temperatures and deposits an insulating material layer onto the switch internal electrical contacts as it cools. The deposit of insulation material results in contact resistances exceeding the supplier acceptance criteria of $25 \mathrm{~m} \Omega$ max, the industry $500 \mathrm{~m} \Omega$ max acceptance criteria and in some cases causes an open circuit.

It should be noted that tests were performed at constant temperatures. The effect of varying temperature with time has not been investigated in the available time and the possibility exists that an initial high temperature for a short period could subsequently cause outgassing to continue at lower temperatures. Rotork thus recommend that the risk be assessed by testing switches under representative temperature time profiles.

In tests performed by Rotork the anomaly was not observed at temperatures $90^{\circ} \mathrm{C}\left(194^{\circ} \mathrm{F}\right)$ and below. The maximum service temperature for A range and NA5/5E actuators is $70^{\circ} \mathrm{C}\left(158^{\circ} \mathrm{F}\right)$ thus they can be excluded from the scope of this Part 21.

Nuclear power plants that use Rotork NA actuators provided temperature profiles which also were tested. Anomalies were not observed using these profiles.

Rotork are recommending the replacement of the switches in the affected orders which are identified in the Part 21 notification letter.

## rotork

Nuclear Engineering Report No. ER857 Issue 1
Date: $3^{\text {rd }}$ May 2016

## 12. References

1) Czarnecki, N. (2012) Nema White Paper. Cadmium in Electrical Contacts [online]. Rosslyn, VA. Available from: https://www.google.co.uk/url?sa=t\&rct=i\&q=\&esrc=s\&source=web\&cd=1\&ved=0ahUKEwjK 5dCdt7PMAhWiBsAKHbPtBbcQFggtMAA\&url=https\%3A\%2F\%2Fwww.nema.org\%2FProducts \%2FDocuments\%2Fnema\%2Bwhitepaper\%2Bon\%2Bcadmium\%2Bin\%2Belectrical\%2Bcontac ts.pdf\&usg=AFQjCNFevJ949rWGVG65Oefdbr4ejiiT6kw\&sig2=s1UgMfEIFnKDWWhowkA4Ig [Accessed 29 April 2016]
2) Buffing, M. (2009) Outgassing of glue in the Outer Tracker of LHCb; measurements with a quadrupole mass spectrometer [online]. BSc, Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam. Available from: http://www.nikhef.nl/pub/experiments/bfys/lhcb/Theses/bachelor/2009 MaartenBuffing.p df [Accessed 29 April 2016]
3) Tuning, N., et al. (2011) Ageing in the LHCb outertracker: Aromatic hydrocarbons and wire cleaning. Nuclear Instruments and Methods in Physics Research A. 656, pp. 45-50

Rotork Controls Limited
Page 37 of 48
Approved by Engineering
Nuclear Engineering Report No.
ER857 Issue 1 Date: $3^{\text {rd }}$ May 2016


## Page 38 of 48

Rotork Controls Limited Approved by Engineering


## rotor:

Page 39 of 48
Rotork Controls Limited
Approved by Engineering
Nuclear Engineering Report No.
ER857 Issue 1 Date: $3^{\text {rd }}$ May 2016


## rotor:

Rotork Controls Limited Approved by Engineering

## Appendix B - Pre and post-aging resistance results, Test 1 and 3

All results in Ohms.
Test $\mathbf{1 - 1 2 5 ^ { \circ }}{ }^{\circ}$ ( $\left.\mathbf{2 5} 7^{\circ} \mathrm{F}\right)$ aging of V12 switches manufactured in 2015
Results before ageing

| Operation 1 |  |  | Operation 2 |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Operation 3 |  |  |  |  |
| N/C | $\mathrm{N} / \mathrm{O}$ | $\mathrm{N} / \mathrm{C}$ | $\mathrm{N} / \mathrm{O}$ | $\mathrm{N} / \mathrm{C}$ | $\mathrm{N} / \mathrm{O}$ |

Into oven Out of oven Total aging Results after ageing

| Date Code |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | N/C | N/O | N/C | N/O | N/C | N/O |  |  |  | N/C | $\mathrm{N} / \mathrm{O}$ | N/C | N/O | N/C | N/O |
| 3715K | 0.003 | 0.003 | 0.004 | 0.005 | 0.004 | 0.005 |  |  |  | 0.004 |  | 0.003 | - | 0.005 |  |
| 3715K | 0.004 | 0.005 | 0.004 | 0.003 | 0.005 | 0.003 | 14:00 | 08:00 |  | 0.005 | - | 0.005 | - | 0.005 | - |
| 3715K | 0.004 | 0.005 | 0.004 | 0.004 | 0.004 | 0.004 | Tue | Mon |  | 0.006 | - | 0.006 | 0.010 | 0.006 | 0.007 |
| 3715K | 0.004 | 0.004 | 0.006 | 0.003 | 0.005 | 0.004 | 26/01/16 | 01/02/16 | (5.75 days) | 0.004 |  | 0.005 | - | 0.005 | - |
| 3715K | 0.004 | 0.004 | 0.004 | 0.004 | 0.004 | 0.003 |  |  |  | 0.005 | * | 0.006 | - | 0.008 |  |

Test $\mathbf{3 - 1 2 5}{ }^{\circ} \mathrm{C}\left(\mathbf{2 5 7 ^ { \circ }} \mathrm{F}\right)$ aging of V12 switches manufactured in 2007
Results before ageing

| Into oven | Out of oven | Total aging | Results after ageing |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  |  | Operation 4 |  | Operation 5 |  | Operation 6 |  |
|  |  |  | N/C | N/O | N/C | N/O | N/C | N/O |
| 15:45 | 14:00 |  | 0.004 | 0.279 | 0.004 | 184 | 0.004 | 0.124 |
| Mon | Fri | 94.25 hrs | 0.004 | - | 0.009 | - | 0.005 | - |
| 01/02/16 | 05/02/16 | (3.93 days) | 0.004 | - | 0.004 | - | 0.004 | - |
| 01/02/16 |  |  | 0.004 | 0.642 | 0.004 | 0.030 | 0.007 | 0.04 |

## - indicates open circuit

* indicates that the resistance value was fluctuating between several ohms, to hundreds of ohms, to open circuit


## rotork

Rotork Controls Limited

Nuclear Engineering Report No.

ER857 Issue 1
Date: $3^{\text {rd }}$ May 2016

## Appendix C - Resistance results post-curing and subsequent aging, Test 5

All results in Ohms.
Post-curing of each switch in a fan assisted oven
Results before post-curing Into oven Out of oven Total aging Results after post-curing
Operation 1 Operation 2 Operation 3

|  | Date Code | N/C | N/O | N/C | N/O | N/C | N/O |  |  |  | N/C | N/O | N/C | N/O | N/C | N/O |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | 4315K | 0.004 | 0.007 | 0.005 | 0.006 | 0.007 | 0.006 |  | 11:55 Fri 12/02/16 | 1.02 days | 0.003 | 0.023 | 0.004 | 0.018 | 0.002 | 0.07 |
| 2 | 4315K | 0.007 | 0.010 | 0.006 | 0.008 | 0.006 | 0.006 |  | 11:50 Mon 15/02/16 | 4.01 days | 0.007 | 0.040 | 0.007 | 0.012 | 0.008 | 0.01 |
| 3 | 4315K | 0.005 | 0.005 | 0.004 | 0.005 | 0.005 | 0.005 |  | 15:00 Tue 16/02/16 | 5.15 days | 0.004 | 0.086 | 0.005 | 0.047 | 0.005 | 0.06 |
| 4 | 4315K | 0.002 | 0.009 | 0.004 | 0.006 | 0.004 | 0.006 |  | 11:30 Wed 17/02/16 | 6 days | 0.005 | 0.066 | 0.005 | 0.006 | 0.006 | 0.00 |
| 5 | 4315K | 0.004 | 0.007 | 0.005 | 0.008 | 0.005 | 0.006 |  | 11:30 Thu 18/02/16 | 7 days | 0.006 | 0.077 | 0.006 | 0.176 | 0.006 | 0.08 |
| 6 | 4315K | 0.004 | 0.005 | 0.004 | 0.005 | 0.004 | 0.005 |  | 11:30 Fri 19/02/16 | 8 days | 0.005 | 0.150 | 0.007 | 0.159 | 0.006 | 0.0 |

Further aging of post-cured switches in metal containers
Results before ageing
Operation 1 Operation 2 Operation 3
Date Code N/C N/O N/C N/O N/C N/O
14315 K
2 4315K
$3 \quad 4315 \mathrm{~K}$
4 4315K
5 4315K
6 4315K
Above post-cured switches were taken and 14:30
each switch was placed in its own Fri
09:00 Tue 23/02/16
Total aging
Results after ageing

| Operation 4 |  | Operation 5 |  | Operation 6 |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| $\underline{\mathbf{N} / \mathbf{C}}$ | $\underline{\mathrm{N} / \mathrm{O}}$ | $\underline{\mathrm{N} / \mathrm{C}}$ | $\underline{\mathrm{N} / \mathrm{O}}$ | $\underline{\mathrm{N} / \mathrm{C}}$ | $\underline{\mathrm{N} / \mathbf{O}}$ |
| 0.010 | - | 0.024 | - | 0.011 | - |
| 0.006 | 4.800 | 0.016 | 0.319 | 0.018 | 0.243 |
| 0.007 | - | 0.010 | - | 0.048 | - |
| 0.004 | 49.700 | 0.008 | 3.450 | 0.006 | 1.200 |
| 0.004 | 0.059 | 0.005 | 0.250 | 0.005 | 0.164 |
| 0.009 | - | 0.028 | - | 0.040 | - |

[^1]
# rotork 

| Rotork Controls Limited | Approved by Engineering |  |
| :--- | :--- | :--- |
| Nuclear Engineering Report No. | ER857 Issue 1 | Date: $3^{\text {rd }}$ May 2016 |

## Appendix D - Resistance results of K5 switches, Test 6

## All results in Ohms.



## rotor:

| Rotork Controls Limited |  |
| :--- | :--- |
| Nuclear Engineering Report No. |  |
|  | ER857 Issue 1 |
|  | Appendix E-Resistance results of switch aged without adhesive, Test 7 |

All results in Ohms.

|  | Results before ageing |  |  |  |  | Into oven | Out of oven | Total aging | Results after ageing |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Operation 1 Operation 2 Operation 3 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | Operation 4 |  | Operation 5 |  | Operation 6 |  | Operation 7 |  |
|  | N/C N/O | N/C | N/O | N/C | N/O |  |  |  | N/C | N/O | N/C | N/O | N/C | N/O | N/C | N/O |
| 18 | 0.0060 .004 | 0.005 | 0.004 | 0.007 | 0.005 | $\begin{gathered} \text { 13:55 Mon } \\ 29 / 02 / 16 \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} 13: 55 \text { Wed } \\ 02 / 03 / 16 \end{gathered}$ | 2 days | 0.004 | 0.020 | 0.004 | 0.012 | 0.004 | 0.018 | 0.004 | 0.005 |
| Further aging of above switch to complete total 7 days aging |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  | Results before ageing |  |  |  |  | Into oven | Out of oven | Total aging |  |  | sults af | ter age |  |  |  |  |
|  | Operation 1 | Opera | tion 2 | Oper | on 3 |  |  |  | Opera | tion 4 | Opera | tion 5 | Opera | tion 6 | Opera | tion 7 |
|  | N/C N/O | N/C | N/O | N/C | N/O |  |  |  | N/C | N/O | N/C | N/O | N/C | N/O | N/C | N/O |
| 18 | Above swis | itch w | s aged | urther |  | $\begin{gathered} 14: 55 \text { Wed } \\ 02 / 03 / 16 \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { 13:55 Mon } \\ \text { 07/03/16 } \end{gathered}$ | 4.96 days | 0.012 | 0.004 | 0.006 | 0.138 | 0.014 | 0.227 | 0.068 | 0.077 |
| Further aging of above switch to complete total 10 days aging |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  | Results before ageing |  |  |  |  | Into oven | Out of oven | Total aging | Results after ageing |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  | Operation 1 Operation 2 Operation 3 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | Operation 4 |  | Operation 5 |  | Operation 6 |  | Operation 7 |  |
|  | N/C N/O | N/C | N/O | N/C | N/O |  |  |  | N/C | N/O | N/C | N/O | N/C | N/O | N/C | N/O |
| 18 | Above swid | witch w | as aged | further |  | $\begin{aligned} & \text { 08:30 Fri } \\ & \text { 01/04/16 } \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { 08:00 Mon } \\ \text { 04/04/16 } \end{gathered}$ | 3.98 days | 0.007 | 0.117 | 0.082 | 0.006 | 0.174 | 0.015 | 0.006 | 0.017 |

[^2]Page 43 of 48
Approved by Engineering
Date: $3^{\text {rd }}$ May 2016

## Appendix E - Resistance results of switch aged without adhesive, Test 7

# rotork 

| Rotork Controls Limited | Approved by Engineering |  |
| :--- | :--- | :--- |
| Nuclear Engineering Report No. | ER857 Issue 1 | Date: $3^{\text {rd }}$ May 2016 |

## Appendix F - Resistance results of switch aged with Duralco 4525, Test 8

All results in Ohms.

|  | Results before ageing |  |  |  |  |  | Into oven | Out of oven | Total aging | Results after ageing |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Opera | tion 1 | Opera | tion 2 | Opera | tion 3 |  |  |  | Opera | ion 4 | Operat | ion 5 | Oper | n 6 | Oper | ion 7 |
|  | N/C | N/O | N/C | N/O | N/C | N/O |  |  |  | N/C | N/O | N/C | N/O | N/C | N/O | N/C | N/O |
| 21 | 0.004 | 0.004 | 0.005 | 0.004 | 0.007 | 0.004 | $\begin{aligned} & \text { 08:30 Fri } \\ & \text { 01/04/16 } \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { 08:30 Mon } \\ \text { 11/04/16 } \end{gathered}$ | 10 days | 0.027 | - | 0.178 | - | 0.250 | - | 0.186 | - |

[^3]
## rotork

Rotork Controls Limited
Nuclear Engineering Report No.

Total aging time for switch $19=14$ days, 5 hrs
Total aging time for switch $20=10$ days, $3 \mathrm{hrs}, 30 \mathrm{mins}$

- indicates open circuit
* denotes a value that was inconsistent, i.e. the ohm value moved around the value recorded, it did not settle.


## rotork

Rotork Controls Limited

Nuclear Engineering Report No.

Page 46 of 48
Approved by Engineering
Date: $3^{\text {rd }}$ May 2016

Thermal aging of switch assembled with reduced quantity of AY105-1/HY991

| Results before ageing |  |  |  |  |  |  | Into oven | Out of oven | Total aging | Results after ageing |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Operation 1 |  |  | Operation 2 |  | Operation 3 |  |  |  |  | Operation 4 |  | Operation 5 |  | Operation 6 |  | Operation 7 |  |
|  | N/C | N/O | N/C | N/O | N/C | N/O |  |  |  | N/C | N/O | N/C | N/O | N/C | N/O | N/C | N/O |
| 50 | 0.006 | 0.004 | 0.018 | 0.004 | 0.012 | 0.004 | $\begin{gathered} \text { 13:00 Thu } \\ \text { 14/04/16 } \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { 08:00 Mon } \\ 25 / 04 / 16 \end{gathered}$ | 10days <br> 19hrs | 0.030 | 0.078 | 0.035 | 0.008 | 0.005 | 0.007 | 0.170 | 0.005 |

## rotork

Rotork Controls Limited
Nuclear Engineering Report No.

## Page 47 of 48

Approved by Engineering
Date: $3^{\text {rd }}$ May 2016

## Appendix H - Resistance results of switch aged with Raychem S1264, Test 10

All results in Ohms.

| Results before ageing |  |  |  |  |  |  | Into oven | Out of oven | Total aging | Results after ageing |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Operation 1 |  | Operation 2 |  | Operation 3 |  |  |  |  | Operation 4 |  | Operation 5 |  | Operation 6 |  | Operation 7 |  |
|  | N/C | N/O | N/C | N/O | N/C | N/O |  |  |  | N/C | N/O | N/C | N/O | N/C | N/O | N/C | N/O |
| 49 | 0.004 | 0.003 | 0.004 | 0.003 | 0.004 | 0.004 | $\begin{aligned} & \text { 13:00 Thu } \\ & 14 / 04 / 16 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { 08:00 Mon } \\ 25 / 04 / 16 \end{gathered}$ | 10days 19hrs | 0.010 | 0.024 | 0.007 | 0.021 | 0.008 | 0.023 | 0.012 | 0.009 |

## rotor*

| Rotork Controls Limited | Approved by Engineering |  |
| :--- | :--- | :--- |
| Nuclear Engineering Report No. | ER857 Issue 1 | Date: $3^{\text {rd }}$ May 2016 |

ER857 Issue 1 Date: $3^{\text {rd }}$ May 2016

## Appendix I - Resistance results of switch aged with X60, Test 11

All results in Ohms.

| Res |  |  |  |  |  |  | Into oven | Out of oven | Total aging | Results after ageing |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  |  | Operation 2 |  | Operation 3 |  |  |  |  | Operation 4 |  | Operation 5 |  | Operation 6 |  | Operation 7 |  |
|  | N/C | N/O | N/C | N/O | N/C | N/O |  |  |  | N/C | N/O | N/C | N/O | N/C | N/O | N/C | N/O |
| 53 | 0.006 | 0.002 | 0.005 | 0.002 | 0.006 | 0.003 | $\begin{gathered} \text { 14:20 Mon } \\ \text { 18/04/16 } \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { 14:20 Thu } \\ & \text { 28/04/16 } \end{aligned}$ | 10 days | 0.008 | - | 0.040 | - | 0.016 | - | 0.042 | - |

- indicates open circuit
* indicates that the resistance value was fluctuating between several ohms, to hundreds of ohms, to open circuit


[^0]:    memo: the contact resistance meets the industry acceptance criteria of 500 mill ohms

[^1]:    - indicates open circuit
    * indicates that the resistance value was fluctuating between several ohms, to hundreds of ohms, to open circuit

[^2]:    Total aging time for switch $18=2+4.96+3.98=10.94$ days

[^3]:    - indicates open circuit
    * indicates that the resistance value was fluctuating between several ohms, to hundreds of ohms, to open circuit

